



Investigating the Susceptibility of Seyyed Mostafa Hosseini Tabataba'i from Sunnis

Hossein Mohammadi Fam^{*1}; Hadi Razaghi harikandee²

¹ PhD in Theological Religions, University of Religions, Iran

² Assistant Professor, Department of Islamic Studies, Noshirvani University of Technology, Babol, Iran

Email: hosseinfam110@gmail.com^{*1}; razaghi@nit.ac.ir²

^{*}Corresponding Author: Hossein Mohammadi Fam

<http://dx.doi.org/10.18415/ijmmu.v7i9.2018>

Abstract

Seyyed Mostafa Hosseini Tabataba'i was born in 1935. His website is <http://www.mostafatabatabaie.net/> where he publishes his works. He is considered as one of the Shiite Qur'anists (The Qur'anists are those who radically deny the hadith). In addition, he criticizes some Shiite principles which show that he is influenced by Salafism and Wahhabism. He does not consider the resort to the Ahl al-Bayt (AS) and pilgrimage of them to be correct. He believes that some Shiite festivals and occasions such as the birth and martyrdom of the Ahl al-Bayt (AS) are made by the people. He considers only 'Eid al-Fitr¹ and 'Eid al-Aḏḥā² as 'Eid al-Islam. He acts upon Sunni jurisprudence. And some of his books have been published in Saudi Arabia, and some websites belonging to Saudi Arabia and Sunnis publish his works electronically. All of the above shows the susceptibility of Mostafa Hosseini Tabataba'i by Salafism and Wahhabism.

Keywords: *Mostafa Hosseini Tabataba'i; Shiite Qur'anists; Denial of Recourse; Pilgrimage*

Introduction

In recent centuries in Iran, some currents called religious reform have been introduced, each of which had specific methods and principles for reform. One of these currents is the Shiite Qur'anic current. Seyyed Mostafa Hosseini Tabataba'i, born in 1935, is one of the influential figures of the Shiite Qur'anic current. The Qur'anists are those who do not pay enough attention to the hadiths and consider many hadiths to be false and inaccurate. Some of them consider a limited number of hadiths to be correct, while others do not consider any hadith to be correct and consider only the Qur'an as a criterion for belief and practice.

¹ Feast of the Breaking Fast.

² Feast of the Sacrifice

Seyyed Mostafa Hosseini Tabataba'i, by criticizing the principles of Shiism and rejecting hadiths, distanced himself from some Imāmīyyah beliefs. He opposes them by extremist criticism of Shiite beliefs and considers the Qur'an as the most important source of receiving divine beliefs and rules and rejects Shiite hadiths.

In the following article, his scientific life and the study of his thoughts current will be examined. Of course, it should be noted that this article does not seek to reject all of his thoughts, ideas and books, because there are valuable works and points from him, for example, "in the critique of Salman Rushdie" and "the critique of the views of Orientalists". In this article, the influence of the Sunnis on him is mentioned and in some cases he is criticized, therefore, the problems with him are due to deviations from the principles of Shiism.

1- Recognition of Hosseini Tabataba'i by his Identity Card

Seyyed Mostafa Hosseini Tabataba'i was born in 1935 in a religious and learned family. His grandfather is the late Ayatollah Seyyed Mohammad Tabataba'i, one of the founders of the constitutional revolution, and his mother is the daughter of Ayatollah Mirza Ahmad Ashtiani.

He was raised by his grandfather as a child; after passing Arabic lessons and the basics of ijthad with the late professor Dehghan, he learned the principles of jurisprudence and philosophy in the presence of his ancestor. According to Mr. Hosseini Tabataba'i, his highest level of religious education was in the private class of his grandfather, Mirza Ahmad Ashtiani. (<http://www.mostafatabatabaie.net/> and <http://aqeedeh.com/author/48>)

Yusuf Shu'ar was the promoter of the "independence of understanding" of the whole Qur'an, and this view affected him to some extent. (<http://www.quraniun.com/index.php/quraniun1/mostafa-hosseini-tabataei/>)

Of course, the Aqīdah website (a Wahhabi propaganda site belonging to Saudi Arabia) said that Hosseini Tabataba'i entered the seminary of Qom as a teenager and received a degree in ijthad from the scholars of that day at the age of twenty. He has never dressed as a clergyman and has always sought to investigate and discover the truth. As a young man, he attended and debated in Baha'i meetings and wrote books rejecting the Baha'iyat (<http://www.mostafatabatabaie.net/> and <http://aqeedeh.com/author/48>)

He believed that Friday prayer is an obligation of God that has been forgotten in the Shiite community and should be revived. For this reason, he has been trying to hold it since then, and according to one of his very old friends, he has been praying Friday prayers with even two people for about forty years. After his acquaintance with the Burqa'i, they held Friday prayers together in Gozar Wazir Mosque and then in a house on Jamalzadeh Street in Tehran; after that, Hosseini Tabataba'i's Friday prayers with his companions will be held in the houses of individuals and his father's house in Tajrish. (<http://www.mostafatabatabaie.net/> and <http://aqeedeh.com/author/48>) From the text of one of his Friday prayer sermons, it is clear that it is a session that has been held since the time of Shariat Sangalji and Burqa'i and after the Islamic Revolution, Hosseini Tabataba'i is the speaker and its axis. (<http://sadaislam.com/records/id/3053>)

According to his site, which is also confirmed by his works, Tabataba'i is proficient in various Islamic sciences, including philosophy, logic, principles of jurisprudence, jurisprudence, hadith, history, and especially the interpretation of the Holy Qur'an, and has constantly taught those sciences. He was well versed in the critique of various Western culture, philosophy, and schools, and was successful in criticizing intellectuals and skeptics with arguments. (<http://www.mostafatabatabaie.net/> and <http://aqeedeh.com/author/48>)

Scientific works of Seyyed Mostafa Hosseini Tabataba'i

There is a list of Hosseini Tabataba'i's works and their text on his website (<http://www.mostafatabatabaie.net/>). In the following, his works will be introduced and a brief explanation of the generalities of each work will be provided.

