



The Position of Women Legislators as a Form of Inclusive Citizenship in the Political Agenda for Gender Equality

Dini Nur Fadhillah; Triyanto; Muhammad Hendri Nuryadi

Faculty of Teacher Training and Education, Universitas Sebelas Maret, Surakarta, Indonesia

<http://dx.doi.org/10.18415/ijmmu.v8i10.3120>

Abstract

The study aims to conduct a qualitative analysis of the position of women legislators as a form of inclusive citizenship on the political agenda for gender equality. The case study approach was conducted to identify the position of women in the legislature as representatives of women in fighting for the Political Agenda. Data collection is carried out through interviews, observations, and documentation from women legislators in the Jakarta Regional Representative Council. This study showed that the representation of women legislators was motivated by formal representation to meet women's quotas. This condition illustrates that to fulfill the quota of 30% of women again used as a tool so that male legislator candidates can follow the election. There is no clear selection process and only fixated on party decisions.

Keywords: *Women Legislators; Inclusive Citizenship; Political Agenda; Gender Equality*

Introduction

Discrimination against women that continues to occur in various parts of the world shows that understanding and efforts to realize gender equality still find many obstacles (Gheaus, 2017). A patriarchal culture that positions women in stereotypes, roles, and positions that make them considered unimportant, especially in politics (Yoon et al., 2018). Stereotypes of women are constructed feminine, not knowing the firmness, might, or firmness that becomes the main element of power that is more synonymous with masculine attitudes (Saguni, 2014). According to Lovenduski (Cardo, 2020), parliament is a storehouse of masculinity in politics. This is due to the existence of gender views that can lead to subordination to women. So they cannot come out to lead in government. Therefore, gender injustice results in attitudes that put women in unimportant political decisions (Massé et al., 2021).

Women as citizens have the right to participate in politics (Finlay & Hopkins, 2019). In addition, women's participation should be given space in the decision-making process because their historical and empirical experience is different from men (Stone, 1996). Thus, the struggle for the representation of women in parliament deserves to be appreciated. According to Bargain et al. (2019), participation is a process of citizens, both as individuals, groups, and as organizations, having a role in planning, implementing, and evaluating various policies that affect their lives. The participation of women legislators who have entered parliament is expected to be directly involved in decision-making related to their interests as women (Yao & You, 2018).

On the other hand, the presence of women as legislators provides opportunities and opportunities for them to play an active role as citizens through political participation by participating in making fair policies (Arvate et al., 2021). The hope is that women will participate in fighting for the rights of citizens and minimizing policies that are free from gender equality. The representation of elected women legislators is the politics of presence that can channel political interests well. In addition, the interests of marginalized groups cannot be channeled if there are no women legislators involved in parliament so that both men and women have the same opportunity in the process of decision-making involvement in policymaking (Prasad & Thampi, 2021). This is based on Marshall's concept of gender in citizenship in Cela (2015) that citizenship is gender-neutral. So that gender does not determine or distinguish the rights and obligations of either men or women. They have the same civil, political, and social rights and obligations.

According to Heath (2005), women legislators tend to study, change, and report on the issues of women, children, and family laws that give them power in the policy process. Increasing the proportion of women in the legislature, issues of particular concern to many women, such as women's rights and children's and family issues, can spread among all local regulators. Based on the results of Spark, Cox, and Corbett (2019), policy emphasis on political representation is legitimized by descriptive and substantive elements. Descriptive representation relates to the number of women selected, reflecting women's empowerment in society (Dhima et al., 2021). The substantial representation shows that women will make better decisions for women and society at large (Vural et al., 2021). This reflects the aspiration to allocate resources more fairly. The study aimed to analyze how women legislators stand as a form of inclusive citizenship on the political agenda for gender equality in Jakarta Regional People Representatives.

