



## YouTube Viewers' Ideology on the Content of Pilgrimage Practices to the Ulama's Tomb: A Case Study of the Tomb of Habib Anis Al-Habsyi in Surakarta

Endang Tri Irianingsih<sup>1</sup>; Wakil Abdullah<sup>2</sup>; Wardo<sup>2</sup>; Sri Kusumo Habsari<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Doctoral Candidate, Cultural Studies Program, Universitas Sebelas Maret, Indonesia

<sup>2</sup> Lecturer at the Cultural Studies Program, Universitas Sebelas Maret, Indonesia

<http://dx.doi.org/10.18415/ijmmu.v9i10.4276>

---

### **Abstract**

YouTube, as a social media platform, has many videos that allow viewers to interact with one another via the comments section. Viewers comment on the video's content. There are comments that agree with the content of the video and comments that disagree with the content of the video. The language used by the audience can reflect their ideology. This is a qualitative interpretive study. Data analysis based on Fairclough's critical discourse theory. The audience's comments on the YouTube video content of an ulama figure's tomb were used as research data in this study, particularly Imam Subkhan's YouTube channel revealing the practice of pilgrimage to the tomb of Habib Anis Al Habsyi in Surakarta. The study results revealed an ideology, precisely Islam, as expressed in the audience's comments through language expression, however there was also emerging conflict. There are disagreements of opinion among Muslims of various schools of thought. Their ability to comment on the content of YouTube videos portraying pilgrimages to the tombs of ulama figures is influenced by their educational level.

**Keywords:** *Ideology; Language Expression; YouTube; Pilgrimage; Tomb of Habib Anis Al-Habsyi*

### **Introduction**

YouTube is a popular social media platform with a large user base. YouTube offers its users a visual and audio experience in the form of video and audience interaction. Because of the large number of users, content creators must be more creative in order to maintain viewership. A content is created by combining various ideas. Beginning with content about daily life, cooking, and travel, and progressing to religious activities. Imam Subkhan's YouTube channel features pilgrimage activities. Pilgrimages featured as content are objective daily activities. This means that the video shown was not deliberately fabricated as content; instead, these are recordings used to capture a moment.

Pilgrimages to the tombs of ulama figures in Surakarta, as well as the tombs of Habib Ali's descendants, were featured on the YouTube channel during the Haul Habib Ali event. The documentary showed the atmosphere surrounding the tomb and inside the tomb complex. Because this content directly records events, the image would seem natural based on the conditions at the time. There are street vendors selling their wares around the tomb, groups of pilgrims walking, and pilgrims queuing to make a

pilgrimage to the tomb of Habib Ali's descendants. Viewers leave a variety of comments in the comments section. The written comments reflect the viewer's assessment of the video's content, including both positive and negative comments.

YouTube-related studies have typically focused on the video's content as well as the video's aesthetics, technique, and the impact caused by the video content. As in Chandra's (2017) study on the impact of video content featured on YouTube. The content featured can have an effect on the audience, such as an increase or decrease in the number of viewers, as well as social effects on the audience. This study focuses on the impact that occurs after video content in the form of vlogs of prominent figures is uploaded. The vlog figure was chosen based on the number of subscribers and viewers. Because of the effects of popularity, popular figures' content gains more viewers quite rapidly. In addition to the popularity of the characters, the video's content is equally important in capturing the audience's attention. The content's theme must be tailored to the target audience, and current circumstances must be considered. The number of people who watch a YouTube video is also influenced by the circumstances of the community. Reading about the conditions of society is an important step in enticing an audience. For example, Rahma and Kusumah (2020) conducted a study on using YouTube as a platform for preaching the Islamic religion during the Covid-19 pandemic. The Covid-19 pandemic confines everyone's mobility and lessens outdoor activities. This is what prompted a YouTube channel to use the platform to preach Islam. The content on the channel features da'wah, allowing people to receive spiritual guidance even when they are at home. Another additional benefit of YouTube that it can be used as platform for online protests. When compared to its initial appearance, which was only used as a video sharing platform, the growth of YouTube's advantages is now moving at a rapid pace. Faisol et al. (2021) used a cyberpragmatic study perspective to investigate cyber activism in the commentary on news of the Palestinian conflict on the Al-Jazeera YouTube channel. YouTube is used as an online protest platform that can influence the wider public to engage in cyber activism and resistance.

