



Examining Civic Education: A Comparative Perspective of Indonesian and Malaysian Multiculturalism

Salsa Anindya; Muhammad Turhan Yani; Harmanto

Postgraduate Social Studies Education, Surabaya State University, Indonesia

<http://dx.doi.org/10.18415/ijmmu.v11i6.5911>

Abstract

This research focuses on comparing citizenship education from the perspective of multiculturalism in Indonesia and Malaysia. The aims of this research are to (1) Understand citizenship education from a multicultural perspective in Indonesia, (2) Understand citizenship education from a multicultural perspective in Malaysia, (3) Analyze the comparison of citizenship education from a multicultural perspective in Indonesia. The results of the research show that citizenship education with a multicultural perspective in Indonesia is different from that in Malaysia. Citizenship education in Indonesia is called Pancasila Education, while in Malaysia it is called Civic Education. Citizenship education has demonstrated the existence of a multiculturalism perspective in the Learning Outcomes and Indicators provided in the material.

Keywords: *Education; Citizenship; Multicultural*

Introduction

Foreign cultures invaded everyday life in Indonesia, becoming a regular and familiar habit. This tendency has been regarded as part of Indonesia's cultural dynamics. Viewing it as commonplace is consistent with the multicultural richness that has defined the Indonesian nation. Through this lens, the influx of foreign cultural components is viewed as a reflection of society's vibrant diversity. As a result, it is unsurprising that these alien cultural components have integrated and formed an organic part of local culture. Further this acceptance, though, is the possibility of new issues developing. This simplistic view of foreign cultures could leave people ill-prepared to handle more complicated effects, such challenges to local cultural identity or even social disputes brought on by disparities in values and views. Febrianti (2023).

Stereotyping and discrimination against specific ethnic or cultural groups are possible in a diversified society. In social interactions, these preconceptions may give rise to unfairness and prejudice. Threats to cultural identity, social injustice, integration difficulties, and cultural conflict are a few of the variables that may have an impact on this. Conflicts between the customs and values of various ethnic groups can cause tension and strife and are known as cultural conflicts. Inequality in chances and rights is often the result of social injustice, which is caused by the unequal treatment of particular groups. When

individuals from diverse backgrounds find it difficult to fit in and collaborate peacefully, integration issues are clearly present. Furthermore, consequences to cultural identity might cause some groups to feel excluded and lose their cultural legacy, which can worsen feelings of injustice and alienation (Vera Dwi Apriliani & Acep, 2023).

Cultural diversity is possible supported and promoted with great effect through civic education. This education aims to lessen practices that have the potential to generate violence, conflicts based on ethnic, religious, racial, and intergroup (SARA) differences, oppression, and discrimination. It also includes inclusive objectives and a scientific structure that accommodates multicultural values. People are taught the value of recognizing variety as the nation's greatest asset and the need to promote inclusive attitudes and respect among neighbors through comprehensive civic education. This lays a solid basis for creating a just, harmonious, and peaceful society in which each person is respected for who they are, regardless of their ancestry, religion, or culture (Nanggala, 2020).

Educating citizens through multiculturalism is crucial to raising awareness of social plurality. People are given the chance to comprehend and value the diversity of cultures, religions, and ethnicities through this education. In a society with a diverse population, this procedure helps to lessen inequalities, foster tolerance, and enhance unity. Multicultural citizenship education creates a knowledge of social pluralism, which is a crucial cornerstone of a welcoming and peaceful community. According to Tinambunan et al. (2024), this education thus not only produces citizens who comprehend the concepts of equality and diversity, but it also lays the groundwork for the realization of peace and strong community collaboration.

The major objective of multiculturalism-based civics education is to raise awareness of these values in Indonesian society, particularly in the context of the home and school to enhance the basis of democracy, ideals founded on multiculturalism's tenets are established. It is the duty of society to accept and coexist with difference. It is hoped that a paradigm or perspective that values diversity can continue to emerge through multicultural education. This includes differences in religion, culture, language, ethnicity, and physical characteristics such as gender, skin color, age, and height (Sati & Dewi, 2021).

