



## An Answer to the Book "Al-Radd 'Alā al-Rāfiḍah" by Maqdisī on the Drawbacks Mentioned about the A'lamīyat of Imam Ali (AS)

Ja'far Bachari<sup>1</sup>; Asiyeh Ostadi<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Assistant Professor, University of Qur'anic Sciences and Education, Iran

<sup>2</sup> PhD Student in Philosophy and Theology, Islamic Theology, University Qom, Iran

Corresponding Author: Asiyeh Ostadi (a\_ostadi@yahoo.com)

Email: bacharijafa@yahoo.com; a\_ostadi@yahoo.com

<http://dx.doi.org/10.18415/ijmmu.v7i6.1744>

---

### Abstract

Muhammad ibn Khalīl Maqdisī, one of the Shāfi'ī scholars of the ninth century AH, in the book "Ar-Radd 'Alā al-Rāfiḍah", introduces some problems to the A'lamīyat<sup>1</sup> of Imam Ali (AS) over the companions of the Prophet (PBUH). In this article, after introducing Maqdisī and his book, the problems that he has raised about the A'lamīyat of the Amir al-Mu'minin, Ali (AS) are stated and then they are answered. In presenting the answers, an attempt is made to answer based on Sunni sources. Maqdisī tries to deny the supremacy of Imam Ali and prove it for Abu Bakr and Umar; among the problems he mentioned, there are the multiplicity of narratives of Abu Bakr and Umar on Imam Ali (AS) and the employment of Abu Bakr by the Prophet (PBUH) in prayer and Hajj and so on. By analyzing these narratives and evidences by Maqdisī, as well as stating the positive evidences that prove contrary to the claim of Maqdisī, it can be known that the narratives that he refers to have uncertainties and problems that are not acceptable. His main goal is to give virtue to Abu Bakr over Imam Ali (AS), which is rejected with sufficient arguments.

**Keywords:** *Imam Ali (AS); Muhammad Ibn Khalīl Maqdisī; Doubt; Supremacy; A'lamīyat of Imam Ali (AS)*

### 1. Introduction

According to Shiite beliefs, Imam Ali (AS) is the successor of the Holy Prophet, and this succession is based on the divine command. Shiites cite a variety of reasons to prove their word. These arguments have always been criticized by some, but Shiite scholars are responding to these drawbacks.

---

<sup>1</sup> Scientific Priority

The book "Ar-Radd 'Alā al-Rāfiḍah" by Muhammad ibn Khalīl Maqdisī is an example of the opposition's efforts to reject the superiority of Imam Ali (AS). In part of this book, he criticizes the Shiite arguments about the priority of Imam Ali (AS) and then denies his virtue over other companions.

In criticizing the Shiite belief in the supremacy of Imam Ali (AS), Maqdisī relies on the rejection of Firuzabadi, who considers this belief to be a blatant lie and slander. The following article examines the validity of his speech, and in response to his drawbacks, an attempt has been made to answer his objections on the basis of Sunni books.

## **2- Introducing Maqdisī, the Author of the Book "Ar-Radd 'Alā al-Rāfiḍah"**

Abu Hamid Muhammad ibn Khalīl ibn Yūsuf ibn Ali Ramlī Maqdisī (attributed to Jerusalem), who is best known for his kunyah<sup>2</sup>. He was born at the end of Ramadan in 817 or 819 AH and died in 888 AH. He was one of the most famous people of his time, and the scholars of his time praised him, and the thinkers after him, such as Sakhāwī and Shawkānī, praised him. Sakhāwī said: "In general, he was always trying to study science and write books. He was kind and honest in his religion and had a healthy nature." Shawkānī considers Maqdisī one of the elders of his contemporaries and says about him: "He has preserved many of the details and obtained knowledge from Shahab ibn Raslan. (Shawkānī, Muhammad ibn Ali, Al-Badr al-Ṭāli' bi Mahāsin min Ba'd al-Qarn al-Sābi', vol. 2, p. 170)

Among his most important professors are Shahab ibn Raslan Ramlī Shāfi'ī, 'Izz 'Abdul Salam Ibn Dāwūd Ibn 'Uthman Maqdisī Shāfi'ī known as 'Izz Qudsī (d. 850 AH), Muhammad ibn Ali ibn Muhammad Abu al-Qāsim al-Nawīrī (d. 857 AH), Abdul Wahab ibn Muhammad ibn Ismail al-Tāj Abu al-Yamen Miṣrī al-Aṣl Madanī Shāfi'ī (d. 865 AH), Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn Muhammad ibn Mahmud Kāzīrūnī al-Aṣl Madanī Shāfi'ī (d. 843 AH), Ahmad ibn Ali ibn Muhammad Abu al-Faḍl Shahab al-Din ibn Ḥajar (d. 852 AH). Some of the most important books of Muqaddasi are: "Al-Bahja", "Sharh al-Minhaj", "Sharh Jam' al-Jawāmi'", "Ar-Radd 'Alā al-Rāfiḍah".

## **3- Introducing the Book "Ar-Radd 'Alā al-Rāfiḍah"**

The treatise "Ar-Radd 'Alā al-Rāfiḍah" by Abu Hamid Muhammad ibn Khalīl Maqdisī al-Shāfi'ī, who died in 888 AH, the manuscript of which was written in the author's handwriting in 881 AH, is on the list of treaties in Cairo.

