



## Comparison of Liberal and Republican Citizenship Theories in Various Countries

Ade Sopyan Hadi; Samsuri

Program Pascasarjana, Yogyakarta State University, Indonesia

<http://dx.doi.org/10.18415/ijmmu.v11i8.5976>

---

### **Abstract**

The rapid development of globalization needs to be filtered according to Pancasila. If we examine the French state, it can be seen that the republican model of citizenship is ideal for the pluralism of Brubaker and Cooper (Lurbe, 2015). Estonia has received a high international assessment for the quality of liberal democracy (Khoma & Kokoriev, 2021). Therefore, we can instill the spirit of tolerance, and pluralism and maintain democracy in accordance with Pancasila. The aim of this research is to determine liberal and republican citizenship theories, as well as their comparisons in various countries. The type of research used is a literature study. A literature study is said to be a type of research carried out through the process of collecting data such as books, documents, articles, and so on (Saputri & Nuryono, 2018). The results of this research show that the theory of republican citizenship in Turkey, for example, the armed forces, is identified as a disciplined organization that defends the Republican regime (Kardam & Cengiz, 2011). In the context of the Republic of Indonesia, republicans played a role in gaining independence (Wicaksono, 2019). Meanwhile, the comparison is that liberal citizenship theory prioritizes freedom while republican citizenship theory focuses on the spirit of struggle. The conclusion is that liberal and republican theories of citizenship are suitable for one country and less suitable for another country. This is certainly influenced by the country's background.

**Keywords:** *Liberal; Republican; Citizenship*

### **Introduction**

The rapid development of globalization, the entry of foreign cultures that often appear without strong filtering, becomes an important thing to seek vaccination so that the understandings that enter through the development of science and technology (IPTEK) continue to be in accordance with the existing Pancasila values. If we examine the country of France, it can be seen that the French state has shown that the republican citizenship model seems to be an ideal that is widely held among the French political elite rather than a description of reality in policy making. The nature and level of tolerance given by the Roman authorities to religious pluralism in the Brubaker and Cooper empire (Lurbe, 2015). In addition, the country of Estonia received a fairly high international assessment in terms of the quality of democracy. This country has been recognized as a "fortress" of liberal democratic values and strong support for the idea of a "European House" (Khoma & Kokoriev, 2021). Therefore, the spirit of tolerance and upholding pluralism, and the spirit of maintaining democracy can be instilled in the Indonesian state which is covered by the values of Pancasila.

Reflecting on the above, we can reflect on whether Indonesia has currently instilled republican values that are in accordance with the values of Pancasila properly. There are 7 functions of Pancasila as a guideline in carrying out national and state life, one of which is Pancasila as a guideline for life, which means that Pancasila, which is the guideline for the nation's life, certainly functions towards the sustainability of the life of the Indonesian nation. In its function as a guideline for life, Pancasila is often said to be a way of life, a reference for life, a guideline for living life, or a reference for viewing the country. Pancasila, which is a way of life, can function as a guide in various actions in carrying out daily life. This means that all behavior in the Indonesian nation must be based on Pancasila so that Pancasila can be a reflection in life (Rahma & Dewi., 2021). So that the spirit of unity, and tolerance in diversity must continue to be used as a guideline in the nation and state.

The reason the researcher chose the theme of comparing liberal and republican citizenship theories in various countries is because based on the researcher's initial observations, it can be seen that this theme is very rarely discussed and researched in the existing literature. Therefore, the researcher is interested in conducting a broader study entitled "Comparison of Liberal and Republican Citizenship Theories in Various Countries". The purpose of this study is to determine the theory of liberal citizenship in various countries, the theory of republican citizenship in various countries, and the comparison of liberal and republican citizenship theories in various countries.

### ***Research Method***

The qualitative approach is the process of collecting data in a natural setting within the legal framework of a phenomenon as a key instrument, while purposive sampling is applied for sampling (Rama, 2021). In this comparative study of liberal and republican citizenship theories in various countries, the type of research applied is a literature study. A literature study is said to be a type of research that is carried out through the process of collecting data such as books, documents, articles, and so on (Saputri & Nuryono, 2018). Meanwhile, the method of data collection in this study was carried out through analysis of various sources, especially from international journals and then national journals that have been indexed by Sinta.