It is fundamental to determine whether or whether Indonesian civic education currently adopts a multicultural perspective, given the problem statement about multicultural society that was previously disclosed. People from different social, ethnic, and cultural backgrounds will be treated equally in the social structure when there is a multicultural viewpoint. Given that learning to coexist is one of the tenets of education, including intercultural values into formal education is a calculated move (Yani et al., 2020). Following that, a comparison between Malaysia and Indonesia will be made in terms of civic education from the multicultural perspective, given that both countries share comparable socioeconomic circumstances. Previous research examining the comparison of Indonesian and Malaysian civic education has been conducted by Hendra & Hajri (2023) from the historical and cultural aspects of the two countries.

In a previous study, Prayogi et al. (2023) compared civic education in Indonesia with several European countries. The findings indicated that civic education in the Netherlands, England, and Indonesia is similar in that it emphasizes civic knowledge, civic skills, civic character, and active citizenship—all of which are necessary for citizens to be good citizens. There isn't any research that addresses the viewpoint of multiculturalism in civic education from the earlier pertinent studies. Researchers will thus concentrate on elements of multiculturalism in citizenship education as it is used in Malaysia and Indonesia.

Thus, the formulation of the problem in this study comprises the following questions: (1) How is civic education perceived from an Indonesian multicultural perspective? (2) How is civic education perceived from a Malaysian multicultural perspective? and (3) How is the comparison of civic education perceived from an Indonesian multicultural perspective? The goals of this study are as follows, based on how the problem was formulated: (1) Understanding civic education from the viewpoint of

multiculturalism in Indonesia; (2) Understanding civic education from the viewpoint of multiculturalism in Malaysia; and (3) Comparing civic education from the viewpoint of multiculturalism in Indonesia.

Research Method

This study employed the literature review approach, also known as a literature study, in which information is gathered by comprehending and examining theories from a variety of literatures that are pertinent to the research issue (Adlini et al., 2022). The primary sources for this research were previously published scholarly works on the subject, including books, journal articles, and other literature. The author focuses on civic education-related topics from an Indonesian and Malaysian multicultural perspective. In the process, the author hopes to pinpoint and evaluate the ways that the two nations' approaches to multicultural citizenship education differ and are similar. By doing this, the author wants to make a substantial contribution to both countries' understanding and advancement of multiculturalism-based citizenship education.

Result and Discussion

The Growing Demand for Comparative Civic Education in Indonesia and Malaysia from a Multiculturalism Perspective

Studies comparing education in various nations offer crucial implications, particularly for individuals working in the field of education. Yahya (2011) lists intellectual satisfaction, cultural benefits, humanistic benefits, scientific academic benefits, and operational benefits as some of the advantages that might seem gained from comparative studies of education. Comparative studies of education also have the benefit of enlightening and assisting individuals in resolving their educational issues by examining the approaches taken by other nations. Studies on comparative education also make life easier for people whose expertise want to comprehend a country's way of life, which can help build peaceful connections with that country.

The ASEAN-Indonesia National Secretariat's website features a poll conducted by U.S. News & World Report, which is the rationale behind comparing citizenship education programs in Indonesia and Malaysia. Malaysia is one of the top three nations in Southeast Asia for educational systems, according to the website setnasasean.id (National Secretariat of ASEAN, 2021). After Singapore, Malaysia is placed second, followed by Thailand. Malaysia was rated 38th in the world in 2021, which is why it is thought to have the best education system in Southeast Asia. Comparing education in Indonesia with other nations that have superior educational systems is crucial because the two countries are in the same region.

As stated Alexander's statement in Saleh (2015), doing cross-national education comparisons has numerous advantages. One benefit is that nations with less established educational systems can pick up knowledge from those with more advanced systems. For instance, the adoption of foreign models for educational standards has significantly improved the educational systems of a number of nations with a majority of Muslims. These enhancements include a wide range of topics, subjects, education levels, curricula, and assessment methods.

