



## Critique of Ethan Kohlberg's Views on the Martyrdom of Early Muslims

Sakineh Razzaghi zadeh<sup>1</sup>; Mohammad Reza Aram<sup>2\*</sup>

<sup>1</sup> PhD Student of Quranic Sciences and Hadith, Central Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

<sup>2\*</sup> Associate Professor of Department of Quranic Sciences and Hadith, Central Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

Emails: sakinehrazghizadeh@gmail.com; moh.aram@iauctb.ac.ir\*

\* Corresponding Author: Mohammad Reza Aram

<http://dx.doi.org/10.18415/ijmmu.v7i7.1918>

---

### **Abstract**

The special place of martyrdom in Islam has caused researchers to pay attention to this issue; The issue of martyrdom in Islam has also attracted the attention of Orientalists. Ethan Kohlberg is one of the Islamologists who has dealt with the subject of martyrdom in his research. *Medieval Muslim Views on Martyrdom* (Medieval Muslim views on martyrdom) He concludes that the concept of martyrdom in Islam is to give up life and seek an opportunity to reach death. In another part of the article, Kohlberg discusses the relationship between suicide and martyrdom, and challenges the issue of boycotting suicide in Islam and its ugliness. He believes that attacking the enemy is a form of suicide. Arguing against historical narrations, he considers suicide permissible in Islam. In this study, after briefly introducing the concepts of martyrdom and suicide in Islamic verses and hadiths, in the content critique section, to express and explain the citations of this Orientalist about his views on martyrdom, the ruling on suicide in Islam, and that martyrdom seeks suicide. We will pay and the inaccuracy of his views will be revealed.

**Keywords:** *Martyrdom; Martyrdom; Suicide; Ethan Kohlberg; Islam*

### **Problem Statement**

The subject of martyrdom is one of the most important issues in Islam, which has a special place among Muslims. According to Islamic sources, the martyr is alive<sup>1</sup> (Al-Imran, 169) and with the first drop of the martyr's blood, all his sins are forgiven except religion. (Ameli, 327) Martyr means to be killed in the way of God. The sum of those martyrs is martyrdom: seeking martyrdom and martyr who is alive, that is, he is alive before God. (son Manzoor, 1414 AH, 3/242) is stated in the definition of martyrdom: »(Motahari, 1372, 71).

---

<sup>1</sup> - wala tahsabann alladhin qutiluu fi sabil allah 'amwatana bal 'ahya' eind rabbihim yurzaqun

The subject of martyrdom and martyrdom-seeking has entered the researches of Orientalist Islamology, and it has been seriously analyzed and studied, and different views have been put forward on this subject. Among these orientalist, the Shiite orientalist Ethan Kohlberg has authored several articles on the subject of martyrdom in Islam. "Martyrdom"<sup>2</sup> has been written. In this article, Ethan Kohlberg offers thoughtful insights into martyrdom in Islam, and its relationship to suicide. He believes that suicide is permissible in Islam and attacking the enemy is a kind of suicide if suicide means consciously destroying oneself to get rid of the unbearable situation (Asgari, 2014, 109) Which the Qur'an forbids (Nisa: 29); But seeking martyrdom means wanting to desire martyrdom, the question that arises is whether seeking death by martyrdom from God is acceptable in Islam? Is such a request worthwhile or not? Examining the verses of the Holy Quran and the narrations of the Ahl al-Bayt (as), we will come to the conclusion that the purpose of seeking martyrdom is to defend Islamic values, so these two issues have two different rulings in Islam. Given the differences between the two issues, with what documents did Kohlberg present his views on the subject of testimony? And how does he consider the martyrdom of Muslims as a kind of suicide?

In this research, we will refer to the analysis of martyrdom-seeking views in Islam from the point of view of Ethan Kohlberg. We will finally come to the inaccuracy of Ethan Kohlberg's views on the subject of martyrdom.

## ***Background***

In this study, we analyze Ethan Kohlberg's views on testimony. Given that Ethan Kohlberg has written many works in the field of Shiism and Islam, only a few of these works have been criticized. The issue of martyrdom is one of the most important topics in Islam, to which several research works by Ethan Kohlberg are dedicated. Despite the fact that Islamic thinkers have tried to defend Shiism over time; However, in response to the suspicions and currents of thought that have been raised against the issue of martyrdom, there are no significant writings in response to it.

### **Description of Ethan Kohlberg:**

Ethan Kahlberg was born in 1943 in Tel Aviv. His father, Dr. Joshua Kahlberg (1909-1999), is a Zionist activist, and his mother, Dr. Arma Kohlberg (1909-2002), is Jewish. His family settled in occupied Palestine in 1937. Who were of European descent and from areas under German and Ukrainian rule after World War II, this made it easier for Kohlberg to learn different languages.

Ethan Kohlberg lived in many countries and studied with many professors. After completing his military service, he joined the Hebrew University, completing his bachelor's degree in 1966, obtaining his bachelor's degree two years later, and two years later his master's degree by defending his dissertation in He received the subject of "Sunnis and Shiites around the first caliph of Abu Bakr." He studied at the University of Oxford from 1969 to 1971 and earned his doctorate by defending a dissertation on "Shiite Imami views on the Companions". He then taught at the Hebrew University in 1972 and became a professor in 1991.

