



The Review of the Proposed Words of James Bellamy in Verse 52 of Surah Hajj and Verse 32 of Surah 'Abasa

Robab Shahmoradi*¹; Seyyed Majid Nabavi²

¹ Undergraduate Student, Al-Zahra University, Iran

² Quran and Hadith Sciences, University of Quranic Sciences and Teachings, Iran

* shahmoradi.robab@yahoo.com

<http://dx.doi.org/10.18415/ijmmu.v6i3.862>

Abstract

James Andrew Bellamy is an American orientalist and professor at the University of Michigan, who has conducted some research about the holy Qur'an. In his research, he assumed Quran as an old manuscript and, by presenting several articles, he has criticized and studied several Quranic words. He believes that Qur'an has been altered and changed; therefore, it is necessary to correct these mistakes by examining the content of Qur'anic verses and surahs. In some of his articles, he considers some of the words of Qur'an as changed words and gives the correct word instead. The following article reviews and criticizes the words proposed by James Bellamy about the word "تعنى¹" in verse 52 of *Surah al-Hajj* and also the word "أبا²" in verse 32 of *Surah al-'Abasa*.

Keywords: Qur'an; James Bellamy; Reformation; Tamanna, Aba

Introduction

The Holy Qur'an, the immortal miracle of the Holy Prophet (pbuh), has attracted the attention of scientists, scholars, literates and orientalists since the devolution. In recent centuries, the orientalists have studied the culture of the East, especially the holy Qur'an, with various motives. Some were driven by the evangelical and critical motivation, some with colonial motivation and some with a scientific motivation to study the East and Islamic culture scientifically. One of the Orientalists who has done some research on the Qur'an is James Bellamy. He is a professor at the University of Michigan in the United States who has conducted some research in the field of Quran studies. He believes that some of the Qur'anic words have been modified and changed due to the neglect of the scribes when writing. James Bellamy, while listing these words, tries to suggest new vocabulary instead of those words, which, in spite of having a new meaning, is also consistent with the meaning of the verses. In his articles, he used the term "critique of text" in three meanings: "correcting the errors of texts" ", "the science of detecting the error" and "the art of detecting the error and the art of eliminating it" and he considers "the critique of the text" including the

¹ spells: "tamanna" and means: "wish"

² spells: "aba" and means: "fodder"

three stages of achieving an initial text, and then evaluating the text, and ultimately correcting the mistakes.

In the same way, Bellamy criticizes the text of the holy Qur'an and examines the possibility of mistaking some of the words in the Quran. And he introduces the following as the basis for his work: 1) the clear meaning of the commentary proposed by the corrector in comparison to our text. 2) The corrected meaning that should be in accordance with the style of the Qur'an; 3) it should also be justified in terms of orthography; 4) it should be possible to show how the initial deviation of the text has occurred. In his article, he cites about 30 cases about these mistakes in the Qur'an, and he explains why these words are wrong.

The remarkable point in James Bellamy's articles is that he has made a mistake in selecting the manuscript that has been criticized, and has also made the wrong path due to not being familiar with the principles and rules of edit. Because this discussion is not a new issue, but it has rules and regulations that Muslim scholars have focused on for a long time and they have defined its limits.

Of course, it should be noted that Bellamy's view also has a fundamental difference with the differences of recitations that Muslims believe in. Because in the difference of recitations of a word, its meaning is constant, and there is only a difference in writing, which is often due to the difference in dialects.

It should be mentioned that the idea of correcting the text of Qur'an is innovated by him, and before him, no one has mentioned the accusation of the mistake of scribes and abrogators of the first revelation. The historical background of this theme is about the nineteenth century, and it has a strangeness and freshness.

Bellamy offers some suggestions for the Qur'anic words in the verses 52 of Hajj and 32 of Abasa, which will be further discussed and criticized.

Background

So far, several articles have been published on some comments of James Bellamy that are being introduced.

1. Morteza Kariminia (translator), the language of Qur'an, the interpretation of Qur'an: the articles on Qur'anic studies of the West (John Wansbrough, Andrew Rippin, Herbert Berg, Harald Motzki, Uri Rubin, François Doblove, James Bellamy), Hermes Publications, 2012, p 426.
2. Abdol Hadi Fiqahi Zadeh; Hesam Emami Danaloo; the proposed inaccurate and non-scholarly "patent"; Summer and Spring 2014; The Bulletin of Interpretation and Language of the Quran.
3. Seyyed Babak Farzaneh, the affection of Hell, the Semantic Survey of the word "حصب³" in the Quran, two journals of the historical studies of Quran and hadith (the ex Sahifeh Mobin), No. 49, Spring and Summer 2011, p. 99-112.
4. Mohammad Javad Eskandarloo, Mohammad Meqdad Amiri, Reviewing and criticizing the claims of James A. Bellamy regarding the correction of the word "الرقيم⁴" in the ninth verse of the Surah al-Kahf, two Oriental Quranic Journals, number 10- Spring and summer of 2011
5. The Methodology of Text Criticism in Quranic Studies by Orientalists (Describe, Explain and Critique), Ph.D., 2017, Field: Theology and Islamic Education - Quran and Hadith Sciences, Author: Nafiseh Amiri Dumari, Supervisor: Jafar Nekounam, Advisor Professor: Mohammad Taghi Diyari Bidgoli, University of Qom, Faculty of Theology and Islamic Studies.

