



Measuring the Level of Discipline of Bureaucrats in Palu City

Andi Pasinringi; Muhammad Nur Alamsyah; Muhammad Ahsan Samad

Tadulako University, Palu, Central Sulawesi, Indonesia

<http://dx.doi.org/10.18415/ijmmu.v7i10.2011>

Abstract

This research was conducted to find out why the implementation of the disciplinary policies of the State Civil Apparatus in Palu City has not been running optimally. The scope of this research is the Palu City government using qualitative methods as a reference to produce descriptive data collected through in-depth interviews, observation and document analysis related to the implementation of employee work discipline. With the determination of informants using a purposive method. Purposive sampling is a non-random sampling strategy where the selection is determined by the researcher by determining certain characteristics that are in line with the research objectives so that research questions can be resolved. The results showed that the implementation of the discipline of the Palu City State Civil Apparatus, which was seen from the dimensions of communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure, had not gone as expected. Thus it is necessary to evaluate and provide motivation given by the leadership to employees in order to increase the quality of performance. Employee discipline is very influential on services for the community.

Keywords: *Work Discipline; State Civil Apparatus; Performance; Service*

Introduction

Public policy is a guideline for action, and it relates to a broader framework involving the application of theories, principles, visions and decisions which are translated into various programs, projects and activities (Khan & Khandaker, 2016). Policy implementation requires planning, with the availability of funds, guidelines, action plans, initiatives and projects. When funds are collected, implementation begins with a hierarchical distribution of funds from the central government to the provincial, city, district, sub-district, sub-district and village levels (Pradhan, Fu, Zhang, & Yang, 2017). The public policy-making process is generally defined as an action embedded in the principle of rationality and logical development from one stage to the next. This process consists of at least four stages, policy formulation, policy evaluation, policy implementation, and policy assessment. Each requires careful consideration and sufficient encouragement for behavior change (Khudyakova, Shapiro, Grabovskaya, & Alexeeva, 2017). A policy can respond to needs, or perceptions of needs which must be clearly defined to facilitate the formulation, legitimacy and implementation of solutions (Viennet, R and Pont, 2017).

The effort, knowledge and resources devoted to translating policy decisions into action comprise a series of activities generally described as the 'implementation phase' of policy making (Howlett, 2019). Policy implementation is a complex phenomenon and cannot be adequately covered in short documents (Campos & Reich, 2019). Governance experts acknowledge these complexities and the gradual differences between policy formulation and implementation (Gollata & Newwig, 2017). Therefore, we only focus on certain aspects of policy implementation regarding bureaucratic discipline using Edward III's theory. What is meant by bureaucrats in this paper is the State Civil Apparatus (ASN). The policy implementation process requires collaboration involving a group of actors and organizations to communicate policy objectives, ensure resource availability, establish policy controls by implementers, manage conflict and cooperation, and support policy adjustment (Campos & Reich, 2019). Given that implementing member states remain formally independent, implementation is not only the implementation of delegated tasks but involves independent decision making or other processes (Heidbreder, 2017). A developing civil society will increase the accountability of policy making and hold policymakers accountable for the implementation of appropriate policies (Schrama & Zhelyazkova, 2018). However, policymakers around the world seem to be too busy identifying the 'right' policies to secure change and improvement, rather than considering the conditions and contextual factors that are most likely to make selected policies effective in practice (Harris & Jones, 2018). The creation of an overly ambitious strategy, setting targets separate from actual national facts and capabilities, is another vacuum, partly linked to external tensions (Ménard, Jimenez, & Tropp, 2018).

Government agencies as organizations must have goals to be achieved. This goal is achieved or not determined by the performance of the organization itself. Organizational performance certainly does not escape the interference of its apparatus. State Civil Apparatus with good performance will result in good performance replacement so that organizational goals can be achieved (Semmaila & Arifin, 2020). The State Civil Apparatus is an employee who works for the government and is paid in accordance with the provisions of the prevailing laws and regulations and is appointed with certain conditions. Then in carrying out its duties and obligations, it is obligatory to discipline oneself in the duties and positions it carries out in accordance with the provisions governing the applicable employee discipline. The provision of disciplinary punishment aims to improve and educate State Civil Servants who commit disciplinary violations. Therefore, every official who has the authority to impose sanctions, before imposing a disciplinary sentence, must first examine the State Civil Apparatus who committed the violation. The purpose of the examination is to ascertain and find out the motive behind the disciplinary violation (Suprpto, Pomalingo, & Akib, 2018). Because no matter how great a policy plan is without involving and determining the implementing units in its implementation, it is certain that the policy will not run well.