### ***Result and Discussion***

#### **Result**

##### **A. Liberal Citizenship Theory in Various Countries**

In the theory of citizenship, there is one theory called the liberal citizenship theory (Trihantoyo et al., 2021). In Indonesia, applies the liberal citizenship theory to national and state life, the state is unable to limit the rights or movements of the people in the country, which means that people's freedom is so significant (Effendi, 2018). Therefore, of course, this liberal concept is difficult for Indonesian society to accept considering that the Indonesian nation is closely related to existing moral values considering that liberal citizenship views individual freedom which includes several fundamental rights such as the right to life, the right to liberty, and property rights. The debate between the authoritarian/collectivist understanding of Western and Soviet liberals about the relationship between citizens and the state played a key role in shaping the refugee protection regime that emerged after World War II (Long, 2011). Liberalism in government projects in European countries is seen as a government project that initially developed in the conditions of society and state provided by the European state system (Hindess, 2002). In liberal ideology, individual freedom is more focused on being implemented, while for example in communist ideology the focus is on how equality in community life can be realized, while in Pancasila ideology the existing society is more balanced on how individual life and social life can be guaranteed (Kariadi, 2016). Therefore, the Pancasila ideology is very suitable for the Indonesian nation to be able to regulate such significant freedom in liberal ideology so that society can still live side by side.

In the liberal democratic system, there is a vision of liberal democracy as a gathering of free citizens from various levels of society, but the same political and economic fate and debating constructively, as equal morals, about justice and public interest (King, 2010). This liberal ideal of democratic citizenship is often opposed by critics as utopian fiction, in tension with cultural identity and affective sources of loyalty in the contemporary context. In liberal citizenship, consistent political liberalism must understand its citizens as environmental citizens (Bell, 2005). Each of us has an effect on the environment every day, the key is to make this impact positive. Therefore, we must have our own commitment to be responsible both as individuals and as members of a community or within an organization.

Modern liberal democratic theory always claims to make assumptions about equality, but never fully embraces it (McBride, 2020). In the context of the French Revolution, the struggle for independence of the United States and various economic changes in European countries. Ideas related to liberalism play a very important role. According to Belgrano, Vieytes and Moreno are the keys to understanding the economic perspectives of the revolutionaries (Blanco, 2015). Modern representative liberal democracy is always based on an idea that assumes that the people must precede power and hold it as a constituent power (Bellini, 2014). Liberalism appears deconstructive when viewed from a gender perspective (Rodriguez, 2009).

Developed countries claim to follow the principles of liberalism, protecting their markets with actions that actually contradict the goals of the global economy because they introduce high customs duties, technical requirements that are not available worldwide, subsidize agricultural producers and other industries whose activities are an integral part, ensure a high level of national security in the broad sense of these words, and also spend a lot of money to support their own exporters (Volodymyr & Nataliia, 2017). In the North American region, there is a liberal capitalist ideology especially in the North American and Western European regions that can influence the elimination of a person's citizenship (Nurvenayanti, 2016). In Cameron's country, Prime Minister Cameron sees extremist ideology as the cause of terrorism and relies on liberal values as a weapon against extremism (Lewicki, 2017).

The role of women in liberal citizenship such as the women's movement has occupied a central role in the struggle around citizenship rights related to seeking economic autonomy in the context of liberal welfare (Scott, 1996). Liberal citizenship is seen as a dilemma for feminists. In this case their special capacity as women is not recognized and their citizenship is substantively unequal (Nash, 2001). There is the term Home Feelings in liberal citizenship which means an interdisciplinary study of Canadians along the border during the first half of the twentieth century which contained liberal-democratic citizenship before World War II (Bruce, 2020). In Turkey, the characteristic of Turkish politics in the 2000s is the existence of liberals and Islamic conservatives. While legitimizing Islamic conservatism, liberals have delegitimized Kemalism (Karaveli, 2010). In the UK, there is a debate about changing the 'Life in the UK' citizenship test which offers another opportunity to reflect on the testing of prospective citizens in a liberal democracy (Turner, 2014). The citizenship test is often understood as part of the strengthening of state borders and is set in a discourse of fear of high migration rates and the risk of cultural homogeneity. Furthermore, it is seen as an illustration of the death of multiculturalism and is presented as an illiberal strategy of cultural assimilation.

