



The Application of Lexicology in the Interpretative Approach of the Second Verse of Surah Fath from the point of View of Shi'a and Sunni Commentators

Maryam Alizadeh

PhD Student in Islamic Studies, Faculty of Islamic Studies and Thought, University of Tehran, Tehran, Iran

Email: alizade62@ut.ac.ir

<http://dx.doi.org/10.18415/ijmmu.v9i12.4148>

Abstract

One of the most important missions of the Qur'an's commentator is to check the lexical meaning of the Qur'anic verses before the interpretation. Neglecting this matter and being satisfied with the conventional meaning by some Sunni commentators is the reason for not referring to the lexical meaning of the word (Dhanb) in the interpretation of the second verse of the surah Fath and defining it has been based on the conventional meaning. In addition to a strategic error in interpretation, this is a factor in damaging the sacred honor of the Holy Prophet of Islam (PBUH) and his infallibility. This research has investigated this issue by assuming the necessity of using the knowledge of words in the interpretation of the Qur'an with descriptive and analytical method. Based on the lexical definition of Dhanb (following something) and confirming by numerous rational and narrative documents and reasons, Shi'a commentators believe that not only did the Holy Prophet (PBUH) not commit any sin, but also the intention of this word is the same consequences of confronting the polytheists of Mecca, that with the conquest of Mecca and their conversion to Islam, the sin of the polytheists is forgiven.

Keywords: *Lexicology; Interpretation; Second Verse of Surah Fath; Commentators; Shi'a and Sunni*

Introduction

Qur'an, the holy book of Muslims, was revealed in Arabic, and understanding the concept of the divine word is achieved through the knowledge of the Arabic language. For this reason, one of the sciences needed by the interpreter to interpret the verses is literary knowledge, which includes vocabulary, grammar, syntax, and rhetoric. The purpose of lexicography is to know the main material of words based on its verbal status. On the other hand, the vastness of the Arabic language and using figurative and metaphorical phrases in the Holy Qur'an doubles the need for the commentator to refer to lexicography. Therefore, it is necessary for every commentator to examine the words of the Qur'an from the point of view of lexicography before interpreting then proceed to interpret the verses. This can be very effective in preventing the commentator's error in his interpretation. All commentators acknowledge the necessity of lexicology in interpreting the Qur'an, but at the practical stage, due to the conventional meaning of some words, they refrain from referring to dictionaries. One of the verses that lexicology is

very effective in interpreting it is the second verse of Surah Fath, which without lexicology has created a difference in interpretation of the word (Dhanb).

The article (formulation of sin in the Holy Qur'an based on the semantics of the concept of Dhanb) written by Mehdi Jalali and Fatemeh Agahi, has investigated the types of sin based on the word Dhanb. Also, Seyyed Mahmoud Tayyeb Hosseini and Motahara Sadat Tayyeb Hosseini have also investigated this word under the title "Investigating the view of Qāmūs on the meaning of Dhanb attributed to the Prophet (PBUH) in the Holy Qur'an".

Also, the article (Comparative study of the second verse of Surah Fath from the point of view of Shi'a and Sunni commentators) written by Hossein Alavi-Mehr and Moghaddas Bashiri deals with the meaning of this verse from the Shi'a and Sunni point of view. However, none of the articles have mentioned the interpretive difference of Shi'a and Sunni commentators in not using the precise terminology of the concept of Dhanb. The present study deals with this issue by emphasizing the role of lexicology in the correct interpretation of the second verse of Surah Fath and with the aim of investigating the role of lexicology in the exegetical approach of Shi'a and Sunni commentators. Therefore, the main question is, what is the role of the lexical examination of the word "Dhanb" by the Shi'a and Sunni commentators in the correct interpretation of the second verse of Surah Fath?

The Importance of Lexicology in Understanding the Meaning of Qur'anic Words

Since interpretation means "Explaining the customary content of the verses of the Qur'an and discovering its divine meaning and purpose based on the rules of Arabic literature and the principles of rational conversation" (Rajabi, 2004: 12). For the correct interpretation of the verses, a complete knowledge of the rules of Arabic language is required as one of the first tools to understand the Qur'an, which should be used. In order to interpret and understand the meaning of the verse, every commentator must examine the words in terms of lexicology, grammar and syntax and finally in terms of rhetoric. Therefore, the first step in the interpretation after determining the correct reading of the verse is to examine its vocabulary, which is done through the science of lexicology, and the commentator must obtain the literal meaning of the word at the time of its revelation by referring to Arabic dictionaries and poems and previous sources.

Of course, some words may be changed to another meaning as a result of multiple usages. For example, the word "Şirāt" in the dictionary means sensory path, i.e. truth, but due to its many uses in the Holy Qur'an, it is used in the sense of non-sensory path, and it has found another real meaning, which is called "Qur'anic truth". Based on this, the second meaning will be the truth for that word, even if it is used without analogy, this topic is also used in the science of principles under the title of "Shar'i truth" (Babayi, 2014: 87).

Also, with the passage of time, some words found different meaning other than the time of revelation, in which case the interpreter should refer to the culture of the time of revelation. For example, at the beginning of the revelation, the word Zakāt was used in the meaning of Mustahab charity, but now it is used in the meaning of Wājib charity. Therefore, the commentator must refer to the culture of the time of revelation, because not referring will cause interpretive mistakes.

One of the mistakes of the commentators, especially the Arabic commentators, is that they are satisfied with the meaning of Qur'anic words in their mind and neglect to understand the true meaning of the word. This makes them not pay attention to the meaning of the word in the time of revelation and interpret the verse based on the meaning of the present tense while this word may have been used in a different sense in the era of revelation. In fact, if the commentator is limited to the conventional meaning, it will cause errors in the correct understanding of the meaning of the verse. For this reason, it seems necessary to refer to dictionaries even for words that have a simple meaning.