The audience's comments in the comment section describe the effects of a particular type of content. Viewer comments are an intriguing aspect of YouTube video content because they can be seen in the social interactions that occur in the digital world. As a viewer, one not only accepts but also actively participates by commenting. Viewer comments can be used to respond to a YouTube video that is currently playing. Based on their respective perspectives, the audience has a variety of opinions. Harpizon et al. (2022) studied the sentiment of audience comments on Ustadz Abdul Somad's YouTube lectures. They use a simple Nave Bayes algorithm to assess the sentiment of audience comments. The comments from the audience are quite intriguing due to the ideology behind them. Syah (2020) studied YouTube viewer ideology and comments. Using Sara Mills' critical discourse analysis model, the researcher investigates gender ideology in audience comments on Dewi Perssik's YouTube vlog. Harry et al. (2022) probed ideology on YouTube as well, but they focused on two YouTube channels that covered the same topic, namely the preservation of Lasem culture from a different angle. This difference in perspective is due to distinctions in the ideology used to express meaning to the audience. YouTube study extended since it focuses not only on the content, advantages, or aesthetic value of a video, but also on the audience through comments. This demonstrates that the study of YouTube viewers has established human activity in the digital world as a new ethnographic study, namely digital ethnography.

This study also focuses on the audience's comments to determine the ideology based on the language expressions featured. Viewers with knowledge of the content will provide judgmental responses that agree or disagree with the content of the video content displayed. The audience's knowledge is inextricably linked to their ideology. Therefore, the audience's comments containing this justification are worth studying in order to gain a better understanding of the language expressions used in expressing an opinion about something. The audience's language expressions are then analyzed using Norman Fairclough's critical discourse theory to determine the representing ideology.

## **Methodology**

This study was designed using a qualitative descriptive method with a digital ethnographic approach. YouTube is the digital platform in use. The selected YouTube videos feature pilgrimages to scholar tombs. The YouTube video content used in this study was taken from Imam Subkhan's channel and is titled "*Berebut Cium Nisan Makam Keturunan Habib Ali di Solo-Haul Habib Ali bin Muhammad Al Habsyi*". There are 70 viewer comments in the video. The data used in this study were viewer comments, particularly those expressing agreement or disagreement with the video's content. The method of observation and recording was used to collect data. The selected comments were then analyzed to determine the ideology behind them. Fairclough's critical discourse analysis was used to analyze the data. Discourse analysis is used to probe the critical relationship between discursive practices, texts, and events and the ideology that underpins them, because the ideology is what gives rise to the discourse (Fairclough, 1989; 1995). Fairclough's discourse analysis is divided into three stages: 1) the text as a form of representation containing an ideology of linguistically dismantled; 2) discourse practice related to text production, consumption, and distribution; and 3) socio-cultural practice related to context outside the text in the form of discourse relations with ideology and power.

## **Result and Discussion**

### **1. Audience Comment Text**

Imam Subkhan's YouTube channel with pilgrimage video content was launched on December 29, 2018 and has received 18,664 thousand views. The content is titled "*Berebut Cium Nisan Makam Keturunan Habib Ali di Solo-Haul Habib Ali bi Muhammad Al Habsyi*" [Scramble for Kissing Tombstones of the Descendants of Habib Ali at Solo-Haul Habib Ali bi Muhammad Al Habsyi]. This content portrays the atmosphere surrounding the tomb, beginning with the road leading to the tomb and continuing with the Ar-Riyadh Mosque, souvenir shops, and tomb complex. The video begins with an explanation of the situation surrounding the tomb, continues with the pilgrimage procession, and ends with an explanation of Haul Habib Ali's impact.

This study focused on the middle section of the video. The pilgrimage procedures for Habib Ali's descendants' tombs are described in this section. Viewers have provided the most feedback on the video in this section. This video received 70 comments highlighting the tombs and pilgrimages situation. Bystanders also commented on the purpose of the pilgrimage. The comments were received in the form of words, short sentences, and sentences in paragraphs. The audience's comments that are the focus are in the form of discourse comments in the form of language expressions that indicate a certain meaning. This symbol represents the ideology that was chosen. The table below lists study results.