During its time as a member of the European Union, Estonia received quite high international ratings in terms of the quality of democracy. The country has been recognized internationally as a "fortress" in fighting for liberal democratic values and strong support for the idea of a "European House" (Khoma & Kokoriev, 2021). In Colombia, the federal story of Boyacá embodies the general tension between the vision of economic modernity promoted by the radical liberals in power at the time (Rosenthal, 2015). In Indonesia, there has been a significant decline in citizen participation in politics over the past few decades in a liberal democracy that cannot guarantee political freedom. In Indonesia, the Liberal Islam Network (JIL) is an intellectual community that gives birth to open and tolerant Islamic religious thought (Idris, 2017). In Indonesia, the process of spreading liberal Islam began in the 70s with

Islamic activists regularly spreading liberal Islam. The existence of a liberal Islamic network in Indonesia tries to create a religious atmosphere that is transformative and inclusive, carrying out its existence so that it is glanced at by the people. Through inclusive religious education, it is hoped that Muslims can solve various humanitarian problems. Liberalism can be seen as a way of running politics that brings political rationality into a historical context (Salazar, 2003)

## B. Theory of Republican Citizenship in Various Countries

David Miller has raised objections to the idea of cosmopolitan citizenship. His understanding of citizenship under the title of republicanism does not strengthen any kind of republican correlation (Chung, 2003). Patriotism is understood as where the hegemony of the government is stronger. This patriotism tries to bridge republicanism and communitarianism. Therefore, this patriotism is always defined politically (Samidi et al., 2020). In the old republican Turkish state, the Turkish Armed Forces (TAF) are identified as a disciplined and strong organization not only in terms of protecting the state but also as a symbol and defender of the existing regime, namely the secular and modern Republic of Turkey based on popular sovereignty (Kardam & Cengiz, 2011). In the State of Israel, the science of republicanism has shifted from a perfect and communitarian interpretation of tradition to a neo-Roman one, but citizenship in Israel republican citizenship has been identified with an unusual ethnic conception (Elazar & Milikowsky, 2020).

In France, there is a discourse from party members about where the hijab is said to be contrary to French values and Human Rights (Udasmoro, 2010). According to French political elites, the use of the hijab is associated with the French state which upholds religious freedom. The use of the hijab by women is interpreted as contrary to the spirit and way of life of the French state as *Etat laïque*. In addition, there is also the term *paris prototo* when party members explain the values that exist in the French state and universal human rights. This relationship places France as the one who is in line with universal human rights, while the hijab is not like that because it is subordinate and oppressive. The French state in French citizenship through the experience of the French Caribbean community shows how citizenship is rooted in the republican tradition (Ducoulombier, 2002).

In the book *Emile*, for Rousseau only individuals with highly developed moral and civic consciousness are able to articulate the general will in a modern republic (Thompson, 2021). In 1848, after the emancipation of slaves in the West Indies, France also granted them French citizenship on the basis of one of the three basic principles of the French Republic (Scott, 1996). Everyone could take part in a community but on the condition that the rules of the community were subject to the rules of the republic (Patton, 2014). Brubaker and Cooper (Lurbe I Puerto, 2015a) have shown that the republican model of citizenship seems to have been an ideal widely held among the French political elite rather than a description of the reality of policymaking. the nature and degree of tolerance given by the Roman authorities to religious pluralism in the empire. Roman legal instruments identified religion not as an individual concern but as a community concern (Ando, 2018).

South America and Algeria in 1865-1900 had a relationship in expressing the paradox of republicanism and the fear of the emergence of socialism provoked by the Paris Commune (Roberts, 2018). In the context of the Indonesian state, the context of republican citizenship can be seen from the term "struggle" found in the novel *Burung-burung Manyar*. In this novel, there are two different perspectives. First, the Dutch version where Teto, who is Dutch, thinks that the efforts of Indonesian fighters to seize and maintain independence are in vain. Meanwhile, on the Indonesian side, Larasati is very enthusiastic about seizing and maintaining independence from the hands of the Dutch (Wicaksono, 2019). In the novel, it can be seen that Larasati is fighting according to her profession as an artist in order to raise the fighting spirit of the younger generation through a film work related to the spirit of anti-colonialism.

The mindset expressed by Larasati is a satire shown to traitors to the nation who are willing to sell their country and nation to the Dutch without considering the humanitarian aspects that can arise. The republican principle in France is tested by the presence of immigrants from neighboring countries who

have different characters and backgrounds (Bandu, 2021). If in the past the principles in France could create assimilation with immigrants such as those from Italy, Belgium, Spain, or other countries, then currently the younger generation does not need to differentiate between immigrants and native French people. The citizenship education policy in Indonesia is intended so that the nation's generation can have a high sense of nationalism towards their nation and country so that things that have the potential to disrupt the integrity of the country can be prevented (Dahliyana et al., 2020).