A) Books

1- A path to Islamic unity: (Dhu al-Qa'dah 1400 AH) This book was written in line with the orders of the Holy Qur'an and the Holy Prophet (PBUH) and Imam Ali (AS) and other leaders of Islam on unity in the shadow of the divine book and the tradition of the Messenger of God (PBUH).

2- Betrayal in History Report: (Publisher: Chapakhsh, last edition 1366 HS) (three volumes) is a solid and reasoned answer to the book of 23 years by Ali Dashti who became an apostate and apparently this book was the biography of the Holy Prophet (PBUH) but it was in the rejection of his Nubuwwah and Risālah and the denial of his prophecy.

3- Unsuccessful anti-religion: (Publisher: Roozbeh Publications, 1380 HS) in defense of Islam and monotheism; it is a response to the book "Another Birth" by Shoja' al-Din Shafa, written against the divine religions and protesting against the Islamic Republic. In one hundred and ninety-four pages, the author defends Islam and the divine religions and answers the problems and doubts.

4- Critique of the works of Orientalists: (Publisher: Chapakhsh, 1375 HS) Includes scientific critique of the works of 20 famous orientalist such as Nöldeke, Petrushevsky, Goldziher, Blachère, Lammens, Louis Massignon, Edward Browne, Henry Carbon and...

This book, which is 223 pages, is one of the most important works of Hosseini Tabataba'i, and even the cover image of this book can be seen on the first page of his site.

5. The Story of Bab and Bahá': (This book was published by Tavakoli Publications under the title "Leaders of Misguidance" in 1378 HS) New research on Baha'ism and documented in 46 books from Babi and Baha'i sources.

6- Invitation of Christians to Tawhid: (Payam Press, 1379) in which the history of the Trinity and how it influences Christianity and its harmful effects have been studied and researched and the real and Qur'anic personality of Jesus (PBUH) has been introduced.

7- Islamic intellectuals against Greek logic: (1358 HS) is a detailed description of the course of logic in the Islamic world and the views of great Islamic critics on Aristotelian logic and finally a comparison of the views of Western and Islamic critics.

8- Slavery from the perspective of Islam: (Publisher: Islamic Encyclopedia Foundation, 1372). It is a valuable study on slavery in the pre-Islamic period and among different nations and the order of Islam and the treatment of Muslims with prisoners of war, and the freedom of slaves and captives.

9- Sheikh Mohammad 'Abduh, the great Egyptian reformer: (Publisher: Qalam Publications, 1357 & 1362 HS), including his biography, struggles, thoughts and his collaboration with the late Seyyed Jamal al-Din Asadabadi.

10- Minus Spirituality: (First and Second Edition: Publishing Joint Stock Company, Third Edition: Kavosh, 1356) It is a kind of protest against the decline of spirituality in the West and its deviation in the East and the invitation of Muslims to unity and uprising and move towards spirituality under the banner of book and tradition.

11- Islam and the Idols of the West: (Shams Edition, 1359) it has been written in the simplistic thinking and intentions of the great materialistic thinking about Islam and the divine religions.

12- Numerical miracle in the Holy Qur'an: (Publisher's Publication, 1361) Research by Abd al-Razzaq Nawfal from Egypt, translated and completed by Hosseini Tabataba'i.

13- Critique of Ibn Sina's views on theology: (Publisher's Publication, 1361 HS) In this book, the author brings the views of the protesters on Ibn Sina's views, and by recalling a part of his valuable speeches in theology, he criticizes the views of that famous sage named in the rule of "Al-Wahid" and the interpretation of "Nubuwwah" and the subject of "Ma'ād".

14- Humiliation of Salman Rushdie: This book, which was published in 1368 in a thousand copies, is a general critique on Salman Rushdie's book. In this work, he has emphasized that Salman Rushdie's book is not a scientific book so that it needs to be criticized paragraph by paragraph because, as he says, it is written in a dreamy way; therefore, Hosseini Tabataba'i has only criticized his evil tricks and motives. (Hosseini Tabataba'i, Humiliation of Salman Rushdie, p. 9)

15- Critique of Hadith Books: (1379 HS) while reminding the important and effective role of Hadith after the Holy Qur'an in introducing Islam, some hadiths, which are considered by the author to be fake, have been criticized.

Another name of this work is "Study of fabricated narratives in books of hadith". The date of writing the book is 1421 AH that is mentioned after the introduction and it coincides with 1379 HS. The book was not available at the National Library and was read through the Saudi "Belief" CD.

16- Fath al-Bayān Fi ma Ruwiya 'an Ali (AS) Min Tafsīr al-Qur'an: (Tafsīr by Imam Ali (AS)) (1382 HS) while quoting honorable words from Imam Ali (AS) in honor of the Holy Qur'an, some of his interpretation on Qur'anic verses in Islamic works is collected in this collection and translated into Persian.

17- Mesopotamia in the time of the Rashidun Caliphs: How the Mesopotamia was conquered and reminding that the Muslims in these battles did not initiate riot and war and sedition was carried out by their enemies. Muslims' treatment with defeated nations, according to historical reports and the approval of Islamic and non-Islamic scholars, has been more lenient and fairer than their previous co-rulers.