Therefore, the role of implementing units (Governmental Units) is needed, namely the ranks of the public bureaucracy from the central level to the bureaucracy at the regional level. The city is one of the policy implementing units that plays a role in controlling policies to avoid differences in perceptions in the implementation of a program, so the administrative process must always be guided by Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) as a reference for its implementation. Referring to the description above, the researcher chose the focus of this problem because it is related to the level of discipline of the State Civil Apparatus with problems that dominate government agencies, including the Palu City agency, where disciplinary violations are still frequent. Data in the field shows that the level of discipline of civil servants in Palu City is not optimal. Among them: the attendance of the morning roll call is still low, a lot of work that should be done today but is experiencing delays in completing it, low quality of apparatus resources and mismatches of competence, misplacement, and unclear career path.

Method

The analysis style of this research is descriptive qualitative (Mufti, Kurnia, Karim, & Samad, 2020). The type of research used in this research is the type of research with a descriptive approach. Descriptive research is one type of research whose aim is to present a complete picture of the social setting or is intended for exploration and clarification of a phenomenon or social reality, by describing a number of variables with respect to the problem and the unit under study between the phenomena being tested (Riadi & Rivai, 2020). The purpose of this descriptive writing is to make descriptions, descriptions or paintings systematically, factually and accurately regarding facts, characteristics and relationships between research factors (Syahrir, Yahya, 2020).

In determining informants, researchers used a purposive method. With data collection techniques carried out through field research (observation, interviews, documentation) (Samad & Kusuma, 2020). That is, the main concern is how program policies are implemented, so interviews need to involve people who are involved in the process (Arshed, Mason, & Carter, 2015). The analysis studied involved developing policies on information authentication and several attempts to implement these policies (Niemimaa & Niemimaa, 2017). The types of data collected in this study consisted of two types, namely primary data and secondary data. The research instrument used to collect data in this study consisted of research actors, informants, and supporting devices. The data that has been collected is analyzed using the interactive model data analysis of Miles, Huberman and Saldana which consists of data collection, data condensation, data presentation, and drawing conclusions and verification (Erlambang, Santoso, & Hermawan, 2020). The location of this research was conducted in the Palu City regional office.

Result and Discussion

Discipline is one of the important factors in an organization because it will affect the performance of employees in the organization. The more disciplined an employee is, the higher the work performance that can be achieved. Discipline is a reflection of the amount of responsibility a person has in carrying out the tasks assigned to him, which encourages his enthusiasm. In general, good discipline occurs when employees come to the office regularly and on time and dress neatly. In addition, they used materials and equipment with care. They perform work with satisfactory quantity and quality and follow work procedures determined by the organization (Suprpto et al., 2018). Discipline is a form of employee self-control that is carried out regularly and shows the level of teamwork in an organization (Suprpto et al., 2018).

The key to success in achieving an organizational goal comes from the discipline of its employees. Discipline is the main asset of the State Civil Apparatus in carrying out its functions, duties and obligations. Within government agencies, work discipline is the main asset of the State Civil Apparatus in providing services. Public service is the focal point in every business. This should be continued under the Administrative Renewal Agenda (Holidin, 2020). Every public service intervention, simple or complex, is shaped by collective understanding. The second element of public service interventions includes raw materials, technical skills, and structures that coordinate work to convert inputs into outputs (coordination method) (Moulton, 2016).

The success of policy enforcement depends on other key variables, including the priorities and motivations of local governments and other players involved in the policy network, who are required to enforce national policies. Therefore, it is important to understand the larger policy network and the constellation of priorities (Martin de Jong, Chang Yu, Simon Joss, Ronald Wennersten, Li Yu, XiaolingZhang, 2016). The State Civil Apparatus is the main element of human resources for the running of government administration and development. A State Civil Apparatus must have a mental attitude of work discipline, namely obeying and obeying predetermined regulations, being responsible for

completing work and efficient work productivity. The progress or failure of a predetermined policy is determined by its execution, considering that implementation is a chain that connects policy formulation with the expected policy results (Andi Pasinringi, Muhammad Ahsan Samad, Muh. Nur Alamsyah, 2020).