## Discussion

The theory of liberal citizenship basically requires a society that has a significant level of freedom and guarantees personal rights, whether in the economic, political, or other fields. This is in line with what was stated by (King, 2010) that in a liberal democratic system, there is a vision of liberal democracy as a gathering of free citizens from various levels of society, but with the same political and economic fate and debating constructively, as equal morals, about justice and public interest. Countries that contain liberals such as Estonia have a positive impact on the country which is in accordance with the character of the Estonian nation itself. In Estonia, liberal democracy has made Estonia's name famous in international circles which are considered to have been successful in implementing democracy. This is in line with what was stated by (Khoma & Kokoriev, 2021) that during its time as a member of the European Union, Estonia received a fairly high international assessment in terms of the quality of democracy. This country has been recognized by the international world as a "fortress" in fighting for liberal democratic values and strong support for the idea of a "European House".

The theory of republican citizenship basically requires a society that has the spirit to defend its nation and country in facing various challenges from outside. This is what happened in Indonesia, for example in the context of the Indonesian state, the context of republican citizenship can be seen from the term "struggle" found in the novel *burung-burung manyar*. In this novel, there are two different perspectives. First, the Dutch version where Teto, who is Dutch, thinks that the efforts of Indonesian fighters to seize and maintain independence are in vain. Meanwhile, on the Indonesian side, Larasati is very enthusiastic about seizing and maintaining independence from the hands of the Dutch (Wicaksono, 2019). In the novel, it can be seen that Larasati is fighting according to her profession as an artist in order to raise the spirit of struggle of the younger generation through a film work related to the spirit of anti-colonialism. The mindset expressed by Larasati is a satire aimed at traitors who are willing to sell their country and nation to the Dutch without considering the humanitarian aspects that can arise.

No	Citizenship Theory	Understanding	Adhering Countries
1	Liberal	prioritize individual freedom	France, Cameroon, Canada, Türkiye, England, Colombia and North America
2	Republican	To realize high tolerance among its citizens to maintain pluralism	Indonesia

Based on the description above, it can be seen that the liberal citizenship theory prioritizes individual freedom in various aspects such as in Estonia. In addition, countries that have liberals include France, Cameroon, Canada, Turkey, England, Colombia, and the North American region. Meanwhile, the republican citizenship theory can realize the nature and high level of tolerance in its citizens to maintain pluralism in a country. In addition, the republican theory is also able to arouse the spirit of struggle to seize independence as found in the Indonesian nation.

## Conclusion

The results of this literature study show that liberal citizenship theory prioritizes individual freedom in various aspects. Countries that have liberals include France, Cameroon, Canada, Turkey, England, Colombia, and the North American region. Meanwhile, the republican citizenship theory can

realize the nature and high level of tolerance in its citizens to maintain pluralism in a country. In addition, the republican theory is also able to arouse the spirit of struggle to seize independence as found in the Indonesian nation. Comparison of liberal citizenship theory with republican citizenship theory in various countries as liberal citizenship theory in various countries tends to focus more on studies related to individual freedom and equality such as the aspect of equality in a democracy such as in Estonia which is so high that this country is also dubbed a fortress of democracy. At the same time, the republican citizenship theory focuses more on aspects related to nationalism and national defense such as in Indonesia.