18- Study of Informational³ and Doctrinal⁴ opinions: (1383 HS) A complete research on the emergence of the science of principles and a detailed explanation of the opinions of Akhbārī and Usūlī scholars on the authority of the Qur'an and Hadith.

19- Inner meanings in the Holy Qur'an: (1375 HS) is a study in the inner meanings of the verses of the Qur'an, which are in fact spiritual messages that are mentioned in the Holy Qur'an and the context of the verses indicate them; because otherwise, everyone will make false claims against the Qur'an to prove their intentions under the title of the inner part of Qur'an. Such as internal interpretations and some Sufis etc.

20- Stages and steps of Hajj: (Tehran, 1385 HS) is a description of his lessons in the description, nature, stages, steps and practices of Hajj. The topics of the book are jurisprudential and argumentative.

B) Articles

1- "Defending the multiplicity of Islamic couples" / 2- "Three frontiers of creation" / 3- "Interpreting the expression of meanings in the word of God" / 4- "Islamization of Iranians" / 5- "Ali (AS), the representative of justice and morality In Islam" / 6- "In response to Dr. Sina's objections" / 7- "Condemnation of homosexuality" / 8- "Unsuccessful considerations about homosexuality" / 9- "Stability and movement in the mind and outside" / 10- "The language of the people, not their culture" // 11- "A ray of the auspicious Alawite government" / 12- "Critique of syntactic objection to the Qur'an" / 13- "Critique of the article "Hijab and covering the head and neck" (1 and 2) / 14- "Islam and the Western

³ Akhbārī

⁴ Usūlī

poles / 15- "Henry Carbone and esotericism" / 16- "A conscious Muslim is not afraid of the opposite words!" / 17- "Qur'an in the new times" / 18- "Hafiz among his supporters and opponents" / 19- "Islam condemns terrorism" / 20- "Tolerance and intensity of action in Islam" / 21- "Holy revelation" / 22 - "Do not fight with Islamic culture" / 23- "New life in Islamic culture" / 24- "Ijtihad against the text" / 25- "Fundamentals of changing the rules" / 26- "Modernity in ijtihad": / 27- "Expressing the truth about illegitimate mourning" / 28- "Qur'an and exaggeration about prophets" / 29- "Friday prayer, revolutionary and forgotten prayer" / 30- "Reduce distances from Ali (AS)" / 31- "Characteristics of Islamic Bazaar" / 32- "Holy revelation not sensual revelation" / 33- "The link between religion and government" / 34- "The difference between fault and exaggeration" / 35- "God and the prophets in the Torah, the Bible and the Qur'an" / 36- "Is it permissible to prostrate on the ground?" / 37- "The secret of arrogance!" / 38- "Muhammad (PBUH), the Prophet of Mercy and the Sword" / 39- "Answer to doubts" / 40- "Correction of mistakes and repulsion of slander!" / 41- "The Qur'an can be understood without a hadith" / 42- "The Messenger of God (PBUH) and the explanation of the verses" / 43- "Woman in Zoroastrian and Baha'i religion" / 44- "Responsibility and faith" / 45- "Open letter to the religious scholars" / 46- "Response to the religious problems of the new generation" / 47- "Defending the sword of Islam" / 48- "Towards God" / 49- "Critique of the translation of "Al-Ghārat"/ 50- "In response to slanderer"/ 51- "Zoroastrianism from our point of view" / 52- Three articles: "Motivation of scientific research in Islamic civilization", "Several centuries of silence" and "Muslims and extremism"/ 53- "Defense of the Holy Qur'an"/ 54- "Critique of religious intellectualism" / 55- "Contemporary anti-Islamism" / 56- "Critique of the theory of religious pluralism" / 57- "Considerations about the humanistic approach in the Qur'an" / 58- "Critique of the translation of the "Siffin incident"

Many of the articles in the list published on his site were not available in the articles section or other sections of the site for us to download and review.

C) Site

The website of "Seyyed Mostafa Hosseini Tabataba'i" is at <http://www.mostafatabatabaie.net/>.

In this site, there are books, articles, audio archives and pictures of his speeches, along with a gallery of his pictures and a list of works, as well as his e-mail for communication and correspondence, etc., and in general, it is a good database that has presented the works of this person very well. Books and articles have the feature of download and when downloading them, in one or two short sentences, an explanation is given about that book or article so that the reader is informed of its concise content before receiving the work.

Twenty books and 44 articles are now available on the site and can be downloaded.

In the "About" section, a brief description of him is given and he is introduced very briefly.

In the "Video Gallery" section, video files of his speeches on various topics are available for viewing and downloading. Most of these remarks have been recorded in his study and work office.

Some of these videos are:

Questions about the Baha'i, answers to Bahram Moshiri about the people of rank, answers to the letters, was Babiyah a protest movement? Imam Hussein (AS) and the fight against oppression, let's be fair, the principles of interpretation of the Qur'an, religious intellectuals and the issue of homosexuality, I think every day I talk all night, how to defend the Prophet (PBUH) ?, a few basic questions about religion, answer to biased Qur'anic study (ten sessions), the right way in life, a night of Ramadan nights, Bahram Moshiri and a critique of religious intellectuals !, religiosity and social welfare, in protest to the genocide in Myanmar, what is the essence of Islam? About the late Burqa'i and the late Qalamdaran, the policy of Mr. Hosseini Tabataba'i, the answer to the Christian preacher, man and the truth of life, curbing the violence, what is spirituality? Interviews about hadith, the legitimacy of the Qur'an, terrorism and Muslims today, the clergy, the Ash'arites, the Mu'tazilite, scientific testimony, in criticism of Ofogh

(Voice of America) program, about Haḍrat Fatima and Ahl al-Bayt (PBUH), a communion with you, in critique of Baha'ism, in defense of the book "Critique of Hadith Books", conflict of theory of evolution and belief in Existence of God and so on.

