Analysis of Censorship in Subtitle of American Pie 1-7

Atina Afwah; Mangatur Rudolf Nababan; Djamika
Master Linguistics Department, Universitas Sebelas Maret, Surakarta, Indonesia

http://dx.doi.org/10.18415/ijmmu.v6i5.1057

Abstract

Cultural differences make translators censor some parts that considered as taboo, abusive, and inappropriate in the culture of the target language. Censorship carried out by deleting and reducing words, phrases, or sentences in subtitles. The aims of this research are finding words, phrases, and sentences that censored, factors causing censorship and the impact of censorship on the quality of translation. This research uses a descriptive qualitative research method with a fixed case study form. The result shows that censorship was carried out by translators because of two main causes, namely self-censorship and translator’s capacity. The results also showed that most of the data was censor because of self-censorship. The translators choose to delete or reduce because of four things, namely swearing words, emphasized, sexual references, and repetitions. Meanwhile, the impact of censorship on the quality of translation shows that most of the data is inaccurate, acceptable, and has high legibility.

Keywords: Censorship; Self-Censorship; Translator’s Capacity; Translation Quality

1. Introduction

The translator is the bridge between the source language and target language. There are many things that translator should pay attention such as the culture of the target and source language. The different culture will be a problem that should be faced and resolved by the translator. Cultural diversity makes people want to study and understand more about it. But, the curiosity does not come along with well language understanding. The willingness to learn and understand other cultures comes from various societies. Those societies make translator to sensor some part in the target language. This sensor can found in the novel, film, news, video, etc. The sensor in subtitle called censorship. Censorship usually is done by reducing or deleting some part that considers as tabu.

According to Cintas and Anderman (2009: 5), subtitling is audiovisual translation which produces written translation usually put in the down middle screen with the aim to deliver the dialog from the source language. Meanwhile censorship according to Scandura (2014) did by deleting words or phrase which consider as rude, tabu, and inappropriate. Generally, there is four reason of censorship, such as (1) politics, the government assumes by did not let their citizens know about others country make it easier to rule them. (2) Politically correctness, something that politically or legally wrong then allowed deleting.
(3) Religion, some scenes from a film is inappropriate and unsuitable for target religion then it will delete or re-shot substituting by something else. (4) Self-censorship, translator sometimes decided to modify words, phrase, or sentences by delete or reduce which consider as taboo.

In movie subtitle, sometimes we found there are some sentences reduced some even deleted. This problem makes the researcher know about the reasons for it. In translation, those problems included in the theory of translation technique called deletion and reduction. According to Molina & Albir (2002), the deletion is the technique of translation done by deleted terms or words from the source language. Meanwhile, the reduction is the technique of translation that aimed to condense information from source language to target language.

As researcher mention before, culture indeed the main problems for the translator. Indonesian culture which is known as eastern culture is unfamiliar with something vulgar and taboo. From this phenomena, the researcher wants to know how the translator faced this dilemma between target culture or source culture. The cultural difference also become researcher benchmark for finding the source of data for this research. There are many films which contrary to Indonesian culture, some of them are American Pie 1-7. These movies tell about the life of American teenagers to find their love, to lose their virginity and to find their true identity. These movies won some awards such as Best Teen Movie at Csapivalo Awards year 2000, Golden Screen Germany year 2000, Top Box Office Films in ASCAP Film, Television Music Awards year 2000, Film – Pretty Funny Male Performance in Canadian Comedy Awards pada year 2002, and Breakthrough Female Performance in Hollywood Film Awards year 2001.

Besides those phenomena, the researcher also found the research gap by looking at previous research about subtitle. First, research about translation technique, method, and ideology in the subtitle done by Purbasari (2001). Second, research about speech act in the translation of subtitle did by Wahyudi (2016) and Antoni (2014). Then research about the technique used to translate taboo terms in subtitle and translation quality of the product done by Sari (2016) and Mutakin (2009). The research gap from those is research particularly about censorship in the subtitle and the reasons of censorship never done before.