³ spelled: hasb, meaning: affection

⁴ Al-Raqim

The introduction of James Bellamy

James Andrew Bellamy was born on August 12, 1925 in Anzville, Indiana, USA. In 1946, he received a Bachelor of Arts degree from the Center College. From 1951 to 1953, he studied at the University of Pennsylvania using the Harrison Scholarship, and in 1953 and 1954, he studied with the Ford Foundation Scholarship, and in 1956 he was succeeded to obtain a doctorate degree in Eastern Studies. In 1956 and 1957 he became the temporary Arabic instructor at Pennsylvania University, in 1958 and 1959, he was the Assistant Professor at Vienna State University, in 1959-1960 he was the instructor at Michigan University in the city of Ann Arbor, since 1960 to 1964 he was the Assistant Professor and since 1964 to 1968 he became an Associate Professor, and then became a Professor (Hasan Rezaie Haftadar), Biologist of some Orientalists and their works, Quranic studies of Orientalists - No. 8 -Spring and Summer of 2010, Mr. Hassan Rezaei introduces Bellamy in issue No. 13).

Some of his works include:

1. Al-Raqim or al-raqud? A note on Surah 18: 9. Journal of the American Oriental Society 111i (1991) pp. 115-117.
2. Fa-Ummuhu Hawiyah a note on Surah 101: 9. Journal of American Oriental Society 112iii (1992) pp. 485-487.
3. "The Mysterious Letters of the Koran: Old Abbreviations of the Basmalah." Journal of the American Oriental Society. 93 (3): 267-285. Jul-Sep 1973. doi: 10.2307 / 599460.
4. "Some Proposed Emendations to the Text of the Koran". Journal of the American Oriental Society. 113 (4): 562-573. Oct-Dec 1993. doi: 10.2307 / 606724.
5. "More Proposed Emendations to the Text of the Koran". Journal of the American Oriental Society. 116 (2): 196-204. Apr-Jun 1996. doi: 10.2307 / 606724.
6. "Textual Criticism of the Koran". Journal of the American Oriental Society. 121 (1): 1-6. Jan-Mar 2001. doi: 10.2307 / 605695.
7. "A Further Note is On". Journal of the American Oriental Society. 122 (3): 1-6. Jul-Sep 2002. doi: 10.2307 / 3087526. (Subscription required (help)).
8. McAuliffe, Jane Dammen, ed. (2006). "Textual Criticism of the Qur'ān". Encyclopedia of the Qur'ān. 5. Brill. pp. 237-252.

Reviewing the opinions of Bellamy on the word "تمنى" and "أبا"

In his articles, James Bellamy seeks to prove that some of the Qur'anic words have been altered and edited when copying and writing. He believes that in verse 52 of surah Hajj, the word "يملى" has been transformed and has been recorded as "تمنى" due to neglect of the scribe and the slip of his pen. He explains the problem in this way: "the word "تمنى" means "to wish" that does not have the correct meaning in the nominal and verbal form. But the expected meaning in the verse is memory-based reading. "

James describes the incident of editing as follows: "The new definition of "تمنى" is true, and we modify "تمنى" to "يملى" and "امنيته" to "املاه", which means "commands" and "in its command", the last word is originally written as "ملاه" without the letter "الف" for "أ". Similar to the word "مثالى", "ن" is written instead of "ل" because it is very short. One of the components is also missing. After "يملى" was distorted with "تمنى", "امنيته" was inevitable."(Some Proposed Emendations to the Text of the Koran." Journal of the American Oriental Society)

Then, in order to prove his claim, he refers to verse 78 of Surah Al-Baqarah and states: In the verse "وَمَنْهُمْ أُمِّيُونَ لَا يَعْلَمُونَ الْكِتَابَ إِلَّا أَمَانِيَّ وَإِنْ هُمْ إِلَّا يَظُنُّونَ" if we take the meaning of "اماني" as "dreams", the concept of verse would not be correct because the translation of the verse will be as follows:

"و منهم أميون لا يعلمون الكتب إلا أمانى وإن هم إلا يظنون"

(That is, some uneducated people who do not know the Heavenly Book of (Torah)

(Among them there are some "أميون", who consider the Heavenly Book nothing but vain hopes and they just suppose. (Some Proposed Emendations to the Text of the Koran ". Journal of the American Oriental Society)

In another part of his article, Bellamy examines the word "ابا" in verse 31 of Surah Abasa, and states that "ابا" doesn't have the true concept in the verse, and therefore the commentators have encountered a problem in the interpretation of this verse, so he modifies this word to "لبا" because he imagines that in this way, the meaning of the verse will be understood by this change. He again rebukes the mistake to the scribes and says: The writer of the revelation has been drowned in his dreams when writing, and he has written "الف" instead of the word "لام" and he has stopped on the letter "ب", he has translated "لبا" as the many blessings of Allah that have been granted to human beings and he emphasizes that this new word is more relevant to the register of the verse. (Some Proposed Emendations to the Text of the Koran. "Journal of the American Oriental Society)

An overall critique to the viewpoint of Bellamy

At first, we review the overall critique of Bellamy's viewpoint then we criticize his proposed words.