### **3-1- The first edition of this book:**

This manuscript was corrected and edited by Abdul Wahab Khalil al-Rahman as a master's thesis at the University of Umm al-Qurā in Mecca and was published in 1403 AH in Dar al-Salafiyah, Mumbai, India. This treatise includes the following chapters:

Chapter One: Author's Life: a) Name, nickname, place of birth, professors, religion, scientific position and scholars' opinions about him, his other writings, his temporal characteristics, his death. B) Describing the manuscript, examining the relation of the manuscript to the author, introducing the author's method in the book.

Chapter Two: A) The political situation during the caliphate of the caliphs and the emergence of differences among Muslims. B) The positions of the Islamic society in the friendship and enmity of Imam Ali (AS), to be divided into groups;

Chapter Three: Discussion on the meaning of Shiism, types of Shiism and the progress of Shiite beliefs;

<sup>2</sup>Kunyah is a nickname in Arabic names, the name of an adult derived from their eldest child.

Chapter Four: Imamate;

Chapter Five: Beliefs of public Rāfiḍah;

Chapter Six: Similarity of Shiite Viewpoint to Former Religions;

Chapter Seven: Condemnation of the Rāfiḍah and the rulings of Islamic scholars about them;

Chapter Nine: Research Methods;

Conclusion: The most important results obtained during the research.

### **3-2- The second edition of the book:**

In this article, this version of the book has been considered as a reference. This version was researched by Ahmad Hijazi al-Saqqā and with an introduction of more than 40 pages, it was published in 1410 AH in collaboration with Dar al-Jīl Beirut and al-Maktab al-Thaqāfi Cairo. This book was published in 1410 AH, and includes six chapters, including the concluding chapter, with the author's introduction and an introduction independent from the researcher

### **3-3 Criticizing and examining the doubt of Maqdisī in rejecting the priority of Amir al-Mu'minin, Ali (AS)**

Here, the doubts of Maqdisī about Imam Ali's priority are raised and then the doubt of Maqdisī about Imam Ali's priority is examined and answered.

#### **3-3-1- The first doubt**

- Mentioning the Doubt:

One of the sarcasm that Maqdisī expresses in his book on opposing Shiite beliefs is the rejection of the supremacy of the Amir al-Mu'minin (AS), which is mentioned along with the rejection of Shiite rational arguments, regardless of the fact that the evidences that he refuted them are not rational; but it is necessary to answer his drawbacks in this regard. He writes in his book: "One of the things that Ibn al-Muṭahhar and his followers believe is that Ali (AS) is scientifically superior to the Companions, while Majd al-Din Firuzabadi has rejected it and in his treatise called "Al-Qadhāb al-Mushtahar 'Alā Riqāb Ibn Muṭahhar" writes: This claim is a clear lie and slander, because the knowledge of the companions is known in two ways: 1- Their narration and fatwa are many 2- Their employment by the Prophet (PBUH) is great. It is impossible for the Prophet (PBUH) to hire someone who has no knowledge, and this is the greatest and clearest evidence of knowledge and its extent, so we examine it: The Prophet (PBUH) appointed Abu Bakr during his illness as the Imamate of prayer, while all the elders of the Companions were also present, such as Ali, Umar, Uthmān, Ibn Mas'ud, etc., and Prophet made him superior to all of them. This is contrary to Ali's succession in the war, because the Prophet (PBUH) appointed him over women, children, and powerless people; therefore, this is the reason why Abu Bakr is superior to others in terms of knowledge of prayer and its rules, and the companions mentioned. It is because prayer is the pillar of religion; it is also narrated that the Prophet (PBUH) commissioned Abu Bakr to collect alms. As a result, he is as aware of alms as any other Companion, and no less than them (perhaps more than them). All jurists believe the same according to the hadith of Abu Bakr regarding zakat.

But the hadith narrated by Ali (AS) was rejected by everyone. The narrators of this hadith are uncertain and none of the Imams has narrated it. The narration is as follows: there are 5 camels in every 25 camels and nothing else, and none of the imams believe this. As a result, Abu Bakr is more aware of zakat, which is one of the pillars of religion, but it was obligatory in the case of Hajj, which took place in the ninth year of AH (according to the correct saying), the Prophet (PBUH) tried to equip the Muslims and, in expressing his permission to delay, ordered Abu Bakr to teach the people the rituals, and it is impossible to put him at the forefront of this great matter, which includes some of the rules of religion. As

a result, who is wiser than him? At the time of Hajj and Surah Barā'at, it included many rituals. The Prophet (PBUH) sent Ali (AS) for the Manāqib<sup>3</sup> of Abu Bakr to recite it to the people. When Ali (AS) reached Abu Bakr, Abu Bakr asked: Are you Amir or an officer? And the Imam replied: Officer. Then he recited to the people so that they could hear the virtues of Abu Bakr from the word of Ali (AS) and it could enter their hearts and heads so that the virtues of Abu Bakr could be expressed to the highest degree. The Prophet (PBUH) hired Abu Bakr to repel and prevent the spread of evil, and he did not see any reason for his honor and pride, it is a word that smells of disbelief and stubbornness. With the correct hadiths, there is a reason for his ignorance. (Maqdisī, pp. 95-99)

There are two major drawbacks in the word of Maqdisī:

1- Too many narratives and fatwa of Abu Bakr and Umar towards Imam Ali (AS)

2- Employment by the Prophet (PBUH). Regarding employment, he also refers to knowledge in duties such as prayer, zakat and Hajj.