The Concept of Dhanb

The word "Dhanb" (Dh, N, B) has three meanings; in the meaning of crime, the end of something that is the same as the tail of animals and in the meaning of interest and profit. (Ibn Fāris, 2008: 352) Therefore, one of the three meanings of the word "Dhanb" means crime. (Farāhīdī, 1414: 289) The reason for the name of Dhanb is that any act whose consequences are dire is called Dhanb because its punishment is like the tail of an animal at the end. (Qarashī, 1992, Vol. 3: 25) Then, this word is used as a metaphor for any work that has an unfortunate outcome, and as a consequence of everything. So the word (Dhanb) has been called bad end and punishment because of the result of sin. (Rāghib Isfihānī, 1412: 331)

Allameh Mustafawi in summarizing the concept of the word "Dhanb" writes: "Dhanb is an infinitive meaning subservience, and then the noun is placed for a low and late subordinate and non-separated from man." (Mustafawi, 1430, Vol. 3: 360) Dhanb in its absolute form means the sequence of human actions that can result in humiliation.

This word has mentioned in the singular form and with or without genitive case in eleven verses of the Holy Qur'an, whose structural forms are as follows:

- a) In two cases, it is mentioned in the form of Nakarah, which are:
 - "And they have a crime against me, so I fear that they will kill me." (Shu'arā/14)
 - "For what sin she was slain" (Takwīr: 9).
- b) In one case it is mentioned in the form of Ma'refah by al:
 - "The Forgiver of sin, the Acceptor of repentance" (Ghāfir: 3)
- c) In eight cases, it has been added to the pronouns (your, his, and their).
 - Four times with the pronoun (your): "That Allah may forgive your sin that which is past and that which is to come" (Fath: 2).

Twice with the pronoun (his): "So We took each one in his sin" ('Ankabūt: 40) and twice with the pronoun (their): "So they acknowledge their sins" (Mulk: 11). Of course, the word "Dhanb" is also used in the plural form in thirty cases, which does not need to mention all cases. This research examines the meaning of this word in the second verse of Surah Fath due to the sensitivity of using the word (Dhanb) about the personality of the Prophet (PBUH).

Explaining the Reason for the Revelation of the Verse and Its General Meaning

Fath is the 48th Surah of the Holy Qur'an, which is placed in the 112th place in the descending order. This surah is one of the Madanī surahs revealed at the end of the Prophet's (PBUH) life and during the Treaty of Ḥudaybiyyah. The beginning of the surah begins with the glad tidings of victory to Muslims, that's why it is named Surah Fath. The almighty God says: "Lo! We have given thee (O Muhammad) a signal victory. That Allah may forgive thee of thy sin that which is past and that which is to come, and may perfect His favor unto thee, and may guide thee on a right path. And that Allah may help thee with strong help." (Fath: 1-3)

The reason for the revelation of the holy verse is as follows: "Muḥammad ibn Ibrahim Daraki narrates with evidence from Miswar ibn Makhrama and Marwan ibn Hakam that Surah Fath was revealed from the beginning to the end between Mecca and Medina after the Treaty of Ḥudaybiyyah. Mansour ibn Abi Mansour Samani narrates from Anas that when we returned from the battle of Ḥudaybiyyah and it was while the polytheists had prevented us from performing Hajj and we were sad and broken-hearted, "Surah Fath" was revealed to the Messenger of God (PBUH) and he said: "A verse has been revealed to me that I love more than the world and everything in it." (Wahedi, 1411 AH: 202) Therefore, the first verse of Surah Fath speaks of a victory, which was achieved after many hardships at the end of the

migration of the Prophet of Islam and caused him great happiness. This narration is also narrated in the Book "Asbāb al-Nuzūl al-Qur'ān" by Tirmidhī and Al-Ḥākim, citing Anas. (See: 'Ināyah, 1411 AH: 350)

Most of the various discussions about these verses are focused on the second verse and the word (Dhanb). Due to the presence of lām ta'īl at the beginning of the second verse, conquering on behalf of the Almighty God is due to the forgiveness of sin. If Dhanb is used in the sense of sin, the meaning of the verse is as follows: God gave you victory to forgive your past and future sins. But if we consider the word "Dhanb" in the meaning of sequence of work, it means: Allah has given you victory to give you the results of your past and future deeds.

The Interpretative Approach of Shi'a and Sunni Commentators

As mentioned in the importance of lexicology in the interpretation of the verses, the commentator in the interpretation of the verses must refer to the lexical meaning of the words of the Qur'an in the lexical sources in order to interpret the verse by acquiring the main meaning of the word at the time of revelation. Sunni and Shi'a commentators have different opinions in interpreting this verse, which is due to their tools in interpretation.

Sunni Interpretative Approach

Sunni commentators differ in the interpretation of this verse. In such a way that it is not possible to consider a comprehensive aspect for their opinions, that's why we expressed their opinions in the form of three groups. It should be noted that the approach of Sunni commentators in interpreting this verse is based on their theological point of view.

A. The First Group: Dhanb Means Sin

The first group of Sunni commentators is those who believe that infallibility is specific for the time of Nubuwwah and that the Prophet's sin before Nubuwwah does not harm his dignity. Therefore, regarding the verses in which the word (Dhanb) is used, they believe; the Prophet has already committed sins that have been forgiven by God. Ṭabarī is one of the great Sunni commentators; he is one of the people who express his belief more clearly than other commentators that the Holy Prophet (PBUH) is allowed to sin and also proves it with some reasons. In his commentary, without examining the meaning of the word "Dhanb", he limited himself to the common meaning of this word and said: "The holy verse (May Allah forgives you) is actually a message from the Almighty God to the Holy Prophet (PBUH) about the reward of his actions on thanksgiving for the blessings that God has given him, such as victory, because God rewards his servants for their deeds and not for something he has not done" (Ṭabarī, 1412 AH, Vol. 26: 43) According to Ṭabarī, the Holy Prophet (PBUH) has had sins that God forgives him because of his actions and thanks to God's blessings. He believes that if the Prophet (PBUH) has done no sins, forgiveness in this verse would have no meaning and relevance. Then, by insisting on the meaning of Istighfār, he argues that since Istighfār means that a servant asks God to forgive his sins, therefore, if people have done no sins, there will be nothing to be forgiven by God.