The writer of the article considers the Qur'an as an old manuscript, in which some mistakes have been occurred during its writing, and he has therefore sought to modify it after expressing the changes.

His views can be examined and criticized from several perspectives that we will discuss in more detail. First of all, it is necessary to recall that the Quran is not an old manuscript, but it is the eternal miracle of the Prophet Muhammad peace be upon him, which has been extraordinarily protected from distortion. God has explicitly referred to this protection in some of the verses of the holy Quran such as:

"إِنَّا نَحْنُ نَزَّلْنَا الذِّكْرَ وَإِنَّا لَهُ لَحَافِظُونَ"

"We have revealed this Qur'an ourselves and we will surely be its guardian" (Hijr /9)

His views can be examined and criticized from several points of view, which will be discussed below. We read in verse 41 of surah Fussilat: "Those who reject the Reminder, [The Holy Qur'an] when it came to them, they should know that it is The Book of Exalted Power in Knowledge and Wisdom. No falsehood finds way to it neither in Present nor in future; and its descending is by the Source-Wisdom Commander Of goodness."

Because descending from the honorable leads to "honor" and descending from the "wise" leads to wisdom and descending from "the adorable" leads to adoration, and the distorted Book does not have any of these three outstanding qualities. (Javadi Amoli, 2009, p. 334)

The rational reasons also indicate that if the Qur'an, which is the cause of guidance, itself be distorted, it will cause a deviation of the people and a violation of the will. (Mesbah Yazdi, 2013, v. 1, p. 318)

Other rational and traditional reasons have been presented in the theological and commentary books on this subject, which will prolong the discourse in this position.

Also, by looking at the history of the early days of Islam and the amount of efforts of the Prophet and the Companions to protect the Qur'anic position, all doubts about the occurrence of distortions in the Qur'an are completely canceled. The existence of a large number of readers and keepers of Quran at the beginning of Islam confirms the special position of the Quran in the presence of Muslims and protects every word of divine verses. History testifies that the oral repetition of the Qur'an has always taken precedence over its manuscript. Mahmoud Ramyar wrote in the footnote of the book "On the eve of the Qur'an" that: at the beginning of the revelation and Islam, the holy Quran relied on memorization. That is,

the Muslims preserved the Qur'an verse by verse and surah by surah as they were taught by the teacher. Each teacher had been taught by the previous teacher and he had learnt a reading, then he taught whatever he had learnt to the next generation, verbally without changing the vowels and consonants of the word. This training continued from a generations to the next generations, and the manuscript that exists, only confirmed this memorization and that was all. Writing was only a companion for memorizing and nothing more. People only rely on memory and did not need to writing. (Blachère, translated by Mahmoud Ramyar, 1995, p. 17)

In addition to the above mentioned materials about the Quran and its non-distortion, it is necessary to say that the probability of edit and change in writing of the Quran, with the presence of countless memorizers and readers, is very poor. Because the discussed surah is meccan and the meccan surahs have been descended long time ago, and in the life of the holy Prophet (peace be upon him), it has been read by him and his companions many times. And if its manuscript was edited, it was corrected by the Prophet with oral repetition and frequent reading of verses.

It should be noted that assuming some words of the verses of the holy Qur'an have been edited, it should be corrected by observing the rules of the correction of the texts. The following is briefly referred to these rules.

Jouya Jahanbakhsh writes in the article on the rules of correcting the texts:

“Knowledge and technique of correcting the texts are a class of information and methods, whose purpose is to adjust and apply it to each text, to bring text closer to the original text, which has been produced by the author's pen. Therefore, contrary to the thoughts or actions of some, "corrector" is not the scientific editor of the text or its author. That is, if in an old text there are some content mistakes that have come from the author himself; he has no right to seize it. Corrector to do this should investigate the entire life of a document since the time of the emergence of the original work to its last version, from different aspects, such as the social environment of its emergence, the intellectual, social and political space of that period, as well as the status of the life of the author and his collaborators or text distorters. (Jahanbakhsh, Journal of Research and Technology, No. 10, Summer 2003).

At the same time, Bellamy's work can be criticized as follows:

First of all, if he had little information about the date of the decline of writing and memorizing the holy Qur'an by the companions, he would not concluded that the writer of the revelation has written the word "تَمَنِي" in a wrong way due to the slippage of the pen because the writer of the revelation was not a single particular person that writes and others memorize the Quran by this text, but the Quran was based on memory due to the oral repetition, and the writers of revelation, who were reliable companions of the Prophet, had been writing the revelation under his supervision.

Secondly, Bellamy should provide some information to the reader about who carried out the distortion and what the reason was and why the distortion occurred and what motives the distortions had. Because knowing the motive of distortion can help us to get the right text.

In the other part of the rules of correcting the text, it is stated that: various elements must be involved in the correction of the texts. 1) Materials and resources; 2) competence and livelihood of the corrector. (Jahanbakhsh, Journal of Research and Technology, No. 10, summer 2003, same).

At this point, we also recall that it was necessary for Bellamy to refer to the first-hand sources of interpretive and narrative texts, to find the glory of the words used in the verses and the harmony of the meaning of these words. Bellamy has judged so because he is unaware of the position and dignity of each word of Quran in the verses; the old scholars of the science of expression state that "if a word is taken from the Qur'an and you seek the entire Arabic language to find its equivalent or better than it to replace with the original word, you will never be able to do it."