In order to improve the discipline of the State Civil Apparatus, the government has issued a Regulation on the discipline of Civil Servants. The 2010 Government Regulation regulates provisions regarding Obligations, Prohibitions, Disciplinary Punishment, Officials authorized to punish, Imposing disciplinary penalties, Objections to disciplinary penalties, and enactment of disciplinary decisions. Then it was strengthened by the 2013 Palu Mayor's Regulation concerning Work Discipline for Civil Servants in the Palu City Regional Government. The focus of this research is regarding the level of discipline of the State Civil Apparatus in Palu City and to measure the level of success and failure refers to Edward III (1980) theory which explains four variables, namely communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure.

Communication Factors

Communication has a very important role in the successful implementation of public policies (Erlambang et al., 2020). Communication is the main requirement for the implementor, thus the implementor knows exactly what must be done clearly and communicates jointly with the target group (target group). The implementation of discipline in the State Civil Apparatus in Palu City has not shown optimal results. There are still employees who do not know and understand the substance of the provisions of the discipline of the State Civil Apparatus as stipulated in the 2010 Government Regulation, so that there are still many employees who violate the discipline of the State Civil Apparatus. Basically the most dominating disciplinary offense is not showing up on time and leaving early. Subsequently, a sanction was imposed on civil servants who were absent within one working day, namely a penalty for deducting a salary of Rp. 15,000 {fifteen thousand rupiah}. However, the fine applies when he is present within one working day and is not calculated at the time of coming to work, namely entering at 07.30 and leaving at 16.00 This indicates that the policy was not implemented intensively. In addition, the transmission and delivery of policies on apparatus discipline has not been carried out, so it can be said that it has not yet been implemented as expected from the stipulated employee discipline policy. Furthermore, the socialization of the disciplinary policies of the State Civil Apparatus in Palu City has been carried out, but in general it has not shown the expected results, namely an increase in employee work discipline.

Resource Factor

There are five elements of the implementation plan identified from the various selected frameworks, namely the allocation of tasks and accountability, objectives and tools, resources, time, communication strategies and engagement with stakeholders (Viennet, R and Pont, 2017). Researchers have developed a model created, namely an 'interactive policy implementation model' which describes resource criteria, such as political, financial, administrative and technological resources needed to introduce policy reforms effectively (Jamil, Dhakal, & Paudel, 2018). Resources are useful for facilitating policy implementation. Policy execution will be hindered without adequate resources (Nurbaiti, Nurabiti & Na, 2019).

Resources are a successful supporting variable for public policy implementation. Several types of resources, including human resources, have an important role as subjects and drivers of public policy implementation (Erlambang et al., 2020). The importance of the availability of good and adequate human, financial, facilities and infrastructure is a measure of the success of implementing an implemented policy. Likewise the disciplinary policy towards the State Civil Apparatus. Secondary processed data shows that the quantity of human resources owned by Palu City is adequate in terms of the appropriate government

situation and condition. Data from the Central Sulawesi Provincial Statistics Agency shows that the total number of bureaucrats in Palu City is 6,849 people. The facilities and infrastructure in Palu City are also considered adequate in implementing the program. This is supported by disciplinary fostering carried out by government leaders in providing appeals and directions to develop disciplinary awareness of the State Civil Apparatus. The appeal is in the form of a warning to employees that they are paid public money. However, the appeal given was not accompanied by firm leadership when reprimanding employees for errors.

Disposition

The causes of policy failure are 4 factors that can be categorized, namely too high expectations, widespread introduction of governance; inadequate collective policy making; and the twists and turns of the political cycle (Hudson, Hunter, & Peckham, 2019). If the implementor has a tendency or there is support for policy implementation, there is a high probability that policy implementation will be carried out in accordance with the initial decision. On the other hand, if the implementers have a negative attitude or refuse to implement the policy because of a conflict of interest, the implementation of the policy will face serious obstacles. Thus disposition or attitude is one of the factors that has important consequences for effective policy implementation. Disposition is the essence, characteristic or behavior of the executor, such as honesty, integrity or democratic character (Putra & Khaidir, 2019). However, this does not apply in Palu City. Leaders do not provide good examples. The reason for the employee to violate working hours is based on the attitude and behavior of the leader who commits the same violation. On the other hand, local government leaders may have different interests regarding organizational goals, therefore they cannot take the responsibilities assigned to them, resulting in deviations from policy implementation (Li, Yang, Wei, & Zhang, 2019).