What seems to be important is that his views with other Shiite scholars and his Shādh views are not emphasized at all on the site, and if one goes to the site without knowing his Shādh views and his intellectual trend towards Salafism, he feels that he is also a scientist like other Shiite scholars.

D) Lectures

For many years, Hosseini Tabataba'i has held Friday prayers on Fridays at his father's house or at the homes of friends and relatives, and has given thematic lectures in his sermons. According to him, in one of these audio files, he has a Qur'an interpretation session once or twice a week. (<http://sadaislam.com/records/id/3045>) The audio of many speeches has been uploaded on sadaislam.com and can be downloaded. (He has been referred to as Allameh on this site.) Of course, the section of the audio archive of his site has not been completed yet and it is currently not possible to receive speeches from Hosseini Tabatabai's site.

Some of the topics he has talked about are:

Understanding the Qur'an, worshiping the dead, Arba'in, returning to the Qur'an, Bid'ah, about Haḍrat Zahra (AS), pure religion, critique of hadiths, unity, Ashura, extremism and so on.

Hosseini Tabatabai's Relationship with Burqa'i

Hosseini Tabataba'i was a friend and in a sense one of the students and servants of Burqa'i.

Regarding the starting point of Hosseini Tabatabai's acquaintance with Burqa'i, two articles have been quoted from their own words, both of which have been brought on the site of Aqīdah. Hosseini Tabataba'i explained that when I heard that there was a scholar in the Gozar Wazir Mosque who was teaching the Qur'an, I attended one night and saw him interpreting "Yāsīn" as "O Muhammad, I swear by you." After the meeting, I went to him and said that Haj Agha Yā and Sīn are separated words and "y" is different from the letter of Neda, and I gave the following explanations. Burqa'i continued to listen, and after my words, he thought for a while and said: Yes, you are right! It was surprising for Hosseini Tabataba'i that a cleric would listen and accept the words of a man in plain clothes.

Burqa'i also quoted that in our mosque, a preacher spoke for a few nights only to prove the Wilāyat of Imam Ali (AS). After my protest that "has any one denied his Wilāyat?" It turned out that the host had such a request and he explained the reason for it in such a way that a person has just become a Sunni, I said, who is he? Said: Seyyed Mustafa! You do not know him. He lives in Shemiran.

Burqa'i said that until then we did not know Seyyed Mustafa. Later it turned out that he was a young scientist and a virtuous researcher and a resident of Shemiran who did not deny the guardianship and friendship of Ali (AS) in any way, but considered himself the first true friend and follower of Imam Ali (AS). He knows and believes that Ali (AS) is a follower of religion, neither the principle of religion nor the branch of religion. (<http://aqeedeh.com/author/48>)

Some believe that these two characters have influenced each other. It is said that Hosseini Tabataba'i used the Burqa'i facilities in the Gozar Wazir Mosque to raise his voice and with a negative impact has accelerated the departure of the Burqa'i from the Shiites and his entry into the trap of Salafism. <http://www.quraniun.com/index.php/quraniun1/mostafa-hosseini-tabataei/>

In some of his works, Burqa'i mentions Hosseini Tabataba'i and his works in proportion to the discussion and praises him with titles such as "Our dear brother, Master Seyyed Mostafa Tabataba'i".

(Burqa'ī, *Representing the News of the Principles on the Qur'an and the Minds*, p. 80) Hosseini Tabataba'i has also referred to him as "Allameh Burqa'ī" in some of his works. "Nūr al-Dīn Chahardehi mentions Hosseini Tabataba'i as an intimate friend of Abolfazl Burqa'ī, who, of course, has suffered more than Burqa'ī in terms of knowledge." (Chahardehi, *Wahhabism and its roots*, p. 211)

2- Evidences of Hosseini Tabatabai's Susceptibility from Salafism

Unlike Burqa'ī, Mostafa Hosseini Tabataba'i has used Wahhabi-like words only in certain matters and has shown his adherence to Shiism in principles and foundations.

In a video file that can be seen on his site, he removes the accusation of being a Wahhabi from Qalamdaran and Burqa'ī and emphasizes the same issue about himself and states that we disagree with this sect of (Salafism and Wahhabism) in many ways. He then points to the monotheistic differences with them, including regarding the manifestation of the attributes of God, which leads to the compounding of the essence of God, and emphasizes: "On the issue of the difference between the Companions and the others, we consider Imam Ali and the Ahl al-Bayt (AS) superior. Hazrat Amir (AS) himself said in *Nahj al-Balāghah*: "No one can be compared with Muhammad (PBUH) or one of his people." (<http://media.mostafatabatabaie//video 1909>)

In another video, Hosseini Tabataba'i refers to his policy and states that in his works, gentleness always prevails over intensity and insult, and so on. According to him, he has never insulted the elders of Islam, and even when someone like Allameh Tabataba'i was insulted by some people, he defended him and it was reflected on his website. He states:

"Let me also say that I am a free-thinking Muslim. I am extremely interested in the family of the Prophet (PBUH) and I am proud to be a follower of them. Therefore, I am neither a Sunni, nor a Wahhabi, nor an anti-Ahl al-Bayt of the Messenger of God (PBUH). For this reason, I consider myself a free-thinking Muslim and a lover of the Ahl al-Bayt of the Prophet (PBUH) and I respect all Muslims who have not exited from the path of truth since the beginning of Islam." ([http:// media. mostafatabatabaie // video 1908](http://media.mostafatabatabaie // video 1908))