There is an extraordinary harmony among the words, and the eloquence of the Qur'anic words will disable the wisdom of mankind. (Mohammad Hadi Ma'refat, 1426 AH, v. 2, p. 197).

Also, the corrector should be competent and deserved in correcting the text. It would seem that if there was a need to correct a word, it would have to be done by eloquent and fluent people on the island

of al-Arab. Because they were the most familiar people to eloquence and fluency, and the same eloquence and rhetoric of the Qur'an was confirmed by them, and even made some of them Muslims. It would seem that if there was a need for a change in Qur'anic words and some corrections should be made, this task would have to be carried out by such great people as Walid ibn Mughīrah and other Arab linguists, not one who is not fully acquainted with Arabic language and he has become familiar with this language educationally. Since one of the other characteristics of the corrector is that he should be specialized in the language of the text that he wants to correct, as if it is his native language, and he must be famous in mastering the rules and details of that language.

It is apparent from Bellamy's suggestion that he had not been even aware of the translation of some of the words he corrected, since these words were used in Arabic poetry in the same sense as used in the Qur'an, and the great Arabic writers, such as Amir al Mōemenin, Ali (peace be upon him), who have fully understood that word and its meaning, have not referred to it in the traditions. "Bellamy" in correcting the text of the Qur'an has not even followed the principles and rules for reviewing the linear texts and he has suggested words by speculation.

Investigating the words "بأ" and "بئني" in interpretive sources

The holy surah Hajj is the twenty-second surah that has been revealed to the Holy Prophet (peace be upon him). This surah has 78 verses. There is a controversy among the commentators on whether it is meccan or medinan. Some believe the entire surah is meccan. (Abdul Azim Haghani, 2004, vol. 1, p. 539), and some believe that part of this surah is meccan including Ibn Sa'd in al-Tabaqat al-aqbar and Ibn Salam in Al-Nasikh and al-Mansukh in the book of Allah, the almighty, and Ibn Adel in al-Bab in the science of book. However, most Islamic scholars such as Ibn al-Arabi Maliki, in the verdicts of Quran and Ibn Atiyah in Al-Muharrar al-Wajiz, in the interpretation of the Precious Book and Abu al-Fotouh Razi in Rawz al-Jānān and Roh al- Jānān to interpret the Quran, they all consider verse 52 of surah Hajj meccan.

Surah Hajj begins with mentioning the greatness of the Day of Judgment and drawing the horrible scene of it, and then it discusses the attributes and destiny of the believers and unbelievers, their characteristics, hajj and its precepts, jihad and the preservation of the religious community and the denial of the previous prophets, and ultimately it ends with the discussions of the revelation and the resurrection and the invitation to help God and listen to the parables.

In verse 52 of this surah addressing the Prophet, God refers to the obstacles Satan creates in the way of inviting Prophets and the great prophet of Islam through his agents, the barriers that were broken with the Divine Supports and the Prophet's wisdom (PBUH) and did not result.

The holy verse says:

«وَمَا أَرْسَلْنَا مِنْ قَبْلِكَ مِنْ رَسُولٍ وَلَا نَبِيٍّ إِلَّا إِذَا تَمَنَّى أَلْقَى الشَّيْطَانُ فِي أُمْنِيَّتِهِ فَيَنسَخُ اللَّهُ مَا يُلْقِي الشَّيْطَانُ»

Without any exception those Emissaries And Messengers that We sent before You while receiving the Divine Revelations [if any thought came to Their mind] Satan made an alluring Suggestion related to that thought; but Allah through the Embracing Knowledge [realizes the Satanic Interference] and blots out what The devil has cast; and then makes His Messages and Decrees firm and sound. And Allah is the Knowing Decreeer. (Hajj/52)

Concerning the meaning of the word "امنيته"⁵, there are two possibilities in this verse, which based on both possibilities, the correct meaning of the verse is obtained.

The first possibility is that the concept of "امنيته" is assuming and taking into account the imaginary shapes of things that are desirable and relevant to the future. The return of this concept to the original root of تمنى, has been taken from "مني", which essentially means fate and dream and suppose. Therefore, possibly, the concept of the verse is that: the imaginations and aspirations such as the victory

⁵ security

of religion, confrontation and beliefs of the people towards it have been in the mind of the Prophet (pbuh), and Satan hindered the realization of those aspirations by tempting the people, provoking the cruelty, deceiving the corruptors and some ways like that, and through these ways he disturbed the attempts of people.

The second possibility is that "امنيته" means reading and reciting. Considering this possibility, the translation of the verse is as follows: when all the prophets were reciting their words to the people, the devil, especially the humanly devil, induced in their words and told something to divert public opinion and to neutralize its guiding effects. (Tabatabai, 2011, v. 13, p. 391)

There are different views on the meaning of the word "تمني" "في امنيته" in the discussed verse and throughout the Qur'an. The author of the book, «the aspects and shapes of the words of the almighty God's Book⁶», writes: This word has four meanings: 1) False Hadiths; 2) Wish; 3) Reading and Reciting; 4) Question. In verse 14 of Surah al-Hadid, it has been applied in the first meaning and in in verse 123 of Surah al-Baqarah, it has been applied in the meaning of greed and wish and in verse 52 of surah hajj, it means reading and in verse 111 of Surah al-Baqarah, it has been applied in the meaning of question.