Perspectives on Multiculturalism in Indonesian Civic Education

A study of the Learning Outcomes will precede the analysis of the multiculturalism perspective in civic education in Indonesia. As is well known, the Merdeka Curriculum is the most recent curriculum implemented in Indonesia, and each phase of the curriculum requires students to meet certain competences, or learning outcomes. Every stage of the CP teaches pupils Pancasila values, which they

can then put into practice. Slamet claims that every principle of Pancasila incorporates intercultural values (Maulana Jamaludin et al., 2023).

The first principle embraces to do with Indonesia, where six different religions are recognized, allowing people to coexist peacefully despite their differences in religious views. The second principle has to do with maintaining human rights through interactions with others. The third commandment has to do with appreciating the diversity that already exists and the cooperative efforts between countries made up of different racial, religious, and tribal groups, among other groups. The culture of contemplation in Indonesian society is related to the fourth precept. The nation's objectives and aspirations, which must be attained by cooperating across socioeconomic and cultural divides, are enumerated in the fifth precept.

Recognizing the state flag, national anthem, symbols and precepts of Pancasila in the Garuda Pancasila state symbol; recognize the formulators of Pancasila and apply the values of Pancasila" is one of the learning outcomes of Pancasila Education Phase A subjects (grades 1-2 SD / MI / Package A / equivalent). According to the CP statement, children have been taught civics from a multicultural perspective since they were in elementary school. Students that successfully integrate Pancasila values will be able to demonstrate behavior that values and respects a multicultural or diverse community. Typically, during this stage, students will be instructed in the development of tolerance, one of Pancasila's core virtues.

The phrase showing an attitude of cooperation in various forms of diversity that are bound by unity and integrity; applying the meaning of the precepts of Pancasila and emulating the character of the formulators of Pancasila" demonstrates the multicultural perspective in the Learning Outcomes of Pancasila Education Phase B (grades 3-4 SD/MI/Paket A/equivalent). The goal of this phase is for students to demonstrate a positive attitude toward diversity. Naturally, this attitude is derived from the Pancasila values that students successfully applied in the previous phase. Furthermore, students appear to be able to imitate the nationalist disposition that the Pancasila formulators had.

Learning outcomes for Phase C of Pancasila (grades 5-6 SD / MI / Package A / similar) The statement "Learners understand the chronology of the history of Pancasila's birth and emulate the attitudes of Pancasila's formulators; understand the relationship between the precepts of Pancasila as a whole unit and the meaning of Pancasila values as the basis of state, outlook on life, and state ideology; maintain and preserve cultural diversity within the framework of *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika* indicates education subjects from a multicultural perspective. It is possible to say that pupils need to acquire metacognitive knowledge at this phase, which is the ability to uphold and preserve the cultural diversity of the country. Asy'ari et al. (2018) define metacognition as the capacity to analyze, comprehend, and regulate one's own learning. One way that students' understanding of Pancasila education values is reflected in their ability to sustain and preserve cultural diversity.

The phrase Learners understand the history of the birth of Pancasila; apply the values of Pancasila; identify the diversity of ethnicity, religion, race, and intergroup in the frame of *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika*, accept diversity and cultural change in local, national, and global social life; understand the position of Pancasila" highlights the multicultural perspective in the Learning Outcomes of Pancasila Education Phase D subjects (grade 7-9 SMP/MTs/Paket B/equivalent). In addition to accepting cultural diversity, learners must also be able to adapt to societal shifts in culture. Globalization is to blame for the cultural shifts that are taking place in our society. For example, Tektona's research from 2022, which looks at civic education policies in the face of global disruption, demonstrates that civic education must play a significant role in the fight against globalization in order to prepare good citizens—in this case, having civic knowledge, civic skills, and civic character (Civic Dispositions).

The sentence students analyze the perspective of the state's founders, the position of Pancasila as the basis of the state, outlook on life, and state ideology; formulate solutive ideas to overcome behavior that is contrary to Pancasila values presents the origin and meaning of the motto *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika* as

social capital, building harmony in diversity; describe the values of Pancasila that must be realized in national development" is where the multicultural perspective can be found in the Learning Outcomes of Pancasila Education Phase E (grade 10 SMA/SMK/MA/MA/MA Vocational/Paket C/equivalent). The statement in the CP indicates that pupils who are already enrolled in high school have an even more nuanced understanding of multiculturalism. Learners now comprehend Pancasila as a state ideology and way of life in addition to applying its values. The phrase "building harmony in diversity" is highly prejudiced, nevertheless.