He goes on to mention the books of "Betrayal in the Report of the History" and "Failed Anti-Religionist" and "the Answer to the Suspicions of Dr. Sina", etc., announcing that he has devoted all his energy to defending the principle of Islam, and recently someone has insulted Imam Ali (AS) and he answered. ([http:// media. mostafatabatabaie // video 1908](http://media.mostafatabatabaie // video 1908))

It is important to note that many of Hosseini Tabatabai's intellectual trends toward the Sunnis, which are rarely seen in his books and articles, are found in his oral speeches. Perhaps this is why Varjani says about him: "... It is very unfortunate to admit that Mr. Mostafa Hosseini Tabataba'i is an" Islamologist and commentator "who does not even have the courage to write down his true beliefs! »<http://h-varjani.blogfa.com/post-44.aspx>

He attributes this to the fear of a scholarly critique of Hosseini Tabatabai's views, and as we have found, he declares that he addresses ambiguous issues in his published public letters, but instead, when speaking in private, the original Shiite beliefs are being attacked more and more vigorously. The reason is that their listeners in these sessions (unfortunately) have superficial information about Shiite beliefs. <http://h-varjani.blogfa.com/post-44.aspx>

In any case, there is no choice but for us to evaluate him based on the works and writings of this character. On this account, we do not consider him a Sunni, but his intellectual inclinations towards Salafism in some important issues cannot be denied. Here are some of his words that tend to Salafi ideas.

Doubt in Some Issues Such as Pilgrimage, Genetic Guardianship and Recourse to Ahl Al-Bayt (PBUH)

Hosseini Tabataba'i, like Burqa'i, has never explicitly denied the issues of guardianship, but in his works he has taunted these issues. For example:

"... Imams and religious leaders are more like lords among us than guides of life that is why we turn to them in needs, and we believe for them, in addition to religious guardianship, guardian occupation and genetic guardianship!, and rather than turning to mosques, we turn to their graves "severely" and we have left the houses of God empty and have filled the tombs of the servants of God and adorned the graves with gold, and we circumambulate and supplicate around them, and we ask for help and we cry and we ask for help ... And these exaggerations are the same as that of our Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) has fought against them for many years, and his Qur'an, his tradition, and his life all tell of this battle. (Hosseini Tabataba'i, *Islam and the idols of the West and minus spirituality*, pp. 49-51)

In a footnote, he objected to the statement that "the Imam and the Guardian of Truth, whenever he wants and desires, influences everything and humbles the universe." He considers this belief to be contrary to verse fifty-six of Surah Al-Qaṣaṣ, which states: "You cannot guide whomever you love, but God guides whomever He wills!" He has also considered such beliefs as contradictory to verses such as verse fifty of surah Ankabūt: "Say: The signs are only with Allah and His power, and I am the only one who warns openly." He believes that there are many of these verses in the Qur'an, but we interpret these Muḥkamat with all courage. (Hosseini Tabataba'i, *Islam and the idols of the West and minus spirituality*, pp. 49-51)

It should be added that sentences such as the above sentence need to be examined that by whom it was issued and what is the degree of validity and authority of the speaker? Is this statement rooted in the Qur'an and the correct narration or not? And ... even if a statement is hypothetical, many similar hypotheses can be made and criticized.

In one of his speeches, Hosseini Tabataba'i criticized those who claim their children have been healed in Mashhad and attribute it to Imam Reza (AS) and consider it a personal fantasy, while God said: "Every blessing you have is from God" and therefore he considers that person to be involved in divine Istidraj (<http://sadaislam.com/records/id/3312>). This statement is made while all Shiites and lovers of Ahl al-Bayt (PBUH) consider Imam Reza (AS) as the authority of God who performs miracles by divine power. The one whose child is healed also knows that it is God who healed his child through Imam Reza (AS). Divine blessings are revealed in these holy shrines most of all.

In the concluding lines of one of his articles, while mentioning the discussion of "exaggeration" and the sensitivity of Islam in the discussion of monotheism and polytheism, he outlines this prophetic narration which said: "Do not take me higher than what is my right that God has enslaved me before He made me a prophet." Then he emphasizes that the Messenger of God (PBUH) said in the last days of his life: "Do not make my grave a Qiblah and a mosque" (Sheikh Sadūq, *Man La Yahḍarah al-Faqīh*, vol. 1, p. 178) And the aim of these narrations is to damage the issue of pilgrimage in Shia. (Hosseini Tabataba'i, "Tolerance and Intensity of Action in Islam", p. 11, taken from Tabataba'i website)

He also discusses the difference between the Islamic Sects in the discussion of the monotheism of worship and extracts from the verses of the Qur'an that prayer, sacrifice, circumambulation, seclusion and vows are all dedicated to God Almighty. (Hosseini Tabataba'i, *The Path to Islamic Unity*, p. 93) While expressing some Shiite narrations in this regard, without mentioning the differences between the fatwas of the scholars and the arguments of the defenders, he writes:

If any of the Sunni scholars and brothers observe that the Shiite masses circumambulate around the graves or offer sacrifices and vows to the owner of the grave, and such deviations, they should note that these indecent acts are not in accordance with the works of the Ahl al-Bayt (AS) and their religion

and It also has nothing to do with the fatwas of the great Shiite mujtahids because they have stated the sanctity of these deeds in their books. (Ibid., P. 94)

Of course, he then points out that among the Sunni people, the like is also seen on the graves of the elders.