Lack of discipline and a sense of responsibility towards work is a common phenomenon, especially in government offices which are the main implementers of government and national development (Suprpto et al., 2018). To re-apply employee discipline rules consistently and consistently, leaders must set a good example and increase work motivation for employees. To improve work discipline, providing motivation for employees needs to be considered. Strategies for providing motivation are also efforts that can be taken to improve employee discipline. This effort is made so that the goals and objectives of employee administration activities are achieved. Motivation must be directed at efforts to create an orderly and disciplined atmosphere, both in the form of budgetary discipline and administrative discipline, which grow and develop on the basis of self-awareness. This will create conditions for dynamic obedience and obedience to orders and leadership policies, applicable laws, without pressure so that creativity and initiative continue to grow and develop which allows the work productivity of the apparatus to be higher. The delivery of individual support needs is done in a rational way (Verdugo, Jenaro, Calvo, & Navas, 2017). Because some of the problems of implementation are rooted at the micro level, beyond the various stakeholders involved with actors with different interests (Ménard et al., 2018).

Bureaucratic Structure

Bureaucracy is a type of government and administration that should be in an ideal organizational system, as suggested by Max Weber (Koybasi & Ugurlu, 2017). The bureaucratic structure seeks to place employees to carry out their roles and authorities according to their expertise, main duties, roles and obligations (Erlambang et al., 2020). The organizational structure in implementing a policy as far as possible avoids convoluted, long and complex matters. Therefore, the implementing organizational structure must be able to ensure that there are decisions made on extraordinary events in the program quickly. This can be done if the organization is designed to be concise and flexible, avoiding the rigid, hierarchical and bureaucratic web virus. Regarding the bureaucratic structure, seen from the aspect of

standard operational procedures / policies in enforcing employee discipline in Palu City, there is no clear framework. This means that if there are rules that will be socialized, they will be immediately conveyed without a clear working mechanism. Domestic rules adopted by many policymakers often include incoherent and ambiguous policy objectives that hinder the ability of bureaucrats to implement policies in a realistic manner (Zhelyazkova, Kaya, & Schrama, 2016). A policy to be implemented requires a clear, systematic, straightforward and easy to understand work mechanism. Because with standard operating procedures, the direction of a policy can be understood, and make the program run smoothly.

The bureaucracy must be in a position to support the policies to be implemented. Solidarity, cooperation and mutual support will create harmony in upholding the discipline of the State Civil Apparatus in their respective environments. The implementation of the disciplinary policy implementation of the State Civil Apparatus in Palu City is still not optimal. The responsibility of the head of the work unit in communicating and implementing the 2010 Government Regulation and the Mayor's Instruction on the Implementation of Employee Discipline which contains provisions on working hours, morning and evening apples are still not implemented, this is due to the lack of optimal supervision carried out. If this continues to be done, then on a small scale (work unit) even to the sub-district office work unit will experience a decline in work performance and by itself will affect the level of government services to the community.

An organization that has a clear division of tasks, hierarchy and lines of authority is a good type of bureaucratic structure. Such a bureaucratic posture clearly has a line of authority for structural officials in taking steps to carry out disciplinary guidance in accordance with the authorities and responsibilities they have and the work unit they lead. A good bureaucratic structure can also create a network of cooperation / collaboration between work units, which in the end the inherent supervision related to the implementation of discipline can be carried out properly. An important part of measuring the success of implementing employee disciplinary policies in Palu City bureaucrats is the existence of a standard operating system, which is a reference or guideline. Although it is not implemented consistently and consequently.

