



## A Survey of the Ashurayee Narratives of the Book Muntahi Al-Amal (From Imam Hossein's (AS) Arrival in Karbala to His Martyrdom)

Alireza Tabibi<sup>\*1</sup>; Hossein Mohammadi<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Associate Professor and Director of Quran and Hadith Sciences Department, Arak University, Iran

<sup>2</sup> PhD student of Quran and Hadith Sciences of Arak Department, Arak University, Iran

E-Mail: a-tabibi@araku.ac.ir<sup>\*</sup>; m67hoss@yahoo.com

<http://dx.doi.org/10.18415/ijmmu.v6i4.999>

### **Abstract**

Among the books available to report on the events of Ashura, one of the reference books is the book "Muntahi Al-Amal" written by Shaykh Abbas Qomi. In spite of the great efforts of its author who is a scholar, sometimes weak reports are also found. Therefore, the present article, with a descriptive-analytical approach, seeks to answer the following question: Which of the Ashura narratives of the book Muntahi Al-Amal is weak and invalid? From what source has Shaykh Abbas Qomi cited these weak reports? Are these Ashura reports acceptable? At the end, it was revealed that the some of the narratives quoted in this book are weak such as the use of 'Noureh<sup>1</sup>' by Imam Hussain (PBUH) in the morning of Ashura, the martyrdom of a person named Wahab ibn Abdullah, the martyrdom of a young man whose father was killed, the martyrdom of Ali Akbar (AS) by an arrow in his throat, the famous report of how Hazrat Abbas (AS) went to battle and fought, the crying of Umm Al-Banin (AS) and Marwān ibn Al-Ḥakam on Hazrat Abbas (AS), anointing Ali Asghar (AS) with his throat blood, the number of wounds of Imam Hossein (PBUH), the entrance of Imam Hossein (PBUH) with his horse to the battlefield and complimenting the water to each other and reporting the second farewell of Imam (PBUH), exaggeration in the number of those killed by Imam Hussain (PBUH), looting of the ring of Imam (PBUH) as well as preventing Umar ibn Sa'ad from attacking his army to the tent.

**Keywords:** *Muntahi Al-Amal; Muhaddith Qomi; Imam Hossein (PBUH); Ashurayee Narratives; Distortions*

### **The Statement of the Problem**

The great event of Ashura and its special place among historical events required that from the earliest days, those who witnessed the incident would play the role of reporting it and express its events to others. After some time, these historical reports were distanced their oral form and were written, first narrated among the Hadithi works and then written in the form of monograph and writing maqal. But poor and unreliable reports, among some of these books, make it necessary to review and clean them and to document the text of reports in ancient and credible sources. Therefore, the reputation of a historical

<sup>1</sup> hair-removal powder, in Farsi it is called نوره

report and its quotation in contemporary books cannot be accepted as a criterion, but rather considered the source of the movable reports, and if it has no reliable source or its source was weak, it must be excluded. However, it should be noted that the credibility of a source does not mean that all its reports are accurate and that there may be inaccurate reports in credible sources as well.

One of the high-referenced books is the book *Muntahi Al-Amal fi Tawarikh Al-Nabi wa Al-'Al* written by Shaykh Abbas Qomi. That despite the great efforts of its author and his scholarship, not all the reports in it can be credited with validity, but need to be examined on a case-by-case basis. Although he has written this valuable work after the book "*Nafas Al-mahmūm*" in the last years of his life, and has criticized some reports, there are sometimes weak reports. Therefore, the present article attempts to answer the following question with a descriptive-analytical method: Which of the Ashura reports of the book *Muntahi Al-Amal* are weak and invalid narratives of this book? From what source has Shaykh Abbas Qomi cited these weak reports? Are these reports of Ashura acceptable?

In this article, we have considered only the reports of the second and third destinations of the fifth chapter of the book - from Imam Khomeini's arrival to Karbala until his martyrdom, and it should be noted that in the historical researches, the conventional strictures in fiqhi traditions is not uncommon, but rather the "text of the report" is evaluated by confirming the content of the reports with rational and narrative evidences and documenting them to credible sources. But in order to solidify the reviews, we have sometimes used document reviews to criticize some reports.

### ***Shaykh Abbas Qomi and the Report of the Ashura Uprising in Muntahi Al-Amal***

*Muhaddith Qomi* has written the book *Muntahi Al-Amal* in two volumes and in fourteen chapters about the events of the life of the fourteen infallible Imams. The first volume begins with the life of the Prophet (PBUH) and ends with the life of Imam Hossein (AS) and the second volume has been compiled from the life of Imam Sajjad (AS) to the life of Imam Mahdi (AS). And the date of the end of writing of the book is the 23rd night of Ramadan in 1350 A.H. The fifth chapter of this book, which is larger than the other chapters, is written about Imam Hossein (AS) with four destinations and one ending and each destination has several chapters. The first destination is written in four chapters respectively on the birth of Imam Hossein (AS), his characteristics, narrations about the divine reward of crying on Imam Hossein (AS) and news about his martyrdom. The second destination in seven chapters is about affairs that belonged to Sayyed Al-Shuhada' (AS) from the time of his departure from Medina up to the arrival to Karbala and the martyrdom of Muslim ibn Aqil and the martyrdom of his two children. The third destination has been compiled in five chapters from the arrival of Imam (PBUH) to Karbala and the events that happened to him until his martyrdom. The fourth destination is set in twelve chapters dealing with the recent events after the martyrdom of Imam Hossein (as) from the move of the Ahl Al-Bayt (AS) from Karbala to Kufa and Sham and the events that followed them to Medina as well as some events and also introduced the children of Imam Hossein (AS). And the end of this chapter is about issues such as the importance of mourning sessions and criticizing the mourning state and giving advice to the people who mourn for the tragedies of Imams Hossein (AS).

But - as it has been said - although he wrote this valuable work after the book "*Nafas Al-Mahmūm*" and in the last years of his life, there are occasionally poor reports that should be examined one by one.

#### ***1-Preparation for Martyrdom at the Dawn of Ashura and Use of 'Noureh' by Imam Hossein (AS)***

In the book of *Muntahi Al-Amal* it has been said: "At dawn, the infallible Imam, to be prepared for the Hereafter journey, said to make a 'Noureh' for him, in a dish full of musk, then he used the 'Noureh' in a special tent. Burayr ibn Khuzayr Al-Hamadani and Abdul Rahman Ibn 'Abd Rabbih Ansari

had stood at the tent and waited for using the powder after Imam Hussain (AS). At that time, Burayr was kidding with Abdul Rahman. Abdul Rahman said: O Burayr this is not the time for joking, Burayr said: My people know that I have never done debauchery in youth and old age, and I am happy because I know that I will be martyred and after the martyrdom I will embrace Paradise, and I will be blessed with the blessings of the Hereafter" (Muhaddith Qomi, 1386 H.S., 1: 467-468).

1. This narration has been reported by Tabari, Balādhurī, Ibn Athir, in this way and with mentioning the word 'نوره' /Noureh/.

«... دخل الحسين ذلك الفسطاط فقتلني بالثوره...»

(Tabari, ND, 5: 423 and Balādhurī, 1417 AH, 3: 395-396 and Ibn Athir, 1408 AH, 2: 561).