Research Methods

Qualitative techniques used by researchers are done to share understanding, perception and explore how the position of women legislators as a form of inclusive citizenship affects the political agenda for gender equality. Lune and Berg (2017) also explained that the deeper their knowledge about a particular group, the more it captures the group's uniqueness. The group in this study is an elected women legislator in the Jakarta Regional People Representative Council for 2019-2024. According to Yin (2011), the case study method is an effort made by researchers to systematically investigate women legislators from affirmative action results that show the representation of women legislators in the Jakarta Regional People Representatives Council. To collect observational data, researchers act as participants directly. So, researchers participated in filling out the list of attendance and sitting with constituents as participants in recess activities and socialization of local regulations. The study used semi-structured interviews. According to Braun and Clarke (2019), researchers have a list of questions, but there is room for participants to raise issues that researchers have not anticipated; This is the most common type of interview in qualitative research. The interview was conducted for 60- 90 minutes on six women legislators. Researchers also collected public documents such as recess reports, legislator performance reports, national journals, and international journals (Creswell, 2017). In the triangulation of the data, researchers compared the results of observations made through interviews. This is done to compare the words expressed in general with private. Then compare the results of the interview data with existing documents. In addition, because the research topic includes sensitive matters, the validity of data through data triangulation becomes important to sort information tailored to the research purpose. Data analysis is based on Miles and Huberman (1994) data reduction, data presentation, conclusions, and verification.

Results and Discussions

Extreme male power with social and cultural systems supports women's political participation rarely reach the top. According to Wahid (2014), women must revolt and do not want to be limited to political instruments, loyal supporters of political parties, or used for groups with power over women. Based

on the research code of ethics, the name of the informant in Jakarta, women can participate through the legislature actively. Their position is the same in the decision-making process. In addition, of the five commissions in the Jakarta Regional People Representatives Council, one of them is chaired by women, namely commission D for development. This shows that the Jakarta Regional People Representatives Council strives to realize a society free from dominance and gender surgery.

Based on the findings of the data from six informants, three of them are already married. This shows that the three Jakarta Regional People Representatives Council members broke Freud parable (Lianawati, 2020) that women over 30 have withered. AY, AO, and AR show that besides taking care of domestic tasks, but also have the opportunity to hone their intellectual skills. Not only that, they have the determination to be able to benefit the community. In addition, based on Jakarta Regional People Representatives Council members background, 10 or 43% (forty-three percent) of the 23 women had a bachelor background. This data shows that women have the same opportunities as men both in education and power. From Constituency I, AO is two of the 12 elected legislators and qualify for legislative seats. The findings illustrate AO journey to the legislature. She said that her position as a women legislator began with her activities in community activities in cadet reefs.

"...many things are limited if we are still members of the young organization. One of them is when you want to help facilitate the visit to the hospital. Because I don't have an important role in government and getting into the system of government becomes quite difficult." (Interview with AO, 2021).

The results of her interview showed that her position as a women legislator went through a long process and had a background. The election process as a politician began in 1995 by becoming the chairman of the *Partai Demokrasi Indonesia Perjuangan* (PDIP) branch in the village. Furthermore, become the head of twigs at the District level. Therefore, when the ratification of affirmative action in 2009, she was assigned to participate in the general election of the legislative members of the Jakarta Regional People Representatives Council as a party required to meet the quota of 30%. Thus, AO only follows the procedure without having ambitions to win the election. In the second term election, which is 2014-2019, she got to number three. It is just that AO has not been able to win legislative seats. This is because he has a lack of operational costs. These operational costs are more directed to the cost of needs in the community. Because being a candidate for the legislature of Mrs. AO must be ready for her house to be approached by her constituents.

Moreover, she also had to provide food or transport for her team. However, her spirit did not waver; the PDIP Party again allowed her to participate in the legislative elections for the period 2019-2024. Although she did not have a large campaign cost, building friendships and friendships impacted her electoral vote. As a result, in the period 2019-2024, she can have the opportunity to become a member of the legislature.

"I think people today are getting smarter in choosing legislators." (Interview with AO, 2021).