In the interpretation of this verse, Qāḍī 'Abd al-Jabbār, like Ṭabarī, considers the word "Dhanb" to mean the sin of the Holy Prophet (PBUH) and writes: "Dhanb means any sin done by the Prophet before the prophecy and any sin after it, and both of them are forgiven." (Qāḍī 'Abd al-Jabbār, 1426 AH: 393)

Fakhr Rāzī, like most Sunni commentators, believes that the prophets are infallible during the time of prophecy, and they do not commit major or minor sins intentionally, but they are not infallible in making mistake. In fact, according to them, the infallibility of the Prophet (PBUH) is limited to the time of Nubuwwah and does not include before it. (See: Fakhr Rāzī, 1420 AH, Vol. 3: 455)

Regarding the second verse of Surah Fath, he initially presented different views about the concept of Fath, and finally preferred the conquest of Mecca and proved it with several reasons. Then by asking the question that there is no sin for the Holy Prophet (PBUH), so how God forgives him? He answers like this: "The first is the sin of the believers, the second is the abandonment of the better deed, the third is minor sins, which are permissible for the prophets intentionally or unintentionally because such mistakes keep them away from arrogance, and the fourth is infallibility." (Fakhr Rāzī, 1420 AH, v. 28: 26) He further explains that the sins of the Prophet before Nubuwwah are forgiven through forgiveness and the sins after Nubuwwah are also forgiven through infallibility. (Ibid: 67) As it is clear, Fakhr Rāzī, due to the lack of examining the word Dhanb, considers its conventional meaning and believes in the realization of sin by the Holy Prophet (PBUH) who was forgiven with the promise of victory.

It is interesting that when Fakhr Rāzī comes to the same word about Prophet Musa (PBUH), creates a question and answers and writes: "Does it indicate the sin done by the Prophet? His answer: No, and what is meant is that they consider it as a sin" (Ibid. Vol. 24: 494), in fact, although Fakhr Rāzī considers the word Dhanb to mean sin, he rejects the commission of it by Prophet Musa (PBUH) and says that the Israelites consider it a sin. But he considers the same word about the Prophet (PBUH) to mean sin.

Of course, Fakhr Rāzī's point of view does not end with this verse, because he expresses the matter in a different way in the discussion of seeking forgiveness for sins. In his opinion, everyone needs forgiveness, except for the angels, because there is no mention in the verses about asking for forgiveness by the angels. Therefore, according to him, the status of an angel is higher than that of a human being. The important point about this is that Fakhr Rāzī did not exclude the prophets and according to the verse "Ask forgiveness for your sin and for the faithful men and women" (Muhammad: 19) proves that the prophets also need forgiveness for their sins. (Fakhr Rāzī, 1420 AH, v. 28: 52) Therefore, according to Fakhr Rāzī, due to the relation of forgiveness to the Prophet (PBUH) in the verses of the Qur'an, it is possible for him to commit a sin.

In his commentary, Suyuṭī did not give an explanation about the word "Dhanb" and merely stated the narrations that he considers the meaning of past sins to be the sins at the time of ignorance and the future sins to be the sins at the time of Islam. He also goes on to quote narrations from Ayesha, Abu Hurairah and Anas, all of which contain such a theme. After the revelation of the verse (That Allah may forgive thee of thy sin that which is past and that which is to come, and may perfect His favour unto thee, and may guide thee on a right path), the Holy Prophet (PBUH) made a lot of effort in worship and prayer, so that his blessed feet became swollen. He was told why you are trying so hard when God has forgiven you, the Prophet said in response: "Shall I not be a grateful servant?" (Suyuṭī, 1404 AH, Vol. 6: 70). Therefore, Suyuṭī has also limited the meaning of the word (Dhanb) to the realization of sins by the Holy Prophet (PBUH) as a possible thing.

Ibn 'Āshūr, a contemporary Sunni commentator, first of all, with a syntactic analysis of the holy verse, states that the "L i.e. to" in this verse (to be forgiven by Allah) is not an explanatory L that causes the necessity of limitation for the purpose of the verb, but there are many things that have many reasons that according to the requirements of the position, some of them are mentioned. In the following, it is concluded that this forgiveness is specific for the Prophet (PBUH) and is different from the forgiveness that is obtained for the Mujahidin due to Jihad and conquest. (Ibn 'Āshūr, nd, Vol. 26: 125) In explaining the sins of the Prophet (PBUH), he offers a different interpretation and believes that this forgiveness belongs to all the past sins of the Prophet and all the sins that are considered sin by the Prophet (PBUH) because of the severity of piety. In fact, they are considered sin for the Prophet (PBUH) in terms of "The good deeds of the righteous are like a sin for the most pious ones". So, like Fakhr Rāzī and other commentators, he did not mention the real meaning of the word Dhanb and considers its conventional meaning as sin. with the difference that there is a kind of doubt in his words; because on the one hand, he considers some sins for the Prophet (PBUH) and on the other hand, he considers these sins as sins

according to the Holy Prophet, then he writes: "Then this verse does not confirm that Prophet has done a sin or he will sin, but the meaning is that the Almighty God has removed the non-excuse, even though he has the power to sin. (Ibid)

It is interesting that Ibn 'Āshūr under the verse "Patiently, then, persevere: for the Promise of Allah is true: and ask forgiveness for thy fault" (Ghāfir: 55) in the discussion of the forgiveness of the Prophet (PBUH), he considers it a kind of forgiveness worthy of the position of Nubuwwah, that is, he asks God to continue his infallibility and this position is the evacuation of emotional turbidity because the Holy Prophet (PBUH) is in charge of asking for forgiveness, both in terms of worship and education. (See: Ibn 'Āshūr, nd, v. 24: 219)

Therefore, the first group of Sunni commentators are commentators who, without providing a precise conceptualization of the word (Dhanb), consider it a simple concept and focus on the conventional meaning of sin, and in the interpretation of this verse, they believe that the Prophet (PBUH) had sins that have been forgiven by the revelation of this verse.