Conclusion

The work discipline of the Palu City State Civil Apparatus in the aspects of communication, disposition, resources and bureaucratic structures still has not shown optimal performance. Communication on the implementation of the discipline of the State Civil Apparatus that is carried out is still in one direction, namely in the form of giving directions from the highest leadership to employees which are subsequently forwarded to the head of the work unit. This resulted in less effective communication. From the resource dimension, the data show a lack of awareness of the apparatus regarding work discipline, minimal facilities and infrastructure, as well as a lack of budgeting from the APBD. The disposition dimension shows that the commitment, honesty, and exemplary attitude included in the disposition of the disciplinary policy of the Palu City bureaucrats have not shown the level of satisfaction. Meanwhile, seen from the dimensions of the bureaucratic structure, Palu City does not yet have a clear working mechanism.

References

- Andi Pasinringi, Muhammad Ahsan Samad, Muh. Nur Alamsyah, J. (2020). Public Health Policy in Donggala Regency. *Technium Social Sciences Journal*, 11, 1–12. Retrieved from www.techniumscience.com
- Arshed, N., Mason, C., & Carter, S. (2015). Exploring the disconnect in policy implementation: A case of enterprise policy in England. *Environment and Planning C: Government and Policy*, 34(8), 1582–1611. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0263774X16628181>

- Campos, P. A., & Reich, M. R. (2019). Political Analysis for Health Policy Implementation. *Health Systems and Reform*, 5(3), 224–235. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23288604.2019.1625251>
- Erlambang, N., Santoso, B., & Hermawan, R. (2020). Policy Implementation in Transportation Office of Kediri City Regarding to Motor Vehicle Testing. *Jurnal Ilmiah Administrasi Publik (JIAP)*, 6(2), 170–177.
- Gollata, J. A. M., & Newig, J. (2017). Policy implementation through multi-level governance: analysing practical implementation of EU air quality directives in Germany. *Journal of European Public Policy*, 24(9), 1308–1327. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13501763.2017.1314539>
- Harris, A., & Jones, M. (2018). Why context matters: a comparative perspective on education reform and policy implementation. *Educational Research for Policy and Practice*, 17(3), 195–207. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10671-018-9231-9>
- Heidbreder, E. G. (2017). Strategies in multilevel policy implementation: moving beyond the limited focus on compliance. *Journal of European Public Policy*, 24(9), 1367–1384. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13501763.2017.1314540>
- Holidin, D. (2020). Protracted Public Service Improvement at the Local Level: A Quest for Certification? *Journal of Public Administration and Government*, 2(2). <https://doi.org/10.22487/jpag.v2i2.107>
- Howlett, M. (2019). Moving policy implementation theory forward: A multiple streams/critical juncture approach. *Public Policy and Administration*, 34(4), 405–430. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0952076718775791>
- Hudson, B., Hunter, D., & Peckham, S. (2019). Policy failure and the policy-implementation gap: can policy support programs help? *Policy Design and Practice*, 2(1), 1–14. <https://doi.org/10.1080/25741292.2018.1540378>
- Jamil, I., Dhakal, T. N., & Paudel, N. R. (2018). Civil service management and administrative systems in South Asia. In *Civil Service Management and Administrative Systems in South Asia*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-90191-6>
- Khan, A. R., & Khandaker, S. (2016). A critical insight into policy implementation and implementation performance. *Public Policy and Administration*, 15(4), 538–548. <https://doi.org/10.13165/VPA-16-15-4-02>
- Khudyakova, M. V., Shapiro, M. M., Grabovskaya, M. A., & Alexeeva, M. (2017). Coherence in Aphasia: Implementation of Different Measurement Procedures. *SSRN Electronic Journal*. <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2885766>
- Koybasi, F., & Ugurlu, C. T. (2017). The Factors That Influence Bureaucracy and Professionalism in Schools: A Grounded Theory Study. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 8(8), 196–207. Retrieved from <http://ezproxy.lib.uconn.edu/login?url=https://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=eric&AN=EJ1139040&site=ehost-live>
- Li, X., Yang, X., Wei, Q., & Zhang, B. (2019). Authoritarian environmentalism and environmental policy implementation in China. *Resources, Conservation and Recycling*, 145(February), 86–93. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.resconrec.2019.02.011>
- Martin de Jong, Chang Yu, Simon Joss, Ronald Wennersten, Li Yu, XiaolingZhang, X. M. (2016). *Eco city development in China: addressing the policy implementation challenge*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2016.03.083>.This
- Ménard, C., Jimenez, A., & Tropp, H. (2018). Addressing the policy-implementation gaps in water services: the key role of meso-institutions. *Water International*, 43(1), 13–33. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02508060.2017.1405696>
- Moulton, S. (2016). The Strategic Action Field Framework For Policy Implementation Research. *Policy Studies Journal*, 00(00), 1–26. Retrieved from <http://10.0.4.87/psj.12147%0Ahttps://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=bth&AN=121147446&site=ehost-live>