In fact, in order to clarify the knowledge and merit of employment by the Messenger of God, three duties of prayer, zakat and Hajj have been examined here.

### 3-3-2- Response to doubt

In response to the doubts raised, first of all, the evidences on priority of Imam Ali's (AS) knowledge over the Companions is given:

#### 3-3-2-1- Evidences on the A'lamīyat of Imam Ali (AS)

Undoubtedly, the extensive efforts of the Prophet of God for the scientific development of Amir al-Mu'minin have led to the scientific superiority of Imam Ali (AS) and the scope of his knowledge. It is an attempt that according to the history, the Prophet (PBUH) has not made such an attempt on someone like Ali. Also, the great talent and breadth of existence of Ali (AS) and his tireless efforts to learn knowledge from the Prophet (PBUH) have caused his scientific superiority over other companions.

There are many evidences in the Islamic sources on the scientific priority of Imam Ali (AS) which are mentioned.

#### 3-3-2-1-1- The clear emphasis of the Prophet (PBUH) on the A'lamīyat of Imam Ali (AS)

In Sunni and Shiite sources, there are many narratives that emphasize, directly or indirectly, on the scientific priority of Imam Ali (AS) over other companions, some of which are mentioned. It should be noted that efforts are being made to use Sunni sources to respond.

The Prophet (PBUH) said: "The most learned person of the nation after me is Ali ibn Abi Ṭālib." (Qandūzī Ḥanafī, 1416, Chapter 14, Vol. 1, p. 61) This narration clearly expresses the scientific supremacy of the Prophet. Also in a hadith, the Prophet (PBUH) said: "I am the city of knowledge and Ali (AS) is its gate, so whoever wants knowledge must enter through its gate" (Muttaqī Hindī, 1384, vol. 13, p. 149; Ibn Abi al-Ḥadīd, nd, vol. 7, p. 21 and vol. 9, p. 165; Ibn Ḥajar Asqalānī, al-Ṣawā'iq al-Muharraqa, nd, p. 189, p. 9) In some other sources, instead of the word "knowledge", the word "wisdom" has been mentioned (Ḥākīm Nayshābūrī, 1422, vol. 3, p. 126; Asqalānī, Ibn Ḥajar, nd, p. 189, v. 9; Ibn Athīr, 1418, vol. 4, p. 100; Tirmidhī, 1426, vol. 2, p. 299. vol. 5, p. 598; Abu Na'im Isfahani, 1405, vol. 1, p. 64, Juwaynī, 1398, vol. 1, p. 99, chapter 19,).

Also, several narratives have been narrated from the Prophet (PBUH) with a slight difference that Imam Ali (AS) is the vessel (and place) of the Prophet's knowledge. The Prophet explicitly said: "Ali (AS) is the vessel of my knowledge." (Juwaynī, *ibid.*, Vol. 1, p. 97, chapter 18, p. 66) and "Ali (AS) is the

<sup>3</sup> virtues

box of my knowledge" (Juwaynī, *ibid.*, Vol. 1, p. 332, chapter 61, p. 257); also the Prophet (PBUH) states about the Wisdom and Knowledge of Imam Ali (AS): "If wisdom is divided into ten parts, nine parts of it has been granted to Ali (AS) and the other people have been given one part. And Ali is more knowledgeable than them." (Ibn Abd al-Barr, *al-Istī'āb*, 1427, vol. 3, p. 1104; Ibn Athīr, 1418, vol. 4, p. 22, *Qandūzī Ḥanafī*, *ibid.*, Vol. 1, p. 213; *Muttaqī Hindī*, *ibid.*, Vol. 13, p. 146, p. 36461). He also said: "Whoever wants to see the knowledge of Adam, the wisdom of Noah, the Ḥilm<sup>4</sup> of Abraham, then look at Ali ibn Abi Ṭālib (AS)" (Ibn Abi al-Ḥadīd, *ibid.*, Vol. 2, p. 449, *Tafsīr Fakhr Rāzī* following the verse of *Mubāhilah*, Ibn Ṣabbāgh, *nd*, p. 121, *Qarashī 'Adawī*, 1419, p. 22; *Ganjī Shāfī'ī*, 1431, Chapter 23, p. 122).

It is narrated from Anas ibn Malik that the Holy Prophet (PBUH) said to Imam Ali (AS): "After me, you will explain to my nation what they are arguing about." (Ḥākim Nayshābūrī, 1422, vol. 3, p. 335, p. 4678) This hadith is correct according to the view ruling on the Sheikh's condition. It is clear that the explorer must have sufficient scientific mastery over matters to resolve the dispute.