Dictionaries have mentioned two meanings for this word. 1) to reading 2) to wish (Farahidi, undated, v. 8, p. 391, Tarihi, 1996, v. 1, p. 400, Ghorashi, 1992, v. 6, p. 297, Darwish, v. 6, p. 462). In explaining this two meanings, he writes: Using this word means recitation and reading at the beginning of Islam and during the revelation of the Qur'an. In confirming the meaning of recite for the word "تمني", he refers to the poem of Hesan ibn Sabet, in which he has said:

تمني كتاب الله اول ليله و آخره لافي حمام المقادر

He read the book of God at the beginning of night and he met the death at the end of night. Then he says that this word has other assumed meanings, such as to wish, to soliloquize and to ask, which is also used so in the Quranic verses.

The commentators have expressed the meaning of reading and reciting in their commentaries and have also expressed Hesan's poem as an approval for this translation (Suyuti, 1404 AH, v. 4, p. 368, Tusi, undated, p. 82, Baqa'i, 1427 AH, v. 5, p. 164, Sayyid Qutb, 1425 AH, v. 4, p. 2432, Matrudi, 1426 AH, v. 7, p. 432, Nahas, 1421 AH, v. 5, p. 57)

In Tafsir al-Kabir, in the explanation of this meaning, it has been stated that: in the word, "تمني" has been used in two meanings: first, to wish and the second meaning, to read and recite. In verse 78 of surah al-Baqara, the word "اماني" has been also translated "to read" and he says that an uneducated person knows nothing from the Quran other than reading, and when he comes to the verse of torture, he wishes to be safe and, when he comes to the verse of mercy, he wishes to achieve it. He continues to refer to Hesan's poem to confirm this meaning, and he considers that poem as the reason for this meaning.

However, some other commentators have chosen the second meaning and believe that "تمني" has two principles and they believe that the meaning "to wish" is more appropriate in this verse. Ibn Abbas and Sakaki and Farra, believe that "تمني" refers to the soliloquy and the heart's wish⁷ (Farra, 1980, v. 2, p. 229, Shabr, 1410, p. 328, Tabarsi, 1996, v. 4, p. 220, Tabatabai, 2011, v. 14, p. 391, encyclopedia, center of culture and education of Qur'an, 2003, v. 1, p. 180, Fazlollah, 1419, v. 16, p. 100, Makarem Shirazi, 1992, v. 14, p. 139).

We can criticize Bellamy's views as follows: When Arabic commentators and speakers define the word "تمني" as reading and reciting, and express this meaning is widespread in Arabic, is it necessary that they, with much difficulty and abundant justifications, consider this word as a changed word and suggest a word that has the same meaning as the word "تمني"? Does Bellamy mean anything other than memorizing and reading? Although this word carries this meaning, without the need for a change in the structure of the word and accusing the writer for wrong script and the distortion of the Quran.

⁶ الوجوه و النظائر لالفاظ كتاب الله العزيز

⁷ manmarziyaan

The second word that Bellamy suggests to correct is related to the word "ابأ" in verse 31 of Surah Abasa, with a view to the interpretation of this verse and examining the meanings of this word, we can find out that the viewpoint of Bellamy is void.

From verse 24 to verse 32, Allah mentions the blessings He has granted to human beings and in verse 31 He states that we gave "فاكهه" and "ابأ" as a commodity for you and for your cattle. Almost all Arab commentators and scholars believe that "فاكهه" means "fruit", but in the meaning of the word "ابأ", some of the commentators believe that there is a complexity in the translation of this word, and documented this issue to a narrative that has been narrated by Anas ibn Malik. In this narrative it has been said that Omar was unable to interpret and translate this word and let God translate it. (Tabari, 1412 AH, v. 30, p. 39, Maturidi, 1426 AH, v. 1, p. 218, Suyuti, 1404 AH, v. 6, p. 317, Alusi, 1415 AH, v. 15, p. 250, Ibn Ashoor, 1420 AH, v. 30, p. 117).

Other narratives have also been mentioned that Abu Bakr also refused to translate the word "ابأ" for the same reason. Most of the narratives mention the ignorance of these two in the translation of this word. Commentators, by expressing such traditions, aim to attribute virtue to these two, and to depict their avoidance from the interpretation based on one's own opinion. Most commentators, after expressing these narratives, have blamed the interpretation based on one's own opinion.

Tabarani writes in the introduction of his commentary: "It is not necessary for the Arabs to be aware of all the words and their translations, because of the Arabic language of the Qur'an, and that they should have knowledge about it, but a brief knowledge is also sufficient." Because the detailed knowledge to the Qur'an requires a great knowledge. Therefore, the Companions had knowledge to the Qur'an based on their differences in knowledge and their cleverness towards the Qur'an. Tabarani further notes that Omar was unable to translate the word "ابأ" although he was one of the Companions and his language was Arabic. (Tabarani, 2008, v. 1, p. 42)

Most of the commentators, including Shia and Sunni, after expressing this verse, have mentioned many traditions from elders and companions in the translation of this verse. (San'ani, 1411 AH, v. 2, p. 283, Tabari, 1412 AH, v. 30, p. 39)

Allameh Tabatabai says: "أَب" means a dried grass that herbivores eat. He further states that in the book "al-Irshad" by Sheikh Mofid, it has been narrated that a person asked Abu Bakr about the word of Allah, the Almighty: "فاكهه" and "ابأ": Abu Bakr did not know the meaning of the Quranic word "اب" and replied, "Which sky And which land will shelter me and what kind of earth I will be damned if I say something about the Qur'an that I do not know about it. But we all know the word "فاكهه" but I do not know the word "اب", God knows.