B. The Second Group: Dhanb Means Leaving the Better Deed

The second group of Sunni commentators is those who, like the first group, did not provide a precise definition of the word (Dhanb), but because they see problems in attributing sin to the Prophet (PBUH), they analyzed the word Dhanb in the meaning of leaving the better deed. They explained the connection of this word with forgiveness in the verse and said that forgiveness is, in fact, forgiveness worthy of the position of Nubuwwah, not that the Holy Prophet (PBUH) also commits sins like ordinary people. Few Sunni commentators have such a view. In his commentary, referring to the Ash'arites religion, Ālūsī emphasizes the non-interpretation of divine actions to purposes. For this reason, they take L i.e. to (To be forgiven by Allah) in the meaning of simile to the final cause in the order of forgiveness over conquest, because the Prophet made great efforts in exalting the divine word; however, he continues by rejecting this point of view and explains that despite the fact that there are more than a thousand verses and hadiths in which there are reason, accepting their interpretation is going beyond the limits of fairness. Emphasizing the greatness of God's forgiveness in the phrase (Verily We have granted thee a manifest Victory), he considers forgiveness and victory to be among the things that God is only responsible for, and mentioning it with the pronoun "Mutikallim Ma'a al-Ghayr¹" refers to the existence of means for its realization.

Despite many explanations, he did not mention the literal meaning of (Dhanb) and finally, due to the position of the Prophet, he considers the meaning of Dhanb to be leaving the better deed and such as (The good deeds of the righteous are like a sin for the most pious ones). (Ālūsī, 1415 AH, Vol. 13: 245) He also writes about asking for forgiveness by the Holy Prophet (PBUH): "If supplication for forgiveness does not necessitate the obligation of a sin, rather it may be by increasing degrees, as indicated by his asking for forgiveness, is considered peace and blessings upon him a hundred times a day and night. " And tonight a hundred times" (ibid. Vol. 11: 262)

In addition to the infallibility of the Prophet (PBUH) in all aspects, Ālūsī believes in the infallibility of all prophets and in the verses where the story of Suleiman and the sighting of the horses are narrated, he strongly rejects the view of the commentators who consider him to be sinful for leaving the prayer and loving the world. And while calling such statements as absurd, he considers their opinions to be against reason and tradition. Also, he considers such stories as single news that does not have the authority to contradict strong proofs of innocence. (See: ibid. vol. 12: 188)

Haghi Brosavi is also among the commentators who believe in the infallibility of the prophets from the time of their birth. Because when it comes to the discussion of the infallibility of the prophets, in

¹ متكلم مع الغير

the definition of the infallibility of Jesus, he says: "He was infallible with the approval of the Holy Spirit, that is, from the beginning of his birth until his ascension to heaven, because of the intention of the Jews to kill him, never Satan approaches him." (Haghi Brosavi, nd, vol. 1: 177) Of course, referring to the story of Prophet Suleiman, he considers it permissible to make mistakes on the basis of negligence.

In the same phrase, without any explanation about (Dhanb), Bayḍāwī also considers the past and future sins in the meaning of (All of extremes you do, for which you are reprimanded). (Bayḍāwī, 1418 AH, Vol. 5: 126) It means all the mistakes done by the Prophet (PBUH) and he is blamed for the same reason. If we take this mistake to mean leaving the better deed, it is the same as Ālūsī's point of view, but if it means not doing all duties, it will have the concept of sin and should be placed next to Ṭabarī's opinion in the first group. Abd al-Karīm Khaṭīb, one of the Sunni contemporary commentators, without determining the meaning of the word "Dhanb", believes that forgiveness in the verse is an operation for the revelation of divine holy lights that descended from the sky on the Prophet (PBUH) and then no earthly dust will belong to him, and because of this blessing, prophecy will end. (See: Khaṭīb, nd, Vol. 13: 397) If dust means sins, according to his opinion, the Holy Prophet (PBUH) actually had sins, but after the revelation of this verse, he will not commit any more sins.

Therefore, the second group of Sunni commentators, without explaining the exact meaning of the word Dhanb based on lexicology, due to the contradiction with the infallibility of the Prophet (PBUH), consider the Dhanb as leaving the better deed, and with this interpretation, they intend not to distort the infallibility of the Holy Prophet (PBUH) with the word sin.

C. The Third Group: Just Quoting Sayings without Any Preference

The third group of Sunni commentators is those who only quote sayings and without preferring a particular saying, they limit themselves to explaining phrases other than (Dhanb). In fact, these commentators are either not aware of this doubt, or because they could not resolve this conflict, they did not investigate it in this verse. In Ma'ālim al-Tanzīl, by quoting several different Asbāb al-Nuzūl, Baghawī quotes several sayings in the meaning of the phrase (Forgiveness of your sin) and in the last saying, he quotes from Ata Khorasani that the meaning of past sins is the sins of Adam and Eve, and the meaning of future sins is the sins of the nation with your invitation, but in the end he does not prefer a specific saying. (See: Baghawī, 1420 AH, Vol. 4: 223)

In his commentary, Ibn Kathīr also introduces this divine promise as one of the prerogatives of the Prophet (PBUH) without referring to the realization or non-realization of the Prophet's sin, and no other person has such a position that his past and future sins will be forgiven. He considers this promise to be a kind of honor to the Prophet (PBUH) and writes: "And this is a great honor for the Messenger of God (PBUH)... and he is the most perfect human being ever and the master of all humans in this world and the hereafter." (Ibn Kathīr, 1419 AH, Vol. 7: 304)

Some commentators, like Zamakhsharī in Kashshāf (See: Zamakhsharī, 1407 AH, vol. 4: 333) and also Qurṭubī in Tafsir al-Jami (ref: Qurṭubī, 1985, vol. 16: 263), have limited themselves to quoting the sayings of others and they have not preferred a particular opinion. Of course, Zamakhsharī considers the meaning of the word "Dhanb" to be a literal meaning under the verse "And (further), they have a charge of crime against me; and I fear they may slay me" (Shu'arā: 14) and says: Sin is called sin as the punishment of bad deed is bad deed. (Zamakhsharī, Vol.3: 303) He also writes in the commentary of the holy verse "Allah pardon you! Why did you give them leave" (Tawbah: 43) about the forgiveness of God Almighty towards the Prophet (PBUH): "God forgives you" is an allusion to the occurrence of crime and sin because the meaning of pardon is compatible with it, and its meaning is that you have made a mistake and what bad thing you have done, and it is an ironic expression of pardon. In a summary, it can be stated that most of the great Sunni commentators believe that the verse in question refers to the forgiveness of the sins of the Holy Prophet (PBUH) and among them, only Ālūsī clearly pays attention to the dignity of

the Prophet and considers it as leaving the better deed. For this reason, the differences of opinions of Sunni commentators are serious differences that cannot be summed up in any way.