### 3-3-2-1-2- Confession of Sunni companions and scholars to the A'lamīyat of Imam Ali (AS)

The confession of the second caliph is a clear example in proving the scientific priority of Imam Ali (AS). "One day a man came to Umar and answered him when he was asked how he got up in the morning. He said: I did it while I loved sedition, and I hated the right, and I acknowledged the Jews and the Christians, and I believed in what I did not see, and I confessed what was not created, so Umar sent for Imam Ali (AS). When the Imam came, he said: He is telling the truth that he loves sedition, because God says: Your wealth and children are sedition (*Anfāl* / 28) and he hates the truth, that is, death, because God says: The truth came and acknowledged the Jews and the Christians. God says, "And the Jews say that the Christians are nothing, and the Christians say that the Jews are nothing and believe in what they have not seen. God confesses what was not created, that is, the resurrection." (*Asqalānī*, Ibn Ḥajar, *Lisān al-Mīzān*, vol. 1, p. 174; *Ijī*, 'Izz al-Din, *al-Mawāqif fi Ilm al-Kalām*, vol. 3, p. 636)

In many currents, the second caliph has another phrase that seeks refuge in God from any problem in which Imam Ali (AS) is not present, which does not solve the problem, such as the narration of Ibn Ḥajar *Asqalānī* in *Fath al-Bārī* in the book *al-Nawādir* and *al-Ṭabaqāt* by Muhammad ibn Sa'd narrated from Sa'īd ibn Musayyib: "Umar seeks refuge in God from a problem in which Abu al-Hasan, that is, Ali ibn Abi Ṭālib, is not present." (*Asqalānī*, Ibn Ḥajar, *Fath al-Bārī*, vol. 13, p. 286; Ibn Athīr, *Asad al-Ghābah*, vol. 4, p. 23, *Asqalānī*, Ibn Ḥajar, *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, vol. 7, p. 296; *Qandūzī Ḥanafī*, *Ibid.*, Vol. 2, p. 405; Ibn Kathīr, 1409, vol. 7, p. 397)

Bukharī says: "I heard from 'Aṭā that Aisha said: 'Ali is the wisest of people according to tradition'" (*Ṭabarī*, Muḥib al-Din, *nd*, vol. 2, p. 193; *Ṭabarī*, Muḥib al-Din, 1356, p. 78; Ibn Abd al-Barr, 1427, vol. 3, p. 40; Ibn Athīr, 1418, vol. 4, p. 22). Also in another narration, 'Aṭā was asked about the companions of the Prophet (PBUH) whether anyone is more knowledgeable than Ali among the companions. He said: No, swear by God, no one is wiser than Ali. (Ibn Abi Shaybah, 1409, p. 374, H 32100)

When the news of the martyrdom of Imam Ali (AS) was given to Mu'āwiya, he said: "Knowledge and jurisprudence were destroyed with the death of Ali Ibn Abi Ṭālib." (Ibn Abd al-Barr, *al-Istī'āb*, *ibid.*, Vol. 2, p. 463) Ibn 'Abbas says: "Umar said in a sermon he delivered: Ali (AS) is unique in his judgment (Ahmad Ḥanbal, *nd*, vol. 5, p. 113, Ibn-Sa'd, 1405, vol. 2, p. 102). What is clear is that knowledge is a prerequisite for judgment, and the prerequisite for being unique is superiority over others.

Ahmad ibn Ḥanbal narrates a narration that Ali's knowledge is the highest of all. (Ahmad Ḥanbal, *ibid.*, Vol. 5, p. 26, Ibn Athīr, *ibid.*, Vol. 5, p. 520) Ḥākim Nayshābūrī in *al-Mustadrak* has narrated a narration that proves that Amir al-Mu'minin (AS) is the most knowledgeable of all the Companions. He

<sup>4</sup> meekness

writes: "Qays ibn Abi Ḥāzim says: I was in Medina when I saw people gathered around a rider and watching him. I went forward and saw a man riding a horse insulting Ali ibn Abi Ṭālib. Sa'd ibn Abi Waqqāṣ came and said: What happened? They said: There is a man who insults Ali ibn Abi Ṭālib: Sa'd ibn Abi Waqqāṣ came near that man and said to him: Why do you insult Ali ibn Abi Ṭālib? Wasn't he the first who believe in the Prophet of Islam? Wasn't he the first to pray with the Prophet (PBUH)? Isn't he the most ascetic man? Isn't he the most knowledgeable human being? Isn't he the son-in-law of the Prophet (PBUH) and the husband of the daughter of the Prophet (PBUH)? Wasn't he the flag bearer of the Prophet (PBUH) in all the campaigns? Then Sa'd ibn Abi Waqqāṣ turned to the Qiblah and raised his hands and said: O God! This man is cursing one of your guardians. Show them your strength before they disperse. Qays said: swear by God! "We hadn't dispersed yet when the horse rode and the man fell to the ground and fell on the rocks, and his brain exploded and he died." (Ḥākim Nayshābūrī, 1422, vol. 3, p. 571) Ḥākim Nayshābūrī continues: This hadith is correct on the condition of Bukhārī and Muslim.

Ibn 'Asākir quotes the majority of Sunni scholars as saying: "None of the Companions said, 'Ask me whatever you want, except Ali ibn Abi Ṭālib.' Imam Ali Ibn Ṭālib (AS): "Ask me before you lose me") This hadith has been quoted by various sources: Ḥākim Nayshābūrī, *ibid.*, Vol. 3, p. 122, Ahmad Ḥanbal, *Ibid.*, Vol. 2, p. 646, Ibn Athīr, *ibid.*, Vol. 4, p. 22, Asqalānī, *ibid.*, P. 76)