In this research, the researcher will explain about words, phrase, and sentences which censored in American Pie 1-7 subtitles, the reasons for censorship in American Pie 1-7 subtitle, and the impact of censorship toward translation quality in American Pie 1-7 subtitle. The purpose of this research is to find words, phrase, and sentences which censored in American Pie 1-7 subtitle, analyze reasons for censorship in American Pie 1-7 subtitle and analyze the impact of censorship toward translation quality in American Pie 1-7 subtitle.

The benefit of this research theoretically is to describe words, phrase, and sentences which censored in American Pie 1-7 subtitles, explain translator reasons of censorship in American Pie 1-7 subtitle and analyze translation quality in American Pie 1-7. The practical benefit of this research is aside to increase knowledge about translator reason of censorship, also can be used as translator's reference to more understand about censorship and can translate high-quality subtitle. Besides that, translator expected to know more about words, phrases, and sentences which need and do not need to censor.

2. Method

This research is descriptive qualitative research because this research describes words, phrase, and sentences which deleted and reduce because of censorship in American Pie 1-7 subtitles. Besides that, this research also describes the impact of censorship on translation quality assessment and analyze reasons for censorship in American Pie 1-7 subtitle.

Source of the data in this research consist of document and informant. The source data document is the transcript of American Pie 1-7 subtitle which censored and its translation. The informant of this research is three raters who helped in assessing translation quality of subtitle which had censorship.

The primary source of data is words, phrase, and sentences which censored in American Pie 1-7 subtitle, the reasons for censorship and results of group discussion with raters about accuracy, acceptability, and readability those subtitles. The secondary source of data is researches related to subtitle as additional information for this research.

Data collection technique used in this research is document analysis and focus group discussion (FGD). Document analysis was done by analyzing words, phrases, and sentences censored from source language to target language intently. Researcher examines it by observing American Pie 1-7 film and subtitle transcript from the source language and its translation, take notes words, phrases, and sentences which censored and its content situation, then analyze reasons of censorship. Meanwhile, focus group discussion (FGD) done by three rates who discussed translation quality of those subtitles.

The researcher used data validation technique which is source data triangulation and method triangulation to validate the data. Source data triangulation is American Pie 1-7 subtitle and its translation to collect data which deleted and reduction because of censorship, then give translation quality assessment with rater. Meanwhile, method triangulation done by investigating the same data by use data collection method consists of a document, questioner, and in-depth interview.

The researcher analyzes data used ethnography research by Spradley (1997) which consist of four analysis step which is domain analysis, taxonomy analysis, componential analysis, and cultural theme analysis. In domain analysis, the researcher selects the data by collect words, phrases, and sentences which had censorship in American Pie 1-7 subtitle. Taxonomy analysis was done by analyzing translation quality inaccuracy, acceptability, and readability aspect. The componential analysis is part to connect between words, phrases, and sentences which had censorship with the translation quality assessment. Meanwhile, cultural theme analysis was aims to find the reasons of censorship and the impact on translation accuracy, acceptability, and readability.

3. Finding

3.1. Words, Phrased, and Sentences which had Censorship

Scandura (2014) explains there are two ways of censorship, which are deletion and reduction. Deletion is done by delete all words, phrases, and sentences which considered censoring. Meanwhile, the reduction is done by reduces some part of the source language. In this research, reduction more found than deletion. Translators deleted or reduce some part in subtitle not only because it consist swearing words or tabu terms but also some reasons that will explain in next sub Bab.

Data which deleted because of swearing words such as Jesus; bullshit; Jesus Christ; shit man; shit; holy; and fuck me. Meanwhile, data which deleted because of other factors such as you know what?; I
don’t get it; more important than any bet; someone to spot you; the rose bowl; I’m a total idiot; ride that; gross; and etc.

Data which reduce because of swearing words such as the fuck; losers; fuckers; you dick-snot; fucko; fuck face; big-wheel-riding; these little sons of bitches; assholes; fucking; bitch tits; and etc. Meanwhile, data which reduce because of other factors such as serious; spout off cheeseball lines; at least; anything about you; style kung fu; I mean; eastern European; and etc.