## References

- Ando, C. (2018). Religion, toleration, and religious liberty in the republican empire. *History of European Ideas*, 44(6), 743–755. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01916599.2018.1513245>.
- Bell, D. R. (2005). Liberal environmental citizenship. *Environmental Politics*, 14(2), 179–194. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09644010500054863>.
- Bellini, P. (n.d.). *21st-Century Liberal Democracy and Its Contradictions*. 114–124.
- Blanco, A. F. (2015). Some considerations on the influence of economic liberalism in the May Revolution of 1810 in Buenos Aires, Argentina. *Iberian Journal of the History of Economic Thought*, 2(1), 36–47. [https://doi.org/10.5209/rev\\_ijhe.2015.v2.n1.49772](https://doi.org/10.5209/rev_ijhe.2015.v2.n1.49772).
- Bruce, L. D. (2020). Home Feelings: Liberal Citizenship and the Canadian Reading Camp Movement. *American Review of Canadian Studies*, 50(4), 586–588. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02722011.2020.1843756>.
- Chung, R. (2003). The cosmopolitan scope of republican citizenship. *Critical Review of International Social and Political Philosophy*, 6(1), 135–154. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13698230510001702713>.
- Dahliyana, A., Nurdin, E. S., Budimansyah, D., & Suryadi, A. (2020). Pendidikan pendahuluan bela negara melalui pendidikan kewarganegaraan. *Jurnal Civics: Media Kajian Kewarganegaraan*, 17(2), 130–141. <https://doi.org/10.21831/jc.v17i2.27919>.
- Ducoulombier, A. (2002). Parity is about “race”: French republican citizenship and the French Caribbean. *Modern & Contemporary France*, 10(1), 75–87. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09639480120107587>.
- Effendi, W. R. (2018). KONSEPSI KEWARGANEGARAAN DALAM PERSPEKTIF TRADISI LIBERAL DAN REPUBLIKAN Winda. *Jurnal Trias Politica*, 2(1).
- Elazar, Y., & Milikowsky, N. (2020). Ethnicizing the republic: the strange career of the concept of republican citizenship in Israel. *Citizenship Studies*, 24(6), 786–803. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13621025.2020.1720607>.
- Hindess, B. (2002). Neo-liberal citizenship. *Citizenship Studies*, 6(2), 127–143. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13621020220142932>.
- Idris, M. (2017). Potret Pemikiran Radikal Jaringan Islam Liberal (Jil) Indonesia. *Kalam*, 8(2), 367. <https://doi.org/10.24042/klm.v8i2.227>.
- Karaveli, H. M. (2010). An unfulfilled promise of enlightenment: Kemalism and its liberal critics. *Turkish Studies*, 11(1), 85–102. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14683841003747054>.
- Kardam, F., & Cengiz, K. (2011). Republican citizenship in Turkey: Historical development, perceptions and practices. *Middle Eastern Studies*, 47(1), 151–165. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00263206.2011.535677>.

- Kariadi, D. (2016). Revitalisasi Nilai-Nilai Edukatif Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan Untuk Membangun Masyarakat Berwawasan Global Berjiwa Nasionalis. *Jurnal PIPSI (Jurnal Pendidikan IPS Indonesia)*, 1(1), 14. <https://doi.org/10.26737/jpipi.v1i1.112>.
- Khoma, N., & Kokoriev, O. (2021). Deconsolidation of Liberal Democracy in the Baltic States. The Issue of Compliance with the EU Standards at Institutional and Value Levels. *Romanian Journal of European Affairs*, 21(1), 39–57.
- King, L. (2010). Liberal citizenship: Medieval cities as model and metaphor. *Space and Polity*, 14(2), 123–142. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13562576.2010.505789>.
- Lewicki, A. (2017). The blind spots of liberal citizenship and integration policy. *Patterns of Prejudice*, 51(5), 375–395. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0031322X.2017.1389350>.
- Long, K. (2011). Refugees, repatriation, and liberal citizenship. *History of European Ideas*, 37(2), 232–241. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.histeuroideas.2010.10.016>.
- Lurbe I Puerto, K. (2015a). The insertion of Roma in Sénart Project (2000–2007): a local minority-targeted affirmative action following in the footsteps of the French republican citizenship model. *Identities*, 22(6), 653–670. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1070289X.2014.950968>.
- Lurbe I Puerto, K. (2015b). The insertion of Roma in Sénart Project (2000–2007): a local minority-targeted affirmative action following in the footsteps of the French republican citizenship model. *Identities*, 22(6), 653–670. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1070289X.2014.950968>.
- McBride, W. L. (2020). Western Liberalism At Twilight (?). *Filosofiya Osvity. Philosophy of Education*, 25(2), 211–223. <https://doi.org/10.31874/2309-1606-2019-25-2-11>.
- Nash, K. (2001). Feminism and contemporary liberal citizenship: The undecidability of “women.” *Citizenship Studies*, 5(3), 255–268. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13621020120085234>.
- Nurvenayanti, I. (2016). Teori-Teori Kewarganegaraan. *Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Sosial*, 2, 101–108.
- Patton, C. (2014). Defacing Levinas: vision, veiling and the ethics of republican citizenship in France. *Social Identities*, 20(2–3), 186–198. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13504630.2013.878990>.
- Pérez Salazar, M. (2003). La razón liberal. Economía, política y ética en la obra de John Stuart Mill. *Books*, 1. <https://ideas.repec.org/b/ext/public/27.html#download>.
- Rahma, D., & Dewi., D. A. (2021). Aktualisasi Pancasila sebagai pandangan hidup bangsa Indonesia dalam kehidupan sehari-hari. *Jurpis: Jurnal Pendidikan Ilmu Sosial*, 18(1), 63-74.
- Roberts, T. M. (2018). Republican citizenship in the post-Civil War South and French Algeria 1865–1900. *American Nineteenth Century History*, 19(1), 81–104. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14664658.2018.1441646>.
- Rodriguez, R. (2009). *Del feminismo liberal al deconstructivismo de género*. 2009. [/citations?view\\_op=view\\_citation&continue=/scholar%3Fhl%3Des%26as\\_sdt%3D0,5%26scilib%3D1%26scioq%3D%2522un%2Bcuarto%2Bpropio%2522&citilm=1&citation\\_for\\_view=bZjqczkAAA AJ:MLfJN-KU85MC&hl=es&oi=p](https://doi.org/10.1080/1070289X.2014.950968).
- Rosenthal, J. (2015). The Fiscal History of Boyacá, 1863-1886: Liberal Dreams and Limited Resources. *Tiempo y Economía*, 2(2), 9–32. <https://doi.org/10.21789/24222704.1058>.
- Samidi, R., Kusuma, W. J., Artikel, I., Juni, D., Juni, D., & Juni, D. (2020). *ANALISIS KRITIS EKSISTENSI NILAI PATRIOTISME DALAM PENDIDIKAN KEWARGANEGARAAN*. <http://journal.unnes.ac.id/sju/index.php/harmony>.