The sentence "students describe the formulation and interrelationship of the precepts in Pancasila, the position of Pancasila as a state ideology, national identity, as well as opportunities and challenges in applying Pancasila values in daily and global life; analyze potential conflicts and jointly provide equitable solutions to problems of diversity in society" demonstrates the multicultural perspective in the Learning Outcomes of Pancasila Education Phase F (grade 11–12 SMA/SMK/MA/MA Vocational/Paket C/equivalent). This phase differs from the previous one in that Pancasila values are applied in a setting that encompasses not only daily life but also the global community. Additionally, students must be able to evaluate conflicts arising from diversity in society. Stated differently, this stage of learning is more contextual, drawing from events in the local community.

According to a content study of the Learning Outcomes of Pancasila subjects taught in Indonesian elementary, middle, and high schools, the curriculum does a good job of incorporating multiculturalism. It is crucial to incorporate multicultural principles into civic education because we live in a multicultural nation. The integration of multicultural viewpoints in civic education is rooted in the application of Pancasila values, which permeate every aspect of the program. Thus, it can be concluded that the Indonesian government has done a great job of developing civic education that takes into account kids' developmental stages and is based on the multicultural perspective.

The Viewpoint of Multiculturalism on Civic Education in Malaysia

Sivik Education is the name of civic education in Malaysia, according to the Ministry of Education's official website. Sivik education is a science associated with the people system that aims to instill a sense of civic responsibility in citizens toward the state and their community. In Malaysia, civics education aims to create a generation of citizens with a strong sense of patriotism, an awareness of their rights and responsibilities, and a high moral standard in all spheres of life—the home, the family, the community, and the nation.

Under the Malaysian Ministry of Education, Sivik education encompasses all educational levels, including pre-school, lower school, and secondary school (KPM). By placing a strong focus on the literacy and amali components of civics, civic education is implemented in an integrated way. Furthermore, the execution of civic education encompasses all relevant external parties as well as those inside the learning process. Students need to master civic literacy, which is an overview of the civic information, civic socioemotions, and civic action components found in the curriculum. In contrast, civic practice emphasizes the practical side of things by using knowledge in curriculum activities and other educational programs.

The rich ideals of nationalism and multiculturalism serve as the foundation for Malaysia's Civics and Citizenship Education curriculum. A wide range of significant topics are covered in the curriculum, including social interaction, personal development, family responsibilities, involvement in society, and the capacity to forge peaceful relationships. Furthermore, it underscores the significance of comprehending and valuing variety and honoring the rights of others. It also imparts values like independence and self-worth, as well as the significance of supporting national progress. Students are therefore expected to become citizens through this education who are dedicated to harmony, tolerance, and strong independence within the framework of a multicultural society (Hendra & Hajri, 2023).

In civic education, there are four indications, according to the Malaysian Curriculum Development Section: (1) love, (2) respect, (3) responsibility, and (4) joy. All levels of civics education, from preschool through secondary school, cover the four indicators. To determine whether the multicultural perspective has been present in all or just any of these four indications, we will further examine its derivatives in the content.

Preschool civics education covers six basic topics: (1) respect for oneself; (2) myself, family, and others; (3) student responsibility; (4) love for the environment; (5) our country our responsibility; and (6) me and the globe. Among the six materials, the second, third, fifth, and sixth materials are the ones that most clearly display a multicultural viewpoint. Sub-materials about honoring individual differences and others' rights can be found in the second material. Sub-materials about adhering to school policies and making contributions to the school are included in the third material. Sub-materials in the fifth material, such as pride in cultural heritage and pride in national identity, also convey a multicultural viewpoint. Sub-materials about the behavior of are included in the sixth material.

The resources for lower and secondary education are also predicated on the four critical civic education indicators that were previously discussed. As evidenced by the materials *cintakan negara*, *sayang sesama manusia*, *saya anak Malaysia*, *mengahyati rukun negara*, *budaya Malaysia kebanggaan kita*, and *saya sayang Malaysia*, the compassion indicator in lower school has integrated a multicultural perspective. Indicators of affection at the secondary level have also included intercultural viewpoints, as demonstrated by the materials *Jauhi Bully*, *Sayangi Alam Sekitar*, and *Malaysia Negara Diversiti*.