AO is aware that the public is now smart in choosing candidates for representatives of its people. AO background in politics has been tested since he was 28 years old. So, she went through a long process to be able to represent women in the legislature. However, AO career in the legislature began with fulfilling a 30% quota requirement following Law No.10 of 2008 concerning the General Election of the House of Representatives of the Republic of Indonesia (DPR-RI), Regional Representative Council (DPD), and Regional People Representatives Council (DPRD) article 8 paragraph (1) letter c. This shows that there are still many political parties that have obstacles in meeting the 30% quota. Based on the results of the Regional People Representatives Council general election data, several parties do not have elected women Regional People Representatives Council members, namely the *Partai Kebangkitan Bangsa* (PKB), *Partai Golongan Karya* (Golkar), and *Partai Nasional Demokrasi* (NasDem). In the *Partai Gerakan Indonesia Merdeka* (Gerindra) party, out of 19 legislators, there are only two women of Regional People Representatives Council members elected.

Interestingly, the Gerindra Party Faction chairman. This data is based on interviews and reports in the Regional People Representatives Council that show that the Gerindra Party strives to give women the opportunity to lead. There is no discrimination in it. While the PDIP Party in the period 2019-2024 has 11 women Regional People Representatives Council members or about 44% (forty-four percent) of the 25 total elected legislators. This gives an idea that PDIP seeks to give space to men and women to play an active role in politics. In addition to the PDIP, the *Partai Solidaritas Indonesia* (PSI) also has women Regional People Representatives Council members with a total of 25% (twenty-five percent) or two of the eight total elected members (see Appendix 5). The *Partai Keadilan Sejahtera* (PKS) also has women Regional People Representatives Council members with three or 19% of the 16 elected members. However, because one male Regional People Representatives Council member died, replaced by a woman. So that the number of women in Regional People Representatives Council members from PKS is 4, although the *Partai Amanat Nasional* (PAN) has eight elected Regional People Representatives Council members, 1 of them are women. Furthermore, currently serves as Vice Chairman of the Jakarta Regional People Representatives Council. Democrats also showed that of the ten elected members of the Regional People Representatives Council, 40% or four were women.

The participation of women in the legislature is related to the issue of gender inequality. Thus, a quota of 30% was imposed to increase women to become members of the legislature. AH said that her background went into politics because Ahok asked her to enter the PDIP Party as his representative in prison. AH has been in politics since 2017. AH was one of the successful teams from Ahok during the election of the Governor of Jakarta in 2019. AH added that:

"I also do not deny the role of Mr. Ahok in motivating myself to enter the Regional People Representatives Council. In addition, my motivation to advance to the Jakarta Regional People Representatives Council is to help many people. If we could only help a few people from their salaries, we could use local government budget for the community." (Interview with AH, 2021).

AH, statement illustrates that the representation of women in political participation has diverse backgrounds. So it does not fully arise from the intentions of the woman herself. On the other hand, the placement of women legislative candidates is generally carried out by political parties only as a moral basis and the fulfillment of a 30% quota. It is not entirely negative. The representation of women in legislative seats also shows that they can govern as effectively as men. According to Plato in (Spary, 2020) women have exactly the same reasoning skills as men. However, they must get the same training and be exempt from the obligation of raising children and taking care of the household. What Plato said was not entirely true. The researchers' findings show that one of the women legislators with a family can participate in training in leadership and politics by carrying out household obligations.

"Since I sat in the Regional People Representatives Council, it has been from the beginning conveyed to the husband to vacuum in the company. Because my husband and I have their own business, so our time is flexible. Thank God we have a family that allows us, and we understand each other. (Results of an interview with AY, 2021).

The participation of women legislators does not mean violating her nature as a woman by freeing her obligations in taking care of the family because the key is to understand each other and equally realize gender equality in the family (Liu, 2018). Although indeed, the journey of women who have the status of wives does not always run smoothly. However, some obstacles occur. Concerning gender equality, according to AH, he never felt any form of gender injustice in the party or the Jakarta Regional People Representatives Council. Therefore, based on the Jakarta Regional People Representatives Council data, the number of women legislators follows Mrs. AH statement. Thus, it can be said that the PDIP Party can achieve a quota of 30% in the representation of women in the Jakarta Regional People Representatives Council. Of the 24 elected members, 11 (45.8%) women were elected. This shows that as women legislators, they can perform a diverse range of roles. Soetjipto and Adelina (2012) explained that the PDIP Party

strategy develops a cadre of parties that do not refer to gender. This is because there is a guide that everything must be equal so as not to be gender-biased. The statement delivered by AH and the position received by AY as Chairman of the party branch representative council and the number of women legislators in the Jakarta Regional People Representatives Council shows that this strategy is still ongoing in the party. The findings show that the representation of women in the political field should be taken into account.