## Expressions of Audience Language in Comments

No	Language Expressions	Meanings
1.	<i>Kuburan bukan tempat ibadah</i> 'Tombs are not places of worship.'	Opposing the video content
2.	<i>Pecinta dzuriat Rasulullah SAW</i> 'Lovers of the Prophet's dzuriat'	Accepting the video content
3.	<i>Mengagungkan kubur-kubur orang-orang soleh</i> 'Glorifying the pious' tombs'	Opposing the video content
4.	<i>Memuja kubur dan meminta hajat dari kubur</i> 'Worshipping the tomb and seeking wishes from it'	Opposing the video content
5.	<i>Belajar dulu biar gak mensyirikkan orang</i> 'Learn first so you don't lead others astray'	Accepting the video content
6.	<i>Mana ada kuburan mengandung berkah</i> 'there is a tomb bearing blessings'	Opposing the video content
7.	<i>Mencium kuburan merupakan salah satu penyakit menular</i> 'Kissing the tomb is a contagious disease'	Opposing the video content
8.	<i>Kaum Nabi Nuh jaman sekarang</i> 'Noah's people of today'	Opposing the video content
9.	<i>Ngeri kubur rame</i> 'Terrifying, crowded tombs'	Opposing the video content
10.	<i>Kuburan malah kayak hotel</i> 'Tombs are pretty much identical to hotels.'	Opposing the video content
11.	<i>Khurafat, ghuluw</i>	Opposing the video content
12.	<i>Wajah-wajah polos penyembah kuburan</i> 'The tomb worshippers' innocent faces'	Opposing the video content
13.	<i>Sesat lagi menyesatkan</i> 'Misguided again misleading'	Opposing the video content
14.	<i>Perbuatan yang sia-sia</i> 'What a waste'	Opposing the video content
15.	<i>Kesyirikan</i> 'Shirk'	Opposing the video content
16.	<i>Mendoakan</i> 'praying'	Accepting the video content
17.	<i>Kuburiyyun</i> 'people of graveyards'	Opposing the video content

Based on the language expressions featured by the audience in the comments, it represents the meaning of writing comments, namely 1) rejection of the video content and 2) agreement with the video content. The use of formal and informal vocabulary and diction illustrates this representation. The audience's comments are divided into two sides that form the discourse on the practice of pilgrimage by kissing the tombstone or as shown in the video and the discourse of rejection of the pilgrimage practice carried out in the video.

Data 1, 3, 4, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, and 17 indicate rejection of the video content. The comments conveyed a discourse of rejection of the pilgrimage practice featured in the video. The refusal was rooted in the belief that the pilgrimage practices in the video did not correspond to the pilgrimage practices understood by the commentators. They use vocabulary and diction that can be interpreted as rejection. Furthermore, the diction used has negative labeling, as evidenced by the data (11), (15), and (17). The vocabulary used is Arabic, and it refers to disgraceful acts. *Khurafat* refers to things that deviate from Islamic teachings. *Ghuluw* refers to anything exaggerated. *Kuburiyyun* is a person who enjoys visiting graveyards. These three dictions describe deviant behavior from Islamic teachings, thus using such dictions in the comments clearly showed that the audience strongly disagrees with the video's content.

Data (1), (3), (7), (8), (9), (10), (12), (13), and (14) are also comments that mean rejection by using sentences that provide information and explanation. Data (1) explains that graves/cemeteries are not places of worship, but rather places where people who have died are buried, so pilgrimages to tombs

should not behave like worshipers. Data (3) explains why the graves of pious people should not be exalted excessively. Because the visual of the tomb in the video is considered a form of glorifying the tomb, this comment arose. Data (7) contains a firm rejection of the practice of pilgrimage by kissing gravestones. This is a deviant behavior according to Islamic teachings and can be a contagious disease. Infectious disease here refers to a behavioral disease that can and is easily replicated by others, hence the name infectious disease. Data (8) explains how the pilgrims' attitude in the video is similar to Noah's people's behavior in the past. Allah SWT punished Noah's people for making partners with Allah SWT by worshipping idols. Because they worship the tomb and have intentions other than pilgrimage to pray, the pilgrims in the video are considered partners with Allah SWT, and they are now considered as Noah's people. Data (9) indicates that the tomb is crowded with individuals. Typically, only a few people visit the tomb to pray briefly before leaving. Contrary to the visuals in the video, the tombs are crowded with people who tend to be in the tomb in a short time. Ironically, data (10) compares tombs to hotels. Tombs are places where people die, as opposed to hotels where people are still alive. This comparison is made because the visuals in the video depict the crowds at the tombs as well as the physical condition of the tomb building, which is intended to resemble a hotel. This comparison is also satirical. Data (12) is also a satire because it would seem innocent but worships the tomb. The innocent face represents a parable for people who are considered believers not to commit sins but instead to associate partners with Allah SWT by worshipping the grave. In the video, the audience satirizes pilgrims. Data (13), which explains the attitude in the video considered heretical and is then disseminated, has the potential to mislead others. People who observe can imitate this attitude, leading them astray as well. Data (14) explains that the actions portrayed in the video are futile acts because they are ineffective. The pilgrimage practices portrayed in the video are deemed ineffective.