His activities revolve around the research of Islamic thought and religious teachings in the Middle Ages and focus on Shiite Islam. He has written many articles on Shiite beliefs. He pays special attention to Shiite culture, especially what belongs to hadith and tradition, and what is related to current issues, between Shiites and other Muslims. The issue of martyrdom in Islam is one of the topics seen in the works of Ethan Kohlberg. The title of Kohlberg's articles on the subject of martyrdom in Islam is as

---

<sup>2</sup> - Medieval Muslim Views on Martyrdom

follows (Amir-Moezzi, Mohammad Ali, & Bar-Asher, Meir M. & Hopkins, Simon, 2009, 11-29) Martyr 1995.<sup>3</sup>

Medieval Muslims' views on the 1997 martyrdom<sup>4</sup>

The image of the Prophet Muhammad as a martyr<sup>2005</sup><sup>5</sup>

Martyr: A Framework on Islamic Martyrdom in 2006<sup>6</sup>

### **Martyrdom and martyrdom in Islam:**

Martyrdom is the way to attain true happiness and immortality in heaven, and a believer who seeks perfection must seek martyrdom; Because martyrdom is the way to reach his desired degrees, the truth of what has been said, according to God Almighty in the Holy Quran <<wala tahsabana aladhin qutiluu fi sabil allah 'amwatana bal 'ahya' eind rabihi yurzaquna, farihin bima atahum allah min fadlih wayastabshirun bialadhin lam yalhaquu bihim min khalfihim 'alaa khawf ealayhim wala hum yahzanuna, yastabshirun biniemat min allah wafadl wa'ana allah la yudie 'ajr almuminina(al eamrana:171-169).

Witnessing is for a person to sacrifice his life for the sake of God, to defend the homeland and the religion of truth and the believers, and not to be afraid of any threat, in order to achieve a higher goal. Prefer death with dignity over life with humiliation. (Qaraati, 1387, 2/115) And as mentioned before, suicide is completely different from destroying oneself to get rid of an unbearable situation.

A martyr is someone who is killed in the way of God. (Ibn Manzur, 1414 AH, 3/242) and the infidels killed him in battle. (Fayumi, 1987, 124) Tashahhud means seeking martyrdom. (Hosseini Zubaydi, 1414 AH, 5/50) and it is also said that the martyr is deceased and for this reason it is named because the angels of mercy are present with him.<<'iina aladhin qaluu rabuna allah thuma astaqamuu tatanazal ealayhim almalayikat 'alaa takhafuu wala tahzanuu wa'abshiruu bialjanat alati kuntum tuedun >>. (fsalta, 30) Oh, the guide of Aynkeh, the martyrs, in it, that it is the secret of the blessings of which Anan, Maha Farmoudeh, witness Hastand, oh, the guide of Inaka, the souls of Anan, the souls of Anan, the souls of the nazd, are present, and he witnessed what may be more intense. (The Imran family 171-169) waladhin amanuu biallah warusulih 'uwayik hum alsidiyqun walshuhada' eind rabihi lahum 'ajruhum wanuruhum (alihadayd, 19). (raghb,1412q, 468; taryhy, 1375sh, 3/81)

Since the present article deals with the lack of connection between the two issues of martyrdom and suicide in Islam, it is necessary to examine these two issues in Islamic sources; In the following, we present the contents of both topics in verses and hadiths alone.

---

1 -SHAHID 1997.

2- Medieval Muslim Views on Martyrdom1997.

3-The image of the prophet Muhammad as a shahid 2005.

4-shahid: a framework on islamic martyrdom 2006

### Ethan Kohlberg's view on martyrdom in Islam:

Ethan Kohlberg, in his article "Medieval Muslims' Views on Martyrdom", examines the subject of martyrdom in Islam and considers it a form of suicide. In the sections "Martyrdom on the Battlefield" and "Martyrdom and Suicide", he mentions verses from the Qur'an and historical narrations that in Awf, the sum of these verses and narrations, presents his views on the martyrdom of Muslims and its connection with suicide, which we refer to below.

- 1- The martyrdom of Awf Ibn Harith: There is a narration about the battle of Uhud about a companion named Ibn Harith. While wearing armor, he asks the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings of God be upon him, what makes God pleased with his servant? The Holy Prophet said: Entering the battle without armor will bring pleasure to God. Awf took out the armor he was wearing and threw it and fought to become a martyr.
- 2- Bridge War: A battle near the Euphrates, which is known as the Battle of the Bridge (Al-Jasr) (in 13 AH / 635-634), a number of Muslim warriors attacked the Persian elephants and were crushed to the death under the heavy weight of these animals. The animals were crushed.
- 3- The martyrdom of Abdullah Ibn Rawaha: Kohlberg explicitly considers the martyrdom of Muslims to mean "wishing for death". He writes about the martyrdom of Abdullah ibn Rawaha: "Ibn Rawaha took command of the Muslim forces after the two previous commanders of the division, Ja'far Tayyar and Zayd ibn Harith, who were martyred in battle. "Many documents have described him in such a way that, like other commanders, he sought his death (martyrdom) in the same way and wished to see it."
- 4- Definition of Martyrdom: Kohlberg seeks the martyrdom of Muslims in such a way that warriors not only want to give up their lives, but are constantly looking for an opportunity to do so, a behavior known as "martyrdom". (Medieval Muslim Views on Martyrdom »Kohlberg, 1997, 7-11,)
- 5- Permitting Suicide on the Case of Repentance Uprising: Ethan Kohlberg believes that one should refer to the Qur'an in order to obtain a suicidal sentence. Following his suicide sentence, he cited only two verses 54 and 195 of Surah Al-Baqarah. Moses said to his people: O my people! You Zlemtem yourselves Batakazkm calf Repent to Barikm Vaqtheloa yourselves is better for you when you Barikm Fattab It is the Most Merciful » Considers suicide as a license in Islam. And he says: The phrase "kill yourself" in the verse is a vague phrase. And sometimes it is a document that shows that suicide is permissible in certain circumstances. While Ethan Kohlberg has studied the interpretation of this verse in commentary books and seen it as meaning to kill each other; But he abandons commentary books, citing a story of the Tawabin uprising in Tabari's history book. He claims that the Tawabin, who blamed themselves for leaving Hussein (AS) alone in Karbala, were aware of the understanding of this verse to cite suicide.
- 6- The connection between suicide and the phrase <<la talaqawa biaydykm aly althlk>>: Kohlberg makes such a view in connection with verse 195 of Surah Al-Baqarah; Do you mean <<la talaqawa biaydykm aly althlk>> Does it refer to suicide? Referring to Tabari's commentary, he claims that Muslims have attributed this phrase to suicide in a particular situation by their own interpretation (Ibid, 1997, 27-31).