Ahmad ibn Ḥanbal narrated from the Prophet (PBUH) that he said to Fatima (AS): "Are you not satisfied that I will marry you to someone who is the first Muslim and his knowledge is the highest and his wisdom is the greatest?" (Ahmad Ḥanbal, *Ibid.*, Vol. 5, p. 26, Haythamī, 1408, vol. 5, p. 101) There is another narration with the same theme that the Prophet (PBUH) addressed Fatima (AS) when marrying Imam Ali (AS) and said: "I married you to someone who was first in Islam and he was the best in science and the highest in tolerance. (Ibn Abi Shaybah, *Ibid.*, Vol. 6, p. 376, H. 32131, Haythamī, *ibid.*, Vol. 9, p. 102) Abu Sa'id Khadri narrates a narration from the Prophet (PBUH) that he considers that A'lamīyat is one of the seven virtues of Imam Ali (AS), seven characteristics to which no one is equal to Imam Ali until the Day of Judgment. (Isfihānī, Abu Na'im, *Ibid.*, Vol. 1, pp. 65 and 66, Muttaqī Hindī, *ibid.*, Vol. 11, p. 617) Haythamī says in the following of this narration: The documents of this hadith are correct (Haythamī, *ibid.*, Vol. 9, p. 102) Haythamī confirms this hadith. (*Ibid.*, Vol. 9, p. 123)

It is also narrated from Amir al-Mu'minin Ali (AS) himself: "The Holy Prophet (PBUH) taught me a thousand doors of knowledge that a thousand doors open from every door." (Juwaynī, *Ibid.*, Vol. 1, p. 601, Chapter 19, Hadith 70, Bahrānī, Seyyed Hāshim, 1431, p. 517)

### **3-3-2-1-3- Proficiency of Imam Ali (AS) in the interpretation of the Qur'an**

One of the scientific priorities of Imam Ali (AS) is his knowledge on the Qur'an and its interpretation, because the knowledgeable to Qur'an is more knowledgeable about the religion. Regarding the interpretation of the Qur'an by Imam Ali (AS), Suyūṭī writes: "But he (Amir al-Mu'minin) has a lot to say on the interpretation of the Qur'an." (Suyūṭī, 1406 AH, p. 205) And then he quotes Ali (AS) who said: swear by God, no verse was revealed unless I know why, where, and in whose honor it was revealed. Indeed, my Lord has given me a wise heart and an honest tongue. (*ibid.*) In this regard, another narration has been narrated from Abu Ṭufayl that Imam Ali (AS) said: "Ask me about the Book of God, because there is no verse unless I know that it was revealed at night or during the day, or in the plain or in the mountains." (*ibid.*) Imam Ali (AS) also says: I swear by God, within the Qur'an, there is no verse for which the dignity of revelation, the place of revelation and the purpose of its revelation be hidden for me. (Ibn 'Asākir, *History of Damascus*, vol. 42, p. 397)

### **3-3-2-1-4- Reference of all sciences to Imam Ali (AS)**

Ibn Abi al-Ḥadīd writes in his commentary on Nahj al-Balāghah: "The principles of all sciences go back to him. He is the one who has arranged the rules of religion and explained the rules of Sharī'a. He is the one who has narrated the intellectual and narrative issues. (Ibn Abi al-Ḥadīd, *ibid.* Vol. 1, p. 17.).

### 3-3-2- Examining the multiplicity of narratives narrated from Imam Ali (AS)

Many Sunni narrators have narrated that Imam Ali's (AS) knowledge was documented and connected to the source of revelation. (Ibn Athīr, *Ibid.*, Vol. 4, p. 22, Ibn Abd al-Barr, 1427, vol. 2, P. 462, Muttaqī Hindī, *ibid.*, Vol. 15, p. 215); However, regarding the multiplicity of narrations narrated from Imam Ali (AS), a narration in the Sunni books makes it clear that the frequency of the hadiths narrated by him is so great that it has caused questions about that Imam (AS). "Imam Ali (AS) was asked: What is the reason that you are the most hadīthī of all the companions of the Prophet (PBUH)? He replied: "Because I was in a position that whenever I asked the Prophet (PBUH), he would answer me and whenever I was silent, the Prophet himself would speak." (Tirmidhī, *ibid.*, Vol. 5, p. 1104, H 3729, Ibn Abi Shaybah, *ibid.*, P. 368, H 32060 and 32061)

It is not a secret that the multiplicity of companionship with the Prophet is one of the reasons for quoting the hadiths by Imam Ali more than other companions, so considering the companionship of Imam Ali (AS) with the Prophet of Islam (PBUH) who has been more than others and despite the Prophet's (PBUH) emphasis on recording the hadiths "Write down this knowledge, so that you may benefit from it in this world and in the Hereafter, and that knowledge may be pleasing to the owner" (Muttaqī Hindī, *ibid.*, Vol. 1, p. 157) Emphasize the knowledge by writing (Ḥākim Nayshābūrī, 1422, vol. 1, p. 186), The statistics that Muqaddasi presents do not correspond to the historical reality of the life of Imam Ali (AS).

In addition to the multiplicity of Imam Ali's narrations due to more companionship with the Prophet than the Companions, Islamic sources also mention letters from the Imam, which are as follows:

1- *Ṣaḥīfah* of the Prophet (PBUH): This *Ṣaḥīfah* was dictated by the Prophet (PBUH) and written by Amir al-Mu'minin Ali (AS). Sunni scholars attribute it to Imam Ali (AS) and call it "*Ṣaḥīfah* of Ali". Its quality and content, according to Sharḥ Ibn Abi al-Ḥadīd, is a small *Ṣaḥīfah* containing *diyāt* and the rulings on the release of a captive. (Ibn Abi al-Ḥadīd, *ibid.*, Vol. 4, p. 75)

2- Ali's book: This book has been mentioned in Shiite sources, but Sunni sources have also mentioned it with different descriptions and other writings which are not mentioned due to the lack of mention in Sunni sources.