Some contemporary scholars have criticized this report in the book "The History of the Uprising and the Comprehensive Maqal of Sayyed Al-Shuhada":

"In this report, it seems that the word 'Noureh'<sup>2</sup> is the corrected form of the word 'Toureh'<sup>3</sup>, which means a brass or a rock vessel. That is, "following the order of the Imam, the musk was shattered in that container and prepared, and then the Imam and his companions perfumed their bodies with it", but because the historians have called the word "Noureh", the phrases have been confused and the word "Noureh" has been used, while essentially the discussion has not been about "Noureh". Among the historians, the report of Abū 'Alī Miskawayh is accurate and without any edit; he only mentions musk and writes:

«و امر الحسين بمسك فميث في جفنة عظيمة و اطلي»

"Imam Hossein ordered to dissolve musk in a big container and rub it on their bodies ... (Miskawayh, 1379 H.S., 2:70). Confirming that the word 'Toureh' means a container that has been mentioned in the first report about the meeting of Hurr ibn Yazid Riyahi and his companions with Imam Hussain (AS) and it indicates that when Imam saw the army of Hurr is thirsty, he ordered his young men to water them and their horses, then the young men watered them with bowls:

«... فقام فتية و سقوا القوم من الماء حتى ارووهم، واقبلو يملأون القصاع والأتوار والطساس من الماء و يدنونها من الفرس....»

A group of young people got up and watered that group, the youth filled the bowls, porringers and nets with water and gave them to the horses (Tabari, ND, 5: 401).

It is not possible here to call the word after 'tasas'<sup>4</sup> as: 'Anwar'<sup>5</sup> but surely 'atwar'<sup>6</sup> is the plural of 'toor'<sup>7</sup>, which means brass or stone container. We add that the word 'toor' has been common in the ancient times, and has been used repeatedly in the hadiths and stories of the Companions, but then became obscure and unfamiliar. Ibn Athir, the author of "an-Nihayah fi Qarib Al-hadith wal-Athar" writes about the word 'toor': In the hadith of Umm Salim it has been said that:

(إنها صنعت حيساً في تور...)

He prepared a food including the dates, oil and soufflé in the 'toor'; toor is a brass or stone container like basin that is sometimes used for ablution. It is also quoted that Salman asked for a musk when he was dying and told his wife to "stir it in the toor, that is, to mix it with water (Ibn Athir, 1376 H.S., 1: 199)" (Pishwayee et al., 1393, 1: 742).

<sup>2</sup> نوره

<sup>3</sup> توره

<sup>4</sup> طساس

<sup>5</sup> انوار

<sup>6</sup> اتوار

<sup>7</sup> تور

## 2- The Martyrdom of Wahab Ibn Abdullah

Shaykh Abbas Qomi writes: "Wahab Ibn Abdullah Ibn Hobab Kalbi, who was present in the army of Imam Hossein (PBUH) with his mother and his wife, went to the holy war by his mother's encouragement, rode a horse to the battlefield and began bragging:

سَوْفَ تَرَوْنِي وَتَرَوْنَ ضَرْبِي  
أَدْرِكُ ثَارِي بَعْدَ ثَارِ صَحْبِي  
لَيْسَ جِهَادِي فِي الْوَعَى بِاللَّعِبِ  
إِنْ تَنْكُرُونِي فَأَنَا ابْنُ الْكَلْبِ  
وَحَمَلْتِي وَصَوَّلْتِي فِي الْحَرْبِ  
وَأَدْفَعُ الْكُرْبَ أَمَامَ الْكُرْبِ

After a good battle and killing a group of enemies, he rushed out of the battlefield and came to his mother and wife and said to his mother, "Are you satisfied with me?" She said that I would not be satisfied until you were killed in front of Imam Hossein (AS), his wife said: "I swear by God that you do not leave me widow and don't let me suffer from your calamity, Mother said: O child! Leave the word of your wife and go to the battlefield and for the victory of Imam Hossein (AS) martyr yourself so that you would be granted by the intercession of prophet in the resurrection day, then Wahab returned to the battlefield while bragging:

أَتَى زَعِيمَ لَكِ أُمِّ وَهَبٍ  
بِالطَّعْنِ فِيهِمْ تَارَةً وَالضَّرْبِ  
ضَرْبِ غُلَامٍ مُؤْمِنٍ بِالرَّبِّ

So he killed nineteen riders and twelve pedestrians and he fought for a while until his two hands were cut off, then his mother took up the tent perpendicularly and entered the battlefield and said, "O, Wahab! May my parents be sacrificed for you, fight as you can and repel the enemy from the sanctuary of Holy Prophet (PBUH), Wahab wanted to bring her back to the tent but his mother took his garment and said, "I will not return until I will be plunged in my blood like you." when Imam Hossein (AS) saw this, he said: "The good benefit of my *Āl Al-Bayt be on you*, go back to the veil of women, may God have mercy on you." So the woman returned to the honorable tents of the women, and that young Kalbi continued to fight until he was martyred.

The narrator said that Wahab's wife ran toward him after his martyrdom, and put her face on his face, Shemr told his slave to kill her so she joined her husband, and this was the first woman in the army of Imam Hussain (AS) who was martyred" (Muhaddith Qomi, 1386, 1: 477-483).

1. According to the survey, we should say that such a name was not found in ancient sources among the martyrs of Karbala, and the only one who has given such a name is *Khawārizmī* (*Khawārizmī*, 1367 H.S., 1:13) and Shaykh Abbas has followed him. Apparently the reason for using such a name is the confusion of the reports related to «‘Abdullāh b. ‘Umayr Al-Kalbī» and «Wahab bin Wahab» because of the similarities in their texts. And this has led the writer of *Qāmūs Al-rijāl* to consider these two as one and essentially regard "Wahab Ibn Wahab" as having no external existence (Shushtari, 1422 AH, 10: 456). Therefore, it is necessary for the preliminary reports of these two martyrs to be reported, in addition to proving that the two are not one, the confusion of the report quoted by Shaykh Abbas Qomi is also revealed. There is, of course, a great error in the history books and among historians, which has been created due to the multitude of names.

### A) ‘Abdullāh b. ‘Umayr Al-Kalbī:

Tabari quotes about him as this: "Abu Mokhanaf Abu Jenab told me: Among us was a man named ‘Abdullāh b. ‘Umayr, from the Bani-Alim tribe who lived in Kufa and his house was near Ja‘deh well, in the Hamadan tribe neighborhood. His wife, Umm Wahab, the daughter of Abd, of the Namr Ibn Qaset tribe, was also with him. When the Kufa Corps in Nakhilah was preparing to be sent to Imam