## Witnessing in the Quran:

In examining the issue of martyrdom, it should be noted at the beginning that none of the wars waged by the Holy Prophet were for the expansion of the Islamic government, and all of them were fought to defend Islam. (Tabatabai, 1417 AH, 4/164) In the Qur'an, many verses refer to the issue of jihad, and in most verses of the Qur'an where the word jihad is used, the phrase "in the way of God" appears; Because jihad is worship and any worship in which there is no intention of closeness is not accepted by God, therefore jihad must be for the sake of God, to be accepted by God Almighty. (Mughniyeh, 1379, 3/9)

In the Qur'an, God says about the importance of jihad in verse 95 of Surah An-Nisa: Not equal spectators of believers is an initial damage and the Mujahideen in the way of Allah with their wealth and themselves Fadlallah mujahideen with their money and themselves on the laggards and the degree of both the promise of Allah and Mujahideen Fadlallah on the laggards a great reward»

In the above verse, God does not equate those who prevent jihad in His way with those who jihad in His way, and gives a great reward to His true Mujahideen; But we should not be unaware of the fact that in every war, a group of fighters are killed and another group survives. Left alive. God says in verse 154 of Surah Al-Imran:

<<... yaqulun law kan lana min al'amr shay' ma qutilna hahuna qul law kuntum fi buyutikum labaraz aladhin kutib ealayhim alqatl 'iilaa madajiehim waliabtali allah ma fi sudurikum waliumahis ma fi qulubikum ...>>

God addresses those who have doubts in their hearts about the victory of Islam and say that if victory is from Islam, we would not have been killed here: If you stayed in your homes, those for whom God would bear witness. Destined to travel to their place of martyrdom; But all this is for your test. (Feyz Kashani, 1415 AH, 1/393)

In this verse, God gives martyrdom to those who have true faith in God. The above verse makes it clear that God does not grant martyrdom to all those who are present on the battlefield; Because not all of these people have the true faith to achieve martyrdom; As a result, seeking martyrdom has a lofty goal, which is done for the exaltation of the word of God, and man gives his life and property in the way of God in defense of the truth, in which case God bestows martyrdom on those who have true faith in this truth. And puts a group waiting for martyrdom; As God says: <<min almuinin rijal sadaquu ma eahaduu allah ealayh faminhum man qadaa nahbah waminhum man yantazir wama badaluu tabdilana>>(ahzab ,23)<sup>7</sup>

In the above verse, God Almighty refers to two groups, the first group remained steadfast in the covenant they made with God and His Messenger to defend the religion, and they sacrificed their lives to end their covenant with martyrdom. The second group are the believers who keep their promise and wait for martyrdom for the truth of their claim. An example of this is what God has said in another verse in the same surah.

walaqad kanuu eahaduu allah min qabl la yualuwn al'adbar wakan eahd allah masyuwlana( ahzab,15)<sup>8</sup>

For this reason, it should be said: Martyrdom is fulfillment of the divine covenant, and martyrdom is waiting for fulfillment of the covenant with God.

<sup>7</sup> - Ahzab 23. Among the believers are men who have faithfully fulfilled what they made a covenant with God [and that was steadfastness and defense of the truth until the sacrifice of life], some of them fulfilled their covenant [and achieved the honor of martyrdom and some of them are waiting for [the testimony] and have not made any changes [in their covenant].

<sup>8</sup> -Ahzab 15. And indeed, they had made a covenant with God not to turn their backs [on the enemy]; And God's covenant is always questionable.

Elsewhere God says:

And among the people is someone who buys for himself seeking the pleasures of God, and God is gracious to worship (Baqarah: 207)<sup>9</sup>.

In this verse, God praises the believers who sacrifice their lives to please God. Looking at the dignity of the revelation of this verse, the greatest concept of martyrdom in the history of Islam can be seen. Amir al-mu'minin mentioned in the verse, without any doubt, sleeps in the bed of the Messenger of God, peace and blessings be upon him, knowing that the enemies intended to kill the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings of God be upon him. He sleeps to save the life of the Messenger of God, peace and blessings of God be upon him. (Feyz Kashani, 1415 AH, 1/241; Tabarsi, 1372, 2/535; Bolaghi Najafi, 1420 AH, 1/184; Bahrani 1416 AH, 1/442)

Also, in the Sunni sources, the verse in question (Baqarah 207) has been mentioned in the honor of Imam Ali (as), regarding his sacrifice in order to preserve the life of the Holy Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him). (Esfarayeni, 1375 AH, 1/218; Haskani, 1411 AH, 1/123; Andalusian, 1420 AH, 2/334; Qortabi, 1364 AH, 3/21; Jazri, 1433 AH, 877; Hakim Neyshabouri, 1422 AH, 3/5)

In other verses of the Holy Quran, such as verse 12 of Surah Saf «Believe in Allah and His Messenger and Tjahidon in the way of Allah with your wealth and yourselves is better for you if you know» and verse 111 of Al Tuba «God bought from the believers themselves and their money that they Paradise fighting in the way of Allah and kill and kill and except it really in the Torah, the Bible and the Koran, and fulfilled his promise of God, so seek good news of the sale of you with which you sold it, and that is the great victory. God encourages the believers to have the spirit of martyrdom and jihad with wealth in the way of God, and has declared martyrdom and jihad to be trade with God; In this trade, man trades his mortal world with the eternal life of heaven.