This message came to Amir al Moemenin Ali (peace be upon him) and he said: How doesn't he know that the word "اب" means grass and graze? And that the almighty God, in this verse, wants to show off the blessings He has granted to His creatures, including their own food and their livestock's food, through which their soul survive and their bodies will be powerful. (Tabatabai, 2011, v. 20, p. 211)

Mr. Ghorashi, a contemporary commentator and linguist, says: "All dictionaries means this word as a pasture that is ready for grazing. Aqrab al-Mawared has said: "اب" is the grass that livestock eat and this definition is the same in Majma, Mufradat and Nihayah." (Ghorashi, 1992, v. 1, p. 1). In the book "al-Mu'ajam on the jurisprudence of the Qur'an and the secret of its rhetoric feature⁸", all the sayings about the meaning of the word "اب" have been mentioned and the views of the commentators have been explained in detail. (Váez Zadeh Khorasani, 2009, v. 1, p. 69). In the majority of interpretations, the following poems have also been used to confirm this meaning and that this word in this sense has been prevalent in the age of revelation.

⁸ المعجم في فقه القرآن و سر بلاغته

علي الشريعة يجري تحتها العذب تري به الاب و اليقطين مختلط

(San'ani, 1411 AH, v. 2, p. 283)

ولنا الاب به والمكرع

جدنا قيس و نجد دارنا

(Tousi, undated, v. 10, p. 276)

And also this poem written by Ibn Arafah in the praise of prophet:

لها نبيت الله الحصيد و الابا لة دعوه ميمونه ريحها الصبا

(Ibn Khalawayh, 1413 AH, v. 2, p. 440)

From the materials mentioned in the dictionaries and interpretations, one can conclude that: this word in Arabic means pasture and it has been used in this sense. And using this word in this verse is necessary in order to maintain proportionality and to communicate with the next verse which seeks to express the divine blessings to human and animal, because if instead of this word and according to the comment of Bellamy, the word "لبا" is placed, the semantic relationship between this verse and the next verse will be cut off. Because in this case, for the blessings granted to human, God has mentioned a witness, but the blessings God has given to animals will remain without any witness.

Considering this point is also necessary that in writing some words, there were some difference of readings and it has been reported by the commentators that in the case of reporting the difference of readings, it is possible to think about these words, but in these two verses that Bellamy has suggested a substitute for its words, even no difference of readings has been reported. (Abu Amro Uthman ibn Sa'id al-Dani, 1426 AH, p. 220, site: tafsir.com)

Also, if there was a mistake in this word, it was necessary for scholar commentators such as Zamakhshari and others to refer to it and mention the semantic relationship of these two words and the ambiguity claimed in this sense, but none of the commentators mentioned this point.

The Relationship of Bellamy's Discussion with the Distortion of the Holy Qur'an and the Response to It

Bellamy's words in fact prove the distortion of the holy Quran. He wants to prove the distortion of the Qur'an with his suggestions. The distortion of the holy Qur'an is not approved by Muslims. Researchers have written many books and articles denying the distortion of Quran that refers to some of the bibliographies of non-distortion of the Quran, namely books that introduce non-distortion sources. The existence of the sources mentioned in these books and articles suggests that Muslims believe in not distorting the Quran.

1. The bibliography of the non-distortion of the Qur'an, Mohammad Molavi, the content scientist editor Mohammad Ali Rezaei Kermani Nasab Poor, Mashhad: Astan Quds Razavi, Beh Nashr Co., 2014, p. 295.
2. The bibliography of non-distortion of the Qur'an, Kazem Ostadi, Tehran: Mashar Publication, 2016, p. 275.
3. Bibliography of non-distortion of the Quran, References: Ostadi, Kazem; Magazine: Mirror of Research, June and July 2015, No. 152 (32 pages - from 77 to 108)
4. Bibliography of the Fiction of Distortion, Sehati Sarvroodi, Mohammad; Magazine: Historical Studies of Quran and Hadith, summer 2000; Sahifeh Mobin's Articles - Number 2 (22 pages - from 137 to 158)
5. Bibliography of the non-distortion of the Holy Quran, Amini, Mohammad; Magazine: Binat (Islamic Educational Institute of Imam Reza (peace be upon him)), Spring 1999 – No. 21 (18 pages - from 153 to 170).

Conclusion

Bellamy was not aware of the position of the holy Quran in the presence of Muslims and he did not know the early history of Islam, and the sensitivities of the Prophet and the Companions in preserving the holy Qur'an, and he was not mastered in the translation and interpretation of the holy Qur'an. Referring to the Shia and Sunni interpretations of the two words below, we conclude that no change has been made in the words criticized by Bellamy. There are no difference of readings regarding these two words. In addition, these two words are ultimately persistent in terms of interpretation and rhetoric and they have an exact semantic proportion with the style and content of the verses. Existing interpretations on these abundant narratives, which are below these words, reject the whole view of them, and considers the rejection and alteration claimed by them to be null and void.