The educational resources named "Respect for Malaysia's Religious, Cultural, and Ethnic Diversity and Tolerance" are part of the lower school's respect indicator. In the meanwhile, resources for secondary education that showcase multicultural viewpoints cover topics including global security, citizenship, harmony, and preserving biodiversity. Multicultural viewpoints appear to have been incorporated into the responsibility indicator that was created from the materials intended for lower school students. Related materials have titles like "respect for time" and "human rights." The middle school resources *Democratic System* and *My Earth is Green* both clearly demonstrate a multicultural viewpoint. According to the materials, multicultural viewpoints are already included in the joy indicator at the lower and middle school levels. At the elementary school level, closeness, intimacy, constructive engagement, and friends are related materials. Secondary school curriculum materials pertaining to *Muhibbah*, international friendship, national identity, and *My Country, My Responsibility* are available.

Multicultural viewpoints are covered in civics education from preschool through secondary school, according to a content analysis of the indicators and resources used in Malaysia. In Malaysia, the four primary indicators that are the subject of civics education are expanded upon in pertinent resources. While both Malaysia and Indonesia have shown that a multicultural viewpoint may be included into civic education, their approaches differ. We'll talk more about the variations in civic education implementation from a multicultural viewpoint in our upcoming conversation.

A Comprehensive Examination of Civic Education in Indonesia and Malaysia via the Lens of Multiculturalism

As multicultural nations, Indonesia and Malaysia must immediately begin teaching civic education courses from a multicultural perspective. The goal of comparing civic education in the two nations from the standpoint of diversity is to determine how much the curricula in the two nations incorporate multicultural ideals. The comparison principles—comparable (worth comparing), equal, and the importance of comparison aspects—must be followed when drawing comparisons (Wahab Syakhrani et al., 2022).

The fundamental principles and metrics of intercultural education in general are discussed in the comparative study. The comparison study makes use of seven indicators and six fundamental ideals. To

facilitate understanding of the differences between Malaysian and Indonesian attitudes on multiculturalism, comparative tables were developed.

Table 1: Indonesian and Malaysian Civic Education Multiculturalism Perspectives Compare

No.	Core Values of Multicultural Education	Indicator	Country	
			Indonesia	Malaysia
1.	Appreciation of cultural plurality	Getting to know your own culture	In the home and classroom, learners recognize and value their identities based on gender, interests, language, religion, and convictions (Phase A)	“Proud of the identity of the country/countries” and “Proud of the cultural heritage” materials at the pre-school level.
		Getting to know other cultures	Learners identify and appreciate their identity according to gender, hobbies, language, and religion and beliefs in the home and school environment (Phase A)	“Respect for individual differences” and “Respect for citizens among nations” materials at pre-school level
		Respect differences in culture, religion, tribe, race, and ethnicity	Learners identify and appreciate their identity according to gender, hobbies, language, and religion and beliefs in the home and school environment (Phase A)	Materials “Respect individual differences” and “Respect citizens among nations” at pre-school level.
2.	Human nature and human rights	Respect HAM	Carry out the rules, rights and obligations as a member of the family, school community, and neighborhood (Phase B)	Materials on “Respecting the rights of others” at the pre-school level
		Tolerance between citizens	Learners identify and appreciate their identity according to gender, hobbies, language, and religion and beliefs in the home and school environment (Phase A)	“Respect for individual differences” and “Respect for citizens among nations” materials at pre-school level
3.	Responsibility of the global community	Cooperate in social activities regardless of cultural differences	Demonstrate an attitude of cooperation in various forms of diversity bound by unity and integrity (phase B)	Materials on “Self-responsibility”, “Responsibility as a family member”, “Responsibility to keep the environment clean”, and “Responsibility to maintain public facilities” at the pre-school level