The Interpretive Approach of Shi'a Commentators

There is no difference among Shi'a commentators on the issue and they all believe that the word "Dhanb" in this verse cannot be considered in the conventional sense of sin; because according to the Shi'a belief, not only the Prophet (PBUH) but all divine prophets are infallible from birth. They are often divided into three groups based on the two correct narrations that will be mentioned.

A. The First Group: The Meaning of Sin, the Result of the Prophet's Actions, According to the Pagans of Mecca, in Calling to Islam

The first group is the commentators who have considered (Dhanb) to mean the sequence of work in terms of the lexical concept. From the point of view of infidels and polytheists, if the Prophet (PBUH) incited Muslims against idolatry and disbelief, such an act is considered a sin, and by conquering Mecca and their convert to Islam, these sins will be forgiven. Of course, the Shi'a commentators have relied on a narration from Imam Reza (AS) to prove their point of view, which will be discussed below.

Allameh Tabataba'i, explaining the word (Dhanb) in the holy verse, writes: "Dhanb is any act that is followed by loss of benefit and expediency, and the root of the word is taken from Dhanb, which means the tail of an animal, and this word is not synonymous with the word sin, so that wherever it is used, it gives the meaning of disobedience, but its meaning is general. (Tabataba'i, 1995, Vol. 9: 384) He, according to the literal meaning of Dhanb, in addition to the literal meaning of forgiveness, which means to cover everything, they conclude that in this verse the meaning of these two words contradicts the common meaning of the people, which is the forgiveness of sins.

In fact, the word forgiveness means removing punishment and then creating reward. Therefore, other than the believer, he does not deserve forgiveness. For this reason, this word is only used about God Almighty. While the word "Forgiveness" causes the removal of blame, it does not lead to reward. For this reason, in addition to God Almighty, it is also used about Abd. (See: Abi Hilal Askari, 2010:264)

The connection between the meaning of the word (forgiveness) next to the word (sin) leads to the conclusion that due to the consequences of the sin that the polytheists and infidels of Mecca attributed to the Prophet (PBUH), the Almighty God removed the torment and hardship of this work from him and with the conquest of Mecca or the Treaty of Ḥudaybiyyah resulted in a reward for them.

According to the dignity of the revelation of the verse, the concept of Dhanb is the uprising of the Messenger of God against disbelief and polytheism, which began before the Hijra and continued after that with battles such as Badr, Uhud, and Khandaq. These affairs have ominous effects and examples of the word Dhanb from the point of view of infidels, and as long as the infidels had power, they could not forgive the Prophet (PBUH). But the Almighty God took away the power of the infidels with the Treaty of Ḥudaybiyyah and the conquest of Mecca. For this reason, these effects were erased and the sins of the infidels were forgiven.

Therefore, the majority of Shi'a commentators believe that this word, from the point of view of the Holy Qur'an, means the sequence of work, and from the point of view of the infidels and polytheists of Mecca, it means a sin that must be forgiven, which was forgiven with the conquest of Mecca and the conversion of Quraysh to Islam.

Mohammad Javad Mughniyah, after confirming this point of view, explains the connection between conquest and forgiveness as follows: "Conquest is the same reason that led to the discovery of

the truthfulness of the Prophet (PBUH) and his acquittal of the sin that the infidels and polytheists believed before the conquest of Mecca and attributed it to him" (Mughniyah, 1424 AH, Vol. 7: 84)

Allameh Ṭabṛasī, emphasizing the infinitive (Dhanb) and its genitive case, points out that it can be added to both the subject and the object, but in the holy verse, since it is added to the object, the past and future sins of the infidels means the sins that forced them to prevent the Prophet (PBUH) from entering Mecca and Masjid al-Haram. In fact, by conquering Mecca, God will give the Prophet the power to enter Mecca, and this is the reward He has given for his Jihad. (Ṭabṛasī, 1995, Vol. 23: 108) Of course, it should be mentioned that Ṭabṛasī's interpretation is similar to Allameh Tabataba'i's; with the difference that he used a syntactic expression.

Huwayzī, in his narrative commentary, has given a narration from Imam Reza (AS) that Imam Reza (AS) said in response to Ma'mun's question about the same verse: "No one was more sinful among the polytheists of Mecca than the Prophet (PBUH), because they worshiped 360 idols other than God." So when the Almighty God conquered Mecca for His Prophet and said: O Muhammad, "Surely We have given to you a clear victory. That Allah may forgive your community their past faults and those to follow" with the invitation of the Prophet (PBUH) towards monotheism in Among the polytheists, there were some sins that were forgiven because some of the polytheists of Mecca converted to Islam, some left Mecca, and there remained people who were not able to deny monotheism, so with the invitation of the people, his sins were forgiven. (See: Huwayzī, 1415 AH, Vol. 4: 443; Majlisī, nd, Vol. 11: 83) This narration is actually a reference to determine the meaning of the word (Dhanb) in the holy verse, which should be considered by the commentators. According to the narration of Imam Reza (AS) the meaning of (Dhanb) in this verse is the actions that were mentioned by the Prophet (PBUH) and are considered sins from the eyes of the polytheists of Mecca.