Data (4) and (6) are also substantial rejection comments, particularly rejection from the pilgrimage's intent. Data (4) rejects the pilgrimage's intention to seek prayer. This is considered a deviation from Islamic teachings because it is part of the act of associating partners with Allah SWT. Data (6) also rejects the pilgrimage intent of believing the tomb contains blessings. As a result, many pilgrims may be misled. Pilgrimages are made not to pray, but to receive blessings. As a result, the audience reacted by commenting on the rejection of the pilgrimage's purpose, which was deemed to deviate from Islamic teachings.

Data (2), (5), and (16) stand out from the others because they indicate agreement with the video's content. Data (2) shows that what is depicted in the video is a form of love for the Prophet Muhammad's descendants. Data (5) is a defense against comments that criticize the video's content. This defense is intended to prevent those who disagree from directly justifying it by using the word *shirk*. Data (16) illustrates that pilgrims are '*mendoakan*' praying. The diction used is an affirmation, but it is conveyed subtly.

## 2. Discourse Practice

The interpretation of the discourse formation process begins at this stage with text production, consumption, and distribution. The process of text production is related to the context of discourse's rise, particularly the purpose of text production. The acceptance response to discourse is linked to text consumption. Texts are distributed in proportion to the author's capital and effort in order for the text to be accepted by the community. The first discourse made by the video maker about the practice of pilgrimage inspired the creation of the text of audience rejection and approval. The video maker talked about the practice of kissing the tombstones of scholars on pilgrimage to their graves. He wanted to illustrate his practice of pilgrimage to the grave by replicating the practice of pilgrimage at Habib Ali's descendants' tomb as he saw it. The pilgrimage practice shown in the video is also carried out by many other pilgrims who come, giving him the impression that what he is doing is common. However, this is interpreted differently by viewers with opposing viewpoints. The video then received feedback from the public at large, which in this case is the viewers of YouTube video content. The discourse is responded to with comments of rejection and approval of what is being discussed. This response demonstrates that

there was a text consumption process followed by an audience response. The distribution process can be seen in the efforts of video creators who display it as content on the YouTube channel. The public at large and the general audience can enjoy the uploaded content.

### 3. Socio-Cultural Practice

The third stage is concerned with analyzing the social context of the text's emergence. Pilgrimages are widely practiced in society, particularly among the people of Surakarta. This is inextricably linked to the beliefs that are held. Surakarta is still densely packed with Javanese culture, so many aspects of daily life, including pilgrimages, are still influenced by Javanese traditions. On pilgrimage, the Javanese still sow flowers in the form of *setaman* flowers or roses. Furthermore, the purpose of pilgrimage is sometimes still influenced by ancient beliefs. Although modern Islamic teachings have developed in Surakarta, they do not automatically replace this old belief style tradition. As seen in the video, there is a sprinkling of roses on the headstone and a description from the video maker who says the pilgrimage is to pray. This then elicited a response from the audience. The audience is also very interested in the pilgrimage route, which concludes with kissing the tombstone.

This is inextricably linked to the ideologies of both the video maker and the audience. Video creators and viewers who agree with the video's content share a common background, culminating in a single perception. They have an Islamic ideology but lean toward Kejawen Islam. Kejawen is the Jawi religion, which is a Javanese variant of Islam (Koentjaraningrat, 1994). Kejawen became the Javanese ideology as an alternative to belief as well as resistance to modernity and moral decadence, but resistance in the form of a defense mechanism used a tolerance attitude (Mulder, 2005; Anderson, 2016). They pray in an Islamic way but are still influenced by Javanese cultural traditions such as sprinkling flowers on graves. Viewers who oppose the video's content share an Islamic ideology, but it is sharia Islam. The development of Islamization in the twenty-first century has been in the phase of modern Islamization, where everything is returned in line with the Qur'an and hadith. Sharia law in Islam is only guided by the Qur'an and Hadith, thus any deviation from the two is considered a sin.