Hosseini Tabataba'i in his other writing, quoting verse one hundred and twelve of Surah Al-Shu'arā: "Noah said: "How do I know what they did?" which conveys the ignorance of Noah, and the verse twenty-five of surah Dhāriyāt which conveys the ignorance of Prophet Ibrahim towards the divine angels and even the verse one hundred and one surah of Tawbah which expresses the ignorance of the Messenger of God (PBUH) towards the hypocrites of Medina "And from the people of Medina (also), a group adhere to hypocrisy severely. You do not know them, but we do know them." It proves that the divine messengers and even the Holy Prophet (PBUH) had limited knowledge in the world, and then he says that when their knowledge is limited in the world, they will certainly be more ignorant in the other world. And refers to the story of the hundred-year-old death of Haḍrat 'Uzayr and his lack of knowledge about the duration of his death and ... (204 Baqarah). (Hosseini Tabataba'i, "Qur'an and exaggeration about the prophets", pp. 2 to 5, taken from Tabatabai's site) It goes without saying that this statement of Hosseini Tabataba'i is wrong because according to verse 22 of Surah Qāf, even the deniers become more aware of the world after death, let alone the prophets and saints: "They tell her that you were really unaware of this, but we lifted your veil [before your eyes] and you see today."

He goes on to say that those who have "obliquity" in their hearts have abandoned these Muḥkam verses and believe that the prophets and saints are present and watching everywhere and are aware of the state of the people and can be resorted to. (Ibid., P. 6)

Therefore, in addition to the knowledge of the infallibles (AS), he has also questioned and doubted the appeal to them.

He believes that Islamic Shiism has been changed throughout history and has not kept its original face (Hosseini Tabataba'i, Sheikh Mohammad 'Abduh, p. 23), has written a book about the life of Sheikh Mohammad 'Abduh and with a text that confirms this issue has raised his Salafi view.

In the commentary of al-Manār, Volume One, page fifty-nine, 'Abduh said: "... From here you will know that those who take refuge in the owners of the shrines and graves in order to meet their needs and make their work easier, and to cure their diseases, and ... have turned away from the path of monotheism and turned away from the remembrance of God!" (Ibid., P. 103)

Doubt in the Issue of Mourning and Denial of Some Examples

One of the issues in which Hosseini Tabataba'i has dissenting views with Shiite scholars is the issue of mourning. Mourning for Imam Hossein (AS), which has always been emphasized by scholars in the Shiite community as one of the religious rites, has been criticized by Hosseini Tabataba'i.

In one of the lectures on Friday prayers, about Bid'ah (i.e. heresy) in practice, he considered mourning as one of its important examples and believes that heresies created in mourning such as chaining and beating the chest, which did not exist in Islam at all, is rooted in a false philosophy that even some elders believe in.

Referring to one of the poems of Mirza Ḥabībullāh Qā'ānī known as Mujtahid al-Shu'arā, who considered the condition for Imam Hussein's (AS) intercession as mourning for him, the design of such a philosophy about the Karbala incident is the source of innovations such as beating the chest and chaining.<http://sadaislam.com/records/id/3057>

In short, we do not consider such a philosophy correct for the martyrdom of Imam Hussein (AS). It is not accepted by many contemporary thinkers that the purpose of the martyrdom of Imam Hussein (AS) is to help the Shiites and that the way to achieve it is to weep over his sufferings. (See the history of the uprising and murder of Imam Hussein (AS), vol. 1, chapter six) But this is not a reason to deny mourning and weeping for Imam Hussein (AS).

Hosseini Tabataba'i in another speech while interpreting the verse "Those who take their religion for fun and game" has considered beating on chest and lamenting as examples of entertainment and fun in religion.<http://sadaislam.com/records/id/3312>

Elsewhere, he said that the main task of the religious government is to cultivate the people and that the way of cultivation is to fight against superstitions. Then he stated that our revolution came to life with Shari'ah speeches and all the youth came because he fought against superstitions. He goes on to say, for example, that the Prophet (PBUH) fought against the superstition that the Arabs beat themselves when someone is dying, but the Prophet (PBUH) said that anyone who commits such behavior is not from us.

Hosseini Tabataba'i, regardless of the special characteristics of Imam Hussein (AS) and his tragedy and the difference between this mourning and mourning for the ordinary dead, says sarcastically: "Now it is worse! They are chaining (i.e. beating chain on their back)."<http://sadaislam.com/records/id/3073>

Regarding the mourning of Imam Hussein (AS), he also wrote an article entitled "Expressing the Truth about Illegal Mourning" in which he boycotted tatbir⁵ and chaining in Islam. Although he knows the Karbala incident as the greatest tragedy in the history of Islam, but it has pointed to the emergence of some patterns of mourning, such as tatbir and chaining in recent centuries, and has praised Allameh Seyyed Mohsen Amin Āmulī, who in *al-Tanzīh fī A'mal al-Shabīh*, has opposed tatbir, chaining, and beating the chest.

His reasons are divided into several categories: 1- Qur'anic prohibition 2- Prophetic prohibition 3- Prohibition by the family of the Prophet (PBUH) 4- Consensus of the early scholars of Imamiyyah. All his arguments have many jurisprudential and theological answers that should be addressed in an article.

Denial of Shiite Ceremonies and Occasions

Another Shādh views of Hosseini Tabatabai's is the denial of religious occasions, including the holding of 'Eid ceremonies or the martyrdom of Imams, which can be considered a distance from the Shiite community and a tendency towards Wahhabism, because even Sunnis engage in religious occasions.