As a result, it should be said: the verses mentioned in the above section invite man to have the spirit of martyrdom and by placing the reward of eternal paradise for the martyrs of Islam, he invites more and more Muslims to martyrdom. Therefore, having the spirit of seeking martyrdom and the desire for martyrdom are considered desirable commandments, the result of which will be eternal happiness.

### **Testimony in narrations**

Martyrdom has a high status, as it is stated in the narrations, martyrdom in the way of God is interpreted as the highest virtues. A hadith attributed to the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings of God be upon him, said: Above every good deed, there is another good deed, until a man is killed in the way of God. When he is killed in the way of God, there is no other good deed higher than that deed. (Klini, 1407 AH, 5/53)

To reach such a degree, man must strive for God to grant him death along with martyrdom. The basic condition for achieving the degree of martyrdom is sincerity in action; This means that God does not make a person a martyr unless he is eager for martyrdom in his heart.

In another hadith attributed to the Messenger of God, peace and blessings of God be upon him, he says: Whoever seeks martyrdom from God with a sincere intention, God will give him the status of a martyr, even if he dies in his bed. (Majlisi, 1404 AH, 8/103)

<sup>9</sup> - Baqara 207. And one of the people who sells his life for the pleasure of God, and God is merciful to His servants.

Therefore, in order to reach the degree of martyrdom, a sincere request is required; Also, man does not attain the purity of intention unless he is pure from God in all his actions. In the story of Haritha Ibn Malik Ibn Nu'man's meeting with the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings be upon him, we read that when the Messenger of God, peace and blessings of God be upon him, asked about his condition, Haritha replied, about the truth of his faith with the Holy Prophet. The Holy Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) speaks. In response to his words, the Holy Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) said: A servant (meaning Haritha ibn Malik) may God enlighten his heart and remain steadfast in this faith. The Holy Prophet asks God to make martyrdom a day for him ... After a few mornings, the Messenger of God sent Haritha to a series and he achieved martyrdom by fighting against the enemies of Islam.

As a result, reaching the status of a martyr requires true faith. One is a true martyr who has true faith in God. Therefore, seeking martyrdom is a good thing that has been recommended in the verses and hadiths of God and the Infallibles (peace be upon them), and martyrdom cannot be considered as an example of suicide.

### **The sanctity of suicide in the Holy Quran:**

The sentence of murder is one of the important rules whose prohibition is mentioned in the Qur'an. Also, the sentence of killing oneself is mentioned in several verses, which, like killing others, is forbidden.

Surah An-Nisa ', verse 29, explicitly states the prohibition of suicide

ya 'ayuha aladhin amanuu la takuluu 'amwalakum baynakum bialbatil 'iilaa 'an takun tijaratan ean tarad minkum wala taqtuluu 'anfusakum 'iina allah kan bikum rahima( nisa'an: 29)

In a few other verses in the Qur'an, with the phrase "And do not kill the soul which is forbidden by God except by truth" (An'am: 151; Isra ': 33; Furqan: 68) Expresses the sanctity of suicide in general. Because in this phrase, the soul refers to all people and refers to the soul that causes the body to be alive. (Ibn Ashour, 1984, 303).

In verse 29 of Surah Al-Baqarah, God says: And do not kill yourselves. It explicitly forbids suicide, this phrase has another aspect, and if a person kills another person, he has caused his own murder. In the interpretation of the above verse, it is stated that it is not only about suicide, that is, suicide; It also includes killing others. Because they are all one soul. (Andalusia, 1420 AH, 3/357)

In the next phrase, "<<'iina allah kan bikum rahima>>" refers to the fact that God prevents man from committing suicide, is a proof of his grace and kindness to his servants; Because in this verse, God wants to make man understand that not only is it not a secret for someone to kill another human being, but he does not allow man to harm himself. (Makarem Shirazi, 1374, 3/357)

God has exalted man and his life; Because God prevents man from any danger that threatens his life and forbids the burden of human excellence even from fighting someone who does not have the strength and ability to fight it; (Tabarsi, 1998, 1/251) Because when the Muslims entered their enemies in the caves and the enemy overpowered them and killed them. God forbade them from doing this. (Feyz Kashani, 1418 AH, 1/205).

In general, it can be said that most commentators consider the phrase "do not kill myself" to mean the sanctity of suicide. (Tabarsi, 1372, 3/59; Qomi, 1367, 1/136; Hosseini Jorjani, 1404 AH, 2/135; Bolaghi Najafi, 1420 AH, 2/98; Sadeghi Tehrani, 1419 AH, 2/83; Andalusi, 1420 AH, 3 / 612)

The phrases <<w la taqtuluu alnafs alty haram allah alla bialhaqa>> It is mentioned in three chapters of the Holy Quran. (An'am, 151; Isra ', 33; Furqan, 68) And as mentioned before, the soul is general in the verses in question. (Ibn Abi Hatim, 1419 AH, 5/251) includes all populations; As a result, it signifies the self of man and other people. In the above phrase, God has forbidden the killing of any soul; Because he considers life as a trust in the hands of its owner and it is not permissible for man to commit suicide, God has not left man free in this matter. With the sanctity of self-murder, life flows with security and certainty, because the punishment for premeditated murder, which is betrayal of life, is immortality in the fire of hell. (Fazlullah, 1419 AH, 9/373)

Therefore, it should be said: In the Qur'an, four verses state the ruling on suicide and suicide, and in the meantime, verse 29 of Surah An-Nisa 'with the phrase "do not kill yourself" explicitly prohibits the ruling on suicide, and other verses in general, which include all There are types of murder, that is, suicide and killing others are forbidden.