3.2. Reasons for Censorship
3.2.1. Self-Censorship

According to Scandura (2014), one of the main reasons of censorship is self-censorship. Scandura also explains that self-censorship did by translator choice to delete or reduce some part which considers inappropriate. It happens because of some reasons. In this research, there are four reasons for self-censorship such as swearing words, emphasizing, taboo (part of the body), and repetition.

**Swearing Words**

Swearing words in KBBI mean words awful or dirty said because angry, annoyed, or disappointed. According to Veronica (1997: 2), swearing words are words which part of taboo words but not all taboo words always used to swear. Here are the data:

| Number of data | 09 |
| Context of situation | In American Pie 1 (1999), Steve held a party with his friends and some people who famous or cool at his house. He goes around greeting the guest but getting shocked when he sees Sherman. Steve displeased with Sherman because he is a loser. |
| SL | What the fuck are you doin’ here? |
| TL | Ngapain kamu kemari? |

This data is a reduction. “The fuck” is part of the sentences which said by Steve and shows that Steve really displeased to see Sherman. But translator reduces “the fuck” because it was swearing words. Translator ignores the real meaning of “the fuck” in this data and reduces it. This data consider as self-censorship because of translator's decision to reduce it.

| Number of data | 107 |
| Context of situation | In American Pie 4 (2005), Matt makes troubles in school. He gets punishment from the school committee to attend Band Camp. Matt must attend Band Camp or he will expel from school. In Band Camp, Matt meets Brandon and his friends. Brandon always makes trouble with Matt. One day, Brandon trap Matt and make Matt get trouble. Matt cannot accept it and said to camp guard that Brandon and his friends lie. |
| SL | That’s a lie, you dick-snot. |
| TL | Itu bohong. |

This data is a reduction. "You dick-snot" is a part of sentences "that’s a lie" but translator reduces it. This because "you dick-snot" include as swearing which done by Matt to Brandon and his friends. The data consider as self-censorship because of translator's decision to reduce "you dick-snot" which consider as swearing words.
Number of data : 203

Context of situation: In American Pie 6 (2007), Dwight held freshmen welcoming party in Beta House. Dwight enemy from Geek House, Edgar, come and destroy the party. The next morning, Dwight held meeting with Beta House members to find the way to avenge Edgar and Geek House. Dwight and the members play video from the party. In the video, there is a man who can kiss some different woman.

SL : Jesus!
TL : -

This data is deletion. "Jesus" gets deleted because it was swearing and taboo for the target language. Because of that, the translator chooses to delete "Jesus". Deletion should not happen in this data, because it can make citizen confused by deleted actor's dialog from the subtitle. The real meaning of "Jesus" is to show that Dwight and the members were really shocked to see what happen in the video.

**Emphasizing**

According to the Cambridge dictionary, emphasize is to show that something is very important or worth giving attention. Meanwhile, Oxford dictionary explains that emphasize is giving value or special importance in speaking or writing, or make something more clearly defined. That explanation can resume by emphasizing is something that needs special attention because containing important meaning. Here are the data:

Number of data : 55

Context of situation: In American Pie 2 (2001), Steve known by his style which reckless and woman player. In his party, as usual, Steve seduces a woman and succeeds.

SL : That’s pretty good fucking rule.
TL : Itu aturan yang bagus.

This data is a reduction. "Fucking" in this data is emphasized to show that the rules very good. But translator did reduction because consider that there is no problem to reduce it and the message of source language also translate to the target language well. The data is self-censorship because translator makes his/her own decision to reduce it and consider it as something unimportant.

Number of data : 135

Context of situation: In American Pie 5 (2006), Tracy dating with Erik. During their dating, they never have sex because of Tracy belief. Tracy believes that sex should do after marriage. Tracy feels guilty because of that. Tracy gives Erik a guilt-free pass for a week so he can do whatever he wants. It includes going to the naked mile. Tracy's friends, Brooke and Natalie, give protest to Tracy and tell Tracy the consequence of his decision.

SL : It’s pretty risky, Tracy.
TL : Itu, beresiko, Tracy.