He believes that only 'Eid al-Fiṭr and 'Eid al-Aḍḥā are the two original 'Eids of Islam, which are purely for God, and there is no focus on different people like other religious feasts. This 'Eid is a feast for God Himself, but other religious 'Eids are made by people and are not in the context of religion. Like births and...<http://sadaislam.com/records/id/3267>

He also criticized the reverence of Arba'een and stressed that Islamic feasts such as Fiṭr and Qurbān should be valued instead. Then he protests to the mourning people, why don't you make your alms in Fiṭr and Qurbān and do it on the days that people have made?!<http://sadaislam.com/records/id/3312>

⁵ The practice of Tatbir includes striking oneself with a form of a *talwar* "sword" on the head, causing blood to flow in remembrance of the innocent blood of Imam Hussein.

Acting Upon Sunni Jurisprudence

Seyyed Mohammad Taqi Hosseini Varjani, who has lived with these men for many years, says based on his objective observations:

Mr. 'Abulfaḍl Burqa'ī and Mr. Haydar Ali Qalamdaran prayed with open hands and anointed their heads and feet in ablution, while Mr. Mostafa Hosseini Tabataba'i washed his feet instead of anointing them, he did not use Mohr⁶ at prayer but spread a mat under his feet. And sometimes he prostrated on the carpet. He prayed with his hands open in the Wājib prayer, and of course, it has been heard that he also prayed with his hands closed in the Mustahab prayer.<http://h-varjani.blogfa.com/post-450.aspx>

Publication of Hosseini Tabatabai's Works in Saudi Arabia

The content of some of Hosseini Tabatabai's works is such that Sunni and Wahhabi propaganda sites and networks use them to propagate their ideas; therefore, the Aqīdah website in Saudi Arabia, which promotes Wahhabi beliefs, has uploaded many of his writings.

Of course, Hosseini Tabataba'i himself has expressed his dissatisfaction with this matter and by expressing his unwillingness to enter controversial topics, in a video on his site, he has asked the channels and sites not to use or distribute his tapes and remarks.<http://media.tabatabaienet/video 1908>

Despite this word, it should be said that the content of his articles was Wahhabi-friendly, otherwise why do not they publish other Shiite books and articles? By searching the internet sites, one can find many websites and blogs of Sunnis and Wahhabis who publish his articles and praise him well.

Other Evidences

What we are mentioning in this section is "evidences" that may not be considered "reasons" but cannot be easily ignored:

A) Hosseini Varjani has quoted that at the burial of Burqa'ī, Hosseini Tabataba'i did not allow Talqīn⁷ to be read and gave a speech instead.

<http://h-varjani.blogfa.com/post-450.aspx>

B) He also quoted that Hosseini Tabataba'i, hearing the phrase "believe in the divine prophets and imams" in the will of Burqa'ī, his face color turned to red and he became very upset and stopped Burqa'ī reading the rest of the text.

<http://h-varjani.blogfa.com/post-450.aspx>

C) He mocked the salvation of the love and intercession of Amir al-Mu'minin Ali (AS) and believes that the Qur'an has rejected all this. He attributes these beliefs to religious arrogance. In one of his speeches, he criticized the famous poem "What God Wants of All - is Love of Ali Ibn Abi Ṭālib" and changed it to "following the father of Ali Ibn Abi Ṭālib".

<http://sadaislam.com/records/id/ 3025>

Of course, there are many scholars who do not consider love without action as a means of salvation.

⁶ It is a small piece of soil or clay, often a clay tablet, used during *salāt* (Islamic daily prayers) to symbolize *earth*.

⁷ Talqīn is some phrases regarding Islamic beliefs that are recited for the deceased before burying his or her corpse.

D) Hosseini Tabataba'i denies that Imam Mahdi (AS) is Hujjatullah⁸. His reason is that if he is absent, a problem will arise, and that is that the proof will not be completed and people will be left without proof. Referring to the Qur'anic phrase "The clear proof is for Allah", he says that if the proof is absent, God's proof will no longer be complete and expressive, and the proof will not be completed.

He did not quote the same narrative that is narrated from Imam Mahdi (AS) in this regard, which introduces the scholars and jurists as the authority on the people in the absence of Imam, (Sheikh Saduq, Kamaluddin and all blessings, Vol. 2, p. 484), and says: "The Qur'an and the definite tradition of the Prophet of God (PBUH) that is available now is the real proof of God upon us, and the proof that is absent is not considered as proof.

<http://sadaislam.com/records/view/id/3024>

E) The emphasis on "taking religion from the righteous predecessor" is also one of the issues that has a Wahhabi content. Stating that the Shiite predecessor also believed in it and did not disagree with the Sunnis on this issue, while attributing what he considered exaggeration to the latter, he clarified: "So, true Islam must be taken from the righteous predecessors, and in other words, we should consider what was going on in the beginning of Islam, not what some narrators and Rawḍa Khwan say in our century?!" (Hosseini Tabataba'i, *Betrayal in History Report*, p. 306)

F) Hosseini Tabataba'i has criticized the subject of "awareness of the unseen" according to Basā'ir al-Darajāt. A narration which says: "The Imam will be aware of something as soon as he wants to know something." (Saffar, *Basā'ir al-Darajāt*, vol. 1, p. 315) While weakening this book, he considered the above narration to be contrary to the history of the life of the Holy Prophet (PBUH) because the Prophet (PBUH) was aware of the facts through revelation and the revelation was not available to him. His witness is also the period of "Fatrat of Revelation"⁹ in which the Messenger of God (PBUH) suffered a lot from the delay of revelation. Although many scholars have answered these questions and doubts while confirming these narratives, he believes that weak hadiths should not be preferred to the verses of the Qur'an and the testimony of history. (Hosseini Tabataba'i, *Betrayal in History Report*, pp. 307 and 308)

G) In many of his works, he pays less attention to Shiite narrative sources and mostly quotes Sunni hadith. (For example, see Hosseini Tabataba'i, *betrayal in the history report*)

H) Hosseini Tabataba'i does not consider the remembrance of Imam Ali (AS) as worship (The Messenger of God (PBUH) said: ... Remembrance of Ali (AS) is worship.) (Sheikh Mufid, *al-Ikhtisāṣ*, p. 224) and says: "Remembrance of the creature is not considered as a worship! This is infidelity that turns people away from religion."