Therefore, the multiplicity of companionship with the Prophet and the multiplicity of narrations from him, and the writing by Imam Ali is another reason for the scientific superiority of Imam Ali (AS) over other companions.

### 3-3-3- The second doubt

Maqdisī says: Shiites believe that Ali (AS) is more knowledgeable about the Qur'an than other companions and as a result he is better than other companions, but this claim is baseless for some reasons, including that the Prophet (PBUH) said: Your most scholar to the Qur'an will be the Imam of the people. If they were equal in recitation, the most jurist of them, and if they were equal in it, whoever emigrated earlier"; then it is observed that the Prophet, in the days of his illness, puts Abu Bakr ahead of the other companions for prayer; as a result, Abu Bakr was the best in recitation, the most jurist and the first in emigration. Thus, the claim of the Shiites is false. Maqdisī also says about the memorization of the Qur'an by Abu Bakr: It is stated in *Ṣaḥīḥayn* and other books that there were only four people who tried to collect the Qur'an in the time of the Prophet - that is, they memorized and collected the Qur'an completely. And they were Mu'adh ibn Jabal, Ubay Ibn Ka'b, Zayd ibn Thābit and Abu Zayd, and Ali was not one of them, but Abu Bakr was the most knowledgeable to the Qur'an and the most jurist of them, so the Prophet gave him precedence; also Abu Bakr had quoted more hadiths than Ali.

The drawbacks of Maqdisī can be seen in these four cases:

1. The Shiite reason is baseless.

2. Considering the priority of Abu Bakr in prayer during the days of the Prophet's illness, Abu Bakr is the most knowledgeable to the Qur'an, the most jurist and the most preliminary in emigration.
3. Imam Ali (AS) was not one of the memorizers and compilers of the Qur'an.
4. Abu Bakr has narrated more narratives than Imam Ali (AS).

### 3-3-4- The response of Allameh Ḥillī to the second doubt

#### 1) Imam Ali's (AS) accompaniment with the Qur'an

It has been narrated from Umm Salma that she heard from the Prophet (PBUH): Ali is with the Qur'an and the Qur'an is with Ali. These two are never separated to enter the pool of Kawthar on me. (Ḥākim Nayshābūrī, *Ibid.*, Vol. 3, p. 337, H 4686, Muttaqī Hindī, *ibid.*, Vol. 12, p. 201, H 113)

#### 2) Imam Ali (AS), the compiler of the Quran

Also, referring to history, it can be seen that Imam Ali (AS), after refusing to pledge allegiance to Abu Bakr, swore not to wear the cloak to collect the Qur'an (Ibn Qutaybah, 1380, p. 29), in the history of the caliphs of Suyūfī it has been said: "If there is access to this book, it is in the science." (Suyūfī, *ibid.*, P. 206) It is clear that one tries to collect the Qur'an to have sufficient knowledge about it, in addition to the Qur'an that Imam Ali (AS) collected, it has been along with the dignity of revelation and the means of revelation and an interpretation.

#### 3) Abu Bakr's prayer

Regarding the prayer of Abu Bakr, which is mentioned by Maqdisī, it should be mentioned that Abu Bakr's precedence over the person of the Prophet (PBUH) is in conflict with this noble verse, "O Ye who believe! Put not yourselves forward before Allah and His Messenger; but fear Allah; for Allah is He Who hears and knows all things." (Ḥujurāt / 1).

If it is said that the Imam of the congregation has been appointed in the prayer by the order of the Prophet (PBUH), in refuting this, it is enough to examine the narrative of Malik, who said: "He came to the mosque from the house while he was ill and saw Abu Bakr standing in prayer." (Ṭabarī, Muhammad ibn Jarīr, *Tarikh al-Ṭabarī*, vol. 2, p. 439) According to this narrative, Abu Bakr was not ordered to pray instead of the Prophet (PBUH), but after the Prophet (PBUH) came to the mosque, he saw that Abu Bakr was standing in prayer instead of him, and this issue, as mentioned before, contradicts the first verse of Surah Al-Ḥujurāt, because Abu Bakr stood in his place and prayed in his place without his permission.

Also, the reproachful tone of the Prophet can be considered in the continuation of the mentioned narrative. Where the Prophet (PBUH) ordered someone else to pray instead of him, (such as Amir al-Mu'minin (AS)) by other narratives, it is proved that another person means Imam Ali (AS), including: When the Prophet (PBUH) was ill, the same disease that he was in Ayesha's house, the Prophet said: Call Ali for me. Ayesha said: Shall we call Abu Bakr for you? He said: Call him. Hafaṣah said: O Messenger of God! Let us call Umar for you. He said: Call him. Umm Faḍl said: O Messenger of God! Shall we call Abbas to you? He said: Call him. When all of them gathered, the Prophet of God (PBUH) raised his blessed head and did not see Ali (AS) so he kept silence. Then, the Prophet (PBUH) asked for the presence of Amir al-Mu'minin (AS) from the beginning, and the last time he raised his head and did not see Imam Ali (AS), he was disappointed with the fulfillment of his request and inevitably kept silence. (Ibn Mājah, *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, vol. 1, p. 389.)