Hossein (AS), Abdullah met them and asked them about the story. They said: We will be sent to Hossein (AS), the son of Fatima, the daughter of prophet (PBUH). He said: Swear by God, I was eager to fight the polytheists, and I hope the reward of fighting those who intend to fight the Prophet's grandson is no less than fighting the polytheists. He went to his wife and informed him of his intention. Umm Wahab said, "May Allah has guided you in a good way, and bring me with yourself." So he went out with his wife at night and joined Imam Hossein (AS). On the day of Ashura, when 'Umar ibn Sa'ad fired a shot to the camp of Imam Hossein (AS), 'Yasar', the liberated slave of Ziyād *ibn Abī Sufyān* and 'Salem', the liberated slave 'Ubayd Allāh ibn Ziyād came to the battlefield and demanded opponent. Habib Ibn Mazaher and Burayr ibn Khuzayr got up but Imam Hussain (AS) told them to sit down. 'Abdullāh b. 'Umayr stood up and said, 'O Abu 'Abdullāh, the mercy of God on you, let me fight both of them. Hossein (PBUH), who saw him as a tall, dark-colored and broad-shouldered man with strong hands, said: "I suppose he is a murderer of his opponents." If you want, you can go. He came to the two slaves. They asked him, "Who are you?" He introduced himself. They said: We do not know you. Zahir or Habib or Burayr come to fight us. He said to Yasar who was standing nearer, "None of these will come to fight you unless he is better than you." He then he attacked him and killed him. Meanwhile, Salem attacked him. The companions of Imam Hossein (AS) shouted so Abdullah would be aware of his attack, but Abdullah was unaware, Salem hit him. Abdullah defended himself with his left hand and his fingers were cut off. Abdullah then attacked him and killed him. Then he came forward, killing both men, as he bragging:

ان تتكروني فانا ابن كلب \* حسبي ببيتي في عليم حسبي اني امرؤ ذو مرة وعصب \* ولست بالخوار عند النكب اني زعيم لك أم وهب \*  
بالطعن فيهم مقدما والضرب ضرب غلام مؤمن بالرب

His wife Umm Wahab picked up a Perpendicular and went to him. And said my mother and father be sacrificed for you, fight for the infallibles of the Muhammad generation. Abdullah wanted to take her back to the tent, but she took her husband's garment and said:

I will not leave you until I would be martyred with you. At this time Imam Hossein (AS) called her and said: "May God bless you on behalf of the Ahl al Bayt. Come back (may God have mercy on you) and sit with the women, since fighting is not necessary for women." So she returned to the women. In the morning of Ashura, Shemr ibn Ziljawshan, who was the commander of the left wing of the Kufa Corps, attacked the army of Imam with his soldiers. But the Imam's companions resisted and clashed with him and his companions and then attacked Imam Hossein and his companions from all sides and killed Kalbi. In addition to the first two, he killed two others and fought fiercely. In this attack, Hānī b. Thubayt and Bakir Ibn Hayy Timi, martyred 'Abdullāh b. 'Umayr. He was the second martyr of Hossein's companions. After Abdullah's martyrdom, his wife Umm Wahab came to him and said, "Congratulation for the Paradise". Shemr ibn Ziljawshan said to his servant Rostam, to hit on her head with a perpendicular. He knocked on that woman's head and broke her head. Then, she died there. It is said that she was the first female martyr in the Battle of Karbala. (Tabari, ND, 5: 429-438; and Balādhurī, 1417 AH, 3: 398-401).

Shaykh Mufid and Ibn Nama have quoted this story with the same name until his bragging (Shaykh Mufid, 1413 AH, 2: 101 and Ibn Nama, 1406, 56).

#### B) Wahab Ibn Wahab:

Shaykh Saduq in Amali quotes Abdullah Ibn Mansour, from Imam Sadiq (as), and he from his ancestor: Wahab Ibn Wahab came to the battlefield. He and his mother were Christians who had been converted to Islam by Imam Hossein (AS) and had followed him and came to Karbala. Wahab, mounted on horseback, took up the tent perpendicular and fought to kill seven or eight, and then was captured. They brought him to Umar ibn Sa'ad. He ordered to cut his head. He was beheaded and his head was thrown to Imam Hossein's army. His mother took his sword and came to the battlefield. Imam Hossein (AS) said to him: O Umm Wahab, sit down, God has not obliged jihad for women. You and your son will be in Paradise with my grandfather Muhammad (PBUH).

These two reports, apart from some similarities, have significant differences that probably these are two persons, in particular Wahab as a Christian cannot be summed up by any means with 'Abdullāh b. 'Umayr who has been a great companion of Imam Hossein (AS). But the similarities between the two reports are also notable.

Similarities such as:

- A. the presence of 'Abdullāh b. 'Umayr's wife and Wahab's mother.
- B. The kunya of Umm Wahab (which in the first report refers to the kunya of 'Abdullāh b. 'Umayr's wife, and in the second report, Imam Hossein (AS) calls the mother of Wahab as Umm Wahab).
- C. Imam Hossein's (AS) speech about detaining them from staying in the battlefield when he says: God has removed jihad from the shoulders of women.

These similarities have led some to record these two even their names in the form of one person named "Wahab Ibn Abdullah Kalbi" (Ibn Shahr Ashub, 1421 AH, 4: 101). And that some, like Shaykh Abbas Qomi, have mentioned 'Umm Wahab' as the mother of 'Abdullāh b. 'Umayr, perhaps because they named him Wahab Ibn Abdullah; so his mother is also thought to have been mistaken for his wife.

2. The first person to confuse the report of 'Abdullāh b. 'Umayr with Wahab ibn Wahab is Khwarizmi whose report is as follows:

"Wahab bin Abdullah bin Jenab Kalbi came out while his mother was with him. His mother said to him, "Rise up, my son, and help the son of the prophet. He said, "Mother, I will do this and I will not be negligent God Willing." Then he came in the battlefield, saying:

إن تنكروني فأنا ابن الكلبى      سوف تروني و ترون ضربى  
أدرك ثارى بعد ثأر صحبى و حملتى و صولتى فى الحرب  
و أدفع الكرب بيوم الكرب      فما جلادى فى الوغى للعب

Then he attacked and fought constantly, killing a group. Then he returned to his wife and his mother and stood near them and said, "O, Mother! Are you satisfied or not? The mother said no, I would not be satisfied until you were killed in the footsteps of Hossein (AS). His wife also said: "I swear by God that don't make me mourn by your own death." But his mother said to him, "My dear son, do not listen to her and return to the battlefield, and fight for the son of the Prophet's daughter, so that you may receive his intercession on the Day of Judgment." Wahab also returned, saying:

إنى زعيم لك أم و هب      بالطعن فيهم تارة و الضرب  
حتى يذيق القوم مرّ الحرب فعل غلام مؤمن بالرب  
إنى امرؤ ذو مرّة و عصب      و لست بالخوار عند النكب  
حسبى بنفسى من عليم حسبى      إذا انتميت فى كرام العرب

Then he fought until his right hand was cut off but he didn't pay attention. And he fought again until his left hand was cut off. And then he was killed. His mother went up to him to wipe the blood off his face, then Shemr saw her and ordered one of his servants to hit her with the perpendicular of tent. He broke her head and killed her. She was the first woman to be martyred with Hossein in the battle. When we look closely at the above text, we find that Khwarizmi has reduced some points of the report of 'Abdullāh b. 'Umayr in addition to confusing the name and mentioning the bragging 'Abdullāh b. 'Umayr in the name of Wahab, and has added a number of things, including:

- A. The presence of mother
- B. The return of Wahab to the tent and asking his mother if she is satisfied

C. Mother went to the battlefield after her son's martyrdom, then she was killed by the servant of Shemr

D. Cutting off the right hand and the left hand of Wahab, etc.

There is also a clear contradiction within the text, which is that first his wife is not satisfied for him to go to the battlefield, but then says: his wife took the perpendicularly of tent and went to him while saying: My parents would be sacrificed for you! Fight in defense of the sanctuary of the Holy Prophet of God.