This data is a reduction. The translator did not translate "pretty" which is an important part of the sentence. Pretty in this data aimed to emphasize risky. The translator should translate it into "cukup beresiko" because the context of the situation shows that it pretty risky. This data is self-censorship because the translator chooses to reduce pretty and consider it as unimportant.
**Sexual References**

According to Eisenson and Boase (in Liedlich, 1973: 107), the taboo is something which forbidden to say because inappropriate with some culture. Burridge (2006: 237) add that taboo refers to social sanction towards rude or impolite behavior in a certain context. Anderson and Trudgill (1990: 55) also stated that taboo related to sex, religion, body function, group, tribe, food, dirt, and death. In this research, the terms of taboo which also found are sexual references. Here are the data which consider as sexual references:

- **Number of data**: 204

  **Context of situation**: In American Pie 6 (2007), Dwight held freshmen welcoming party in Beta House. The next morning, Dwight and Beta House members play video from the party. In the video, there is a man who can kiss some different woman. Dwight wants that man become Beta House member.

  **SL**: Give him a bid. He’ll be a **pussy** magnet, buddy.

  **TL**: Beri dia tawaran. Dia akan menjadi magnet, sobat.

  This data is a reduction. Translator reduces the word “pussy”. “Pussy” means woman genitals which show that this data is sexual references. Translator chooses to reduce “pussy” because consider it as taboo, whereas “pussy” clarifies the magnet. The reduction of “pussy” makes the sentence unclarified. The viewers can get confused by Dwight purpose of hiring the man. The meaning of “magnet” also unclarified.

  **Number of data**: 215

  **Context of situation**: In American Pie 6 (2007), Edgar challenges Dwight to held Greek Roulette competition between Greek House and Beta House. The final game is the first man who ejaculates will lose. In the last minute, Dwight uses his secret weapon to beat Edgar that is a woman with a sheep costume. Edgar has dark past with sheep because of that Dwight used it.

  **SL**: Edgar, you got a little wool **fetish**, buddy?

  **TL**: Edgar, kau punya wol kecil, teman?

  This data is a reduction. Translator reduces “fetish” from the sentence. “Fetish” means a sexual interest in an object or a part of the body other than the sexual organs. Translator considers the message from source language can convey to target language even without translating “fetish”. In fact, “fetish” is included in “a little wool fetish” that should be translated.

**Repetisi**

According to KBBI, repetition is words repetition which worked to explain some meaning. Repetition is words repetition to stress something. Here are the data:

  **Number of data**: 39

  **Context of situation**: In American Pie 1 (1999), Nadia comes to Jim's house. Nadia comes after doing her ballet lesson. Nadia borrows Jim's room to changes her clothes. Jim knows that Nadia will come to his room, so he displays a secret camera to live streaming on campus channel. When Nadia changes her clothes, Jim run to Steve house to see live streaming from his rooms with Kevin, Steve, and Paul. They do not believe that Nadia will take off her panties.

  **SL**: Holy shit! Holy shit!

  **TL**: astaga...
This data is a deletion. “Holy shit” had repetition to show that the viewers really surprise to see that scene. Translators choose to delete one “holy shit” because considering it was enough to translate only one “holy shit”. Actually, “holy shit” repeated to show other meaning which should remain translated.

Number of data : 70

Context of situation: In American Pie 2 (2001), Steve, Jim, Kevin, and Chris rent a house on a beach to hold their summer holiday party. Steve little brother, Matt, comes to attend that party. Matt greets Jim, Kevin, and Chris.

SL : Fuckers, fuckers, fuckers. How you doin’, boys?
TL : Berengsek, bagaimana kabarmu?

This data is a reduction. Matt said “fuckers” three times to call Jin, Kevin, and Chris. But translator only translates one “fuckers” and reduce the others. Actually, the translator should translate all “fuckers”, so the real meaning of those can convey to viewers.

**Translator Capacity**

In Censorship and Subtitling (2004), Scandura explains that deletion or reduction can be a mistake. It happens because of a) the translator’s lack of adequate knowledge; b) the fact that the translator underestimated the audience; and c) the translator’s failure to realize that was a reference.