References

- Holy Qur'an: translated by Mohammad Mahdi Fooladvand, Tehran, Dar ol-Quran al-Karim, Studies of the Office of Islamic History and Education, 1415 AH.
- Ibn Ishaq, Mohammad, Sirah Ibn Ishaq, Office of Studies on Islamic History and Education, Tehran, 1410 AD.
- Ibn Khalouyeh, Hossein ibn Ahmad, E'arab al-Qera'at al-Sab' and its reasons⁹, Khanji library¹⁰, Cairo, 1413 BC.
- Ibn Sa'ad, Mohammad, Al-Tabaqat al-Kobra¹¹, Export house, Beirut, undated.
- Ibn Adel, Omar ibn Ali, Allabab in Science Book¹², and House of science books¹³, Beirut, 1419 AH.
- Ibn Ashoor, Mohammad Tahir, Al-Tahrir wa'l-Tanwir, the institute of Arabic history, Beirut, 1420 AH.
- Abu Amro Uthman ibn Sa'id al-Dani, National scientific library, Beirut, Facilitation in the seven readings, 1426 AH.
- Abu al-Fotouh Razi, Hossein ibn Ali, Rawz al-jinan wa ruh al-jinan, Astan Quds Razavi, Mashhad, 1408 AH.
- Abu Obeid, Qasim ibn Salam, Al-Nasikh wal-Mansoukh fi Kitab Allah, Publishers Roshd Library, Riyadh, 1418 AD.
- The Verdicts of Al-Quran Ibn al-Arabi, Dar al-Jail, Beirut - Lebanon, 1408 AH.
- Andelosi, Ibn Atiyah, Al-Muharer al-Wajiz fi Tafsir al-Ketab al-Aziz, International Science Books, Beirut, 1993.

⁹ اعراب القرانات السبع و عللها
¹⁰ مكتبه الخانجي
¹¹ الطبقات الكبرى
¹² اللباب في علوم الكتاب
¹³ دارالكتب العلميه

- Alousi, Mahmud ibn Abdullah, *Ruh al-Ma'ani*, International Science Books, Beirut, 1415 AD.
Baq'a'i, Ibrahim bin Umar, *Nazm al-Dorar fi tanasob al-Ayat wa al-Sowar*, International Science Books, Mohammad Ali Beyzoun, Beirut, 1427 AD.
- Blachère, Régis, *on the eve of the Qur'an*, translated by Mahmoud Ramyar, Office of the Publishing of Islamic Culture, 1995.
- John Wenz Bro; Andrew Rippin; Herbert Berg; *Articles of the Qur'anic Studies of the West; Quranic Language; Qur'anic Interpretation*, 2012.
- Javadi Amoli, Abdullah, *Quran in the Quran*, Isra Publishing Center, Qom, 2009.
- Hassan Rezaei Haftadar, *Biologist of Some Orientalists and Their Works (A)*, *The Name of the Journal of Quran Studies of Orientalists – number 8*, - spring and summer 2010.
- Hafani, Abdul Azim, *Great Quran Encyclopedia*, Medbouli School, Cairo, 2004.
- Damghani, Hussein ibn Muhammad, *Al-Wojouh wal-Nazaire le-alfaz Ketab Allah al-Aziz*¹⁴, Republic of Egypt, al-Arabiya, Ministry of Endowments, Cairo, 1416.
- Encyclopedia, Holy Qur'an*, Center for Qur'anic Culture and Education, Bostan Book, Qom, 2003.
- Darvish, Mohyee al-Din, *Earab al-Quran al-Karim and its expression*, al-Irshad, Hams, 1415.
- Seyyed Babak Farzaneh, *the Semantic Survey of the word "حصب" according to hell in the Qur'an*, two journals of the historical studies of Qur'an and hadith (*Ex Sahifah Mobin*), No. 49, Spring and Summer 2011, p. 99-112.
- Suyuti, Abdurrahman ibn Abi Bakr, *Al-Dor al-Mansour fi Tafsir Bel-Mäthour*, Ayatollah Mara'shi's Public Library, Qom, 1404 AH.
- Shabbar, Abdullah, *Al-Quran al-Karim (Shabbar)*, Dar-ol Hejrah Institute, Qom, 1410 AD.
- San'ani, Abdul Razzaq ibn Hammam, *Abdul Razzaq's commentary*, Dar ol-Ma'arefah, Lebanon, Beirut, First edition, 1411 AD.
- Tabatabai, Mohammad Hussein, *Tafsir al-Mizan*, Institute of A'alamiLiterature, Beirut, 2011.
- Tabarni, Soleiman ibn Ahmad, *Tafsir al-Quran al-Azeem (Tabarani)*, National Library of Cultue, Jordan, first edition, 2008.
- Tabarsi, Fazl ibn Hassan, *Tafsir Jami' al-Javami*, Astan Quds Razavi, Mashhad, 1996.
- Tabari, Mohammad bin Jarir, *Jami' al-Bayan al-Tafsir al-Quran*, Dar ol-Ma'arefah, Beirut, first edition, 1412 AD.
- Tarihi, Fakhredin ibn Muhammad, *Majma' ol-Bahrain*, Mortazavi, Tehran, 1996.