Every time the Prophet ordered Ayesha, she would tell his father Abu Bakr until the Prophet was upset and addressed Ayesha and Hafaṣah, saying: "You are like the women of Egypt in the time of Joseph (following your will). Tell Abu Bakr to recite it." And then (according to the narration) he came to the

mosque with his discomfort and unfavorable condition, and thus Abu Bakr could not complete the prayer (it is narrated that: The Prophet (PBUH), while leaning two people, came out of the house as if I could see he pulled his feet on the ground).

In one of the narratives that has been narrated from Ayesha during the prayer of Abu Bakr, he is not even willing to mention the name of Imam Ali (AS) (Bukhārī, *Ibid.*, Vol. 1, p. 240, H 648, Muslim Nayshābūrī, *ibid.*, Vol. 1, p. 393-400, Nisā'ī, 1414, vol. 2, p. 418, H 796, Ibn Mājah, 1418, vol. 1, p. 389); therefore, it is possible that the request of the Prophet (PBUH) was that Amir al-Mu'minin (AS) should take the Imam of the congregational prayer, but this was ignored every time until the Holy Prophet (PBUH) sadly left them to themselves and said: "Go to Abu Bakr" and that was when Abu Bakr became the Imam of the congregational prayer.

The narration goes on to say: "Abu Bakr said prayers with the Imamate of the Prophet (PBUH). While the Prophet was sitting, he was performing the prayer, and the people were following Abu Bakr, and the Prophet (PBUH) was sitting and praying, so that Abu Bakr was following the prayer of the Prophet (PBUH) and the people were following the prayer of Abu Bakr. (*Ibid*) Here is a strange way of holding congregational prayers in which Abu Bakr stands in the altar, but the Prophet (PBUH) sat in front of him and took the lead in the prayers while the people continued to follow Abu Bakr. Such a prayer from the Prophet (PBUH) was also unprecedented and strange for the listeners of the hadith, so they were surprised and asked the narrator of the hadith: "Was Prophet (PBUH) praying and Abu Bakr followed his prayer and did the people follow the prayer of Abu Bakr?" (*Ibid*)

In addition, Bukhārī and Muslim agree on the content of the narrative cited by Maqdisī, but Nisā'ī and Ibn al-Mājah narrate different narratives, and Ibn Ḥajar mentions it with great difference. This uncertainty in the text is another reason for the lack of trust and denial of its meaning.

As a result, if this prayer has been recited with the Imamate of Abu Bakr, it will not be considered a virtue for him, because not only the command of Prophet (PBUH) was not the Imamate of Abu Bakr for the congregational prayer, but this act was not acceptable by the Prophet (PBUH), so he went to the mosque while he was sick and took the Imamate of the congregational prayer, so Maqdisī's claim was rejected by quoting this narration about Abu Bakr's superiority over Imam Ali (AS) and his ultimate goal in proving Abu Bakr's superiority over Imam Ali (AS) and violating the caliphate of Imam Ali (AS) is not realized.

At the same time, for various other reasons, the superiority of the Amir al-Mu'minin Ali (AS) over Abu Bakr can be proved, including the fact that the first Muslim after the Prophet (PBUH) was Imam Ali (AS). It is narrated from Ibn Abbas: "The first person who said prayers was Ali." (See: Tirmidhī, *Sunan al-Tirmidhī*, vol. 5, p. 1104, H 3734) this issue is also one of the reasons for Imam Ali's (AS) superiority over Abu Bakr.

## **Conclusion**

In his book, Maqdisī has also criticized the scientific superiority of Imam Ali (AS) under rational arguments. He has tried to refute the A'lamīyat of Imam Ali (AS) and prove it for Abu Bakr and Umar and has made some claims, including so many narratives and fatwa by Abu Bakr and Umar towards Imam Ali (AS), using the Prophet (PBUH) in Wājib rituals such as Prayer, Zakat and Hajj, Abu Bakr's priority in prayer during the illness of the Holy Prophet (PBUH), Abu Bakr as the collector of Zakat and not Imam Ali (AS), quoting much more narratives by several people other than Imam Ali(AS) such as Umar and ... By examining sufficient evidences and reasons in Sunni sources, we can refute the claims of Maqdisī and prove its contrary. To do this, we sometimes cited the answers of Allameh Ḥillī and sometimes mentioned a violation response. The content of the narrative cited by Maqdisī has a textual uncertainty that adds to its distrust and denial of its meaning; therefore, Maqdisī's claim cannot be

proved and his ultimate goal is to prove Abu Bakr's superiority over Imam Ali (AS) and violate the caliphate of Imam Ali (AS) is not be realized, but despite the arguments against it, it is possible to prove the A'lamīyat of Amir al-Mu'minin Ali (AS).

### References

The Holy Qur'an

Nahj al-Balāghah

Asqalānī, Ahmad Ibn Ali (known as Ibn Ḥajar), 1424 AH. *Fath al-Bārī (fi Sharh Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī)*, Beirut: Al-Maktabah al-Asriyya.

Asqalānī, Ahmad Ibn Ali (known as Ibn Ḥajar), nd. *Lisān al-Mizan*, Beirut: Al-A'lamī Foundation for Publications, second edition.

Asqalānī, Ahmad Ibn Ali (known as Ibn Ḥajar), nd. *Ṣawā'iq al-Muharraqa*, Beirut: A'lamī Institute.

Asqalānī, Ibn Ḥajar, 1325 HS. *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, Beirut: Dar Sādir.