According to Lister (2007), one of the values of inclusive citizenship is justice or justice. This leads to a term when it is fair for people to be treated equally. Women who have the right to participate in political participation are one of them through the election of legislators. Being an active woman in public is not easy. Their struggle to get to the legislative seat is full of twists and turns. Therefore, justice for women to be treated equally in the political field shows much improvement. In reality, we cannot deny the privilege of women legislators, like AH, who support Pa Ahok or AR, who has a family in the Gerindra Party. AR told of her experience entering the Gerindra Party when the party was formed in 2009. She became active in the Gerindra Party by volunteering. Her brother, who has a position in the party, invited her to join and register in the general election of legislative candidates. The passing of the 30% quota regulation makes the Gerindra Party need women legislative candidates to meet the requirements. AR was finally willing to contest the election in its first period in 2009-2014.

AR journey was also tested during the campaign. She conducted a door-to-door campaign to introduce her party and her mission vision to become a legislative candidate. Although she has the privilege at the time on the ground, AR still has to fight to get the votes of her constituents. AM also feels it. She joined PSI Party in 2016, or one year after PSI received a letter from a notary that was officially established. Therefore, to meet the quota of 30%, PSI offered to participate in the general election of legislative candidates in 2019-2024. This condition is because PSI has a shortage of women legislative candidates. So, if she does not nominate, male legislative candidates cannot run in west Jakarta city constituencies because Ms. AM said she was not interested in becoming a member of the Regional People Representatives Council. Almost all cadres recruited by PSI are new to politics. She decided to join PSI because she was familiar with several leaders from PSI and had known her for a long time. In addition, PSI offers new and exciting ideas that go along with AM. Later, the AM said that the party had offered whether she was interested in the campaign or not. However, because of the commitment built, AM decided to follow the campaign seriously. The AM interview also added that she has no ambition or intention to become a legislature member as a woman. Despite being given a quota of 30%, she explained that women are not interested in entering the political realm. This can be demonstrated based on the background of the AM being a women legislator. No support system encourages women to have wiggle room in the field of politics. Because of the recruitment process, there is no preparation to find candidates for women legislators who want to fight in the political sphere. So, when women are ready and interested, they are given space to have a party that matches their ideas and strategies.

AM realized that the representation of women in the Jakarta Regional People Representatives Council was not solely because it met the 30% quota regulation. However, there also has to be a clear recruitment process. Thus, this 30% women quota requirement makes women feel trapped in party decisions. It was as if they were ready for a political fight without any planting or a clear recruitment process. Their names are included in the registration even though they do not have readiness. This is what makes this affirmative action rule has strengths and weaknesses. However, we cannot deny that this affirmative action encourages women to play a political role as inclusive citizenship (Yudhanti, 2018). Although there is an element of coercion, this becomes one of the forms of gender equality in politics. Suradiredja and Jpang (2019) questioned whether the rise of women in government leadership was a success story of women's struggle or the dominance of global pressure? These findings showed that the position of women in Jakarta Regional People Representatives Council members was dominated by global pressure. This can be seen in the background of women legislators sitting in the Jakarta Regional People Representatives Council chair due to affirmative action policies. However, we also cannot deny the struggle

of women in legislative seats. Of the six women Regional People Representatives Council members, two failed first in the nomination process. AO did not qualify in the period 2009-2014 and 2014-2019.