<http://sadaislam.com/records/id/3053>

It should be said that the Qur'an has repeatedly ordered to remember (mention) the creature, and this shows that it is worship: "And remember our servant Ayyub..." (P. 41) "And remember Maryam in the Book..." (Maryam, 16) and so on.

Conclusion

Based on the reasons mentioned, it was determined that Seyyed Mostafa Hosseini Tabataba'i was influenced by the Sunnis and distanced himself from some Shiite views. There are many reasons for this issue, including his relationship with Seyyed Abu al-Faḍl Burqa'i, and Burqa'i has praised him in his books and referred to Tabataba'i's books. According to the character of Seyyed Abu al-Faḍl Burqa'i,

⁸ The proof of God

⁹ An interregnum (plural interregna or interregnums) is a period of discontinuity or "gap" between two revelations on the Prophet (PBUH).

Tabatabai's relationship with him is a reason that their thoughts are in harmony with each other. Also, Tabataba'i does not consider recourse and pilgrimage to be correct. He considers Islamic 'Eids as 'Eid al-Fitr and 'Eid al-Aḏḥā, and considers other rituals such as the birth of the Ahl al-Bayt and their martyrdom to be man-made. In some cases, he acts upon Sunni jurisprudence, for example, instead of anointing his feet, he washes them like Sunnis and he does not use Mohr for prayer. His works are published and advertised in Saudi Arabia and on Sunni websites, which all show that Hosseini Tabataba'i is influenced by the Sunnis.

References

The Holy Qur'an.

- Hosseini Tabataba'i, Mustafa; 1357 HS, Sheikh Mohammed 'Abduh, the great reformer of Egypt; Tehran; Pen Publications.
- Hosseini Tabataba'i, Mustafa; 1361 HS, Critique of Ibn Sina's views on theology; First Edition; Tehran; Publisher Publisher.
- Hosseini Tabataba'i, Mustafa; 1363 HS, Betrayal in history report; Volume 2, Tehran; Chapakhsh Publications.
- Hosseini Tabataba'i, Mustafa; 1366 HS, Betrayal in history report; Volume 3, Tehran; Chapakhsh Publications.
- Hosseini Tabataba'i, Mustafa; 1368 HS, Salman Rushdie's humiliation; First Edition; Tehran; Publishing Joint Stock Company.
- Hosseini Tabataba'i, Mustafa; 1370 HS, Inviting Christians to monotheism; First Edition; Tehran; Publisher: Mostafa Hosseini Tabataba'i.
- Hosseini Tabataba'i, Mustafa; 1372 HS, Slavery from the perspective of Islam; First Edition; Tehran; Islamic Encyclopedia Foundation.
- Hosseini Tabataba'i, Mustafa; 1375 HS, Critique of the works of Orientalists; First Edition; Tehran; Chapakhsh Publications.
- Hosseini Tabataba'i, Mustafa; 1377 HS, Mesopotamia in the time of the Rashidun caliphs; First Edition; Tehran; nn.
- Hosseini Tabataba'i, Mustafa; 1378 HS, Islam and the idols of the West and minus spirituality; second edition; Tehran.
- Hosseini Tabataba'i, Mustafa; 1379 HS, Story of Bab and Baha; second edition; Tehran; Rozaneh Publications.
- Hosseini Tabataba'i, Mustafa; 1380 HS, Unsuccessful anti-religion; First Edition; Tehran; Rozaneh Publications.
- Hosseini Tabataba'i, Mustafa; 1382 HS, Faṭḥ al-Bayān Fī ma on the part of Ali (peace be upon him) from the interpretation of the Qur'an; Tehran; Publisher: Mostafa Hosseini Tabataba'i.
- Hosseini Tabataba'i, Mustafa; 1384 HS, Review of Akhbārī and Usūlī Opinions; Tehran; Publisher: Mostafa Hosseini Tabataba'i.
- Hosseini Tabataba'i, Mustafa; 1385 HS, Islamic intellectuals against Greek logic; Tehran; Pen Publications.
- Hosseini Tabataba'i, Mustafa; 1401 AH, Betrayal in history report; Volume 1, Tehran; Print.
- Hosseini Tabataba'i, Mustafa; nd, A path to Islamic unity; Tehran; nn.
- Hosseini Tabataba'i, Mustafa; nd, Critique of hadith books; Misplaced; nn.
- Hosseini Tehrani, Seyyed Mohammad Hossein; 1426 HS, Imamology; Volume 12; Third edition; Mashhad; Allameh Tabataba'i Publications.
- <http://aparar.com>
- <http://aqeedeh.com>
- <http://h-varjani.blogfa.com>
- <http://quraniun.com>

<http://sadaislam.com>

<http://tabatabaie.net>

Sheikh Sadūq; 1378 AH, Uyūn Akhbār al-Reza (AS); Research by Mehdi Lajevardi; Tehran; World Publishing.

Sheikh Sadūq; 1413 AH, Man La Yahḍarah al-Faqīh; Sixth edition; Research by Ali Akbar Ghaffari; Qom; Office of Islamic Publications affiliated with the Society of Teachers of the Seminary of Qom.

Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal.

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).