Bahrānī, Seyyed Hashem, 1431 AH. *Ghāyat al-Marām wa Hajjah al-Khisām fi Ta'yīn al-Imam*, Qom: Islamic Education Publishing Office.

Fakhr Rāzī, 1420 AH. *Al-Tafsīr al-Kabīr*, 32 volumes, Beirut: Dar Ḍīyā al-Turāth al-Arabī.

Ganjī Shāfi'ī, Muhammad ibn Yūsuf, 1431 AH. *Kifāyat al-Ṭālib fi Manāqib Ali ibn Abi Ṭālib*, Qom: Islamic Revival Association.

Ḥākim Nayshābūrī, Muhammad Ibn Abdullah, 1422 AH. *Al-Mustadrak 'Alā al-Ṣaḥīḥayn*, Beirut: Dar al-Fikr.

Haythamī Shāfi'ī, Ali ibn Abi Bakr, 1408 AH. *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmīya.

Hindī, Alā' al-Dīn Ali al-Muttaqī ibn Ḥisām al-Dīn, 1384 HS. *Kanz al-'Amāl fi Sunan al-Aqwāl wa al-Af'āl*, research: Mahmoud Umar al-Damyātī, research: Mustafa Abdul Qādir 'Aṭā, Beirut: Al-Risālah Institute.

Ibn 'Abd al-Barr Yūsuf, 1427 AH. *Al-Istī'āb fi Ma'rifa al-Ṣaḥābah*, Beirut: Dar al-Ma'rifah.

Ibn Abi al-Ḥadīd, Abdul Hamid Ibn Hiba Allah, nd. *Sharh Nahj al-Balāghah*, research: Muhammad Abu al-Faḍl Ibrahim, Beirut: Dar al-Ḍīyā al-Kutub al-Arabiya.

Ibn Abi Shaybah, Abdullah Ibn Muhammad, 1409 AH. *Al-Muṣanaf Fi al-Ahadīth wa al-Āthār*, research: Sa'īd Muhammad al-Lahām, Beirut: Dar al-Fikr.

Ibn Athīr, Ali ibn Muhammad, 1418 AH. *Asad al-Ghābah fi Ma'rifa al-Ṣaḥābah*, research: Khalīl Ma'mūn Shīḥā, Beirut: Dar al-Ma'rifah.

Ibn Ḥanbal, Ahmad ibn Muhammad, nd. *Al-Musnad*, Beirut: Dar al-Sādir.

Ibn Kathīr Damishqī, Ismail Ibn Umar, 1409 AH. *Al-Badāyah wa al-Nahāyah*, research: Ahmad Abu al-Mulham, Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmīya.

Ibn Mājah Qazvīnī, 1418 AH. *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, Beirut, Dar al-Jil.

Ibn Qutaybah Dīnawārī, 1380 HS. *Imamate and Politics (History of Caliphs) Translation*: Seyyed Nāser Tabataba'i, Tehran: Phoenix.

- Ibn Sa'd Zahrī, Muhammad, 1405 AH. *Al-Ṭabaqāt al-Kubrā*, Beirut: Dar Beirut.
- Ibn Ṣabbāgh Mālikī, Ali Ibn Muhammad, nd. *Al-Fuṣūl al-Muhimma Fi Ma'rifa al-A'immah*, Tehran: Al-A'lamī Institute.
- Ijī, Azud al-Din, nd. *Al-Mawāqif fi Ilm al-Kalām*, np: Ālam al-Kutub.
- Isbahānī, Abu Na'im Ahmad ibn Abdullah, 1405 AH. *Ḥilyat al-Awliyā' wa al-Ṭabaqāt al-Asfiyā'*, fourth edition, Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-Arabī.
- Juwaynī, Khurāsānī, Ibrahim Ibn Muhammad, 1398 HS. *Farā'id al-Samṭin*, two volumes, Beirut: Al-Mahmoudi Institute.
- Maqdisī, Muhammad ibn Khalīl ibn Yūsuf, nd. *Al-Rad 'Alā al-Rāfiḍah*, research: Ahmad Hijazi al-Saqqā, Beirut: Dar al-Jil.
- Nisā'ī, Abu Abdul Rahman, 1414 AH. *Sunan*, Beirut, Dar al-Ma'rifah, third edition.
- Qandūzī, Sulaymān Ibn Ibrahim, 1416 AH. *Yanābī' al-Mawda li Dawi al-Qurbā*, np: Dar al-Uswah for printing and publishing.
- Qarashī 'Adwī Nāṣibī Shāfi'ī, Muhammad ibn Talha, 1419 AH. *Matalib al-Su'ul fi Manāqib Al al-Rasul*, Beirut: Al-Balāgh.
- Suyūṭī, Jalāluddīn, 1406 AH. *History of Caliphs*, Beirut: Dar al-Qalam.
- Ṭabarī, Muḥib ad-Din, 1356 HS. *Dhakhā'ir al-Uqbā*, Cairo: Maktabah al-Qudsī.
- Ṭabarī, Muḥib ad-Din, nd. *Riyadh al-Nadhra*, 4 volumes, Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmīyyah - Publications of Muhammad Ali Bayḍūn.
- Tirmidhī, Muhammad ibn Isa ibn Surah, 1426 AH. *Sunan al-Tirmidhī*, 5 volumes, Sida Beirut: Al-Maktabah al-Asriyya.

## Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal.

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).