Ibn Shahr Ashub also reports like Khwarizmi with a little difference, but he mentions the name of the martyr, "Wahab Ibn Abdullah Kalbi." He also wrote at the end of his report: Then he fought repeatedly to kill nineteen riders and twelve pedestrians. Then his right hand was cut off and he was captured." (Ibn Shahr Ashub, 1421 AH, 4: 101) It is not clear from what source he cited the number of those killed. Sayyed Ibn Tawus is another historian who is confused in reporting this event and brings a report similar to Khwarizmi's report but shorter and has reduced the bragging and the type of martyrdom of his wife or mother (Sayyed Ibn Tawus, 1414 AH, 161).

3. The historical evolution of these reports and their blending and the additions and drawbacks have caused them to become very confused about the names of these two martyrs and the quality of their presence in Karbala and their martyrdom and the texts about 'Abdullāh b. 'Umayr' and 'Wahab Ibn Wahab' would also be confused in the following centuries. But what was obtained from different sources and their correspondence with one another was that 'Abdullāh b. 'Umayr Kalbi Alimi' is different from Wahab Ibn Wahab, and these two are not one person. Also the woman who was present in Karbala with 'Abdullāh b. 'Umayr Kalbi Alimi' was his wife, who was known with the Kunya of 'Umm Wahab', not his mother. So Umm Wahab is not martyr's mother, she is martyr's wife. And it should be added that only two from the Kalb tribe have been called martyrs of Karbala:

One is 'Abdullāh b. 'Umayr and the other is Aslam, the ally of the Kalb tribe (refer to. Imam Hossein's encyclopedia, 1393 H.S., 6: 333); therefore, the above-mentioned bragging cannot be attributed to Wahab Ibn Wahab.

### 3. The Martyrdom of a Young Whose Father Was Killed

Muhaddith Qomi quotes: "There was a young man in the army of Imam Hussain (AS) whose father had been killed in the battle of the Kufis. His mother was with him and said to him," My son! Go out and fight in front of the Prophet's son. Inevitably, the young man obeyed his mother and went to the battlefield, when Sayed Al-Shahada (AS) saw him said that the father of this son has been killed and the martyrdom of the son might be difficult to his mother, the young man said: "My parents be sacrificed for you, my mother has ordered me to fight. So he went to the battlefield as bragging.

الأميرُ سرورٌ فُوَ ادِّالبَشِيرِ النَّذِيرِ      أميرى حَسِينٌ وَنِعَمَ الأَمِيرِ  
فَهَلْ تَعْلَمُونَ لَهُ مِنْ نَظِيرِ      عَلِيٌّ وَفَاطِمَةُ وَالدَّاءُ  
لَهُ غُرَّةٌ مِثْلُ بَدْرِ مُنِيرِ      لَهُ طَلْعَةٌ مِثْلُ شَمْسِ الضُّحَى

When he fought and was martyred, the Kufis cut off his head and threw it toward the army of Imam Hossein (AS). The mother grabbed the boy's head and clung to his chest and said, "Well down my little son, O the happiness of my heart! O the apple of my eyes! She threw the head in anger at a man from the enemy corps and killed him, then she took up the tent perpendicular and attacked them and said:

بِالْيَةِ خَاوِيَةَ نَحِيفَةَ      أَنَا عَجُوزٌ فِي النِّسَاءِ ضَعِيفَةٌ  
نُونَ بَنَى فَاطِمَةَ الشَّرِيفَةَ      أَضْرِبُكُمْ بِضَرْبَةِ عَنِيفَةَ

So he killed two of the enemy's army, and Imam Hossein (AS) ordered him to return from the battlefield and prayed for him' (Muhaddith Qomi, 1386: 1: 503-504).

1. By reading the above report and what happened in the review of the previous report, it is clear that this report has also been confused with the report of 'Abdullāh b. 'Umayr Kalbi and Wahab Ibn Wahab.

2- Probably Shaykh Abbas Qomi quoted this report from Khwarizmi, since no such report has been reported before him in any of the Maqatels, so there is no precise information about the name of this young man.

Some have called him Amro ibn Jinadah ibn Ka'b Ansari (Shooshtari, 1422 AH, 8: 73 Shams Al-Din, 1364 AH, 101) because his father has been martyred in Karbala, and because he was called a youth whose father was martyred, so they make such a guess. Muhaddith Qomi in Nafas Al-Humum says probably he is the son of Muslim ibn Awsaja. (Muhaddith Qomi, 1405 AH, 293).

#### 4- Martyrdom of Ali Akbar (AS)

"As the prince was attacking the army, an arrow was hit his throat and tore it," says Muhaddith Qomi from Abu Al-Faraj. He was dropped and tumbled in his own blood, and at this time he tolerated it, until his soul reached his blessed throat and he was approached the Paradise in a hurry, he cried loudly:»

يَا أَبَتَاهُ عَلَيَّكَ مِنِّي السَّلَامُ هَذَا جَدِّي رَسُولُ اللَّهِ يَقْرُوكَ السَّلَامَ وَيَقُولُ عَجَلِ الْفُتُومِ إِلَيْنَا»

(Muhaddith Qomi, 1386 H.S., 1: 508).

This report has been quoted by Shaykh Abbas Qomi without any criticism or even confirmation or disapproval, which seems he has confused the martyrdom of Ali Akbar with Ali Asghar because in none of the earliest and most credible sources, such a report has been quoted for Ali Akbar and it is written about his martyrdom: Ali Akbar repeatedly attacked the enemy until Morrah ibn Monqez Abdi hit him and dropped him on the earth. A group besieged him, cut his body with the sword to pieces (Shaykh Mufid, 1413 AH, 2: 106 and Tabari, ND, 5: 446).

#### 5. How Hazrat Abbas (AS) Went to Battlefield and Fought

Shaykh Abbas quotes a famous narrative of how Hazrat Abbas (AS) known as Qamar Banī Hāshim went to battlefield and martyred:

Abbas ibn Ali was the old son of Umm Al-Banin and the fourth son of Amir Al- Mu'minin (PBUH), and his kunya (i.e. teknonym) was Abu Al-Fazl and his title was Saqqa (the water supplier), and he was the standard-bearer of Imam Hossein (PBUH), he had such a noble character that called him Qamar Banī Hāshim (the moon of Banī Hāshim), and he was so high and broad-shouldered whose foot was dragged on the earth when he was sitting on the horse. He had three brothers who had no children. Abu Al-Fazl (AS) first sent them to war to see their martyrdom and to perceive their suffering.