As stated, from the point of view of the Shi'a commentators, if the word Dhanb is related to the Holy Prophet (S), it is definitely meant in its literal meaning, because it cannot be considered a sin for him, because according to other verses that are mentioned in the description of the Prophet (S), He is one of the first Muslims. "Say: Shall I take a guardian besides Allah, the Originator of the heavens and the earth, and He feeds (others) and is not (Himself) fed. Say: I am commanded to be the first who submits himself, and you should not be of the polytheists..." (An'ām: 14-16) Also, the first worshipers are introduced: "Say: If the Beneficent Allah has a son, I am the foremost of those who serve" (Zukhruf: 81) so how can sin be attributed to them, while they have never gone astray. "Your companion does not err, nor does he go astray" (Najm: 2) All sins are from the devil, while no devil had dominion over him: "Surely, as regards My servants, you have no authority, over them except those who follow you of the deviators" (Hijr: 42) Therefore, the most correct interpretation is that the word (Dhanb) is not taken as sin but in the sense of disobedience, neither error nor leaving the better deed, but rather its literal meaning, which is the sequence and end of something. (Sadeghi Tehrani, 1419 AH, Vol. 27: 151)

Therefore, Shi'a commentators believe that the Prophet (PBUH) was a sinner according to the pagans of Mecca. In addition to a belief sin, such as denying idolatry, he had a legal sin because he had killed the pagans of Mecca in the Battle of Badr and Uhud. With the spread of Islam and the conquest of Mecca, both belief and legal sins of the Prophet (PBUH) were forgiven. The same type of sin is also mentioned in the Holy Qur'an about Prophet Moses (PBUH). "And they have a crime against me, therefore I fear that they may slay me" (Shu'arā: 14) According to the opinion of Pharaoh's family, Prophet Moses was also a sinner. (Jawādī Āmulī, 2015: 275)

Therefore, according to the opinion of this group of Shi'a commentators, according to the tradition, the meaning of the word "Dhanb" is the Prophet's actions and their results, which were considered sins according to infidels. The conquest of Mecca has led to the faith of the infidels and to some extent the forgiveness of the Prophet's deeds.

B. The Second Group: Dhanb Means the Sins of the Prophet's (PBUH) Community

The second group of commentators are those who consider the meaning of the word (Dhanb) to be the same as sin, but because it contradicts the infallibility of the Prophet (PBUH), they add an additional word for this word in the verse in order to find the meaning (Dhanb of your nation). They believe that due to the intensity of the nation's attribution and connection to the Prophet, the word "Dhanb" has been attached to him. (See: Kashani, 1957, Vol. 8:362) Similar to the verse (Ask the township where we were) which means the people of the town, and genitive case was removed in this verse and it was placed with another word. This issue is also found in the holy verse (And the Lord came). (Ṭūsī, nd, vol. 9: 314) To prove their opinion, these commentators quote a tradition from Imam Ṣādiq (AS) in which it is stated: "I swear to God that there was no sin for the Prophet (PBUH) and he has never done a sin, but God Almighty became his guarantor to forgive the sins of the Shi'a of Ali ibn Abī Ṭālib, both in the past and in the future." (Faiz Kashani, 1415 A.H., v. 5: 38) Of course, Faiz Kashani considers the extent of the forgiveness of the Prophet's sins beyond that of the Shi'a and considers all human beings as deserving of this forgiveness because the Prophet (PBUH) was sent to the general public and with the great mercy of God, the sins of all human beings from Adam to the Day of Judgment are intended to be forgiven (All past and future sins).

The noteworthy point is that there are several narrations with the same theme that confirm it. (See: Bahrānī, 1416 AH, v. 5: 86) It is said that a Jewish person asked Imam Ali (AS) whether God accepted Adam's repentance. Imam Ali (AS) replied: "Yes He does, and Muḥammad was revealed for something greater and he had no sins. Allah (Glorified and Exalted) said: "I forgive your past and future sins. Indeed, Muḥammad is not compatible with a sin for the Resurrection, and it is not desirable for him to commit a sin." (Qomi, 1984, vol. 2: 314; See: Mashhadhi Qomi, 1989, vol. 12: 271)

Of course, the noteworthy point is that the forgiveness of the sins of the Prophet's nation (PBUH) according to this verse is not the same as the forgiveness of the sins of Christians by sacrificing Jesus Christ. Because Christians believe; man is born contaminated by the sin of his father, Adam (PBUH), and when Christ (PBUH) was crucified, all the sins of Christians are forgiven. Whereas, if the meaning of (to forgive) in this view is the forgiveness of the sins of the Shi'a of the Prophet, it should definitely be done in the form of intercession. This means that the Shi'a should have the capacity to accept the intercession of the Prophet (PBUH) and Imams (PBUH) through their efforts.

Of course, in addition to the second verse of Surah Faṭḥ, there are other verses where the word "Dhanb" is attributed to the Prophet (PBUH). For example: "Then have patience (O Muhammad). Lo! The promise of Allah is true. And ask forgiveness of thy sin, and hymn the praise of thy Lord at fall of night and in the early hours." (Ghāfir: 55) Also; "So know (O Muhammad) that there is no Allah save Allah, and ask forgiveness for thy sin and for believing men and believing women." (Muhammad: 19) Along with asking for forgiveness, he expresses an important point. In fact, asking for forgiveness does not imply that the Prophet has committed a sin that is not worthy of him, because asking for forgiveness is not specific to the sin, but sometimes it is to attract the soul's full attention to the master, and sometimes to receive a reward. Because Istighfār is an independent act of obedience and worship that leads to reward, not just to remove sin and avoid punishment. (Kashani, 1957, Vol. 3: 110) Therefore, the command of seeking forgiveness to the Prophet (PBUH) is actually a command to worship God so that by asking for forgiveness, his ranks will rise and on the other hand, he will be an example for the believers to follow him. (Ṭabrasī, 1981, vol. 21: 285) Therefore, the second group of commentators, according to the hadiths, considers the meaning of Dhanb in the holy verse to be the sins of the Ummah.