### **Murder (suicide) in the narrations:**

Suicide is one of the greatest sins that man commits; Because its punishment is immortality in hell. It is narrated that "whoever kills himself intentionally, then he is immortal in the fire of Hell." (Ibn Babawiyah, 1406, 276; Homo, 1413, 4/202; Tusi, 1407 AH, 9/207; Feyz Kashani, 1406 AH, 16/568)<sup>10</sup> Also, "If someone intentionally kills or injures himself Then he wills a will and dies due to that injury, his will is not valid in one third of rubbing. Commits suicide; But the Holy Prophet does not pray on his body. (Thalabi Neyshabouri, 1422 AH, 3/293)

The human soul has such a status that even sin is considered as its murder, it is a hadith attributed to Amir al-Mu'minin Ali (as), they said:

The human soul is born to sin and man is commissioned to accustom the soul to good character, the human soul insists on its opposition and man tries not to accept those requests and whenever he releases this rebellious soul; Therefore, man is a partner in the corruption of his soul, and whoever helps his soul to follow the air of the soul, has participated in the murder of his soul. (Nouri, 1404 AH, 11/138)

In the mentioned narrations, it was stated that the end of suicide is immortality in the fire of hell and the good deeds of human beings are destroyed due to suicide.

### **An analysis of the sources cited by Ethan Kohlberg:**

In this section, we examine Ethan Kohlberg's views on the sources cited by him in relation to martyrdom in Islam, as in the previous section; we will pay.

1- The martyrdom of Awf ibn Harith: During the martyrdom of Awf ibn Harith in the battle of Uhud, who took off his armor and fought without armor until he was martyred. The narration cited by Ethan Kohlberg is from two books on the history of Tabari and the biography of Ibn Hisham. According to Ibn Abi Shaybah in his book Al-Musnaf, this narration has made this hadith one of the hadiths of Zawayd (Ibn Abi Shaybah, 1425 AH, 7/55-54). We will explain it below.

<sup>10</sup>-haddathani muhammad bn musaa bn almutawakkil qal haddathani eabd allah bn jaefar alhimyari ean 'ahmad bn muhammad ean alhasan bn mahub ean 'abi wallad alhannat qal samiet 'aba eabd allah e yaqulu man qatal nafsah mutaemmidaan fahu fi nar jahannama khalidaan fiha.



- A- The narration in question is not mentioned in the books of Seth; For this reason, the author has considered it as an extravagant hadith.
- B- Due to the deception of Ibn Ishaq, the hadith has been considered weak.
- C- The narrator of the hadith in the text cited by Ethan Kohlberg and his article is Awf Ibn Harith, known as Ibn Afra; However, in the book of Al-Musnaf, he is Mu'adh ibn Harith and he is the brother of Awf ibn Harith (Dhahabi, 2004, 1/18). And is said to have been alive after that; There is another promise that he was martyred during the time of the Messenger of God. (Zir, 1418 AH, 457-456) As a result, in a hadith that is weak and the text of the hadith, due to the ambiguity of the character of Awf Ibn Harith can not be a reliable citation for research.

2-bridge war: during this war, referring to a source cited by Kohlberg, it was observed that the muslims were forced to take the belts that had fastened the elephants in order to defeat the enemy; because the opposite group of muslims (iranians) were riding on elephants and the muslims did not have access to them, so to overthrow the riders, the muslims went to the elephant and cut the belts. In this case, it is normal for one of the elephants to be injured and for the elephants to attack the muslims. Also, helping others to free the person who was attacked by the elephant does not mean fighting the elephant. (tabari, 1378 ah,3/ 457-456)

So in that war, none of the Muslims attacked the elephants with the aim of committing suicide in order to save their lives and achieve death, and Kohlberg's interpretation of this historical narrative is incorrect.

3-Martyrdom of Abdullah Ibn Rawaha: In the part of the command of the Muslim Corps by Abdullah Ibn Rawaha in the battle of Mu'tah, Ethan Kohlberg first speaks of Ibn Rawaha's command and his martyrdom and considers it as a citation for other commanders of Islam and their martyrdom. Makes it look like a suicide and going after death; But in the continuation of his article, he emphasizes the fear and retreat of Abdullah bin Rawaha in the war.

4- Definition of martyrdom: Kohlberg's definition of martyrdom contradicts the purpose of Muslim martyrdom; This is because Kohlberg, in his misunderstandings of the documents of Islamic sources regarding the martyrdom of Muslims, has given such a definition of seeking martyrdom.

5-Permission to commit suicide based on the Tawabin uprising: In the narration that the history of Tabari comes from the Tawabin uprising and has been cited by Kohlberg, it is seen that the Tawabin considered themselves guilty for not helping Imam Hussein (as) on the day of Ashura; So they chose Suleiman bin Sadr as their leader. In a speech that Suleiman recited to the audience in verse 54 of Surah Al-Baqarah, he asked the audience to learn from the flow of the children of Israel in the above verse and to be superior to the children of Israel. Finally, he asked his companions to prepare themselves to face the killers of Imam Hussein (as); As a result, in no case did Muslims consider verse 54 of Surah Al-Baqarah as a reason for permitting suicide. However, the omission of the sayings of the commentators in verse 54 of Surah Al-Baqarah by Kohlberg is another proof of the falsity of his claim (Homo, 1387 AH, 5/551).