The first reason is questioning translator improvement about language, slang, culture from source and target language, and ability to analyze discourse. The second reason, the translator should not delete every local reference while translating. Maybe there are some unfamiliar things, but the translator should not underestimate viewers because the translator is not the only one who analyzes discourse. And the third reasons show that every translator has a weakness. Even the best translator accidentally may make a mistake. The fact that it is impossible for the translator to know every indirect reference from the source language does not make references from source language reduce or delete. Here are the data:

Number of data : 23

Context of situation: In American Pie 1 (1999), Kevin persuade his friends to make an agreement to should having sex and lose their virginity before their graduation. Kevin also said that their last changes after prom, because women need having sex after prom. Jim also agrees with Kevin statement.

SL : The Rose Bowl.
TL : -

This data is deletion. “The Rose Bowl” deleted in the subtitle. The translator does deletion because unaware of the real meaning of “the rose bowl”. Translator assumes by translating previous sentences is enough to covey Jim intention. Actually, “The Rose Bowl” explains more about the example of a tradition that they referred to before. From this data, we know that translator less understanding about source language culture which needs to improve the knowledge of the source and target language culture.

Number of data : 134

Context of situation: In American Pie 5 (2006), Brooke and Natalie tell Tracy the consequence of his decision to gives Erik, her boyfriend, a guilt-free pass for a week. Tracy gives Erik a guilt-free pass for a week so he can do whatever he wants. It includes going to the naked mile.
SL: He’s gonna go from getting laid back to dry humping.

TL: Dia akan pergi dari hal itu.

This data is a reduction. "Back to dry humping" got reduce from the sentences. The translator does it because lack understands the meaning of the sentence. Actually, "back to dry humping" has an important meaning that should be translated. But the translator does not understand it and reduce it. Meanwhile, "back to dry humping" explain "gonna go from getting laid".

3.3. The Impact of Censorship toward the Translation Quality

Based on the explanation above, the researcher can draw the impact of censorship towards the quality of the translation. Translation quality assessment in this research use quality assessment by Nababan (2003). The quality assessment consists of accuracy, acceptability, and readability. The accuracy used to see the message accuracy from the source language to target language. The acceptability used to see the suitable of the translation with the source language culture. Meanwhile, readability used to see if the translation is easy to understand by the readers or viewers or they need more time to understand the translation meaning.

In this research, the data show that the translator quality is less accurate, acceptable, and high readability; and inaccurate, unacceptable, and low readability. The data only show two assessment patterns.

Less Accurate, Acceptable, and High Readability

Here are some data which show translation quality less accurate, acceptable, and high readability:

Number of data: 03
Context of situation: In American Pie 1 (1999), Jim has lunch with Paul, Chris, and Kevin. They gather to discuss Steve's party tonight. Jim wants to ask their opinion about what clothes that can make a woman fall in love with him.

SL: I have a serious question to ask you guys.
TL: Aku mau nanya nih.

This data consider as less accurate because the whole message from source language gets reduce. The translator chooses to reduce “serious”. Actually “serious” show that Jim wants to ask a serious question, but the translator reduce “serious” and decrease the question level. Although it was less accurate, the data is acceptable and has high readability. It happens because the translation feels natural and easy understanding for readers or viewers.

Number of data: 78
Context of situation: In American Pie 2 (2001), the next morning after the summer party has done. Steve and his friends get ready to go home. Steve, who the last one left the house, ask Jim and Kevin about the car that just left their house.

SL: Who the hell was that?
TL: Siapa itu?

This data is a reduction. Translator reduces “the hell”. Translator thinks that without “the hell”, the message from source language still can be delivered completely. Meanwhile, “the hell” used to show the character of Steve. Steve is someone who always makes problems and rude. By the reduction of “the hell”, the message also gets reduce. Because of that reason, the data is less accurate. But consider as acceptable and has high readability because the translation feels natural and easy understanding.
Inaccurate, Unacceptable, and Low Readability

Here are some data which consider as inaccurate, unacceptable, and has low readability.

Number of data : 66

Context of situation: In American Pie 2 (2001), Steve secretly enters Danielle and Amber room when they go. He wants to prove that they are lesbian. Paul tries to follow Steve and ask him out. But Paul and Steve get caught by Danielle and Amber. Steve explains his reasons enter their room. Danielle and Amber pull a prank to Steve. They ask Steve to do something for exchange with the truth. Paul let Steve touch his buttock willingly, so they get more information about Danielle and Amber.