Following their martyrdom, it has been stated by some narratives of the Maqatel that when he saw his brother is alone, came to him and said: O brother! Do you allow me to sacrifice my life for you? Imam Hussain wept for this word and cried hard, then said: O brother! You are my standard-bearer, if you leave me alone, no one would stay with me. Abu Al- Fazl (AS) said: My chest has been shrunk and I don't want this worldly life and I have decided to seek my blood from this community of hypocrites. Imam said: So now that you are on the journey to the Hereafter, then bring some water for these little children, then Abbas ibn Ali (AS) stepped forward and stood up against the ranks of the army and offered his advice. He exhorted as he could, and his noble words had no effect at the heart of that cruelty. As a result, he rushed to his brother and described what he saw from the enemy. When the children knew this,



they cried "Thirst, Thirst" (Al-Atash Al-Atash), Abbas ibn Ali (as) rode on horseback and took a spear and a waterskin<sup>8</sup>, then went to Euphrates, so he may obtain water. The four thousand men who stood by the Shari'ah of the Euphrates surrounded him and threw arrows at him, Qamar Banī Hāshim attacked them as a lion. And on every side he attacked, he scattered the army until he killed eighty men in a narrative, then entered the Shari'ah and plunged into the Euphrates because of the hard labor and the intensity of his thirsty. He closed water to his thirsty lips, but he remembered the thirst of Imam Hussain (AS) and the children, so he poured the water on the floor. He filled the waterskin with water and threw it on the right shoulder and rushed out of the shari'ah to get himself to his brother's camp and relieve the children of thirst. The troops, seeing this, took his path and surrounded him from every direction, and Abbas ibn Ali, as an angry lion, attacked those hypocrites. Suddenly, Nawfal Al-Azraq came out from behind a palm tree, and Hakim ibn Tofeil helped him, and then hit him with a sword and cut his right hand; Abu Al-Fazl (AS) threw the waterskin on the left shoulder and took the sword with his left hand and attacked the enemies. Then he struggled until the weaknesses overcame him, and again, Nawfal, with the help of Hakim ibn Tofeil attacked him and cut out his left hand. And he took the waterskin to the tooth and tried to get the water to that thirsty children, but the enemy hit the waterskin with an arrow, and the water poured on the earth, and the other arrow reached his chest, and he fell from the horse. Then he cried out, O brother, help me. Then an evil man hit his frontal bone with an iron perpendicular and martyred him. When Imam Hossein (AS) heard his brother's voice, rushed toward him.

But he saw his brother beside the Euphrates with cut hands, torn and wounded body, he cried and said: (Muhaddith Qomi, 1386 H.S: 1: 518-520)

أَلَا إِنَّ كُنْزَ ظَهْرِي وَقَلَّتْ حِيَاتِي»

1. Concerning the sentence: "He was so tall and broad-shouldered that when he sat on the back of a strong and fat horse, his foot was dragged on the earth" It should be said that this word is not found in credible and first hand sources, and none of the infallible Imams have mentioned such a description about Abbas ibn Ali either, and apparently Abu Al-Faraj Isfahani is the first one who has used such an interpretation (Abu Al-Faraj Isfahani, ND, 90) and Majlesi used this description in Bihar Al-Anwar (Majlesi, Bihar Al-Anwar, 1403 AH, 45:39), which is also quoted by Shaykh Abbas Qomi. And if we do not consider its ironic meaning as being tall and broad-shouldered, then this description would have a negative meaning and would mean a lanky person. It is possible that this description about him would be confused with a phrase from the Prophet's uncle, whose name was Abbas, which was about the last moments of the Prophet's life: (Rafat and Rahman Setayesh, 174).

العباس لصلاه الظهر كاني انظر الى رجليه يخطان الارض

2. The report of how Abbas ibn Ali went to the battlefield, reached the water and didn't drink the water, is a famous story in mourning ceremonies but its sanad (i.e. document) is not credible. This report was first reported by the Allameh Majlesi in Bihar Al-Anwar and quoted by Shaykh Abbas Qomi. Majlesi, before reporting this, writes:

«وَفِي بَعْضِ تَأْلِيفَاتِ أَصْحَابِنَا...!»<sup>9</sup>

(Majlesi, Bihar Al-Anwar, 1403 AH, 45: 41-42). But Majlesi has not said where the report came from. A comparison of the authors of the *maqal jāmi-i Sayyid Al-Shuhadā'* concluded that: Allameh Majlesi has probably quoted the aforementioned news with an adaptation and summary of the selected book of Tureihi, but about the selected book of Tureihi it should be said that one of his sources - if don't say the only source - quoted in the report is the book of *Rawḍat Al-shuhadā'* written by Mulla Hussain Kashefi, and later Fazel Darbandi in *Exir Al-Ebadat fi Asrar Al-Shahadat* added to its distortion. There is

<sup>8</sup> it is something like water-bottle but is made of goat skin

<sup>9</sup> And in some of the compilations of our companions...!

no document in *Rawḍat Al-shuhadā'*, and it is written only in the middle of the report: "The narrator says" (Pishwayee et al., 1393 H.S., 1: 844).

3. The content of this report is also problematic: For example, in a phrase Imam says "O brother! You are standard-bearer. If you leave me, no one would stay with me" and the narrator of this word did not pay attention to the fact that the martyrdom of Abbas ibn Ali - according to what was said in the Maqatels – had been in the day of Ashura (Ibn 'A'tham, 1411 AH, 5: 114-115 and Khwarizmi, 1367, 2: 34-36) and in the afternoon of Ashura there was no army left for Imam to be dispersed after the martyrdom of Abbas ibn Ali (AS). In addition, the companions of Imam Hossein (AS) were those who preferred to stay with him over anything and never were they willing to leave the Imam alone (Pishwayee et al., 1393 H.S. 1: 854).

4- Shaykh Abbas Qomi has mentioned the name of Nawfal Al-Azraq as one of the agents of the martyrdom of Abbas ibn Ali (AS), although none of the ancient and authentic sources have recorded the name of the murderers of Abbas ibn Ali in this name ( Refer to Tabari, ND, 5: 468, and Balādhurī, 1417 AH, 3: 406 and Shaykh Mufid, 1413 AH, 109-110 AH and Abu Al-Faraj Isfahani, ND, 85 and Ibn-Shahr Ashub, 1421 AH, 4: 117 ).

#### 6. *Crying of Umm Al-Banin (AS) and Marwān ibn Ḥakam on Abbas ibn Ali (AS)*

Shaykh Abbas Qomi, after reporting the martyrdom of Abbas ibn Ali (AS), says:

" Abbas ibn Ali (AS) was thirty-four years old at the time of the martyrdom, and his mother Umm Al-Banin went outside Medina in *Baqī'* to mourn for him and his brothers, she was crying so that everyone who passed by would cry. Crying of friends is not wondering, but Marwān ibn Ḥakam, who was the greatest enemy of the Prophet's family, cried out for the crying of Umm Al-Banin. " (Mohaddith Qomi, 1386 HS, 1: 521).

1. This report was first quoted by Abu Al-Faraj Isfahani and has since been published in some books, including Muntahi Al-Amal. Abu Al-Faraj is alone in quoting this report, and although he has brought a correct document for this narrative, but Abd Al-Razaq Mousavi considers the document to be unreliable and fake (refer to. Muqarram, 2012, 344).

2. Umm Al-Banin had learned divine teachings and Islamic customs from Amir Al-Mu'minin, so she never did anything contrary to the law of the Messenger of Allah (PBUH), then she never exposing herself to foreigners and strangers without necessity and she should not let her voice be heard except in urgent cases. When Imam Sajjad (AS) says to Abi Khalid Kabuli who opens the door of house: O Abi Khalid, when a woman of our Ahl Al-Bayt comes out of the house, she does not know that the door of the house has been crooked and properly she should close the door tightly, and it is not nice for the Prophet's daughters to close the door loudly to get attention. Therefore, one who has been educated in the school of Ahl Al-Bayt and has learned their customs and traditions will never give up their way, and yet Umm Al-Banin is not an exception to these kinds of people and one cannot doubt about her and say such a woman like her would give up the divine instructions. (Muqarram, 2012, 345).