Kohlberg also argues that the shari'a ruling on suicide should be derived from the Qur'an; But he cites only two verses of the Qur'an from which the true verdict of suicide cannot be deduced. In the section on self-murder in the Qur'an, the author has stated the verses that explain the ruling on suicide in the Qur'an.

6-The connection of suicide with the phrase "la talaqawa biaydykm aly althlk>> Regarding the course of the Battle of Constantinople, which is quoted below (verse 195 of Surah Al-Baqarah) and quoted by Kahlberg, the Muslim interpretation of this verse has nothing to do with the behavior of the person who attacked the enemies; Because that person's purpose in attacking the enemy alone was not to kill himself; Rather, the aim was to frighten the enemy and encourage the Muslims, and what is seen, that person returns to the Muslims; If his goal was suicide, he would stay among the enemies and fight to be killed. (Homo, 1412 AH, 2 / 119-116)

### **Content critique of Ethan Kohlberg's view**

Kahlberg's views on Muslim martyrdom are flawed.

#### **1-Restrictions on the use of resources:**

The hadith of A'waf ibn Harith, as a document on how Muslims were martyred, is a narration that has been referred to only two books on the history of Tabari and the biography of Ibn Hisham. If history books are from any author, they are full of quotations in which there is a high probability of error; Because the historian has not lived at all times and could not witness all the historical events. In the introduction to his book, Tabari says: The narrations and citations that he has brought in his book are the result of quotations that he has heard from others and he has written them without exception and only in a few narrations that are very few in number. Has been able to find out their accuracy; But most of the narrations could not be deduced from the authenticity of the narrations; Because historical news is narrated by people who did not live in those times and only narrate from others. Finally, Tabari says: The text of some hadiths that I have quoted in my book are unpleasant for the reader and listener; Because they are far from the truth and reality. To find out the truth about the martyrdom of Muslims, Kahlberg had to refer to the main sources of Islamic books.

#### **2-Citation of weak narrations:**

The hadiths that are used as an argument in expressing a point of view should be evaluated for authenticity in books and authentic sources, what Ethan Kohlberg cites in the narration of A'waf ibn Harith that by the order of the Holy Prophet, A'waf took his armor from It brings out the body to fight, it makes every reader think about how God is pleased with fighting without armor; If in the Holy Quran, he says: << faqatil fi sabil allah la tukallaf 'illa nafsak >>.( nisa'un, 84) As a result, the concept of defense and readiness to confront the enemy has no place.

When the text of a hadith becomes contemplative, the authenticity of the hadith must be ensured; As mentioned in the previous section, the weakness of this hadith. Unfortunately, Kohlberg has failed to research the authenticity of the hadiths cited in his research.

#### **3-Do not refer to the main sources:**

To understand the verses of the Holy Quran, we refer to commentary books. In any research, commentary books will be cited to understand the Qur'anic expressions, but the rejection of the commentators' quote from a Qur'anic phrase and reference to a narration in the historical books will not be accepted by any scholar. Ethan Kohlberg denies the meaning of the Qur'anic phrase "fakhtlwa anfsakm" in verse 54 of Surah Al-Baqarah, which he admits has rejected the opinion of the commentators, which means "killing each other." And has cited a narration in historical books.

#### 4-Misunderstanding of the concepts of martyrdom and suicide:

At the beginning of this research, the concept of martyrdom and suicide was expressed in Islam, and both issues were examined in the Holy Quran and hadiths; It became clear that ultimately seeking martyrdom in Islam is eternal bliss, and the end of suicide is immortality in torment. Finally, we will achieve these results by searching in reliable Islamic sources. The meaning of the two subjects is different; But Ethan Kohlberg does not refer to verses and hadiths that correctly express the concepts of martyrdom and suicide; Has misinterpreted these two issues.

#### 5-Lack of correct understanding of references:

In the description of Ethan Kohlberg, it was stated that his residence in the Arab-speaking country (Palestine) made it possible for him to understand the Arabic language; But what we see from the study of this Orientalist regarding martyrdom has been a misunderstanding of Arabic texts. "Muslims fought elephants," Kohlberg said in a statement on Paul's war. Also, during the Tawabin uprising, it is not understood that Muslims consider verse 54 of Surah Al-Baqarah to mean the permission to kill in certain circumstances. In verse 195 of Baqarah, which Kohlberg claims about the prohibition of suicide, he does not mention the source that explicitly states the interpretation of the verse forbidding suicide, and only refers to Tabari's interpretation, which in the verse in question has no comment on the prohibition of suicide for the verse. This is not mentioned and what is said about the war in Constantinople in this commentary means leaving jihad.

#### 6-Conflict in the text:

Introducing the martyrdom of Muslims, especially warlords, Ethan Kohlberg describes that martyrdom-seeking Muslims are always seeking their own death. He quotes a narration from the Mu'tah war about Abdullah ibn Rawaha, who, like other commanders of Islam, sought his own death; If he writes about Abdullah Ibn Rawaha: He gets scared in war and returns from attacking the enemy, how can a person who has always sought his own death refrain from attacking the enemy and abandon the war?

#### 7-Do not refer to verses relevant to the subject:

Failure to refer to the verses relevant to the subject under discussion distracts the researcher from reaching the main point, which has led to Ethan Kohlberg's misunderstanding of the main ruling on suicide in Islam, the release of verses that explicitly state the ruling on the prohibition of suicide. And have cited other verses.

### **Result**

According to Ethan Kohlberg's view on the relationship between martyrdom and suicide in Islam, which he has studied in his research, he considers martyrdom and attack on the enemy as a form of suicide, which in this article follows the following results.