### Conclusion

Based on the results of the data analysis, it is possible to conclude that the YouTube video content titled “*Berebut Cium Nisan Makam Keturunan Habib Ali di Solo-Haul Habib Ali bi Muhammad Al Habsy*”. There has been an ideological clash on Imam Subkhan's YouTube channel. The audience is divided into two ideologies: Kejawen Islamic ideology and Sharia Islamic ideology. Viewers who adhere to the Kejawen Islam ideology posted comments that agreed with the video's content. Therefore, they agree with the video maker, who has the same ideology, while the viewer with Sharia Islam ideology gives comments that contain discourses on the video's rejection. The presence of ideological differences among the audience causes conflict by reciprocating comments about the video maker's discourse.

### References

- Aini, Syarifah Nur, Bintan Auliya Qurrota A'yun, Eugenius Damar Pradipta, Awanis Akalili, and Febriansyah Kulau. 2021. “Analisis Retorika Visual Pada Konten Youtube Kanal Skinnyindonesian24 Dengan Judul ‘Youtube Lebih Dari Tv.’” *SOCIA: Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial* 18(1):30–48. doi: 10.21831/socia.v18i1.40433.
- Cenderamata, Rengganis Citra, and Nani Darmayanti. 2019. “Analisis Wacana Kritis Fairclough Pada Pemberitaan Selebriti Di Media Daring (Fairclough ' S Critical Discourse Analysis of Celebrity News on Online Media).” *Academia.Edu* 3(April):1–8.
- Chandra, Edy. 2018. “Youtube, Citra Media Informasi Interaktif Atau Media Penyampaian Aspirasi Pribadi.” *Jurnal Muara Ilmu Sosial, Humaniora, Dan Seni* 1(2):406. doi: 10.24912/jmishumsen.v1i2.1035.

- Fairclough, Norman. 2003. *Textual Analysis for Social Research*.
- Faisol, Yufni, and Wahyudi Rahmat. 2021. "Cyberactivism in Palestinian Conflict News Comments on Al-Jazeera Youtube Channel: A Cyberpragmatic Study (Aktivisme Siber Dalam Komentar Berita Konflik Palestina Di Kanal Youtube Al-Jazeera: Kajian Siberpragmatik)." *Gramatika STKIP PGRI Sumatera Barat* 7(2):267–86. doi: 10.22202/jg.2021.v7i2.4954.
- Fee, Dwight, and Norman Fairclough. 1993. *Discourse and Social Change*. Vol. 22.
- Harpizon, Habibi Al Rasyid, Rahmad Kurniawan, Iwan Iskandar, Roni Salambue, Elvia Budianita, and Fadhilah Syafria. 2022. "Analisis Sentimen Komentar Di YouTube Tentang Ceramah Ustadz Abdul Somad Menggunakan Algoritma Naïve Bayes." ... *Di YouTube* ... 5(1):131–40.
- Harry, Harry, Rustono Farady Marta, and Muhammad Bahrudin. 2022. "Pemetaan Ideologi Performatif Dan Represif Dalam Video Dokumenter Di Kanal Youtube: Sebuah Perspektif Multimodalitas Budaya Kota Lasem." *ANDHARUPA: Jurnal Desain Komunikasi Visual & Multimedia* 8(01):38–51. doi: 10.33633/andharupa.v8i01.4727.
- Mair, Christian, and Norman Fairclough. 1997. *Critical Discourse Analysis: The Critical Analysis of Language*. Vol. 73.
- O'Reilly, Karen. 2010. *Introduction to Ethnographic Methods*.
- Rahma, Farida Nur, and Mada Wijaya Kusumah. 2020. "YOUTUBE SEBAGAI MEDIA DAKWAH MASA PANDEMI COVID 19 (Studi Analisis Konten Dakwah Channel Muslimah Media Center 15-30 Juni 2020)." *Dakwah Di Masa Pandemi Covid-19* 19:41–54.
- Saraswati, Ardhina, and Ni Wayan Sartini. 2017. "Wacana Perlawanan Persebaya 1927 Terhadap PSSI : Analisis Wacana Kritis Norman Fairclough." *Mozaik Humaniora* 17(2):181–91.
- Syah, Ezik Firman. 2020. "Ideologi Gender Pada Komentar Netizen Di Vlog YouTube Dewi Persik: Analisis Wacana Kritis Model Sara Mills." *Seminar Nasional Ilmu Pendidikan Dan Multi Disiplin 3* 3:26–32.

## Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal.

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).