C. The Third Group: Dhanb Means Leaving the Better Deed

The third group is commentators who consider the meaning of Dhanb in the verse to be leaving the better deed. The meaning of leaving the better deed actually means preferring the good deed to the better deed and the important to the more important. In this situation, Prophet did not commit a sin, but it

would have been better if he had not done this. Like a doctor's advice to his patient to avoid certain foods. Faiz Kashani is one of these commentators who consider the Prophet's sin as leaving the better deed. (Faiz Kashani, 1415 AH, Vol. 4: 345) This point of view has few supporters among Shi'a commentators because most of them have adhered to the narrations that came up in two parts and made it the equivalent of the verse for the concept of Dhanb. Of course, some Shi'a commentators have not addressed the issue (Dhanb) in the holy verse and have not answered the problems in this regard. (See: Abul Futuh Razi, 1408 AH, Volume 17: 253)

Therefore, in a summary of the opinions of Shi'a commentators, it can be stated; all the Shi'a commentators are unanimous that no sin was committed by the Prophet (PBUH) and if there are words like (Dhanb) in the verses of the Holy Qur'an, either its literal meaning is intended i.e. the sequence of whatever is desired, or according to the hadiths, it means the sins that the polytheists attribute to the Prophet or the sins of the Prophet's (PBUH) Ummah that are forgiven by the conquest of Mecca.

A Comparative Study of the Opinions of Shi'a and Sunni Commentators

As can be seen from the opinions of the Shi'a and Sunni commentators, the majority of the commentators believe that the prophets of God and the Holy Prophet (PBUH) have infallibility and are immune from performing forbidden acts by the grace of God. It is remarkable because it is not possible to consider a comprehensive aspect between their views. In fact, because one group believes in the commission of sin by the Prophet and another group denies it, their differences are of the type of contradiction and there is no ability to add up between them. Therefore, the existence of conflicting differences between Sunni commentators is the best proof of the existence of a serious weakness in their foundations, as well as the neglect of precise lexicography in examining the verses.

In addition to this, numerous rational and narrative reasons have been established for the infallibility of the prophets, which show the problems in the interpretive approach of Sunnis. For this reason, the words of Shi'a commentators can be preferred based on the following reasons:

- 1- As stated, one of the rules of interpretation is not to be satisfied with the conventional meanings of Qur'anic words. (See: Babayi, 2014: 82) Before interpreting the verses, the commentator must avoid interfering with the meaning of the Qur'anic words by carefully examining the meaning of the Qur'anic words in order to discover the original meaning of the word. This causes the original meaning of the word to be included in the verse in the beginning, so that it deviates from the original meaning if there is an opposite of it. Therefore, Allameh Tabataba'i points out that the meaning of the word (Dhanb) is the same as the literal meaning (sequence of work) and it cannot mean sin.
- 2- In addition to the first reason, the disjointed analogy in this holy verse will prevent the interpretation of the Dhanb as the sin of the Holy Prophet (PBUH). Because there are many narrations in the Shi'a interpretations, in which the Imams (AS) have determined the meaning of (Dhanb) either in the sense of the sins attributed to him by the polytheists or the sins of the Shi'a of the Prophet, and despite these evidences, it definitely doesn't mean the appearance of the words of the Qur'an and another meaning should be determined. An example of this can be found in the interpretation of verses related to divine attributes. For example, in the holy verse (The Hand of Allah is above their hands.), one cannot commit to the authenticity of the appearance of the Qur'an and consider a hand for God Almighty.
- 3- As stated in the fundamental discussions, the appearances of the Holy Qur'an are authentic as long as there is no narrative or intellectual evidence for its absence in the verse. Usuli scholars believe that when performing the originality of appearance, we should assume that the speaker intended his words contrary to their appearance. In other words, if the appearance of the word (Dhanb) from the conventional point of view indicates sin, but based on rational and narrative reasons, the

appearance of the Holy Qur'an should be abandoned and the meaning appropriate to the realm of divine prophets should be chosen.

- 4- In addition to the mentioned cases, based on the conflict between this verse and the verses that indicate the absolute infallibility of the Prophet (PBUH), the appearance of the word (Dhanb) should be abandoned and the appropriate meaning should be taken. Through the method of Qur'an to Qur'an, according to the verses that command absolute obedience to the Prophet (PBUH) "Obey Allah and the Messenger..." (Al-Imrān: 32) as well as the holy verse "Nor does he speak out of desire, It is naught but revelation that is revealed" (Najm: 3-4) it can be argued that pure and absolute obedience to someone is true on the condition of being innocent of any kind of sin, error and mistake, intentionally or unintentionally. In fact, if Prophet is allowed to make mistakes, he may mislead others instead of lead, he may order wrongly, and this causes the people to lose their trust in him, and people no longer oblige themselves to obey him.
- 5- Regarding the infallibility of the prophets before the Nubuwwah, it can also be argued that reaching the position of Nubuwwah requires having the necessary qualifications before Nubuwwah. A person who commits sins and mistakes himself can never be worthy to reach the position of Nubuwwah and speak with God Almighty; therefore, the Prophet (PBUH) and all divine prophets must be free from any sin before reaching the position of Nubuwwah to hold the position of Nubuwwah.

Conclusion

One of the essentials of the interpretive method is using lexicology. The interpreter should examine the literal meaning of the Qur'anic word in the interpretation of the verse at the time of revelation. Otherwise, it is not possible to find certainty in the interpretation of the verse, because in some cases the meaning of the word has moved away from the revelation time and has been changed to another meaning. According to the present research, the Sunni commentators without examining the literal meaning of the word (Dhanb) in the second verse of Surah Faṭḥ and relying on the conventional meaning of this word, consider it to mean sin, which contradicts the position of infallibility of the Holy Prophet (PBUH). For the same reason, in many cases, they believe that the Prophet (PBUH) committed a sin. But the Shi'a commentators, in addition to referring to the lexical sources and examining the original and true meaning of this word, also attached the intellectual reasons for the infallibility of the Prophet (PBUH) to it and relying on the narrations of the Ahl al-Bayt about the reason for the revelation of the verse, have defined (Dhanb) in the meaning of the sequel and the result of the acts of the Prophet (PBUH) so that it does not conflict with the position of infallibility of the Prophet (PBUH).

References

* Al-Qur'an al-Karim

Abul Futuh Razi, Hossein ibn Muhammad, 1408 AH, Rawḍ al-Jinān wa Rūḥ al-Janān fi Tafsir al-Qur'an, Mashhad: Astan Quds.