4.	Planetary responsibility	Bekerja sama menjaga melindungi planet bumi tanpa memandang perbedaan budaya	Working together to protect planet earth regardless of cultural differences	Materials “Responsibility for keeping the environment clean” and “Responsibility for maintaining public conveniences” at the pre-school level
----	--------------------------	--	---	---

The learning outcomes of phase A (grades 1-2 SD/MI/Paket A/equivalent) and phase B (grades 3-4 SD/MI/Paket A/equivalent) of Pancasila Education in Indonesia incorporate the first, second, and third basic ideals of multiculturalism education. This analysis is based on the table above. However, only the phase F Learning Outcomes (grades 11-12 SMA/SMK/MA/MA Vocational/Package C/equivalent) include the fourth core value. The way that multiculturalism viewpoints are incorporated into the curriculum varies greatly from Sivik Education in Malaysia. Every fundamental multicultural education value in Sivik Education is equalized at every level, which suggests this. From preschool onwards, all following levels of education incorporate the four fundamental values of multiculturalism.

This analysis suggests that Pancasila Education in Indonesia places greater emphasis on dividing up student learning outcomes according to their developmental stage. On the other hand, Malaysian civics education places a strong emphasis on applying all fundamental principles and metrics at all levels, with materials that are level-appropriate. Nevertheless, these two nations have done a good job of teaching civics from a multicultural standpoint. Multicultural values are reflected in the learning objectives and materials for each level. The distribution of indicators at each level varies primarily.

Conclusion

Malaysia and Indonesia are both multicultural nations, which unites them in certain ways. This idea suggests that civic education should be conducted from a multicultural perspective in both nations. Malaysian civic education is known as Sivik Education, whereas Indonesian civic education is known as Pancasila Education. The learning outcomes of each phase, from phase A (grades 1-2 SD/MI/Paket A/equivalent) to phase F (grades 11-12 SMA/SMK/MA/MA Vocational/Paket C/equivalent), in Indonesian Pancasila education have taken into account the multicultural perspective. The multicultural perspective has also been represented in Malaysian Sivik education, with four major indicators covering all stages of education from pre-school to secondary school.

There are variations in how diversity is implemented in civic education between Malaysia and Indonesia, according to a comparison of those perspectives. Four multicultural education core values and seven indicators derived from the core values are used in the comparative analysis. that phase A's learning outcomes (grades 1-2 SD/MI/Paket A/equivalent) and phase B's learning outcomes (grades 3-4) incorporate the first, second, and third fundamental ideals of multiculturalism education in Pancasila Education in Indonesia. However, only the phase F Learning Outcomes (grades 11-12 SMA/SMK/MA/MA Vocational/Paket C/equivalent) include the fourth core value. In Malaysia, the diversity approach is applied in civics education in a very distinct way. Every fundamental multicultural education value in Sivik Education is equalized at every level, which suggests this. From early childhood education through secondary education, the four fundamental principles of multiculturalism education are incorporated into the curriculum.

The research's theoretical contribution is to serve as a reference for comparing civic education in two nations with diverse civilizations. A comparison of civic education from the multicultural perspectives of two nations can also serve as an assessment tool for the government, allowing it to

determine the degree to which civic education in these nations is conducted in line with the features of their respective citizenries. This study might serve as a guide for educators regarding the significance of developing curriculum that highlights the multicultural perspective. If researchers wish to investigate related subjects, they can use this study as a reference.

Ssuggestion

This research includes flaws in addition to theoretical advantages and consequences for multiple stakeholders. It is suggested that future study expand on this analysis by focusing on other factors as well, in addition to learning outcomes and key indicators. It is also possible to draw comparisons between two nations with dissimilar societies. It can also examine civic education from several angles, including the perspectives of democracy, human rights, and other issues.