SL : Jesus Christ.
TL : -

This data is a deletion. Translator deletes “Jesus Christ” because it is a swearing word. This data is inaccurate because the translator deletes “Jesus Chris” which makes the message from source language did not convey to target language even unseen in the subtitle. This data is unacceptable and has low readability because the viewer did not see anything in the subtitle because of deletion.

Number of data : 76

Context of situation: In American Pie 2 (2001), Steve and his friends held beach party. Steve little brother, Matt, flirting with some women at the party.

TL : Kemarilah, kamu membuat malu dirimu sendiri.

This data is a deletion. The translator thinks that it is unnecessary to translate the second “come on” because the actors already said “come here”. The translator should translate “come on” because it is part of the dialog and contain a message for the viewers. By doing deletion, translator makes the data inaccurate, unacceptable and has low readability.

4. Discussion

The data in this research show that the main reasons for censorship are swearing words or taboo terms. Translator censor swearing or taboo terms because of still rare even strange for the citizen. Swearing usage in public place considers as disgraceful even though there are some places use swearing words in daily conversation. The subtitle is something that needs more attention from the translator. In subtitle, translator not only translates the message from the source language to target language but also pay attention to censorship. According to Scandura (2014), generally, there are four reasons for censorship such as politics, politically correctness, religion, and self-censorship or censorship done by translator decision. Besides those general reasons, there are other reasons for censorship.

Based on the above explanation, the main reasons for censorship in this research are self-censorship and translator's capacity. There are four factors of self-censorship, they are swearing words, emphasizing, taboo (part of the body), and repetition. Most of the data shows that the translator considers emphasizing as something unimportant and can delete without reducing message from the source language. Meanwhile, the translator's capacity shows the translator's lack of knowledge. The translator may lack knowledge about the culture of source and target language, slang, and analyze discourse. The data shows that the translator does not know if something is a reference and contain important information which needs transfer to viewers.
The quality of subtitle translations which deleted is inaccurate, unacceptable, and low readability. While the quality of subtitle translations which reduced is less accurate, acceptable, and high readability. The translation quality assessment based on the theory by Nababan et al (2012). The accuracy of the translation results judged by how the source language translated into the target language accurately and the presence or absence of meaning distortion also affects the assessment. The accuracy of the translation results judged by how the source language translated into the target language accurately and the presence or absence of meaning distortion also affects the assessment. Finally, the level of readability is assessed by how easily the reader understands the results of the translation.

In this study, the data that deleted has translation quality which inaccurate, not acceptable, and low readability. This due to translator removed the source language removed completely, so the viewer does not see any subtitles in the film. While the quality of subtitle translations which reduced is less accurate, acceptable, and high readability. This due to the translator reduced the integrity of the message, but the results of the translation.subtitle can be understood easily by the audience.

Scandura (2014) explains that remove everything which considers taboo, not appropriate or too local called by cheating the audience and preventing the citizen from learning. Translators try to make people do not know about foreign cultures that they should understand. With this purpose, translators should consider several things and does not censor words, phrases, and sentences that considered as inappropriate.

Conclusion

Based on the discussion and analysis above, it can be concluded that many subtitles which deleted and reduced. The main causes of censorship are self-censorship and translator's capacity. Self-censorship was done because words, phrases or sentences were considered as swearing words, emphasizing, sexual references, and repetition. Meanwhile, the translator's capacity shows the lack of a translator's ability or knowledge to understand the culture, slang, and other matters in the source language. The reduction makes the quality of subtitle translations is less accurate, acceptable, and high readability. The deletion makes the quality of subtitle translations is inaccurate, unacceptable, and low readability.

References

Allan, Keith & Burridge, Kate. 2006. Forbidden Words; Taboo and the Censoring of Language. New York:Cambridge University Press.


https://en.oxforddictionaries.com-definition/emphasize

https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/emphasize

https://kbbi.web.id/maki

https://kbbi.web.id/repetisi


**Copyrights**

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal.

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).