Meanwhile, AY did not qualify in 2009-2014 for candidates for the House of Representatives of the Republic of Indonesia members. Nevertheless, both have a strong determination to try to run again. Although pregnant, AY was still eager to jump into the field to do a campaign during her first experience. In addition, she evaluated her failure in the election of the House of Representatives of the Republic of Indonesia candidates. So, the second time she managed to get enough valid votes to deliver her to a legislative seat in the Jakarta Regional People Representatives Council. In the history of politics in Indonesia and developing countries in general, women are seen as late in their involvement in the political sphere (Yudhanti, 2018).

It is better to be late than no movement. The ratification of the 30% quota was only done in 2008. This has shown an increase in gender equality in the political field. Men can participate in politics, but women also have the same rights as inclusive citizenship—delays due to the environment, culture, and applicable regulations (Arvate et al., 2021). As a militant in the PDIP Party, AO describes that she plunged directly into the political realm from a young age until she was married and had children. So, this delay can also be due to the lack of opportunities for women from political parties. Not only that, AY started his career in politics right when she had a family and had children. In addition, the AY experience is a picture that it is never too late to participate actively in politics. At the time of the pregnancy of the third child, AY began her career as a candidate for the legislative. She conducted political education independently through her nomination process in 2009. Despite her failure, she did not mind the condition.

"The timing of the general election knew 2009 there was already a quota of 30% for women. So, I get the mandate to register as a candidate for the House of Representatives of the Republic of Indonesia as a condition of meeting the quota in the electoral district of West Java Province. At the time, I was pregnant with my third child. My team and I still don't understand the state of the constituency." (Interview with AY, 2021)

AY has a passion for the general election. She was again offered to run in legislative elections from 2014 to 2019. On the second occasion, AY got a valid vote and qualified to become a legislature member. Likewise, in the second period of 2019-2024.

Discussion

The emergence of the idea of the affirmative action movement in 2004, followed by a pessimistic view of the quality and performance of women politicians, became a challenge for women legislators. The findings showed that women in the Jakarta Regional People Representatives Council members are burdened in fighting for women's political agendas in the legislative realm. However, the 30% quota that political parties must meet impacts women and parties from the information collected. When Law No. 10 of 2008 was enacted, many parties still did not meet the quota. So inevitably, AR and AO participated in the general election of legislative candidates in 2009 due to the requirement to meet the quota of 30%. Both have different party backgrounds. Likewise, with the election results that showed at the time of the general election of legislative candidates in 2009, AR was able to win the seat of the Jakarta Regional People Representatives Council. In 2009, the Gerindra party was a new party that participated in the general election. Thus, from the experience that AR conveyed that she uses sense-giving in conducting political communication with the community. This is because AR is a new member of the Gerindra Party, so she starts from door-to-door at the time of the campaign by explaining the first ideas and ideals of the party. Without denying, her brother's role became one of the factors of her victory in the Jakarta Regional People Representatives Council.

Not only AR but meeting the quota requirement of 30% also have an impact on AY. In line with the results of Sulastris et al. (2020) research, the party only meets the representation of women formally without selection. Thus, it impacts the stereotype that women become legislature members due to dynastic political factors (Folke et al., 2020). AY also has a political family background. Her father served as a member of the House of Representatives from 2004 to 2008. However, this cannot be said to be dynastic. Because when Mrs. AY ran as a member of the Regional People Representatives Council, she went through various processes.

Moreover, she failed to win the house of representatives of the Republic of Indonesia seat. It was only in 2014 that she ran for the Jakarta Regional People Representatives Council and successfully voted. As previously explained, of the six Jakarta Regional People Representatives Council members, only one member has relatives of politicians and remains active.

The results of this study are irrelevant if it is associated with studies conducted by Holman, Merolla, and Zechmeister (2011). This is inversely proportional to the findings of the researchers. Although there is a dynastic political factor, and only limited to meeting the quota requirement of 30%, it does not mean women are not supported for candidacy. There are women members of all the bodies in the Jakarta Regional People Representatives Council. However, only an honorary body had no women members. In addition, the position of women legislators for gender equality is strongly supported by the government. The government gives the right to politics or participate in the government. Therefore, the 30% quota given by the government through policies to overcome differences and gaps that harm women. The position of women in the legislature illustrates that women are no longer discriminated against in politics (Couture Gagnon et al., 2019). The existence of legislation becomes the basis of the law as a principle of state obligations that ensure equality and equal opportunities for women and men in various national and state life.