3. The deceased Muqarram has doubted whether Umm Al-Banin was alive in 61 AH and he believes that there is no credible reason that Umm Al-Banin was alive in the story of Karbala in 61 AH (Ibid: 343).

4- It is possible that Abu Al-Faraj has made this story by himself to show his ancestor Marwan ibn Hakam as a kind and gracious person (Rafat and Rahman Setayes, 177)

#### 7. *The Martyrdom of Ali Asghar (AS)*

Muhaddith Qomi narrates from Imam Baqir (AS) that "an arrow came down on the throat of Ali Asghar, the little boy of Imam Hossein (AS), then Imam anointed him with his blood (Muhaddith Qomi, 1386 HS, 1: 525) and said:

«اللَّهُمَّ احْكُم بَيْنَنَا وَبَيْنَ قَوْمٍ دَعَوْنَا لِيُنصِرُونَا فَتَقْتُلُونَا»»

1. The phrase "Imam anointed him with his blood" does not exist in *Tarikh Tabari*, but it is said that Imam took his blood and dropped it on the ground when the palm of his two hands was full of blood (Tabari, ND, 5: 448).

2 - In addition to the fact that there is no such phrase in the Tabari book, such a phrase is not found in any of the authentic historical reports, and only in *Tarikh Yaqubi* it has been said that: (*Tarikh Yaqubi*, ND, 2: 245)

«وَجَعَلَ يُلَطِّخُهُ بِدَمِهِ»»

It seems that Shaykh Abbas has quoted and narrated his interpretation of this.

### 8. *The Number of Wounds of Imam Hossein (AS)*

Muhaddith Qomi narrates from Imam Baqir (as): "There were more than three hundred and twenty injuries and more were narrated and all those wounds were in front of Imam" (Muhaddith Qomi, 1386 HS, 1: 530).

1. This narration has been quoted by Shaykh Abbas Qomi from the *Amali* of Shaykh Saduq (Amali, 1417 AH, 228 and Ibn Fetal Neishaburi, 1368 AH, 189) but this narration is in contradiction with another narration of Imam Baqir (AS) in which he declared the number of wounds to be 63 wounds (Kulayni, 1362 A, 6: 459). There are also other narrations that considers the number of the wounds of Imam less than 320, including: Imam Sadiq (AS): 33 spear wounds and 34 sword wounds (Tabari, ND, 5: 453 and Khwarizmi, 1367 HS, 2: 42 and Ibn Nama, 1406 AH, 76) and in another narration, 33 spear wounds and 44 sword wounds (Tamimi Maghrebi, *Sharh Al-Akhbar*, 1409 AH, 3: 164), and another narration says the number of wounds were more than seventy sword blows. (Tusi, 1414 AH, 677) Imam Sajjad (AS): 40 blows of swords, spears and arrows (Tamimi Maghrebi, *Da'aem Al-Islam*, 1379 HS, 2: 154).

2. It is noteworthy that it has been narrated that all of these wounds were in the front part of his body because he did not turn his back against the enemy and did not flee (Majlesi, *Bihar Al-Anwar*, 1403 AH, 45:52) So how it is possible that 320 wounds can be in front part of the body. Oddly enough, some, like Ibn Shahr Ashub, also reported another claim, such as the 1900 wounds (Ibn Shahr Ashub, 1421 AH, 4: 120).

3. The 320 wounds can only be justified by the fact that the number of wounds was not before the martyrdom and during the martyrdom but after ordering the horses to rush on the bodies of the martyrs of Karbala, such injuries could not be avoided and the aforementioned contradiction can be justified.

### 9. *Exaggeration in the Number of those Killed by the Imam (AS)*

Muhaddith Qomi writes: "Ibn Al-Shahr and others have quoted that Imam Hossein (AS) killed one hundred and ninety-five of the enemies except those he had wounded" (Muhaddith Qomi, 1386 HS, 1: 528).

1- Apparently no one did such an exaggeration until the time of Ibn Shahr Ashub, and he was the first one reported such statistics, and Shaykh Abbas quoted them without any judgment or criticism.

2- It should be said that such statistics of the number of those killed by Imam Hossein (AS) are not consistent with sense and reason and are highly exaggerated because due to the military superiority of the enemy troops as well as the limitation of time and lack of performing extraordinary affairs by Imam in Karbala, such a statistic cannot be true.

3. If we calculate the number of dead approximately and if one person was killed by Imam Hossein every minute, then it would take more than 31 hours to kill 1950, which would certainly be more than half a day in Ashura.

### *10. Imam Hussein's (AS) Arrival in the Shari'ah with His Horse and Complimenting the Water to Each Other and Imam's Second Farewell Report*

Muhaddith Qomi quotes: "A'our Salami and Amru ibn Hajjaj, who were watching the Shari'ah with four thousand archer men, shouted to the army that you would not allow Hossein to go to the Shari'ah, Imam attacked them like an angry lion and find his way to the Shari'ah. He turned away from the enemy and rode the horse to the Euphrates, and he was too thirsty, and his horse was also too thirsty; Imam said you are thirsty and I am thirsty. Swear to God that I would not drink water until you drink, as if the horse understood his word so he didn't drink the water, that is to say, I do not overtake you in drinking water, so he said: "I drink the water so drink it. Suddenly an enemy shouted: "Hossein, you are drinking water while the corpse has raped your tent.

Upon hearing the word, Imam didn't drink water and quickly rushed out of the Shari'ah and attacked the army until it reached his own tent and saw no one has disturbed the people of the tent. So he said farewell to the Ahl Al-Bayt (Muhaddith Qomi, 1386 HS, 1: 529).

1. The report was quoted by Ibn shahr Ashub from Abi Mokhannaf and he also quoted it from Joludi who is unknown, although no credible and first-hand sources recorded such a report. But where Ibn Shahr Ashub attributes such a report to Abi Mokhannaf, there is no answer other than that he may have obtained a distorted version of Maqtal Abi Makhnaf which led to this narration (refer to Pishwayee et al., 1393 HS, 1: 869).

2. It is noteworthy that this is also stated in the book attributed to Abu Ishaq Isfara'ini, ND, 66-67), while in none of the earlier sources dealing with biography of Isfara'ini, they have not mentioned such a book in his works (Ibn Kathir, 1408 AH, 12:30 AH and Dhahabī, 1425 AH, 11: 185-187), furthermore his writing style is inconsistent with his contemporary writing (Tabataba'i, 1417 AH, 655). Also Allameh Tabataba'i believes that Maqtal Isfara'ini is full of storytelling and forgeries (Qazi Tabataba'i, 1368 HS, 640).

3. The report stated that four thousand archers were the guardians of the Shari'ah, while Ibn Shahr Ashub's book was alone in giving such statistics and therefore not credible, and on the other hand, many sources cited five hundred men (Tabari, ND, 54: 412 and Balādthurī, 1417 AH, 3: 389 and Shaykh Mufid, 1413 AH, 2: 86, and Ibn Athir, 1408 AH, 2: 556).