References

- Adlini, M. N., Dinda, A. H., Yulinda, S., Chotimah, O., & Merliyana, S. J. (2022). Metode Penelitian Kualitatif Studi Pustaka. *Edumaspul: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 6(1), 974–980. <https://doi.org/10.33487/edumaspul.v6i1.3394>.
- Asy'ari, M., Ikhsan, M., & Muhali, M. (2018). Apa Itu Metakognisi dan Mengapa Penting? *Seminar Nasional Lembaga Penelitian Dan Pendidikan (LPP) Mandala*, September, 1–14.
- Febrianti, D. (2023). Kebijakan Pendidikan Yang Responsif Terhadap Kehidupan Multikulturalisme Di Era Globalisasi. *Proceedings Series of Educational Studies*, 0–3.
- Hendra, & Hajri, P. (2023). Kajian Komparasi Dinamika Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan di Indonesia dan Malaysia. *Foundasia*, 14(1), 42–54. <https://doi.org/10.21831/foundasia>.
- M Nurul Ikhsan Saleh. (2015). Perbandingan Sistem Pendidikan di Tiga Negara ; Mesir , Iran dan Turki. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, IV(1), 49–70. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/283700343_Perbandingan_Sistem_Pendidikan_di_Tiga_Negara_Mesir_Iran_dan_Turki/citation/download.
- Maulana Jamaludin, G., Araniri, N., & Nahriyah, atun. (2023). Nilai-nilai Multikultural dalam Pendidikan Pancasila dan Budi Pekerti di Madrasah Ibtidaiyah. *Journal Of Islamic Education*, 1(1), 21–26. <https://ejournal.unma.ac.id/index.php/ijie/index>.
- Nanggala, A. (2020). Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan Sebagai Pendidikan Multikultural. *Jurnal Soshum Insentif*, 3(2), 197–210. <https://doi.org/10.36787/jsi.v3i2.354>.
- Prayogi, R., Komalasari, K., Heru Nurgiansah, T., & Kewarganegaraan, P. (2023). Kajian Perbandingan Civic Education di Eropa dan Indonesia. *Jurnal Kewarganegaraan*, 7(2), 2342–2355.
- Sati, L., & Dewi, D. A. (2021). Peran Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan Dalam Pendidikan Multikultural. *Jurnal Pendidikan Tambusai*, 5(1), 904–909.
- Setnas ASEAN. (2021). *5 Negara ASEAN dengan Sistem Pendidikan Terbaik Tahun 2021, RI Termasuk?* <https://setnasasean.id/news/read/5-negara-asean-dengan-sistem-pendidikan-terbaik-tahun-2021-ri-termasuk>.

- Tektona, R. I. (2022). Kebijakan Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan Dalam Era Disrupsi Globalisasi. *Waskita: Jurnal Pendidikan Nilai Dan Pembangunan Karakter*, 6(1), 73. <https://doi.org/10.21776/ub.waskita.2022.006.01.6>.
- Tinambunan, D. R., Saragih, J., Situmeang, T. A., & Theo, I. (2024). *Analisis Pentingnya Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan Multikultural Dalam Membentuk Kesadaran Pluralisme Social*. 2(1).
- Vera Dwi Apriliani, G. S., & Acep, M. E. (2023). Menghargai Perbedaan: Membangun Masyarakat Multikultural. *Jurnal Pendidikan Transformatif (Jupetra)*, 02(02), 425–432.
- Wahab Syakhrani, A., Tinggi Agama Islam Rasyidiyah Khalidiyah Amuntai, S., Sekolah Tinggi Agama Islam Rasyidiyah Khalidiyah Amuntai, E., Hervina Indah Putri Sekolah Tinggi Agama Islam Rasyidiyah Khalidiyah Amuntai, I., Jamiatur Rasidah Sekolah Tinggi Agama Islam Rasyidiyah Khalidiyah Amuntai, I., & Nikmatul Bolqiah Sekolah Tinggi Agama Islam Rasyidiyah Khalidiyah Amuntai, I. (2022). Perbandingan Pendidikan. *Educatioanl Journal: General and Specific Research*, 2(3), 419–432.
- Yahya. (2011). *Mengenal ilmu perbandingan pendidikan*.
- Yani, M. T., Suyanto, T., Ridlwan, A. A., & Febrianto, N. F. (2020). Islam dan Multikulturalisme: Urgensi, Transformasi, dan Implementasi dalam Pendidikan Formal. *Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam (Journal of Islamic Education Studies)*, 8(1), 59–74. <https://doi.org/10.15642/jpai.2020.8.1.59-74>.

Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal.

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).