On the other hand, the results of this study show that the reality of the position of women legislators as inclusive citizenship is in line with Pitkin representation theory (Garboni, 2015) which describes the condition of women legislators of Jakarta Regional People Representatives leading to the formal representation of women. Women who enter a political fight inevitably have to admit that their background is due to meet the 30% quota. This experience was felt by AM while following the process of selecting legislative candidates in 2019. If there are no women candidates in the constituency, male legislative candidates cannot contest the election. Therefore, inevitably AM is nominated as a member of the legislature. This shows that the representation of women is only limited to the fulfillment of formalities. This condition illustrates that to fulfill the quota of 30% of women again used as a tool so that male legislator candidates can follow the election. There is no clear selection process and only fixated on party decisions.

Furthermore, to represent gender equality, the representation of women is included in the descriptive representation (Adriaanse, 2019). Pitkin's theory explains that descriptive forms are where women legislators indicate the activities they do for women. Unfortunately, the concept is not in line with the findings of the researchers. This can be seen from the background of women who were elected to the legislature beginning because of the fulfillment of quotas. As a result, they have no desire to sit as legislators. It is just that they have to follow the direction of the party. Thus, they go into politics not in a qualified ability. The findings suggest that women legislators' inclusive citizenship can be exercised, but gender equality is not yet visible. None of the six legislators explained that she was running on a political agenda for gender equality.

Nor can the findings show that the representation of women legislators is seen as a symbolic representation in the name of gender equality. According to Allwood (2005), women can be elected to parliament, having to pass three important obstacles: first, they must vote for themselves; second, they need to be elected as candidates by the party; and, third, they must be elected by the electorate. Based on data on the obstacles passed by each women legislator is very diverse. Allwood's concept supports the results of this study. It's just that, from the findings of researchers, the barrier of women elected to the legislature is chosen as a candidate by the party. Because the party for women legislative candidates organizes no

selection, anyone and whatever the background of the party's chosen women must accept the opportunity to meet affirmative action rules.

Based on the declaration of the women's movement in (Martiany, 2019), full guarantee of women's political rights both organizing, decision-making participation, and citizenship is a big challenge. However, these findings suggest that the state guarantees full participation in women for gender equality in the political sphere. The results of this study are inversely proportional to the emphasis on exotic and substantive political representation delivered by Spark, Cox, and Corbett (2019). The number of women elected to the legislature cannot reflect women's empowerment in society because those elected to be candidates for legislative members are not a symbol to carry out a political agenda for gender equality. But instead that they were chosen to meet the 30% quota. Bashori statement (2018) supports the findings of researchers who show that women's backgrounds participate in politics because of traditions in their families. This is in line with AR, who has a family background of politicians in the Gerindra Party. AY has a father of former members of the House of Representatives of the Republic of Indonesia. According to Oh (2016), women's participation in politics is a voluntary activity, but the realities were chosen only to meet the requirements of the general election. Thus, women's political participation in this study began with the party's participation as a condition of elections registration by meeting the 30% quota for women.

Although the position of women legislators as a form of inclusive citizenship on the political agenda for gender equality is not visible, this study is supported by Castiglione (2021) as a feature of representative in the form of principal-agent relationships based on rhetorical and formal nature. Women legislators strive to be responsive to the people's interests (Yarchi & Samuel-Azran, 2018). It is just that, indeed, the constituents of the council members have not been able to realize the characteristics of representatives who are in the political power to be able to influence and exercise control.