- Saputri, M. O., & Nuryono, W. (2018). Studi Kepustakaan Konseling Rational Emotive Behavior Therapy Untuk Mengurangi Kecanduan Game Online. *Ejournal.Unesa. Ac.Id*, 801–817. <https://ejournal.unesa.ac.id/index.php/jurnal-bk-unesa/article/view/45865/38718>.
- Scott, K. (1996). The Dilemma of Liberal Citizenship: Women and Social Assistance Reform in the 1990s. *Studies in Political Economy*, 50(1), 7–36. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19187033.1996.11675335>.
- Thompson, M. J. (2021). Rousseau's Post-Liberal Self: Emile and the Formation of Republican Citizenship. *European Legacy*, 26(1), 39–53. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10848770.2020.1823623>.
- Trihantoyo, S., Herachwati, N., & Purwono, R. (2021). Teacher Competence Based on Digital Quotient as Instructional Leadership. *Ilmu Pendidikan: Jurnal Kajian Teori Dan Praktik Kependidikan*, 6(2), 67. <https://doi.org/10.17977/um027v6i22021p067>.
- Turner, J. (2014). Testing the liberal subject: (in)security, responsibility and “self-improvement” in the UK citizenship test. *Citizenship Studies*, 18(3–4), 332–348. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13621025.2014.905273>.
- Udasromo, W. (2010). Discourse Subaltern dalam Masyarakat Interkultural: Mencermati Relasi Gender Jilbab dan Perempuan Berjilbab di Prancis. *Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Dan Ilmu Politik*, 14(1), 1–22.
- Volodymyr, P., & Nataliia, R. (2017). From Protectionism to Neo-Protectionism: New Dimensions of Liberal Regulation. *International Economic Policy*, 2(27), 90–111. <https://doaj.org/article/01374b9d8dcc48d2837cafc7b095fb84>.
- Wahyuddin, Irianti Bandu, M. H. (2021). KEBIJAKAN DAN POLITIK INTEGRASI IMIGRAN DI PRANCIS. *URNAL ILMU BUDAYA*, 9(2).
- Wicaksono, A. (2019). MAKNA PERJUANGAN DALAM NOVEL INDONESIA BERLATAR PERANG KEMERDEKAAN (TINJAUAN NEW HISTORICISM GREENBLATT). *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Dan Sastra*, 18(2), 210–220. [https://doi.org/10.17509/bs\\_jpbsp.v18i2.15509](https://doi.org/10.17509/bs_jpbsp.v18i2.15509).

## Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal.

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).