4- In this narration, being deceived and ignorant has been attributed to the infallible Imam which is also incompatible with the scientific position of Imam.

5. The remarkable point is that in the midst of a war in which 500 archers are there and there is not enough time to drink water, Imam begins to offer water to his horse while there is water for both and there is no reason for doing this.

6. At the end of the report, he speaks of another farewell for the Imam, while no such report is found in any of the ancient sources, and only Allameh Majlesi reports two farewells for the Imam whose source is also unclear (Majlesi, Jal Al-Oyun, 1362, 373-374) and Shaykh Abbas Qomi has expanded it.

### *11. Looting the Ring of Imam*

Shaykh Abbas writes: "Bajdal ibn Salim cut off the ring with the blessed finger of Imam and stole it" (Muhaddith Qomi, 1386 HS, 1: 531).

1. This report was first quoted by Sayyed Ibn Tawus (1414 AH, 178) and his contemporary Ibn Nama (1406 AH, 76) and they are not seen in any of the Maqatels and sources that Sayyed Ibn Tawus, after

quoting this historical narrative, finally states: "And what we have quoted has been narrated by other narrators. And they quote exactly the same." (Sayyed Ibn Tawus, 1414 AH, 178) But Sayyed does not cite any of the sources that quoted this report.

2- This report contradicts a narration of Imam Sadiq (as) who did not consider the stealing the ring of Imam Hossein (AS) to be correct. According to the narration quoted by Shaykh Saduq, Muhammad ibn Muslim says, "I asked Imam Ja'far Sadiq (AS) who obtained Imam Hossein's ring? And I told him that I had heard that it was stolen among the looted things. Imam Sadiq (AS) said: It is not as they say. Rather, Imam Hossein (AS) gave it to his son, Imam Sajjad (AS), and he himself put his ring on his finger and entrusted him with his work, just as the Prophet (peace be upon him) had entrusted it to Imam Ali (as) and he had entrusted it to Imam Hassan and he to Imam Hossein. Then, after my father's father, the ring was given to my father had given to me, and now it is with me, and I hold it on my finger every Friday and pray with it." (Saduq, 1417 AH, 207-208 and Majlesi, Bihar Al-Anwar, 1403 AH, 46:17.

### *12. Umar Ibn Sa'ad Prevented His Army Attacking the Tent*

Muhaddith Qomi writes: "Hamid ibn Muslem said that we were passing through the tents with Shimr ibn Dhil-Jawshan until we reached Ali ibn Hossein (as). We saw that he was asleep in the severity of the illness, sickness, and disability, and those who were with Shimr asked: Do we kill this patient? I said: Praise be to Allah! How cruel are you guys, do you want to kill this helpless young man? The same disease he has, is enough to kill him; and I have returned their evil from that Imam. Then they brutally took the rug that was under the body of Imam Sajjad (AS) and threw him on the earth. At that time, Umar ibn Sa'ad came, the women of Ahl Al-Bayt (PBUH) gathered around him, shouting at him, and crying hard so that he commanded his companions that no one should enter the women's tent again. And do not disturb that young patient. Ibn Sa'ad said to the army that they give Ahl Al-Bayt whatever they have looted, swear by God that no one has followed his order and rejected to give back anything. So Ibn Sa'ad ordered a group to protect the tents so that no women would go out the tent and the army would not attack them. » (Muhaddith Qomi, 1386 HS, 1: 540).

«من يتندب للحسين؟!»

1-The narrator of the report is Hamid Ibn Muslem, he himself was one of those in the army of Ibn Sa'ad, so it is possible he has made such a report in order to clear his sin and to some extent the sin of Ibn Sa'ad.

2- Ibn Sa'ad's behavior in protecting the tents and preventing the attack to the tents are in contradiction with other positions of Umar Ibn Sa'ad in Karbala, including that in his report after appointing some to protect the tents, he ordered Horse riding on Imam Hussain's body!

3. Umar Ibn Sa'ad was the commander of the army, how could his troops have attacked the tents without his permission? Or how can anyone take advantage of what has been looted, when Umar prevented them?! Unless, say, Umar Sa'ad did not intend to issue such a decree seriously, this seems unlikely too.

### **Conclusion**

1- Although Shaykh Abbas Qomi has written Muntahi Al-Amal in the last years of his life, and has criticized some reports, but sometimes weak reports are also found in his book.

2- Use of Nourah by Imam at the dawn of Ashura, the martyrdom of a person named Wahab Ibn Abdullah, the martyrdom of a young man whose father was killed, a report of the martyrdom of Ali Akbar (AS), the famous report of how Abbas Ibn Ali (AS) went to battlefield, and the crying of Umm Al-Banin (as) and Marwan Ibn Hakam on Abbas Ibn Ali (AS), how Imam Hossein (AS) anointed Ali Asghar (AS) with his throat blood, exaggeration in the number of wounds of Imam Hossein (AS), how Imam Hossein (AS) entered the Shari'ah with his horse and complimenting water to each other and the report of the second farewell of the Imam, the exaggeration of those killed by the Imam, the looting of the Imam's ring,

how Umar ibn Sa'ad prevented his corps from invading the tents are some of the weak reports of Ashura in the book *Muntahi Al-Amal*.

These reports, besides not being quoted in authentic sources, have the following problems: the presence of a weak narrator, correction in the context of narrative, confusion and anxiety and confusion in some reports, reporting from invalid books, misinterpretations of texts, exaggeration in some reports and incompatibility with wisdom, sense, correct historical and literary texts and the scientific position of Imam Hossein (AS).