- Mufti, M. I., Kurnia, I., Karim, I., & Samad, M. A. (2020). Evaluation on Community Empowerment Policy after Conflict Resolution (A Study of Sub District Development Program in Poso District). *International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding*, 7(8), 16–25. <https://doi.org/10.18415/ijmmu.v7i8.1792>
- Niemimaa, E., & Niemimaa, M. (2017). Information systems security policy implementation in practice: From best practices to situated practices. *European Journal of Information Systems*, 26(1), 1–20. <https://doi.org/10.1057/s41303-016-0025-y>
- Nurbaiti, Nurabiti, H., & Na, B. (2019). Analysis of Teacher Certification Policy Implementation Through Edward Iii Approach in Aceh Tamiang Regency in Indonesia. *Prizren Social Science Journal*, 3(2), 61. <https://doi.org/10.32936/pssj.v3i2.99>
- Pradhan, N. S., Fu, Y., Zhang, L., & Yang, Y. (2017). Farmers' perception of effective drought policy implementation: A case study of 2009–2010 drought in Yunnan province, China. *Land Use Policy*, 67(April), 48–56. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.landusepol.2017.04.051>
- Putra, R. H., & Khaidir, A. (2019). Concept of George C. Edwards III on Implementation of Regional Regulations No. 12 of 2017 Concerning Youth in Granting Youth Service in West Sumatera. *International Journal of Progressive Sciences and Technologies (IJPSAT)*, 15(1), 236–242.
- Riadi, S., & Rivai, A. (2020). Partisipasi Masyarakat dalam Melaksanakan Program Bedah Rumah Warga Miskin di Kelurahan Silae Kecamatan Ulujadi Kota Palu. *Journal of Public Administration and Government*, 2(2), 54–59. <https://doi.org/10.22487/jpag.v2i2.110>
- Samad, M. A., & Kusuma, E. Z. (2020). Apparatus Resources Development in The Regional Agency of the Palu City. *International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding*, 7(7), 233–237.
- Schrama, R., & Zhelyazkova, A. (2018). ‘You can’t have one without the other’: the differential impact of civil society strength on the implementation of EU policy. *Journal of European Public Policy*, 25(7), 1029–1048. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13501763.2018.1433709>
- Semmaila, B., & Arifin, Z. (2020). Point of View Research Management Influences of work discipline , motivation and Working Environment Non physical on Civil apparatus Performance. *Point of View Research Management*, 1(3), 1–8.
- Suprpto, S., Pomalingo, N., & Akib, H. (2018). The Implementation of a Culture of Discipline for The State Civil Apparatus (ASN) in Gorontalo Regency (A Study of the Application of Discipline Ambassador Vest). *Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research*, 226(Iess), 1135–1140.
- Syahrir, Yahya, A. S. (2020). Integritas Kepemimpinan Integritas Kepemimpinan Perangkat Daerah Dalam Mewujudkan Kinerja Pelayanan Publik Yang Profesional. *Journal of Public Administration and Government*, 2(2). <https://doi.org/10.22487/jpag.v2i2.111>
- Verdugo, M. A., Jenaro, C., Calvo, I., & Navas, P. (2017). Disability policy implementation from a cross-cultural perspective. *Intellectual and Developmental Disabilities*, 55(4), 234–246. <https://doi.org/10.1352/1934-9556-55.4.234>
- Viennet, R and Pont, B. (2017). Education Policy Implementation. *OECD Education Working Papers Series*, (162), 375. <https://doi.org/10.1787/fc467a64-en>
- Zhelyazkova, A., Kaya, C., & Schrama, R. (2016). Decoupling practical and legal compliance: Analysis of member states' implementation of EU policy. *European Journal of Political Research*, 55(4), 827–846. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1475-6765.12154>

Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal.

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).