Conclusion

This study has concluded that the presence of legislators in the Jakarta Regional People Representatives Council has represented the formal representation of women. This shows that women have the same opportunity to participate in politics. On the other hand, political parties must realize that meeting women's quotas alone is not enough in carrying out the political agenda for gender equality. The nomination process in the general election is unfortunate to be passed without a good selection. Thus, women legislators who become informants have not shown women's political agenda for gender equality. Finally, this study illustrates that since the enactment of women's quotas in the Jakarta Regional People Representatives Council, there has been no noticeable change based on Pitkins' representation theory. Political parties since 2009 appointed women to contest elections without socialization related to women's issues. They are used as a tool to meet the party's meeting. Therefore, political parties must recruit using good procedures and be easy to understand.

References

- Adriaanse, J. A. (2019). The influence of gendered emotional relations on gender equality in sport governance. *Journal of Sociology*, 55(3), 587–603. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1440783319842665>
- Allwood, D. G., Allwood, G., Wadia, D. K., & Wadia, K. (2005). Increasing women's political representation. In *Women and Politics in France 1958-2000*. International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203186275-13>
- Arvate, P., Firpo, S., & Pieri, R. (2021). Can women's performance in elections determine the engagement of adolescent girls in politics? *European Journal of Political Economy*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ejpoleco.2021.102045>

- Bargain, O., Boutin, D., & Champeaux, H. (2019). Women's political participation and intrahousehold empowerment: Evidence from the Egyptian Arab Spring. *Journal of Development Economics*, 141. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jdeveco.2019.102379>
- Bashori, K. (2018). Pendidikan Politik di Era Disrupsi. *Sukma: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 2(2), 287–310. <https://doi.org/10.32533/02207.2018>
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2019). *Successful qualitative research a practical guide for beginners*. SAGE Publication.
- Cardo, V. (2020). Gender politics online? Political women and social media at election time in the United Kingdom, the United States and New Zealand. *European Journal of Communication*. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0267323120968962>
- Castiglione, O. (2021). Television and Culture Multimedia Encounters for Improving Distance Learning at High School. *American Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, 9.
- Çela, E. (2015). Gender and Citizenship Models : Reflections from Feminist Literature. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences*, 6(2), 109–114. <https://doi.org/10.5901/mjss.2015.v6n2s5p109>
- Couture Gagnon, A., Palda, F., & Sepielak, K. (2019). Political Parties and Women's Success in Municipal Elections in 2005 in Montérégie and Montréal (Québec, Canada). *American Review of Canadian Studies*, 49(4), 497–510. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02722011.2019.1714678>
- Creswell, J. W. (2017). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative Mixed Methods Approaches*. SAGE Publication.
- Dhima, K., Golder, S. N., Stephenson, L. B., & Van der Straeten, K. (2021). Permissive electoral systems and descriptive representation. *Electoral Studies*, 73. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.electstud.2021.102381>
- Finlay, R., & Hopkins, P. (2019). Young Muslim women's political participation in Scotland: Exploring the intersections of gender, religion, class and place. *Political Geography*, 74(July), 102046. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.polgeo.2019.102046>
- Folke, O., Rickne, J., & Smith, D. M. (2020). Gender and Dynastic Political Selection. In *Comparative Political Studies* (Vol. 54, Issue 2). <https://doi.org/10.1177/0010414020938089>
- Garboni, E. S. (2015). The Impact of Descriptive Representation on Substantive Representation of Women at European and National Parliamentary Levels. Case Study: Romania. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 183, 85–92. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.04.849>
- Gheaus, A. (2017). Gender Justice. *Journal of Ethics and Social Philosophy*, 6(1), 1–25. <https://doi.org/10.26556/jesp.v6i1.60>
- Heath, R. M., Schwindt-Bayer, L. A., & Taylor-Robinson, M. M. (2005). Women on the sidelines: Women's representation on committees in Latin American legislatures. *American Journal of Political Science*, 49(2), 420–436. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.0092-5853.2005.00132.x>
- Holman, M. R., Merolla, J. L., & Zechmeister, E. J. (2011). Sex, stereotypes, and security: A study of the effects of terrorist threat on assessments of female leadership. *Journal of Women, Politics and Policy*, 32(3), 173–192. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1554477X.2011.589283>
- Lianawati, E. (2020). *Ada serigala betina dalam diri setiap perempuan: psikologi feminis untuk meretas patriarki*. (There's a she-wolf in every woman: feminist psychology to hack patriarchy). Buku Mojok Group.