### **References**

- Abu Al-Faraj Isfahani. ND. *Maqatel Al-Talebin*, Research: Sayyed Ahmad Saqar, Beirut, Dar Al-Maarefah.
- Balādhurī, Ahmad Ibn Yahya Al-Jaber. 1417 AH. *Anasab Al-Ashraf*, Research: Soheil Zakar and Riyadh Zarkeli, Beirut, Dar Al-Fekr.
- Dhahabī, Shams Al-Din Muhammad ibn Ahmed. 1425 AH. *Seyr Al-Aalam Al-Nobala'a*, Research: Mustafa Abdul Qader Atta, Beirut, Dar Al-Kutub Al-Elmyah.
- Dinouri, Ibn Al-Qatibah. 1371 HS. *Al-Imamah wa Al-Syasa Al-Oruf be Al-Tarikh Al-Kholafa*, Research: Ali Shiri, Qom, Al-Sharif Al-Razi Publications.
- Erbeli, Ali ibn Isa. 1405 AH. *Kashf Al-Ghamah fi Maarefah Al-Ummah*, Beirut, Dar Al-Azwa, Second Edition.
- Ibn 'Abd Rabbih, Ahmad Ibn Muhammad Ibn 'Abd Rabbih Andalusia. 1409 AH. *Al-Aqd Al-Farid*, Research: Ali Shiri, Beirut, Dar Ihya Al-Torath Al-Arabi.
- Ibn Asakir, Abu Al-Qasim Ali ibn Al-Hasan ibn Hibat Allah ibn `Abd Allah Shafe'i. 1421 AH. *The History of Damascus the Great*, Research: Ali Ashour Al-Jonoubi, Beirut, Dar Ihya Al-Torath Al-Arabi.
- Ibn A'tham, Abū Muḥammad Aḥmad ibn A'tham. 1411 AH. *Kitāb Al-Futūḥ*, Research: Ali Shiri, Beirut, Dar Al-Azwa.
- Ibn Athir, Ali Al-Muhammad Sheibani Jazari. 1408 AH. *Al-Kamel fi Al-Tarikh*, Research: Al-Maktabah Al-Torath, Beirut, Dar Ihya Al-Torath Al-Arabi, Fourth Edition.
- Ibn Fatal Neyshabouri. 1368 HS. *Rawza Al-Waezin*, Qom, Sharif Razi Publications.
- Ibn Hajar. 1415 AH. *Taqrib Al-Tahdhib*, Research: Mustafa Abdul Qader Atta, Beirut, Dar Al-Kutub Al-Elmyah.
- 1404 AH. *Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib*, Beirut, Dar Al-Fekr let-Tebaah wan-Nashr wat-Tawzia.
- Ibn Kathir, Abu Al-Fadaa Ismail, 1408 AH. *Al-Bedayah Al-Nahayah*, Research: Ali Shiri, Beirut, Dar Ihya Al-Torath Al-Arabi.
- 1376 H.S. *Al-Nihayah fi Gharib Al-Hadith wa Al-Athar*, Research: Taher Ahmad Al-Zawari and Mahmoud Mohammad Al-Tanahi, Qom, Ismaili, Fourth Edition.
- Ibn Nama Heli, Najm Al-Din Ja'far ibn Muhammad. 1406 AH. *Mathir Al-Ahzan*, Research: Imam Al-Mahdi School, Qom, Imam Al-Mahdi School, Third Edition.
- Ibn Shahr Ashub, Abu Ja'far Muhammad ibn Ali. 1421 AH. *Manaqeb Al Abi Talib*, Research: Yusuf Al-Baqai, Zawi Al-Qorba Publications.
- Isfara'ini, Abu Ishaq Ibrahim ibn Mohammad Shafe'i Ashari. ND. *Nour Al-Ayn fi Mashhad Al-Hossein*, Beirut, Maktaba Al-Taawon.
- Kamal Al-Din Mohammad ibn Talha. 1420 AH. *Mataleb Al-Sooul fi Manaqeb Al Al-Rasul*, Research: Majed ibn Ahmad Atiyah, Beirut, Umm Al-Qura Institute.
- Khwarizmi, Abu Al-Mo'ayed ibn Ahmad Makki. 1367 AH. *Maqtal Al-Hossein*, Research: Mohammad Samawi, Najaf, Matbaah Al-Zahra.
- Kulayni, Abu Ja'far Mohammad ibn Yaqoub. 1362 HS. *Al-Foroua min Al-Kafi*, Corrected by: Ali Akbar Ghaffari, Tehran, Dar Al-Kutub Al-Islamiyah, Second Edition.

- Majlesi, Mohammad Baqir. 1403 AH. Bihar Al-Anwar, Beirut, Al-Wafa Institute, Second Edition. ----- . 1362 HS. Jala Al-Oyoun, Tehran, Rashidi Publications.
- Miskawayh, Abu Ali Razi. 1379 Hs. Tajareb Al-Omam, Research: Abu Al-Qasem Imami, Tehran, Soroush, Second Edition.
- Moqarram, Abd Al-Razaq Mousavi. 2012 AD. Maqatal Al-Hossein, Qom, Al-Sharif Al-Razi.
- Mufid, Abu Abdullah Muhammad ibn Muhammad ibn Naaman Al-Akbari. 1413 AH. Al-Irshad fi Maarefah Hojajollah Ala Al-Ibad, Research: Institute of Al Al-bayt, Qom, Al-Mu'tamar Al-Alamy Le Alfiyah Al-Shaykh Al-Mufid.
- Pishwayee, Mahdi and a group of historians, 1393 HS. The history of the uprising and maqtAl-i jāmi'-i Sayyid Al-Shuhadā', Qom, Imam Khomeini Educational and Research Institute Publications.
- Qazi Tabataba'i, Sayyed Mohammad Ali. 1368 HS. Investigating the First Arbaeen of Sayyed Al-Shuhada, Qom. Martyr Ayatollah Qazi Tabataba'i Foundation.
- Qomi, Shaykh Abbas. 1386 HS. Muntahi Al-'Amal fi Tawarikh Al-Nabi wa Al, Qom, Nasim Hayat, Fourth Edition. -----, 1405 AH. Nafas Al-Mahmum fi Mosibah Sayyedena Al-Hussain Al-Mazlum, Research: Reza Ostadi, Qom, Insight School.
- Rafat, Mohsen and Mohammad Kazem Rahman Setayesh, ND. "The Ash'urayee Traditions of Maqatel Al-Talebin Abu Al-Faraj Isfahani in Critique", Journal of Hadith Sciences, Year 20, Issue 2, 160-189.
- Saduq, Mohammad ibn Ali ibn Hossein. 1417 AH. Al-Amali, Research: Qasam Al-Derasat Al-Islamiyah Institute Al-Bitha, Qom, Al-Bitha Institute.
- Sayyed Ibn Tawus, Ali ibn Musa ibn Ja'far. 1414 AH. Al-Luhuf 'ala qatlay al-tufuf, Research: Fars Tabrizian, Dar Al-Oswah Let-Teba'a wa Al-Nashr.
- Shams Al-Din, Mohammad Mahdi. 1364 H.S. Ansar Al-Hossein (AS), Translated by: Nasser Hashemzadeh, Tehran. Amir Kabir.
- Shoostari, Mohammad Taghi, 1422 AH. Qamus Al-Rejal, Research: Al-Nashr Al-Islami Institute, Qom, Al-Nashr Al-Islami Institute Printing House.
- Tabari, Abu Ja'far Mohammad ibn Jorayr. ND. Tarikh Al-Omam wa Al-Muluk, Research: Muhammad Abulfazl Ibrahim, Beirut, Rawaeh Al-Torath Al-Arabi.
- Tabataba'i, Sayyad Abdul Aziz, 1417 AH. Ahl Al-Bayt fi Al-Maktaba Al-Arabiya, Qom, Al-Bayt Institute le Ihya Al-Torath.
- Tamimi Maghrebi, Abu Hanifah Naaman ibn Mohammad. 1409 to 1412 AH. Sharh Al- Akhbar fi Fazael Al-A'emeh Al-Athar, Research: Sayyed Mohammad Hosseini Jalali, Qom, Al-Nashr Al-Islamiyah Institute. ----- . 1379 HS. Da'aem Al-Islam wa Zikr Al-Halal and Al-Haram wa Al-Qazaya wa Al-Ahkam, Research: Asif Ibn Ali Asghar Feizi, Cairo, Dar Al-Maaref.
- Tusi, Abu Ja'far Muhammad ibn Hassan ibn Ali. 1414 AH Al-Amali, Research: Qasam Al-Derasat Al-Islami Institute, Qom. Dar Al-Theqafah.
- Ya'qubi, Ahmad ibn Abi Ya'qub ibn Ja'far. ND. Tarikh Ya'qubi, Beirut, Dar Sadr.

## Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).