¹⁴ الوجوه و النظائر لألفاظ كتاب الله العزيز

- Tusi, Mohammad bin Hassan, *al-Tibbyan Fi Tafsir al-Quran*, Dar-e-Ehya al-Torath al-Arabi, Beirut, undated.
- Abdolhadi Fiqhizadeh; Hesam Emami Danaloo; "Registered" incorrectly proposed article, summer and spring 2014," *The Quranic Interpretation and Language Research*.
- Fakhr Razi, Mohammad bin Omar, *Tafsir Kabir*, Dar-e-Ehya al-Torath al-Arabi, Beirut, 1420 AD.
- Farra, Yahya bin Ziyad, *Ma'ani al-Fara'a*, Egyptian General Book Authority, Egypt, Cairo, 1980 BC.
- Farahidi, Khalil ibn Ahmad, *Kitab al-'Ayn*, Hijrat Publication, Qom, undated.
- Fazlullah, Mohammad Hussein, *from the Quranic revelation*, Dar-ol-melak, Beirut, 1419 AH.
- Fi Zilal al-Quran, Seyyed Qotb, *Dar Al-Shoroo'*, Beirut, 1425 AD.
- Qarashi, Ali Akbar, *Qamus Quran*, Dar al-Ketab al-Eslamiyah, Tehran, 1992.
- Kazem Ostadi, *bibliography of non-distortion of the Qur'an*, Tehran: Mash'ar publishing, 2016.
- Kazem Ostadi; *bibliography of non-distortion of the Qur'an*; Magazine: *Mirror of Research*, June and July 2015 - No. 152.
- Matridi, Muhammad ibn Muhammad, *Ahl al-Sunna interpretations*, Scientific Library, Mohammad Ali Beyzoun's pamphlets, Beirut, 1426.
- Mohammad Amini; *The bibliography of the non-distortion of the Holy Quran*; Magazine: *Binat* (Imam Reza's Islamic Educational Institute). Spring 1998 - No. 21.
- Mohammad Sehati Sarwroodi; *Bibliography of Fiction of Distortion*, Journal: *Historical Studies of Quran and Hadith* summer 2000, *Sahife Mobin* articles No. 2.
- Mohammad Molavi, Content-scientific Editor, Mohammad Ali Razayi Kermani Nasabpoor, *Bibliography of the non-distortion of Quran*, Mashhad: Astan Quds Razavi, Behnashr Co., 2014, p. 295.
- Mohammad Javad Eskandarloo, Mohammad Miqdad Amiri, *Review and criticize the claims of James Bellamy about the distortion of word "الرقيم" in the ninth verse of Surah al-Khaf*, two *Qur'anic Research Studies of Orientalists*, No. 10, Spring-Summer 2011.
- Morteza Kariminia (translator), *Quranic language, Qur'anic commentary: article collection of the Qur'anic study of the West* (John Wenzbrough, Andrew Ripin, Herbert Berg, Harald Moteski, Erie Rubin, François Doblouveau, James Bellamy), Hermes Publishing House, 2012, p. 426.
- Mesbah Yazdi, Mohammad Taqi, *Quranology*, Imam Khomeini Institute of Education and Research, Qom, 2013.
- Ma'arefat, Mohammad Hadi, *Talkhis al-Tamhid*, Islamic Publication Institute, Qom, 1426 AD.
- Makarem Shirazi, Naser, *Tafsir Nemooneh*, Islamic International Library, Tehran, 1992.

Nohas, Ahmad ibn Muhammad, Earab al-Quran Nohas, The international scientific books, Muhammad Ali Beyzoun's pamphlets, Beirut, 1421 AD.

Va'ez zadeh Khorasani, Mohammad, Al-Mu'ajim fi Fiqh al-Qara'a, Astan Quds Razavi, 2009 Blaqat, Astan Quds Razavi, Mashhad, 2009.

Site www.tafsir.com.

English Sources

The Mysterious Letters of the Koran: Old Abbreviations of the Basmalah". *Journal of the American Oriental Society*. 93 (3): 267–285. Jul–Sep 1973. doi:10.2307/599460. (Subscription required (help)).

Some Proposed Emendations to the Text of the Koran". *Journal of the American Oriental Society*. 113 (4): 562–573. Oct–Dec 1993. doi:10.2307/606724. (Subscription required (help)).

More Proposed Emendations to the Text of the Koran". *Journal of the American Oriental Society*. 116 (2): 196–204. Apr–Jun 1996. doi:10.2307/606724. (Subscription required (help)).

Textual Criticism of the Koran". *Journal of the American Oriental Society*. 121 (1): 1–6. Jan–Mar 2001. doi:10.2307/605695. (Subscription required (help)).

A Further Note on 'Īsā". *Journal of the American Oriental Society*. 122 (3): 1–6. Jul–Sep 2002. doi:10.2307/3087526. (Subscription required (help)).

McAuliffe, Jane Dammen, ed. (2006). "Textual Criticism of the Qur'ān". *Encyclopedia of the Qur'ān*. 5. Brill. pp. 237–252.

Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).