- Lister, R. (2007). Inclusive citizenship: Realizing the potential. *Citizenship Studies*, 11(1), 49–61. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13621020601099856>
- Liu, S. J. S. (2018). Are Female Political Leaders Role Models? Lessons from Asia. *Political Research Quarterly*, 71(2), 255–269. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1065912917745162>
- Lune, H. & Berg, B. L. (2017). *Qualitative Research Methods for the Social Sciences* (9th Edition). In *Pearson Education Limited*.
- Martiany, D. (2019). *Sepuluh Agenda Politik Perempuan Tahun 2014-2019*. (Ten of Women Political Agenda years 2014-2019). *Jurnal Info Singkat Kesejahteraan Sosial*, 4(14), 9–12.
- Massé, F., Givá, N., & Lunstrum, E. (2021). A feminist political ecology of wildlife crime: The gendered dimensions of a poaching economy and its impacts in Southern Africa. *Geoforum*, 126(June 2020), 205–214. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoforum.2021.07.031>
- Oh, K. J. (2016). Women's political participation in South Korea and activist organizations. *Asian Journal of Women's Studies*, 22(3), 338–345. <https://doi.org/10.1080/12259276.2016.1205382>
- Prasad, V., & Thampi, B. V. (2021). Gender ideology and gendered political dynamics shaping electoral fortunes of women politicians in Kerala, India. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 84. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wsif.2021.102437>
- Saguni, F. (2014). Pemberian Stereotype Gender Fatimah Saguni. *Musawa*, 6(2), 195–224.
- Spark, C., Cox, J., & Corbett, J. (2019). Gender, political representation and symbolic capital: how some women politicians succeed. *Third World Quarterly*, 40(7), 1227–1245. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01436597.2019.1604132>
- Spary, C. (2020). Women candidates, women voters, and the gender politics of India's 2019 parliamentary election. *Contemporary South Asia*, 28(2), 223–241. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09584935.2020.1765987>
- Stone, L. (1996). Feminist political theory: Contributions to a conception of citizenship. *Theory and Research in Social Education*, 24(1), 36–53. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00933104.1996.10505768>
- Suradiredja, D. Y., & Jpang, S. (2019). *Perempuan di Singgasana Lelaki Atlas Pemimpin Perempuan Indonesia*. (Women on the Throne of Men's Atlas of Indonesian Women's Leader). PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Vural, S., Sayılan, G., Şentürk, B., Yılmaz, M. B., & Çoşkun, F. (2021). Women's representation in emergency medicine journals across two decades: 2000–2019. *American Journal of Emergency Medicine*, 50, 501–506. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ajem.2021.09.003>
- Wahid, U. (2014). *Risalah Politik Perempuan Media Massa dan Gerakan Counter Hegemony*. (Political Treatise on Women's Mass Media and the Counter Hegemony Movement). Empat Pena Publishing.
- Yao, Y., & You, W. (2018). Women's political participation and gender gaps of education in China: 1950–1990. *World Development*, 106, 220–237. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2018.01.004>
- Yarchi, M., & Samuel-Azran, T. (2018). Women politicians are more engaging: male versus female politicians' ability to generate users' engagement on social media during an election campaign. *Information Communication and Society*, 21(7), 978–995. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1369118X.2018.1439985>
- Yin, R. K. (2011). *Qualitative Research From Start to Finish*. The Guilford Press.

- Yoon, E., Chang, H., & Adams, K. (2018). Interrelations of patriarchal beliefs, gender, collectivism/individualism, and mental health. *Counselling Psychology Quarterly*, 00(00), 1–19. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09515070.2018.1511520>
- Yudhanti, R. (2018). Examining Affirmative Action in Perspective of Law and Globalization In Indonesia. *PROCEEDING ICTESS (Internasional Conference on Technology, Education and Social Sciences)*, 351–356. <http://ejournal.unisri.ac.id/index.php/proictss/article/viewFile/2182/1944>

Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal.

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).