- 1- Observing the conflict in the text of Ethan Kohlberg's article in introducing the martyrdom of Muslims, has caused a semantic hesitation in his research and he can not really express the concepts of martyrdom in Islam.
- 2- The inference from the narrations of martyrdom in historical books, whose hadiths are not acceptable, neither in terms of text nor in terms of documents, can not confirm the view in the research.

- 3- Ethan Kohlberg's misunderstanding of the concept of martyrdom in Islam, based on the story of the Bridge War and referring to the weak narration of A'waf Ibn Harith, is a good reason for the incorrect definition of martyrdom in Islam according to Ethan Kohlberg.
- 4- Although Ethan Kohlberg considers the first source of Islamic rulings from the Qur'an; However, in order to express the concept of suicide and its ruling, he has referred to other verses of the Qur'an that do not state the ruling on suicide. It is also obvious to refer to commentary books to understand the verses of the Qur'an; If Kohlberg, in expressing his arguments about the permissibility of suicide among Muslims, abandons the opinions of commentators and refers to historical books, and this weakens his research. And there is evidence of a misinterpretation of the ruling on suicide in Islam.
- 5- Martyrdom and suicide are two different issues from each other. In the Holy Quran and the narrations attributed to the infallibles, the end of the martyrs is happiness in the eternal paradise and the punishment for suicide is immortality in hell; Therefore, these two issues, according to Islamic sources, are fundamentally different from each other, so it can not be said: martyrdom is a kind of suicide.

As a result of all that has been said, all of Ethan Kohlberg's views, in defining the martyrdom of Muslims, stating the sentence of suicide in Islam, and that martyrdom is a form of suicide, are a misjudgment and prove the rejection of Ethan Kohlberg.

### **References:**

The Holy Quran

- Ibn Abi Hatim, Abdul Rahman Ibn Muhammad, (1419 AH), **Tafsir Al-Quran Al-Azeem**, As'ad Muhammad Al-Tayyib, Saudi Arabia, Nizar Mustafa Al-Bar School.
- Ibn Abi Shaybah, Abi Bakr Abdullah Ibn Muhammad, (1425 AH), **mosannfe**, Muhammad Ibrahim Al-Lahidan, Saudi Arabia, Rushd.
- Ibn Babawiyah, Muhammad ibn Ali, (1406 AH), **thawab al,aemai w eigab al,aemali**, Qom, Dar al-Sharif al-Radhi for publishing.
- Homo, (1413 AH), **man la yhdaruh alfaqayhu**, Ali Akbar Ghaffari, Qom, Islamic Publications Office affiliated with the Society of Teachers of the Seminary of Qom.
- Ibn Ashour, Muhammad ibn Tahir, (1984 AH), **Tahrir wa al-Tanwir**, Tunisia, Dar al-Tunisia for publishing.
- Ibn Manzoor, Muhammad ibn Makram, (1414 AH), **lisan alearab**, Beirut, Dar Sader.
- Esfarayeni, Abu Muzaffar, (1996), **Taj al-Tarajum fi Tafsir al-Quran l'a'ajm**, Najib Mayel Heravi and Ali Akbar Elahi Khorasani, Tehran, Scientific and Cultural Publications.
- Andalusian, Abu Hayyan Muhammad ibn Yusuf, (1420 AH), **Bahr al-Muhit fi al-Tafsir**, Muhammad Jamil Sadqi, Beirut, Dar al-Fikr.
- Bahrani, Seyyed Hashem, (1416 AH), **Al-Burhan Fi Tafsir Al-Quran**, Qasm Al-Darasat Al-Islamiyya, Tehran, Ba'ath Foundation.
- Bolaghi Najafi, Mohammad Javad, (1420 AH), **Alaa al-Rahman fi Tafsir al-Quran**, Islamic Research Unit of the Besat Foundation, Qom, Besat Foundation.
- Thalabi Neyshabouri, Ahmad Ibn Ibrahim, (1422 AH), **alkshf w albyan awn tafsyir alqurani**, Beirut, Dar Al-Ahya Al-Tarath Al-Arabiya.
- Jazri, Ali ibn Muhammad, (1433 AH), **Asad al-Ghabeh fi Maarefa al-Sahaba**, Beirut-Lebanon, Dar ibn Hazm.