Ālūsī, Seyyed Maḥmūd, 1415 AH, Rūḥ al-Ma'ānī fi Tafsir al-Qur'an al-Azim, Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyyah.

ʿArūsī Huwayzī, 1415 AH, Abd Ali ibn Jum'ah, Tafsir Nur al-Thaqalayn, Qom: Ismailia.

Asgari, Abu Hilal Abdullah ibn Sahl, 2010 AD, Furuq al-Lughah, Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyyah.

Babayi, Ali Akbar, 2014 AD, Methodology of Qur'an Interpretation, Qom: Seminary and University Research Institute.

- Baghawī, Ḥusayn ibn Mas'ūd, 1420 AH, Ma'ālim al-Tanzīl fi Tafsir al-Qur'an, Beirut: Dar Ihyā Turāth al-Arabī.
- Bahrānī, Hāshim ibn Suleiman, 1416 AH, Al-Burhān fi Tafsir al-Qur'an, Tehran: Bi'thah Foundation.
- Bayḍāwī, Abdullah ibn Umar, 1418 AH, Anwār al-Tanzīl wa Asrār al-Ta'wīl, Beirut: Dar Ihyā al-Turāth al-Arabī.
- Faiz Kashani, Mohsen, 1415 AH, Tafsir al-Safi, Tehran: Sadr.
- Fakhr Rāzī, Muḥammad ibn Umar, 1420 AH, Mafatih al-Ghayb, Beirut: Ihyā al-Turāth al-Arabī.
- Farahidi, Khalil ibn Ahmad, 1414 AH, Al-'Ayn, Qom: Nashr al-Islami.
- Haghi Brosavi, Ismail, nd, Rūh Al Bayān, Beirut: Dar al-Fekr.
- Ibn 'Āshūr, Muḥammad Ibn Ṭāhir, nd. Al-Taḥrīr wa al-Tanwīr, Beirut: Institute of History.
- Ibn Fāris, Ahmad ibn Zakarīyā, 1999 AD, the arrangement of Maqāyis al-Lughah, Qom: Seminary and University Research Center.
- Ibn Kathīr, Ismail ibn Umar, 1419 AH, Tafsir al-Qur'an al-Azim, Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyyah.
- 'Inayah, Ghazi Hossein, 1411 AH, Asbāb al-Nuzūl al-Qur'ani, Beirut: Dar al-Jail.
- Jawādī Āmulī, Abdullah, 2006 AD, Revelation and Nubuwwah in the Qur'an, Qom: Isra.
- Kashani, Mulla Fathullah, 1987 AD, Manhaj al-Sadiqin fi Ilzam al-Mukhalifin, Tehran: Mohammad Hassan Elmi.
- Khaṭīb, Abdul Karīm, nd, Al-Tafsir Al-Qur'ani lil-Qur'an, Beirut: Dar al-Fikr al-Arabī.
- Majlisī, Mohammad Bāqir, nd, Bihar al-Anwar, Beirut: Dar Ihyā Turāth al-Arabī.
- Mozaffar, Mohammad Reza, 2015 AD, Uṣūl al-Fiqh, translated by Mohsen Gharawiyān, Qom: Dar al-Fikr.
- Mu'addab, Seyyed Reza, 2013 AD, Interpretive Methods of the Qur'an, Qom: Ishraq.
- Mughniyah, Mohammad Jawad, 1424 AH, Tafsir al-Kashif, Tehran: Dar al-Kutub al-Islamiya.
- Mustafawi, Hassan, 1430 AH, Researching the words of the Qur'an, Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyyah.
- Qāḍī, Abdul Jabbār ibn Ahmad, 1426 AH, Tanzih al-Qur'an an al-Mata'an, Beirut: Dar al-Nahdah al-Hadithah.
- Qarashī, Seyyed Ali Akbar, 1992 AD, Qur'an Dictionary, Tehran: Dar al-Kutub al-Islamiya.
- Qomi, Ali ibn Ibrahim, 1984 AD, Tafsir al-Qami, Qom: Dar al-Kutub.
- Qomi Mashhadi, Mohammad ibn Mohammad Reza, 1989 AD, Tafsir Kanz al-Daqayiq wa Bahr al-Gharayib, Tehran: Ministry of Guidance.
- Qurṭubī, Muḥammad ibn Ahmad, 1985 AD, Al-Jami al-Ahkam al-Qur'an, Tehran: Nasser Khosrow.

- Rāghib Isfihānī, Hossein ibn Muhammad, 1412 AH, Vocabulary of Qur'anic Words, Beirut: Dar al-Qalam.
- Rajabi, Mahmoud, 2004 AD, The Method of Qur'an Interpretation, Qom: Seminary and University Research Institute.
- Sadeghi Tehrani, Muhammad, 1419 AH, Al-Balagh Fi Tafsir al-Qur'an bi al-Qur'an, Qom: Sadeghi.
- Suyuṭī, Abd al-Rahman ibn Abi Bakr, 1404 A.H., Al-Durr al-Manthūr fi Tafsir al-Ma'thūr, Qom: Ayatollah Mar'ashi Library.
- Ṭabarī, Muḥammad ibn Jarīr, 1412 AH, Jami al-Bayān fi Tafsir al-Qur'an, Beirut: Dar al-Ma'rafah.
- Tabataba'i, Muḥammad Hossein, 1408 AH, Al-Mizan fi Tafsir al-Qur'an, Qom: Society of teachers.
- Ṭabrasī, Faḍl ibn Hasan, 1993 AD, Majma al-Bayān fi Tafsir al-Qur'an, Tehran: Nasser Khosrow.
- Ṭūsī, Muḥammad ibn Ḥasan, nd, al-Tibyān fi Tafsir al-Qur'an, Beirut: Dar Ihyā al-Turāth al-Arabī.
- Wahidi, Ali ibn Ahmad, 1411 AH, Asbāb al-Nuzūl al-Qur'ani, Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyyah.
- Zamakhsharī, Mahmud, 1407 AH, Al-Kashshāf an Haqā'iq Ghawāmiḍ al-Tanzīl, Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-Arabī.

Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal.

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).