- Haskani, Obaidullah Ibn Ahmad, (1411 AH), **shawahid altazil liqawaeid altafzili**, Mohammad Baqir Mahmoudi, Tehran, Publications of the Islamic Culture and Guidance Publications-Islamic Culture Revival Association.
- Hosseini Astarabadi, Seyyed Sharaf al-Din, (1409 AH), **tawayl alayat aitaahirat**, Qom, Islamic Publications of the Society of Teachers of the Seminary of Qom.
- Hosseini Jorjani, Seyyed Amir, (1404 AH), **Ayat al-Ahkam**, Mirza Valiullah Ishraqi, Tehran, Navid Publications.
- Hosseini Zubaidi, Mohammad Morteza, (1414 AH), **taj aleurus min jawahir alqamws**, Ali Helali and Ali Siri, Beirut, Dar al-Fikr.
- Hanbal, Ahmad, (2008), **Musnad Ahmad Ibn Hanbal**, Muhammad Abdul Qadir Atta, Beirut - Lebanon, Dar al-Kitab al-Alamiya,.
- Zahabi, Shams al-Din Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn Uthman, (2004), **tahdhyb syra,aelam alnubilai**, Hassan Abdaman, Lebanon, Beit al-Afkar al-Dawlah.
- Ragheb Isfahani, Hussein Ibn Muhammad, (1412 AH), **Mufradat Fi Gharib Al-Quran, Safwan Adnan Davoodi**, Beirut, Dar Al-Alam Al-Shamiya.
- The following, Muhammad ibn Sa'd ibn Saleh, (1418 AH), **zawayid ahmsnnf abn aby shybih ely alktib lsth min alahadyth almarfaweihi**, Abdul Sattar Fathullah Saeed, Saudi Arabia, the community of Umm al-Qura, all the prayers and the principles of religion.
- Sabzevari Najafi, Muhammad ibn Habibullah, (1419 AH), **arshad aladhhan aly tifsyr alqurana**, Beirut, Dar al-Ta'rif for the press.
- Sheikh Hur Ameli, Muhammad ibn Hassan, (1409 AH), **Wasa'il al-Shi'ah**, Al-Bayt (as) Institute, Qom, Al-Bayt (as) Institute.
- Sadeghi Tehrani, Mohammad, (1419 AH), **balagh fay tafsayr alquran bialqurani**, Qom: Author's publications.
- Tabatabai, Seyyed Mohammad Hussein, (1417 AH), **Al-Mizan Fi Tafsir Al-Quran**, Qom, Islamic Publications Office of the Qom Seminary Teachers Association.
- Tabarsi, Fazl Ibn Hassan, (1998), **tafsyr jawamie aljamiei**, Tehran, University of Tehran and Management of Qom Seminary.
- Homo, (1993), **Majma 'al-Bayan fi Tafsir al-Quran**, with introduction by Mohammad Javad Bolaghi, Tehran, Nasser Khosrow Publications.
- Tabari Muhammad ibn Jarir, (2008), **tarikh Tabari tarikh al-rosol w al-moluk**, Muhammad Abul-Fazl Ibrahim, Cairo, Egyptian Encyclopedia.
- Homo, (1412 AH), **Jame 'al-Bayan fi Tafsir al-Quran**, Beirut, Dar al-Ma'rifah.
- Tarihi, Fakhreddin Ibn Mohammad, (1375 AH), **majma al-Bahrain w matlau al- nilin**, Ahmad Hosseini, Tehran, Mortazavi.
- Tusi, Muhammad ibn Hassan, (1407 AH), **Tahdhib al-Ahkam (Tahqiq Khorsan)**, Hassan Mousavi Khorsan, Tehran, Dar al-Kitab al-Islamiyya.
- Asgari, Reza, Khodri Khanabadi, Abdolreza, Salehi, Seyed Mehdi, (Spring and Summer 2014), **"The sanctity of suicide in the Qur'an and the Qur'anic tradition and strategies to prevent it"**, two specialized journals of interdisciplinary research in the Holy Qur'an, Fifth year, first issue.
- Fadlullah, Sayyid Muhammad Hussein, (1419 AH), **men wahy al-quran**, Beirut, Dar al-Malak for printing and publishing.
- Feyz Kashani, Mullah Mohsen, (1418 AH), **Al-Asfi Fi Tafsir Quran**, Mohammad Hossein Drayati and Mohammad Reza Nemati, Qom, Islamic Propaganda Office Publishing Center.
- Homo, (1415 AH), **Tafsir Safi**, Hossein Aalami, Tehran, Al-Sadr Publications.
- Homo, (1406 AH), **Al-Wafi**, Isfahan, Library of Imam Amir al-Mu'minin Ali PBUH.
- Fayumi, Ahmad Ibn Muhammad, (1987), **Mesbah Al-Munir**, Lebanese School.
- Qaraati, Mohsen, (2008), Cultural Center for Lessons from the Quran, Tehran.
- Qurtubi, Muhammad Ibn Ahmad, (1364 AH), **Al-Jami 'Lahkam Al-Quran**, Tehran, Nasser Khosrow Qomi, Ali Ibn Ibrahim, (1988), **Tafsir Qomi**, Seyyed Tayeb Mousavi Jazayeri, Qom, Dar al-Kitab.

- Klini, Muhammad ibn Ya'qub ibn Ishaq, (1407 AH), **Al-Kafi** (I - Islamic), Ali Akbar Ghaffari and Muhammad Akhundi, Tehran: Dar al-Kitab al-Islamiya.
- Majlisi, Muhammad Baqir bin Muhammad Taqi, (1404 AH), **marat aleuqul fi sharak akhbar al alrasuli**, Tehran, Dar al-Kitab al-Islamiya.
- Motahari, Morteza, (1373), **ghyam w enghelab mahdi az didgah falsafe tarikh**, Tehran, Sadra Publications.
- Mughniyeh, Mohammad Javad, (2000), **figh Imam Al-Sadiq**, Qom, Ansarian Publications.
- Makarem Shirazi, Nasser, (1374), **Tafsir Nemoneh**, Tehran, Islamic Bookstore.
- Nouri, Hussein Ibn Muhammad Taqi, (1408 AH), **mostadrak alwasayil w musnbt almasayil**, Al-Bayt (as) Institute, Qom, Al-Bayt (as) Institute.
- Al-Nisaburi, Abu Abdullah Muhammad bin Abdullah Al-Hakim, (1422 AH), **Mostadrak Al-Sahihin**, Mustafa Abdul Qadir Atta, Beirut-Lebanon, Dar Al-Kitab Al-Almiyeh.
- Kohlberg, Etan, (1997), "Medieval Muslim Views on Martyrdom", **koninklijke nederlandse akademie van wetenschappen**, mededelingen afdeling, letterkunde nieuwe reeks deel 6 0, Amsterdam, 6-31.
- Amir-MoezziT, Mohammad Ali, & Bar-Asher, Meir M. & Hopkins, Simon, 2009, **Le Shi'isme imamate quarante ans apres homage a Etan Kohlberg**, Brepols.

## Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal.

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).